

FEAST/APTS IN RETROSPECT PART 2: THE BAGUIO YEARS¹

By Dave Johnson

Introduction

FEAST'S move to Baguio in 1986 went smoothly, although getting settled would take time and patience with both building renovation and new construction of an academic building and, later, a dormitory and married student housing. Most of the Filipino office staff opted not to move, making the hiring of new staff a priority. While most of the faculty moved with FEAST, the registrar, Trinidad Esperanza Seleky, opted not to move and concluded her many years of faithful, illustrious service.

Once the permanent board was in place in 1989, they decided it was time to change the name of the school. The term "Far East" in FEAST's name implied a colonial centric view of the world and, because the nations that had been under colonial masters were now independent, the term "Asia Pacific" was the preferred reference to the region.² The new name, Asia Pacific Theological Seminary, reflects sensitivity to the Asians' point of view and gave greater clarity to the school's graduate level of education.³

As stated in Part I, the purpose of this essay is to evaluate the history of FEAST/APTS through the camera lens of Harold Kohl's original seven goals for the school:

¹ As stated in Part I, much of the basic information for this is drawn from my book, *Led by the Spirit: The History of the American Assemblies of God Missionaries in the Philippines* (Pasig City, Philippines: ICI Ministries, 2009), 133-144, 303-340, 523-537. The original research used for that work is also used here.

² William Menzies and John Carter, *Zeal With Knowledge: The First Forty Years of FEAST/APTS*, (Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press, 2004), 76.

³ Ibid.

1. To encourage fidelity to God's written word and increased spiritual development in faculty and students.
2. To develop excellence in Christian ministry.
3. To establish a center from which to help elevate ministerial/theological education throughout the Asia Pacific region.
4. To establish a series of locations in the region as extension centers of FEAST "to bring the school to the students."
5. To educate and train a much-needed core of able teachers and administrators for the Bible schools in the region.
6. To assist God-called men and women in developing their gifts and talents for pastoral, evangelistic, missionary and leadership ministries in their national churches.
7. To create opportunities for cross-cultural understanding and international friendships that would lead to greater interaction and cooperation in joint ventures for the strengthening and expansion of Christ's church in the affected region.⁴

The First Decade in Baguio (1986-1995)

In January, 1987, the Kendricks completed their ministry at FEAST and returned to the States. At this point, the interim board made a concerted effort to bring in an Asian president. Rev. Johnny Yeoh, the assistant general superintendent of the Assemblies of God in Malaysia accepted the invitation to become the next president.⁵ For some reason, however, he was unable to fulfill this commitment.

David Lim's Tenure (1987-89)

The board then appointed Dr. David Lim, a Chinese-American under appointment with the AGWM⁶ who had been serving as academic dean. Lim's appointment was noteworthy as this fulfilled part of the dream of having an Asian president, despite the board's hopes to

⁴ Menzies and Carter, 16-17.

⁵ Far East Advanced School of Theology Getting New Campus in Baguio, New President, *Pentecostal Evangel*, January 26, 1986, n.p.

⁶ As stated in Part I, I am using AGWM, the current acronym for the Assemblies of God USA's worldwide missions program, to avoid confusion over the names that have been used for the world missions efforts of the Assemblies of God USA over the years.

appoint an Asian from one of the Asian General Councils—a dream that would not be fulfilled until 2009. Through Lim’s leadership, the school’s M.Div program became accredited with the Association of Theological Education in Southeast Asia (ATESEA), “the oldest and most prestigious accrediting association in the region.”⁷ The school was also later accredited through the Asian Theological Association (ATA) and the Asia Pacific Theological Association (APTA), becoming the only theological institution in that part of the world to be accredited by three different agencies.

When the Lims left APTS in 1990, David became the senior pastor of Grace Assembly of God in Singapore and is still there at the time of this writing in late 2013. His reflections on his time at APTS and his comments on the seven original objectives set forth by Kohl which follow must be seen through his current paradigm as a local pastor dealing with the everyday challenges of pastoring a multi-ethnic, urban congregation in Asia.

For Lim, the challenge of developing leaders in the Asia Pacific in the late 20th and early 21st century was daunting:

The world is more complex, globalization is unavoidable, expectation levels are increasing, spiritual warfare is intensifying, and economic upheavals in one country can affect many countries. Those of us who have been involved in theological education are aware that major paradigm shifts are taking place in the field of leadership training. Most theological schools are slow to adapt to the new paradigms. . . . I have spoken to pastors and educators at various times. These are my observations which will be affirmed by many ‘hands on’ leaders.⁸

Regarding the school’s original seven objectives, Lim stated that APTS had done well in stressing fidelity to God’s word but had not always diligently applied it to the realities of the Asian context. For example, he felt that they were not always aware of issues of spiritual warfare or the dynamics of Pentecostal worship in Asian churches.⁹

⁷ Menzies and Carter, 67.

⁸ David Lim, “Developing Leadership: A Radical Rethinking of the Whole Training Process,” in *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*, ed. A. Kay Fountain, 31-37, (Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press, 2004), 31.

⁹ David Lim, email to the author, September 11, 2013.

Wonsuk Ma, the longest serving faculty member in the history of FEAST/APTS (1983-2007) added that fidelity to God's word is directly related to spiritual formation, which he felt was high on the school's agenda. However, he added, forms of spirituality, [i.e. chapel attendance] "may not necessarily be translated into deepened spirituality."¹⁰ Julie Ma, Wonsuk's wife, felt that this objective was fulfilled not only among the students and faculty, but also among the office staff!¹¹

Lim's response to the goal of developing excellence is insightful, reflecting his pastoral paradigm:

We have sought to develop excellence in Christian ministry, but as most seminaries, we were generally stronger on the academic side than the practical. We did have missionary practitioners teach, but in the sense of specializations in Leadership and conflict management, organizational structures, strategic thinking, etc. we were weak. Sometimes I felt that, as educators, we were developing educators more than pastors and evangelists.¹²

Lim's comments here reflect the challenge between maintaining a high academic standard in accordance with the requirements of the academy and remaining relevant to the needs of the church. Citing the educator's track at the Lausanne II conference in Manila in 1989, which called for educators to become evangelists and vice versa, he called for a radical change in approach to education that would seek to synchronize classroom learning with hands-on ministry experience.¹³ He went on to specify:

Let us expose our faculties to where the issues really are. Let us reshape our courses to meet the objectives. Let us ask the right questions. Let us see God's strategy of changing the world. And let us make our commitment to train great leaders for the local churches at every level.¹⁴

¹⁰ Wonsuk Ma, email to the author, September 16, 2013.

¹¹ Julie Ma, email to the author, September 18, 2013.

¹² David Lim, email to the author, September 11, 2013.

¹³ Lim, "Developing Leadership," 33.

¹⁴ Lim, "Developing Leadership," 36-7.

For Lim, the ultimate goal was to train students to be a “yielded vessel disciplined and trained, anointed by Spirit of God [who] can see God do mighty miracles.”¹⁵

Lim went on to say that he felt that FEAST/APTS had succeeded in its goal to elevate theological education throughout the Asia Pacific and training new faculty members for Bible schools.¹⁶ This was critical because accreditation required teachers to be educated one level higher than the level at which they were teaching. Wonsuk Ma spoke clearly to this objective when he wrote that FEAST/APTS was to be “at least one step ahead to meet the faculty needs of national schools.”¹⁷ Ma went on to point out that the many schools in the region which have been able to upgrade their academic levels, including some at the masters degree levels, are being led and staffed by FEAST/APTS graduates.

Maintaining a vibrant extension program over the years has been a daunting challenge. Instructors needed to be recruited from all over the world as the resident faculty at APTS were not able to do all of the teaching in the extensions and teach their classes at the home campus. The locations of the extensions have shifted around the region over the years, depending on the needs and interests of the national churches. In most, if not all cases, the courses had to be taught in block sessions of two to three weeks in length, due to lack of faculty availability and because the faculty needed to have the appropriate credentials for the courses they taught. Since most degree programs call for some courses in other disciplines, no one single teacher could teach the entire program. Therefore block courses with rotating faculty were the only option.

Since block courses are time intensive, the students are normally given up to one month after the course to complete the extensive reading and writing requirements. Getting the students to complete their work after the instructor’s departure has been a chronic problem through the years, despite the fact that all extension sites are required to have onsite representatives to ensure that the work gets done. Many extensions have closed for this reason.

On the other hand, other extensions have closed because, in time, the national church had sufficient FEAST/APTS-educated teachers and were able launch their own graduate school programs or seminaries. These situations are tangible indications that FEAST/APTS

¹⁵ Lim, “Developing Leadership,” 36.

¹⁶ David Lim, email to the author, September 11, 2013.

¹⁷ Wonsuk Ma, email to the author, September 16, 2013.

has succeeded in its goal to provide qualified faculty for the various General Councils!

Regardless of the challenges, by 1992, Jack Rozell, the extension coordinator, who, with his wife, Adel, had come to the school in 1989 after many years of pastoral ministry in the States, could report that since its inception in 1973, the extension program had functioned in eleven countries, served 2,315 students, and had awarded thirty master of arts (MA) and 174 bachelor of theology (BTh) degrees. At the time, there were 326 active students in five locations.¹⁸

Regarding Kohl's objective to assist God-called men and women to develop their gifts for a wide variety of ministries, Lim opined that the school's greatest strength in his time was developing teachers and educators but more expertise was needed in cross cultural understanding and missions.¹⁹ As Julie Ma expertly outlines elsewhere in this edition, the FEAST/APTS leadership began to address this issue in the 1990's, not long after the Lims' departure. The scope of APTS's success in cross cultural/missions training, according to Wonsuk Ma, went well beyond Kohl's original vision.²⁰ Nevertheless, Lim's comment above that the school did not do so well in training pastors cannot be easily dismissed, although a full evaluation of this matter is well beyond the limits of this essay.

Kohl's seventh objective was, "to promote cross cultural understanding and international friendships that would lead to greater interaction and cooperation in joint ventures for the strengthening and expansion of Christ's church in the affected region." Lim, who understood this goal to refer to the cross cultural situation on the main campus, also felt that the opportunity to cross-fertilize ideas was one of the school's greatest successes and noted that many among the students and faculty made life-long friendships across cultural boundaries.²¹ However, he also noted that the economic disparity between the Westerners and the Asians was not as noticeable when the school was still in Valenzuela.²² This disparity, and some lack of cross cultural sensitivity by some, occasionally led to some tension between some members of the multi-cultural faculty and administration.²³ Even in these cases, however, this is plenty of evidence to suggest that those

¹⁸ Jack V. Rozell, "The APTS Extension Opportunity," in *APTS Courier: The Official Newsletter of Asia Pacific Theological Seminary*, Vol. 1 No. 2, 4

¹⁹ David Lim, email to the author, September 11, 2013.

²⁰ Wonsuk Ma, email to the author, September 16, 2013.

²¹ David Lim, email to the author, September 11, 2013.

²² David Lim, email to the author, August 26, 2008.

²³ For a broader discussion of this issue, see *Led by the Spirit*, 336-340.

who struggled successfully endeavored to overcome these tensions, recognizing that the situation has never been perfect.²⁴

But what Kohl meant by “joint cooperation” is open to interpretation. Julie Ma understood it to mean working together with local churches off campus and felt that APTS did not do as well as it could have, and it should have taken more initiative to open dialogue with local church leaders.²⁵ However, John Carter, who will be introduced later, felt that there was great interaction with local churches though the school’s various outreach programs.²⁶

When Bill and Doris Menzies returned in 1989, he reassumed the president’s role and David Lim stayed on as a faculty member and extension director until he and May left the following year to pastor in Singapore.

Bill Menzies’ Second Tenure (1989-95)

This time the Menzies were able to stay long term. The result would have a direct and positive impact on the future of the school, with God opening at least one door in a manner that would literally see the glory of God arise from the dust and ashes of disaster.

The Baguio Earthquake

At 4:27 pm on Monday, July 16, 1990, a massive earthquake measuring 7.8 on the Richter scale struck the mountain area surrounding Baguio City. The city itself was the epicenter. Tremendous damage and loss of life was the result. Guy Deal, an AGWM missionary, who was supervising the construction of the Bethesda Hall dormitory noted:

The earthquake lasted close to 45 seconds. During that time the ground was much like an ocean wave and the buildings were rolling back and forth. Work was being done on Bethesda Hall and the roof trusses were being set at the time. The construction workers held on and just rode it out. Workers jumped up out of footers [part of the foundation] that they were digging ten feet below and climbed down the

²⁴ Wonsuk Ma, email to the author, August 27, 2008.

²⁵ Julie Ma, email to the author, September 18, 2013.

²⁶ John Carter, email to the author, October 22, 2013.

scaffolding without any injuries. All were sent home to check on their families.²⁷

All roads leading down the mountain were closed for about a week, electricity was lost for nearly three weeks and all telephone lines went down, shutting Baguio off from the outside world. Bill Menzies, however, was an amateur short wave radio operator and managed to contact someone in Texas who was able to somehow contact the AGWM field office in Manila to pass on word that everyone at APTS²⁸ was fine.

The entire student body, despite aftershocks and the rainy season, slept outside for a week until the buildings were inspected. Thank God the damage on campus was minimal, despite the massive damage in town. In their annual report to the Philippine missionary body, Bill and Doris Menzies reported:

We are so proud of the maturity of faculty, staff, and students, who rose to the occasion by ministering to the spiritual and physical needs in the community, as well as carrying on regular school activities. The APTS family is active in the relief effort, particularly in giving medical care, providing shelter kits, and in spiritual ministry.²⁹ While the immediate needs of the people were being cared for, a new vision for outreach was birthed in the hearts of the APTS leadership.

The Ministry Development Program

While APTS personnel responded to the earthquake in many ways that are beyond the scope of this essay to describe, the founding of the Ministry Development Program (MDP) grew out of APTS' earthquake response and would have a long term impact on both the Baguio area and the school.

The MDP appears to have been the first formal ministry outreach program in the history of the school.³⁰ It was originally headed by Jack and Adel Rozell. Adel was a registered nurse who became the school's medical consultant and operated a clinic on

²⁷ Guy Deal, email to the author, July 23, 2008.

²⁸ Since the name was changed from FEAST to APTS was changed about the time that Menzies became president, only the APTS name will be used for the remainder of the article.

²⁹ Bill and Doris Menzies, 1990 Annual Report to the AGMF, n.d., n.p.

³⁰ For a more complete description of the various outreaches by APTS personnel to the community after the earthquake and for a more complete description of the various MDP ministries over the years, see Menzies and Carter, *Zeal With Knowledge*, 78-82 and Dave Johnson, *Led by the Spirit*, 314-322.

campus. After the earthquake, the campus became involved in offering relief to the Baguio residents, and Adel led or worked with no less than ten medical outreaches sponsored by APTS to various locations in Baguio.³¹ Many Filipinos came to Christ as a result, and a number of churches in the area saw substantial growth.³²

Seeing the benefit to the community and the opportunity to give students hands-on ministry experience, Menzies asked the Rozells to make this a permanent program. For the next fifteen years, medical outreaches, normally conducted monthly, were a staple feature of the MDP's ministry. Over the years, the MDP featured a number of types of outreach that included literature distribution, telephone counseling in connection with the Christian Broadcasting Network (CBN) Asia, elementary school ministry and Operation Smile—a specialized medical ministry to children with cleft palates. When the Rozells had to leave APTS in 1995 due to Adel's health needs, others picked up the baton, and the ministry, now known as Impact Ministries, continues to bless the Baguio community to this day.

Research and Theological Reflection

Bill Menzies' background and passion for theological reflection was discussed in Part I. During his tenure (1989-1996), APTS made great strides in creating an atmosphere for the growth and development of a written and oral theological tradition.

Library Update

The efforts of head librarian Gary Flokstra, who served at APTS with his wife, Glenna, from 1986 to 1996, resulted in marked growth in the library—which is critical to graduate level education and theological reflection. During this time the library holdings grew to more than 44,000 volumes and other resources.³³ During the 1990s, the school also began to computerize the library, especially the card catalog, and later, a barcode system was added to help with inventory control and the checkout process. By 2004, the library holdings had grown to more than 60,000 volumes and other resources.³⁴

³¹ Jack and Adel Rozell, *1990 Annual Report to the AGMF*, January, 1991.

³² Gary and Glenna Flokstra newsletter, n.d.

³³ Anna Hymes, email to the author, November 26, 2008.

³⁴ Menzies and Carter, 85-6.

Asia Pacific Research Center (APRC)

In late 1990, under Flokstra's leadership, the APRC first opened its doors for business. According to Flokstra, the APRC's purpose was to gather materials on Pentecostal theology, missions and history in order to assist scholars researching and writing in this field. Looking at the actual holdings, however, suggests that, to date, the theology area has not been developed as well as the two other areas.³⁵ Perhaps this is not as necessary since the library, which is just across the hallway, is overwhelmingly theologically oriented. Again, Menzies' influence is unmistakable. The book for which he is best known, *Anointed to Serve*, articulates the history of the Assemblies of God USA up to its original publication date in the early 1970s and indicates that Menzies valued not only theological reflection but Pentecostal historical reflection as well. The connection between these two disciplines allows for Pentecostals to reflect on how their history and theology have interacted together since the beginning of the modern Pentecostal movement in the early 20th century.

APTS Press

There is some confusion over the exact starting date of the APTS Press. In their book, *Zeal With Knowledge*, Bill Menzies and John Carter state that it was started in 1995.³⁶ However, in his annual report to the board of directors for the school year 1992-3, Menzies indicated that it was already in operation.³⁷ The confusion may be resolved by recognizing that the Press did not produce its first book until 1995.³⁸ In the beginning, the Press handled publishing the *Chalice*, the school's yearbook, and the *Courier*, APTS's newsletter.³⁹ Later, this responsibility was passed on to other departments.

The APTS Press again reflects Menzies' conviction that seminaries were places where theological reflection should be encouraged. He opined that most textbooks used in Bible Schools were written by those who were teaching in seminaries or divinity schools.⁴⁰ Elsewhere he noted that APTS was being looked to for theological

³⁵ I am indebted to the APRC, its former curator Rose Engcoy and the current curator, William Alcabedos, for their assistance both with *Led by the Spirit* and these two articles.

³⁶ Menzies and Carter, 104.

³⁷ William W. Menzies, *Asia Pacific Theological Seminary President's Report*, March 23, 1993, 3.

³⁸ Menzies and Carter, 104.

³⁹ Menzies, *President's Report*, March 23, 1993, 3.

⁴⁰ William Menzies, unnamed publication located in the APRC archives, 3.

leadership.⁴¹ Over the next twenty years, a number of books on Pentecostal theology and history have been produced even though the fortunes of the Press have waxed and waned over the years, depending on the availability of someone to lead it. However, only one book, to date, has been known to be used as a textbook, suggesting that Menzies' vision has not yet been fully achieved. In 2012, a new director was brought in who is able to give most of his time to this vital work, and two new titles were brought out in 2013.

Lectureship Series

In February 1993, APTS began its own lectureship series under the direction of Melvin Ho who, with his wife Louise, served at APTS from 1992-2002. The purpose of the lectureship series was to promote theological dialogue and reflection. The series has been conducted annually and features noted speakers from the West and Asia, who discuss various themes of Pentecostal theology and history of interest to APTS students and church leaders in the region. In 1999, the series was aptly renamed in honor of Bill Menzies. Since 1998, the papers presented have been published in the *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies*, APTS's academic journal, which will be described in the next section.

In 1995, Doris Menzies suffered a heart attack and the Menzies were forced to go home to the States. When it became obvious that they would not be able to return, Bill Menzies resigned as president and became president emeritus and chancellor of APTS.

Continued Growth and Development (1996-)

While the Menzies' departure was unfortunate and unexpected, God had already provided a replacement who would build and expand on Menzies' work.

John Carter's Tenure (1996-2004)

In March 1996, Dr. John Carter was appointed as Menzies' successor. Carter, accompanied by his wife, Bea, arrived in 1991 to serve as the academic dean. Like Menzies, Carter was a career educator, but unlike Menzies, he had served both in the Christian and

⁴¹ William Menzies, unpublished minutes of a brainstorming session at the 1992 faculty retreat, 4.

the secular arenas, including a stint as an educational consultant with the government of Iran in the 1970s.

Carter, an exceptional administrator and educator, proved to be an excellent choice. He attempted “to create an organizational climate that was characterized by the *qualities of excellence, collegiality and servant leadership*.”⁴² While he added that these were never achieved perfectly, they did serve as foundational principles for his leadership.⁴³ Like the other presidents, more of Carter’s story is told elsewhere.⁴⁴

The following is an outline of the new academic programs that were developed under his leadership.

New Academic Programs

Starting in the year 2000, APTS began to move beyond the MDiv level by adding a master of theology (MTh) program. In the same year, a PhD program was begun in cooperation with the University of Wales in the UK. In 2002, APTS added their own doctor of ministry program (DMin) in Pentecostal/Charismatic studies.⁴⁵ Both the ThM and DMin program have produced a number of outstanding graduates, but with these programs also came a major challenge. Because these programs were designed for those already in full time ministry, full time residence at APTS was not required. In many cases, ministry schedules and family responsibility crowded out time for thesis or dissertation writing, and many students did not finish the program or had to request extensions in order to do so.

What is important for this study is that these degrees allowed students to teach at the seminary level, fulfilling the original goal of helping to elevate ministerial/theological education in the Asia Pacific region. No doubt this has contributed to the development of other Pentecostal seminaries in the region. It seems fair to say that, in this case, the school went far beyond Kohl’s original vision, although he would likely have endorsed the provision of these degrees.

⁴² John Carter, email to the author, August 19, 2008.

⁴³ Ibid.

⁴⁴ For more on John Carter’s presidency, see Menzies and Carter, 104-140 and Dave Johnson, *Led by the Spirit*, 322-340.

⁴⁵ Menzies and Carter, 108-9.

The Asia Pacific Center for the Advancement in Leadership and Missions (APCALM)

Enrollment on campus continued to grow and regularly exceeded 100 students, so increased dining space and more faculty offices were also needed.⁴⁶ The board responded to Carter's initiative to construct the new APCALM building on the lower part of the campus that included a larger chapel, a sizable cafeteria with a stunning view of the valley below, a number of faculty offices, conference rooms, classrooms and guest lodging. It was dedicated in 2001 and later renamed the Global Missions Center (GMC).

The GMC provided a home for a number of summer ministries and institutes such as the Institute for Islamic Studies (IIS), Leadership Development Institute (LDI) and the Missionary Training Program (MTP). The IIS and MTP programs are explained in greater depth in Julie Ma's article later in this edition.

Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies (AJPS)

In 1996, shortly after the Menzies' departure, APTS leadership began planning to found a new academic journal. Not surprisingly, Bill Menzies, although no longer physically resident, accepted the invitation to serve as the first general editor of the *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies*, to be assisted by Wonsuk Ma.⁴⁷ The original purpose statement reads:

The journal exists:

1. To Encourage serious theological thinking and articulation by Asian Pentecostal/Charismatics
2. To Promote interaction among Asian Pentecostals/Charismatics and dialogue with other Christian traditions
3. To Stimulate creative contextualization of the Christian faith
4. To Provide a means or Pentecostals/Charismatics to publish their theological reflection[s].⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Menzies and Carter, 111-12.

⁴⁷ *Minutes of Journal (ad hoc) Committee Meeting*, October 23, 1996, 2.

⁴⁸ *Minutes of Journal*, 1. The incorrect capitalization of the second word in most of the objectives is in the original but is noted here to avoid cluttering the quote with the use of [sic].

These goals closely reflect that of its short lived predecessor, the *Marturion* (see Part I, page 15). However, it was Ma, who had succeeded Carter as the academic dean, that carried the brunt of the workload and eventually succeeded Menzies as editor. Nevertheless, the Journal, which continues to this day and has largely succeeded in reaching its objectives, is part of the Menzies legacy. Later, Ma pioneered another journal dedicated to missiology, the *Journal of Asian Mission (JAM)*, in cooperation with the Asian Graduate School of Theology, a consortium of evangelical seminaries in the Philippines of which APTS was a founding member. Later *JAM* was edited by Ma's wife, Julie.

Reflections on APTS' Original Goals in the Carter Era and Beyond

Carter's reflections on the school's original objectives are worthy of note, especially since he was the longest serving administrator (13 years) in the school's history and is the current chairman of the board of directors. Two APTS graduates who were also beneficiaries of the Faculty Development Program, A. Kay Fountain from New Zealand, who received her PhD in Auckland after completing her masters at APTS and serves as the current academic dean, and R.G. dela Cruz, who served on the full-time faculty from 1991-2011, were colleagues of Carter, and his successors. Their comments will also be reflected here.⁴⁹ Since Carter has continued to have active involvement up to the present day, his comments may also include observations that extend beyond his era as president.

All three noted that APTS had remained faithful to the Word of God, in the classroom, chapel and elsewhere. Carter and dela Cruz went on to say that this faithfulness was also evident in community and student and faculty prayer meetings. Dela Cruz thought that fidelity to the Word was evident in the various off-campus ministries.⁵⁰

Regarding excellence in Christian ministry, Fountain, writing in 2013, opined that this goal has not always been consistently achieved. While there were times in which it was properly emphasized, there were other times that academic excellence took precedence over

⁴⁹ It should be noted that Fountain's and dela Cruz's tenure cover the time of four presidents, not just Carter, and their comments may reflect observations from those eras. They are reflected here since they both came on the faculty when Carter was the academic dean and worked with him longer than they did any other administrator who became president.

⁵⁰ R.G. dela Cruz, email to the author, September 12, 2013, John Carter, email to the author, September 14, 2013 and A. Kay Fountain, email to the author, September 28, 2013.

ministry involvement.⁵¹ This is important to note because, as Fountain went on to say, those who have the most success in the ministry are not necessarily those who excelled in the classroom.⁵²

Carter felt that the school had done an excellent job of providing ministry opportunities off campus and that these were well used by the students and faculty members during his tenure.⁵³ Dela Cruz, admitting that excellence is hard to define, limited his comments to preaching and teaching, which are easier to evaluate than other types of ministry, and felt that APTS, “generally speaking,” achieved this objective.⁵⁴

All agreed that the school had achieved its goal of “establishing a center from which to help elevate ministerial/theological education.” Carter specifically spoke to the point:

The impact of APTS on ministry and theological education in the Asia Pacific region is one of the most profound results of the seminary. I have visited nearly every Bible school [there were 101 such institutions by 2013] in every country in the region and I rarely find one without an APTS alumnus as an [sic] faculty member or administrator. As APTS has moved from the undergraduate to a graduate and post-graduate level of education, culminating at the present in the D.Min. program, it has clearly elevated the level of education among the church leaders of the region.⁵⁵

All also agreed that APTS had done well in its extension ministry which also helped to achieve the goal of elevating ministerial/theological education, although Fountain acknowledged that, as mentioned before, the fortunes of the extension program have risen and fallen over the years.⁵⁶

⁵¹ Email from A. Kay Fountain to the author, September 28, 2013.

⁵² A. Kay Fountain, email to the author, September 28, 2013.

⁵³ John Carter, email to the author, September 14, 2013.

⁵⁴ R.G. dela Cruz, email to the author, September 12, 2013.

⁵⁵ John Carter, email to the author, September 14, 2013.

⁵⁶ R.G. dela Cruz, email to the author, September 12, 2013, John Carter, email to the author, September, 14, 2013, and A. Kay Fountain, email to the author, September 28, 2013.

Dela Cruz and Carter also felt that the school had done well in “assisting men and women in developing their gifts and talents.”⁵⁷ Fountain, on the other hand, expressed a slightly different viewpoint:

I am pleased to say that I think we are presently [in 2013] doing this better than at any time in the past 20 years. It has always been important, but I think there is a hunger in the student body at this time which is making it more possible for this objective to be met. I think we have always aimed at developing people’s talents, but the giftedness aspect has been lacking before now. I think we are improving in this area.⁵⁸

All agreed that APTS had done well in providing opportunities for cross-cultural interaction. Fountain noted that the last five years [2008-13] had seen significant development in this area.⁵⁹

In 2002, Carter notified the board that he would not stand for reappointment to the presidency when his term expired in 2004, which coincided with APTS’s fortieth anniversary. By this time, Carter noted with gratitude that the school had graduated nearly 900 alumni, who were serving in numerous leadership capacities, mostly in the Assemblies of God, all over the Asia Pacific region. However, the needs of the present generation, he opined, allowed no time to rest on past laurels.⁶⁰

Wayne Cagle’s Tenure (2004-09)

When Carter announced that he would not accept reappointment, the board formed a presidential search committee to look for a successor, preferably an Asian, and the committee recommended six nominees. Their efforts were frustrated, however, when all of the nominees requested that their names be withdrawn from consideration.⁶¹ In time, the board turned to Drs. Wayne and Judy

⁵⁷ R.G. dela Cruz, email to the author, September 12, 2013, and John Carter, email to the author, September 14, 2013.

⁵⁸ A. Kay Fountain, email to the author, September 28, 2013.

⁵⁹ R.G. dela Cruz, email to the author, September 12, 2013, John Carter, email to the author, September 14, 2013, and A. Kay Fountain, email to the author, September 28, 2013.

⁶⁰ John Carter, “Reflections of the Current President,” in *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*, 39-51, ed. A. Kay Fountain (Baguio City, Philippines: Apts Press, 2004), 39.

⁶¹ Menzies and Carter, 145.

Cagle, veteran missionaries to Indonesia (1974-1986), and then-current area directors for the Pacific Oceania region. They had served in Bible schools in nearly every place they served, training hundreds of young men and women for the ministry.⁶² They had also served at APTS on a part-time basis over the years. Wayne had served on the board, taught some extension courses, served as the APCALM director from 2001-2005 and reassumed that role in 2007.⁶³ After Wayne began his presidency in 2004, Judy oversaw the DMin program.

One of the major developments in their tenure was the Leadership Development Program, which they actually started when Carter was still president. Judy Cagle explained:

Leadership Development Institute has as its core 4 modules: 1) The Biblical Leader 2) The Biblical Leader Develops and Communicates a Vision 3) The Assessment of the Biblical Leader 4) Being an Excellent Leader. An Advanced module was added several years for those who returned for a second year which included Conflict Management, Strategic Planning, Power & Leadership and Mentoring. Leaders from many Asia Pacific countries have attended the Leadership Development Institutes including Philippines, Mongolia, Fiji, Thailand, Pohnpei, Marshall Islands, Samoa, Saipan, Nauru, Solomon Islands, Papua New Guinea, Tonga, Guam, Vanuatu, Chuuk, and Kiribati.⁶⁴

Most of the Cagles' insights on Kohl's seven objectives are similar to the others, but a couple are noteworthy here. Regarding the first objective, fidelity to God's word, Judy Cagle said:

I feel that fidelity to God's written Word was definitely an important objective at APTS and every effort was made by faculty, administration, and students to uphold the values expressed. Spiritual development was also an important objective during the years we served at APTS. There was the lectureship which promoted scholarly study of God's Word, spiritual emphasis week each year which encouraged the earnest seeking after God. The mission's convention stressed the needs of our lost world and gave all of us a reminder of

⁶² Judy Cagle, email to the author, April 26, 2008.

⁶³ Ibid.

⁶⁴ Ibid.

God's heart for the lost. Small groups and chapel each week emphasized spiritual development in our daily campus life. Many times the chapel was filled with students praying and seeking God. There were student-led prayer meetings country-by-country among many students each week as well a monthly campus-wide prayer meeting. Staff conducted their own chapel each Monday and many attended the campus chapel services as well. Staff were also a part of the special emphasis weeks held on campus.⁶⁵

What is noticeable here is that their view of fidelity to God's word was comprehensive, embracing all areas of life at APTS, including the staff. The Cagles were the only respondents to note that the staff participated in the chapel services and even conducted their own chapels weekly, a practice that their predecessors had done and has been continued to this day.

The other notable insight came in response to Kohl's sixth objective:

I believe this objective has continued through all the years of APTS. The inclusion of the Missionary Training Institute, Institute of Islamic & Buddhist studies, counseling courses, and the leadership opportunities as well as courses offered have helped men and women develop these varied gifts. Students have served as interns in local churches and been involved in outreach evangelistic ministries during our tenure as well as to the present.⁶⁶

What is notable is their focus on the summer programs hosted at the APCALM/GMC facility. These programs were short-term intensive modules that allowed people to attend who could not normally take more time away from their families and ministries, although many who enrolled were APTS students taking the courses for credit. Short-term modules like these gave people a chance to study who might not have other opportunities, thereby expanding APTS' influence and reach. It also provided the school an excellent recruiting opportunity to attract new students.

⁶⁵ Judy Cagle, email to the author, October 1, 2013.

⁶⁶ Ibid.

Tham Wan Yee's Tenure (2009-)

From the beginning, the Cagles, who were already in their early sixties at the time of their appointment, had indicated that they would serve only one term.⁶⁷ In 2009, the board of directors achieved a long-cherished dream with the appointment of the Reverend Tham Wan Yee. Yee and his wife, Moon Tee Ngoh were Malaysian missionaries already serving at APTS. Yee was the first Asian president not under appointment with AGWM. His appointment also followed the tradition of promoting within the school, which had happened with Jim Long in 1973, David Lim in 1987 and John Carter in 1996. With a new president, who was ethnically Chinese and proficient in several languages, would come new dreams and new directions.

In 2010, Yee began a new GMC program that brought in-house church pastors from mainland China for two months of intense training conducted in the Mandarin language. This was the first time in APTS's history that a language other than English was used as a language of instruction. At least sixty-two men and women have participated between 2011-2013, with thirteen of those later enrolling in APTS programs.⁶⁸ An MA program for Chinese students in Mandarin has begun and a Korean language track is in the planning stages. The Mandarin programs have been under the leadership of Taiwanese missionaries Joe and Lana Liu. Library collections in both of these languages have been started. Considering the stupendous growth of the church in both China and Korea, the vastness of China, the current openness of the Chinese government and the importance of Korea in the Pentecostal movement in Asia Pacific, the potential benefit from these programs is beyond calculation.

Paul Lewis, an AGWM missionary who replaced Wonsuk Ma as the academic dean in 2007-12, reflected on the philosophy of theological education. Echoing Bill Menzies, Lewis argued that while Bible schools taught students "what to think," in other words, indoctrination, the job of the seminary was to teach them "how to think."⁶⁹ In this vein, graduate theological education should equip the student with "the critical tools within the student by which to rightly

⁶⁷ Personal conversation with the author, n.d.

⁶⁸ Barbara dela Cruz, email to the author, October 16, 2013.

⁶⁹ Paul W. Lewis, "Some Theological Considerations on Pentecostal Theological Education," in *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*, ed. A. Kay Fountain, 305-321. (Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press, 2004), 306.

discern the Word, and to be able to spot aberrant and cultic beliefs and practices.”⁷⁰

Lewis advocated a three-pronged holistic approach to the Christian life and applied it to theological education. These prongs were “*orthodoxy*, or right belief; *orthopraxis*, right action and *orthopathy*, right experience or passion.”⁷¹ Orthodoxy, for Lewis, gives the parameters for the other two prongs. The Bible leads to theological reflection “which mediates between the cognitive, experiential and practical strands.”⁷² For Lewis, this triad is cyclical, with the various strands leading to more theological reflection, reinforcing the critical need to remain faithful to the Scriptures in order to remain orthodox and balanced in the Christian life.

The orthopraxis and orthopathy could be seen at APTS in acts of Christian service as well as participation in chapel, the formal field education requirement for MDiv students, small groups, prayer meetings and learning to live in a multicultural community. In other words, the triad called for living out some of the other of Kohl’s original objectives.

Finally, Lewis called for balance:

Perhaps one of the greatest tensions in graduate theological education for the student is the tension between academic rigor and the need for time for reflection or prayer. In any graduate program, there is a problem of balancing time for other things outside of study. Further, it is a usual problem within the world of ministry that there is never enough time. On the one hand, if the student cannot be stretched to work through these issues, and find time for prayer and reflection within their schedule then their ministerial experience will likewise be distorted. On the other hand, there is also a responsibility of the Administration/Faculty to oversee the spiritual growth of the students and ultimately, to make sure that students are not overloading themselves in order to graduate too quickly without proper time to reflect and pray. This sense of haste that many students have, frequently demonstrates the interest of the student in receiving a degree rather than obtaining an education. The balance of *orthodoxy*, *orthopraxis* and *orthopathy* must be mirrored within the life of

⁷⁰ Ibid., 317.

⁷¹ Ibid., 307.

⁷² Ibid., 308-9.

the graduate, and times of reflection are necessary for this to take place.⁷³

Lewis, writing forty years after Kohl originally set the initial objectives of the school and articulated the original motto, Zeal with Knowledge, sounds remarkably like his predecessor. Perhaps Judy Cagle expressed it the best when she wrote “It is amazing that . . . [Rev.] Kohl had the foresight to envision objectives that would be relevant for 50 years and beyond!”⁷⁴ John Carter agreed, stating that by 2011, more than 1,100 students had graduated from the school, and many are now serving as key church leaders in their respective nations.⁷⁵

Conclusion

This essay has attempted to evaluate how Harold Kohl’s original seven objectives for FEAST/APTS were accomplished through the years by looking at the writings of the major personnel involved. The objectives were not followed perfectly, to be sure, and, at different times and seasons, the leadership involved may have felt led by the Lord to emphasize some objectives more than others. On the whole, however, Kohl’s call for Zeal with Knowledge, as articulated by the seven original objectives, has stood the test of time and served the school well.

The degree to which FEAST/APTS has succeeded is beyond the ability of this essay to completely measure, even though it would be a beneficial endeavor and is recommended for further research. Some indicators, however, are available. In 1960, there were sixteen Bible institutes in the Asia Pacific region. Now, there are 101 theological institutions of various levels, and in nearly all of them at least one FEAST/APTS alumnus serves as a member of the faculty or administration, suggesting that the school has largely achieved its goals of providing qualified faculty for Bible schools and opportunity for faculty to upgrade their credentials.

Whatever the success of FEAST/APTS may be, we dare not rest here. The daunting challenge of completing the unfinished task of world evangelism in the Asia Pacific region and beyond demands that APTS carry on its mission of training the next generation of pastors,

⁷³ Ibid., 320-1.

⁷⁴ Judy Cagle, email to the author, October 1, 2013.

⁷⁵ John Carter, *APTS Institutional Review Report Submitted to the APTS President and Board*, unpublished document, March 27, 2012, 1.

educators and missionaries while holding the need for both passionate spirituality and academic rigor in creative tension, balancing both Zeal and Knowledge.

References Cited

Published Materials

- Carter, John. 2004. "Reflections of the Current President." In *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*. Ed. A. Kay Fountain, 39-51. Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press.
- Kohl, Harold. 2004. "Developing a Minister." In *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*. Ed. A. Kay Fountain, 17-26. Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press.
- _____. 1968. "Why Support Foreign Bible Schools." *Pentecostal Evangel*. September 8.
- Johnson, Dave. 2009. *Led by the Spirit: The History of the American Assemblies of God Missionaries in the Philippines*. Pasig City, Philippines: ICI Ministries Inc.
- Lewis, Paul. 2004. "Some Theological Considerations on Pentecostal Theological Education," In *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*. Ed. A. Kay Fountain, 305-321. Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press.
- Lim, David. 2004. "Developing Leadership: A Radical Rethinking of the Whole Training Process." In *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*. Ed. A. Kay Fountain, 31-37. Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press.
- McKinney, Everett L. 2004. "Reflections of a Past President." In *Reflections on Developing Asian Pentecostal Leaders: Essays in Honor of Harold Kohl*. Ed. A. Kay Fountain, 27-31. Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press.

_____. 1982. "Leadership Training at FEAST." *Mountain Movers*. August.

Menzies, William and Carter, John. 2004. *Zeal With Knowledge: The First Forty Years of FEAST/APTS*. Baguio City, Philippines: APTS Press.

Pentecostal Evangel. 1986. "Far East Advanced School of Theology Getting New Campus in Baguio, New President." January 26. n.p.

Summary of Recommendations. 1984. FEAST Consultation. January 2-6.

Non-Published Documents (Most are drawn from the APRC archives at APTS)

Carter, John. 2012. *APTS Institutional Review Report Submitted to the APTS President and Board*. March 27.

Flokstra, Gary and Glenna. Newsletter, n.d.

Long, James W. *Interim President's Report for 1973-1974*.

McKinney, Everett L. 1981. *Far East Advanced School of Theology: Historical Review and Future Projections*. December 28.

_____. *President's Report, 1978-1979*.

Menzies, Bill and Doris. *1990 Annual Report to the AGMF*, n.d., n.p.

Menzies, William. 1993. *Asia Pacific Theological Seminary President's Report*, March 23.

_____. Unnamed publication located in the APRC archives.

_____. Unpublished minutes of a brainstorming session at the 1992 faculty retreat.

Minutes of Journal (ad hoc) Committee Meeting. 1996. October, 23.

Proposal For a New Journal: Maturion. 1985. February 11.

Rozell, Jack V. "The APTS Extension Opportunity," in *APTS Courier: The Official Newsletter of Asia Pacific Theological Seminary*, Vol. 1 No. 2.

Rozell, Jack and Adel. 1991. *1990 Annual Report to the AGMF*. January.

The President' [sic] Annual Report to the Board of Directors. 1986. May.

Private Communication

Cagle, Judy. Email to the author, October 1, 2013.

Cagle, Judy. Email to the author, April 26, 2008.

Carter, John. Email to the author, October 22, 2013.

Carter, John. Email to the author, October 1, 2013.

Carter, John. Email to the author, September 14, 2013.

Carter, John. Email to the author, August 19, 2008.

dela Cruz, Barbara. Email to the author, October 16, 2013.

dela Cruz, Roli G. Email to the author, September 12, 2013.

Deal, Guy. Email to the author, July 23, 2008.

Flokstra, Gary. Email to the author, August 5, 2008.

Fountain, A. Kay. Email to the author, September 28, 2013.

Hymes, Anna. Email to the author, November 26, 2008.

Kendrick, Kendrick. Telephone interview with the author, July 18, 2008.

Lim, David. Email to the author, September 11, 2013.

Lim, David. Email to the author, August 26, 2008.

Ma, Julie. Email to the author, September 18, 2013.

Ma, Wonsuk. Email to the author, September 16, 2013.

Ma, Wonsuk. Email to the author, August 27, 2008.

McKinney, Everett and Evelyn. Email to the author, April 29, 2008.

McKinney, Everett L. Letter to J. Philip Hogan, February 4, 1985.

McKinney, Everett L. Letter to Koichi Kitano, December 15, 1981.

Menzies, Glen. Email to the author, October 3, 2013.

Menzies, Robert. Email to the author, October 1, 2013.