

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

**PayPal**

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Expository Times* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_expository-times\\_01.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_expository-times_01.php)

pdfs are named: [Volume]\_[Issue]\_[1<sup>st</sup> page of article].pdf

included in John 21. We are thus abundantly justified in regarding the Fourth Gospel as amplifying and expanding the witness, which the Presbyter impresses upon his readers as the claim which he can rightly make upon the dutiful attention of the Church. His credentials were those not of official authority but of irrefutable and faithful testimony. 'This is he that bare record, and we know that his record is true.'

The importance of this witness lies in the fact that the historical Jesus is vital to Christianity. The whole edifice collapses if it is denied that Jesus Christ is come in the flesh. His relation to the society which bears His name is not that of the teacher who, having communicated certain ideas about God believed to be true—that He is Love, Light, Life, or even more concretely that He is the Father—has no vital, permanent, and necessary connexion with the community to the formation of which He gave the impulse. The message—what Paul would have called his gospel—was the com-

munication of the means whereby believers might have the Father, might be begotten of Him, through fellowship with the Son who was manifested to take away our sins, and whose blood cleanses from all sin. The Presbyter is not concerned to argue the truth of the message; that is not his object. He assumes that its contents will not be disputed. He appeals to what his readers know, to the experience which the acceptance of the message produced, to the witness of the Spirit, to the conquest of sin, to the new life of the children of God, and to the likeness of Christ reproduced in those whose fellowship is with the Father and the Son. The great Christian ideas are relative to the primary Christian gospel. 'Herein was the love of God manifested in us, that God hath sent His only begotten Son into the world, that we might live through Him.' In Jesus Christ Divine Love is expressed, communicated, and experienced.

There is, therefore, no 'was' or 'was not' about the Life, Death, and Resurrection of Jesus. It is.

---

## Literature.

### THE BACKGROUND OF THE OLD TESTAMENT.

It is characteristic of the modern approach to the Old Testament that scholars no longer consider it as an isolated phenomenon. It is generally recognized that it is one item in a great body of literature, and that the life and thought of Israel can be appreciated only when seen as a single element in the general *ensemble* of the ancient East. The result has been, not merely a better understanding of Hebrew Scripture, but a greatly enhanced appreciation of its value; and anything which helps us to a clearer picture of the world in which it was produced, deserves a warm welcome.

Two contributions to this type of study come to us from America. In the first, *The Assyrian and Hebrew Hymns of Praise* (Milford; 15s. net), Professor Charles Gordon Cumming, of Bangor, discusses one type of religious poetry as it appears in Mesopotamia and in Israel. Most of us tend to apply the word 'hymn' to any poem which may be used in worship, but, strictly speaking, it should be confined to songs of praise, and the studies in the present volume are concerned only with that particular kind of poem. The author emphasizes

the limitation by prefixing a short chapter on Hebrew Psalms which are not 'hymns.'

The last decade has seen a complete change in the technical discussion of the Psalter. The newer criticism is primarily due to Gunkel, but he has been ably followed by almost every scholar of repute who has dealt with the subject. Dr. Cumming's first chapter will give readers a rough outline of the modern approach, which is based on a new classification of the Psalms according to their actual place in worship, and on a scientific study of the form used for each type.

It has long been recognized that Hebrew religious poetry can be paralleled in striking fashion from the sacred literature of Egypt and of Mesopotamia. But Dr. Cumming has done the English-speaking world good service in demonstrating to us the similarity between the Mesopotamian 'hymns' and those of Israel. First he describes the Hebrew type, then the Mesopotamian, and, finally, compares the two. The heart of the book is to be found in the first chapter of this third section—'The literary form of the Assyrian and the Hebrew Hymns.' The parallels in thought which he notes in later chapters are not confined to 'hymns,' but may be found in all the sacred literature of the two peoples.

The work is enriched with copious extracts—indeed, the latter part of the book is nearly all quotation—and a Bibliography which includes references to all the Akkadian hymns yet published. The book is well produced (though with a few curious infelicities in printing), but the price seems excessive for a volume of this size which contains no foreign type, whether Hebrew or Akkadian.

The second book which we have to note as illustrating the background of the Old Testament is much larger and covers a far wider field. In 1902 Professor G. A. Barton published his 'Sketch of Semitic Origins,' a work whose combined learning and originality, courage and scholarship, stimulated many readers whom it did not convince. Thirty years more of patient study, of scientific research, and of balancing judgment, have given us this new volume—*Semitic and Hamitic Origins* (Milford; 17s. net). The area surveyed has expanded, and the enormous progress made by archæology has supplied a mass of material which was not available in the early years of the century. Some of the old conclusions have been discarded, some have been modified, some have been reinforced, and the result is one of the most valuable books we have yet had on this subject.

The book falls into two parts, of which the former (pp. 1-119) deals with racial and social problems, while the latter discusses the origin of Semitic and Hamitic religions. Anthropology, archæology, and philology (there are two illuminating philological charts at the end of the book) are made to contribute to the general treatment. Both Hamites and Semites are traced back to Northern Africa, but the two separated at an early period, and it is still true to say that the Semitic peoples originated in Arabia, since it was there that they developed their distinguishing characteristics. Thence, too, they spread northwards into the Fertile Crescent and south-eastwards into Abyssinia. In Asia they met and combined with other races, especially with a race of Central Asiatic origin, and, in southern Mesopotamia, with the Sumerians. Asia Minor presented a curious mixture of peoples, including a Mongoloid and several Indo-European strains, and in the north of the Fertile Crescent these mingled also with Semites. The social basis of the various groups is then discussed, with special attention to the forms of marriage prevalent, and it is interesting to observe that Dr. Barton gives good reasons for rejecting the view that the Semites were totemistic. He finds, for instance, that, while totemism is common in Egypt, it is never found in those nomes

whose religion shows them to have been formed originally by Semitic settlement.

The greater part of the book is devoted to the religious origins of the races concerned. Here we note the familiar progress from Animism to Polytheism, though we may wish that more stress had been laid on that intermediate stage of Polydæmonism which finds its best expression among Semitic peoples. Dr. Barton might have made a good deal more use of the fact that a number of terms, in some parts of the Semitic world applied to animistic types of spirit, have become elsewhere 'high gods'—'El' is a good illustration. But this is a small matter compared with the comprehensive and valuable survey of the whole field and the concise account of the chief deities worshipped. We note, for instance, that good use has been made of as much of the Ras Shamra material as was available when the book went to press. In some areas, as in southern Arabia, the problem of religious origins is comparatively simple. In others, particularly in Egypt and Babylonia, the intermingling of race-strains has produced a religious tangle which can be straightened out only with great difficulty. Readers will feel that Professor Barton's attempts to solve these problems are, on the whole, the most successful yet made.

It is in the last chapter that we realize the true purpose of the book. Here it is Yahweh who is discussed, and all that has gone before is seen as a preparation and a background for this theme. It is a little surprising to find that Dr. Barton, whose knowledge in all other parts of the field seems encyclopædic, makes no reference to G. R. Driver's exhaustive discussions of the Mesopotamian evidence for the name Yahweh. There is a further weakness in the contention that the name cannot have originated in a verb meaning 'to be,' since in Hebrew its middle radical is W, not Y, and the form should be YHYH, not YHWH. But, by hypothesis, the original Hebrew belonged to an Aramæan, not to a Canaanite or other Hebrew-speaking, stock, and in all forms of Aramaic the second radical of the verb stem is W, not Y. In other words, the Tetragrammaton may easily—almost inevitably—be derived from a verb 'to be,' if the original worshippers of Yahweh were Aramæans, and if the word is to be derived from a verb at all. In other respects Professor Barton's views on this item in his subject are those which are now most generally accepted—Yahweh was a Kenite deity, introduced by Moses to certain Israelite clans as their Redeemer, and adopted as their national God.

The book concludes with a brief outline of the

religious history of Israel, which is practically a summary of the author's 'Religion of Israel,' first published in 1918. The book as a whole must stand out as a notable contribution to the study of the Old Testament; it is not too much to say that we have here the crowning literary achievement of a great scholar's life.

---

*CIVITAS DEI.*

The present distracted and uncertain state of the world; the dubious prospects of the survival of Western civilization; the diagnosis of the trouble, and the suggestion of remedies—these topics have engaged the pens of numerous writers in recent months. Among all such literary efforts one at least deserves to be more than ephemeral; of only one do we feel any confidence in prophesying for it increase of attention and esteem as time passes. That one is *Civitas Dei*, by Mr. Lionel Curtis (Macmillan; 10s. 6d. net). It is one of those really great books which have the effect that Chapman's Homer had on Keats, and make one feel that he has been raised to a new summit affording new vistas; while the reviewer may well feel that it is most becoming to keep silence. Yet it is surely fitting that we should give our readers some idea of what the book is. Well, a sentence on the inside of the jacket is perfectly satisfactory in saying 'this book is an attempt to discover a guiding principle in public affairs.' Mr. Curtis's method is historical. He gives a succinct but most illuminating account of political developments since the first primitive communities became recognizably organized as States. In that development, he points out, the invention of writing was of fundamental importance. In more than one sense there could be no human history without writing. He traces political theory and institutions to the age when Jewish, Greek, and Roman elements interacted at the opening of the Christian era. Then appeared Jesus, who stood sharply opposed to the prevalent Jewish conception of the Kingdom of God, and proclaimed universal Love as man's duty and pledge of prosperity and security. His premature death prevented His disciples fully understanding Him, but fortunately some memory of His essential teaching was preserved. Unfortunately, Christianity became organized in a Church of such a kind as was the very antithesis of what Jesus meant it to be. But it is on the principles taught and exemplified by Jesus that any sure hope for the welfare and security, nay, the very existence, of what we mean by Society must rest.

Such in barest outline is Mr. Curtis's thesis. It is very nobly expressed, and very convincingly expounded and enforced.

No doubt there are points on which difference of opinion will be aroused. The historical judgments here and there may be a little facile or even fallacious. Certainly some will be a little shocked at the theology. But for its noble insistence on the applicability of the Sermon on the Mount to international affairs, and on the duty of each to all, and of all to each, we welcome it as one of the most truly Christian books which our time has produced.

---

*THE ANCIENT CHURCH AND SOCIETY.*

With his wonted clarity and cogency Professor Shirley Jackson Case of Chicago writes on *The Social Triumph of the Ancient Church* (Allen & Unwin; 6s. net). According to the 'jacket,' it is 'an admirable and most interesting outline for the intelligent layman.' We quite agree; only we should add that it is a book for all, and especially, perhaps, ministers, who are perplexed in the present world-situation, and as to the part that may be played by the Church in the present distress. The author begins by showing to what an extent in the ancient world the view prevailed that 'human welfare was the business of the Deity,' and yet how far, despite that, progress had been made with the thought that men might help one another. The pre-Christian philanthropies of the Roman Empire, for example, were very remarkable. Christianity, with philanthropy at its very heart, of course, soon became an easy first. Yet to attain supremacy in the ancient world, the Church was led to considerable modification of its primitive attitudes to various social phenomena. Wealth, social prestige, and the field of politics gradually became regarded no more as things simply to be ignored or even deprecated, but as things to be taken account of, and Christianized. The dangers were as great as they are obvious; and no one will maintain that the Christianization was complete; yet the task had to be attempted as soon as it was realized that the Lord was not to return within any measurable time. All this is set forth in most interesting manner with the sure touch of an authority upon the period. Finally, the author raises the question as to the present situation, and what light, if any, the study of the achievement of the ancient Church may cast upon it. He is guardedly optimistic. He warns against two things. First, against a too facile confidence in some easy way out, suggested by a few texts such as 'turning the other cheek.'

Our world after all is not the Roman Empire ; our world was not within the sight of the leaders of the Early Church. Our problem is far vaster and more complicated. Second, we must not on that account think that the story of the early conquest has nothing at all to teach us. What it teaches is that the old world was won first by trying to understand and do justice to it. Our task is difficult, so was that in early days. It took long for that victory to be won ; ours may take long too. Ministers must not be afraid of the petulant cry ' let the Church mind her own business ' and keep off social, industrial, or international problems. Let the Church speak her mind as she has it at the time, and in course of time she may come to have clear guidance. If society is to be Christianized, Christianity must become socialized.

#### EARLY CHRISTIAN WORSHIP.

The Rev. Alexander B. Macdonald, B.D., Ph.D., minister at Dron, in Perthshire, on the advice of Dr. Vernon Bartlet, has published his thesis for the Ph.D. degree under the title *Christian Worship in the Primitive Church* (T. & T. Clark ; 7s. 6d. net). It fills a gap in our literature on the subject, and fills it very admirably. Dr. Macdonald has attempted a new angle of approach in relating the worship of the first Christians to their spiritual experience. He gives a careful estimate of all the somewhat meagre evidence available, and shows how and why in worship charismatic spontaneity gradually gave place to standardization and regulation. Very valuable, it seems to us, is his emphasis on the freedom of primitive worship ; and his argument here will be appreciated specially by those who dread the growing tendency towards liturgical worship among communions whose tradition since the Reformation has been freedom. On the very difficult problem of the Lord's Supper in the New Testament, Dr. Macdonald's views will not probably command complete agreement ; but his book will at least have the merit of revealing that a problem really exists. His own view is that the words ' This do in remembrance of me ' were not spoken at the Last Supper. In consequence, the ' Breaking of Bread ' in pre-Pauline days was not definitely associated with the Lord's Death, but was a joyous meal. This conception was gradually mastered by the very different Pauline view. Very incisive and valuable is Dr. Macdonald's criticism of the notion that Paul owed much or, indeed, anything to the Mystery-religions. Altogether this is a sober

and scholarly work for which we bespeak wide attention.

#### MUSIC AND RELIGION.

The connexion of music and religion is so ancient and universal that no apology is needed for the production of a book which details the history of that association and discusses its meaning and scope.

Mr. Brian Wibberley, Mus.Bac., has written such a volume—*Music and Religion* (Epworth Press ; 10s. 6d. net)—divided into two parts : Historical and Philosophical. Both parts are encyclopædic. Part I. begins with the place of music in primitive and savage religions, and includes ancient tribal music and the music of the old polytheistic religions of Egypt, China, India, Greece, and Rome. He omits in this category any account of the music of the Sumerians and Babylonians, contenting himself with a five-line reference to Jubal in the chapter on the music of the Hebrews. The latter is treated naturally with some fulness, but the music of the Muhammadan is only allocated two pages and with rather an inadequate reference to the Adan. The value of these early chapters would have been greatly increased had the publishers found room for a few examples of ancient religious melodies.

The author then tackles at much greater length the music of the Christian religion, dividing his subject into three eras which he calls Ancient, Mediæval, and Modern. He emphasizes that the Reformation was the turning-point in the history of Christian hymnody which then became congregational. Hitherto the music of the Church was almost exclusively the preserve of the clergy. This, of course, might be said of every detail of the church service, as is inevitable in any system of priesthood.

In the chapter on the music of modern English-speaking churches Mr. Wibberley discusses various hymnologies. He lays greatest stress on the Methodist collections. This perhaps is fair, for Wesleyan Methodism sang itself into being.

A chapter is then devoted to specialized forms of sacred music : the Carol, the Motet, the Cantata, the Oratorio, etc. The encyclopædic character of the volume is especially marked in this concluding section of the historical survey.

Division II. is critical and philosophical, and the attempt is made to analyse the essential elements in religious music and assess their significance. Many shrewd things are said in the matter of

church choirs and organs. 'The organist's function,' says Mr. Wibberley, 'is truly "priestly": to him are given the keys to open and to shut.' 'The organ is an adornment and not a necessity in Church worship.' 'Organ solo music should be a chastened offering—an invitation and inspiration to worship.' 'The Anthem is a musical commentary on a chosen sacred text.' 'To sing a great hymn in a great way is an act that people should intelligently and assiduously cultivate.' Those and other *bon mots* are under a sub-section titled *Desiderata*. We entirely agree with Mr. Wibberley, but cannot help wishing that when he refers to the church organ as 'the king of instruments' he would frame the phrase in inverted commas.

---

We have received *Life and Soul: Outlines of a Future Theoretical Physiology and of a Critical Philosophy*, by Mr. Max Loewenthal (Allen & Unwin; 8s. 6d. net). It is well written and illustrated with diagrams chiefly of the brain and nervous system. Some of the conclusions are comforting to Christian faith: the criticism of the mechanistic view of man, or of Huxleian 'epiphenomenalism,' seems to us convincing; and we are glad to be assured by so exact and learned a scientist that, on the question of immortality, 'science is as incompetent to deal with this subject and to affirm or deny as is philosophy or ordinary common sense. So much is sure, that there is nothing in the whole of science to blast the hopes of those who yearn for a continuance of conscious existence.' Yet the book on the whole, we fear, will be profitably perused only by the rather limited number who have considerable knowledge of physiology, recent physics, the problem of the mind's relation to body and the main philosophical systems.

---

Mr. J. E. Turner, M.A., Ph.D., of Liverpool, has rapidly established a distinctive position for himself as one of our ablest philosophical writers, and he promises to be one of our most voluminous. He has produced within a remarkably short period some half-dozen important works. His latest is *Essentials in the Development of Religion* (Allen & Unwin; 12s. 6d. net). If to some considerable extent it owes something to his former works and specially to 'Personality and Reality,' nevertheless the reader who is unacquainted with them will be at no great disadvantage. If anything, it is perhaps

even more lucid in style than its predecessors. It cannot fairly be called a philosophy of religion, but it goes far toward being so. It supplies what we now see to be the worst defect of the fine work of the late Professor Galloway, in emphasizing the value of psychological investigation. At the same time it points out the unsatisfactory nature of the result if psychological discussions on religious phenomena tend to divert attention from what after all must constitute the fundamental bases of religion. Dr. Turner's study is therefore 'philosophical and psychological,' and the order of the two epithets is significant. It strikes us as a very competent and suggestive treatment.

---

The 'Swarthmore Lecture' is an annual event, delivered by different persons on the eve of the Friends' Yearly Meeting. It is intended as an exposition of the standpoint of the Society of Friends on public questions, particularly in the light of religion. The latest was delivered this year by Professor George B. Jeffery, F.R.S., Astor Professor of Mathematics in the University of London, and is entitled *Christ, Yesterday and To-Day* (Allen & Unwin; cloth 2s. 6d. net, paper 1s. 9d. net). The book has that air of sweet reasonableness which seems to be the special characteristic of the Quaker spirit. It is pleasant to read, friendly, restrained, very appealing. And, if there is no definite contribution to our theological thinking, it is at least very interesting to hear a Professor of Mathematics say what he believes. 'My Faith' is the title of the last chapter, and among his closing words is a sentence that sums up his choice book: 'Be these things as they may, I believe that Jesus lives and that he is the Christ.'

---

The 'Angus Heresy Case,' which brought an able and distinguished Professor before the New South Wales Assembly, is the occasion of a volume in which the heretic states his position and defends his teaching. The title is *Truth and Tradition*, a Plea for Practical and Vital Religion and for a Reinterpretation of Ancient Theologies, by the Rev. Professor S. Angus, M.A., D.D., D.Litt., Ph.D. (Australian Book Company, London; 4s. 6d. net). The book contains, in an expanded form, the substance of the speech Dr. Angus made in reply to the heresy charge. It traverses the whole ground of the traditional Christian creed, and many people who have been interested in the case will probably be surprised by the radical character of the views here expressed. Professor Angus's creed is an emphatically Modernist one, and, as an expression

of this standpoint, his book will receive respectful consideration.

A book of apologetic that is directed to the plain man is *Christianity and Modern Life*: Through Nature to God and Christ, by the Rev. G. Ferries, D.D. (James Clarke; 6s. net). Dr. Ferries thinks that much is to be found in Nature to confirm the Christian faith, and illustrate it. We cannot conscientiously say that the argument impresses us deeply as apologetic. But Dr. Ferries has read widely, and uses his reading to good purpose, providing many apt illustrations of spiritual realities. And there is a downright sincerity in his book that will please his readers.

*The Book of the Throne*, by Mr. G. W. West (Marshall, Morgan & Scott; 2s. 6d. net), is a detailed exposition of the Apocalypse. The writer is one of those people whose minds are never troubled by doubts or perplexities. He insists that the Book of Revelation must either be accepted as verbally inspired or wholly rejected as an imposture. 'No one has ever yet discovered a middle ground here. To apply to this book the dictum, so profanely made and so glibly repeated, that the Bible is not the Word of God, but contains the Word of God, would be, in this case at any rate, to make God a liar, and to forfeit one's part in the Book (tree) of life and in the holy city.' One can only ponder with amazement the spirit which can so cheerfully assign fellow-Christians to perdition. Following upon this insistence on verbal inspiration the writer proceeds to make free with the words of the book. The four-and-twenty elders are mystical, the riders are partly persons and partly personifications, the dragon is Herod, the flood that helped the woman is 'political forces.' One fails to see what is the use of a doctrine of verbal inspiration which permits such liberties to be taken with the Divine words.

*Jesus as the Women knew Him*, by Mr. H. G. Tunnicliff (Nicholson & Watson; 6s. net), is a book that many will read with interest and profit. It is always a daring venture to retell the gospel story, putting the narrative into the lips of this one and that one who had some part in the events that happened. Such dramatic reconstructions have often grievously offended against Christian good taste and feeling. Mr. Tunnicliff, however, has been wonderfully successful in his attempt. It is a record of what might be called personal testimonies by fourteen women who in various ways

came into contact with Jesus. Much the longest narrative is put into the lips of Mary His mother. Some of the others, such as the Woman of Samaria and the wife of Pontius Pilate, are quite brief. The text of the Gospels is closely followed, and the imaginative details which are brought in to fill the picture are given with commendable restraint. It is a book that will make the gospel story live afresh and touch chords in many hearts. It is commended in an interesting foreword by Dr. Maude Royden.

A very thoughtful and extremely able book comes to us from the Rev. A. T. Cadoux, D.D.—*A New Orthodoxy of Jesus and Personality* (Nicholson & Watson; 5s. net). It is probably the best book Dr. Cadoux has written. At the outset one gets an impression of vagueness. We wander about, certainly in very high regions but in somewhat thin air. But this impression fades as we go on. We are conscious of listening to one who is thinking his way through the big questions of faith, and at various points we find real help coming to us on matters that are perplexing enough. Two examples are his argument for the historical trustworthiness of the gospel picture of Jesus, and his discussion of the difficulty raised for faith by evil and suffering. The book is not orthodox in the accepted sense. But it is positive and in the best sense edifying. No one who can say of Jesus that 'He is, not only entirely divine, but the consummate concentration of the divine, unique throughout the whole range of being' should think of himself as a heretic. The main positions of the book are that the reality of God is implied in all our activity, and especially in our moral activity, and that this faith is reinforced by the goodness of Jesus, which also gives content to our faith in God. We are impressed by the thinking in this book as well as by the earnest and sincere spirit of the writer.

The Guild of Health, a body formed some twenty-five years ago to help the churches to understand and practise the principles of spiritual healing on the basis of the Christian faith, recently held a round table conference on the subject. Many different points of view were represented at the table, and two members of the conference were nominated to put into printed form the conclusions that were more or less unanimously reached. The result is *Spiritual Healing: A Critical Appreciation*, by the Rev. Malcolm Spencer, M.A., and the Rev. H. W. Workman, M.A. (S.C.M.; 2s. 6d. net). There are two appendices: 'A Psychologist's Comment,' by the Rev. F. E. England, and 'A Doctor's Comment,'

by Dr. J. Burnett Rac. The main point of the book is that spiritual healing is the renewal of the whole personality, but many aspects of the subject are dealt with, such as the relation of spiritual healing to mental treatment, and its relations to the subconscious. The whole treatment is sane, Christian, and experimental, and the book ought to be read and seriously considered by Christian people. We like very much the 'Psychologist's Comment,' in which the writer says that 'the movement of the Spirit of God is at work in the garden, in the operating theatre, and in the psychologist's consulting room,' meaning that spiritual healing is continuous with all other forms of healing.

The Student Christian Movement Press are publishing well-known works in a series called 'Religion and Life Books' at the price of 1s. net. This is an excellent venture, and we wish it every success. The series up to date includes *The Religion of Jesus*, by Toyohiko Kagawa; *Moral Adventure*, by Canon B. H. Streeter, D.D.; *A Gentleman in Prison: The Story of Tokichi Ishii*, translated by Miss Caroline Macdonald; *Christ's Revelation of God*, by the Archbishop of York; and *The Assurance of Immortality*, by the Rev. H. E. Fosdick, D.D. There also appears in the Series *Child Psychology and Religious Education*, by the Rev. Dorothy F. Wilson, to which attention was drawn last month.

## The Heretics of the Church and Recurring Heresies.

### Montanus.

BY THE REVEREND JOHN S. WHALE, M.A., THE PRESIDENT, CHESHUNT COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE.

τὸ ἐλεεινὸν ἀνθρώπιον Μοντανὸς.

(Epiph. *Panarion*, 48. 11.)

'One of the holiest men of the second century.'

JOHN WESLEY.

MARK PATTISON said of satire that to be real it must exaggerate, but that it is always an exaggeration of known and recognized facts. Satire never creates the sentiment to which it appeals.

Many classic heresies in Christian history are patient of a like interpretation. Appealing to truth held in common by all the faithful they place disproportionate emphasis on a part, and so distort the whole; heresy is exaggeration rather than innovation. The menace of Marcion, *ipso Paulo paulinior*, lay in his exaggerated Paulinism; the confident moralism of Pelagius threatened the very genius of Christianity as the religion of redemption; and Arianism itself is mainly the illegitimate *reductio ad absurdum* of the legitimate subordinationism of Origen and the East.

Indeed, such distortions repeatedly take their rise as reactions against dreaded error. Marcion feared the threatened eclipse of Paulinism; Arianism dreaded Sabellianism and the pantheism which expresses its implicit logic; Pelagius rightly feared the loss to the faith of the Hebraic emphasis on the will and on moral realities.

I. *The Sect Type*.—Montanism, or, more accurately, 'the heresy of the Phrygians,' who 'crawled over Asia and Phrygia like venomous reptiles

boasting of the Paraclete Montanus and of the women in his train, Prisca and Maximilla, inasmuch as they had been his prophetesses,'<sup>1</sup> provides an early and dramatic example of just such an exaggerated reaction. Its historical importance may easily be over-estimated (Gnosticism constituted a far more dangerous crisis in the Early Church), and, as Labriolle<sup>2</sup> complains, it has been over-dramatized by many historians; yet this is natural enough, and for two related reasons.

First of all Montanism is the classic example of the sect-type destined to reappear constantly in the history of the Church from that day to this. From 1 Corinthians onwards emphasis on the charismatic gifts, though a sign of life and power, opens the door with notorious ease to an unbalanced subjectivity; and Montanism is rightly regarded as the prototype of those many religious revivals which have become separatist movements thanks to their disapproval of the Church as established, and their restless sense of the contrast between empirical and ideal Christianity.

Starting with the promises and apocalyptic visions of Scripture, nourished on the great word

<sup>1</sup> Eus., *H.E.* v. 14-16.

<sup>2</sup> *Les Sources de l'histoire du Montanisme* (1913), a collection and translation of all the passages in early writers which refer to the movement.

*La Crise Montaniste* (1913), the fullest and most authoritative work on the subject.