

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



*Buy me a coffee*

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



**PATREON**

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

**PayPal**

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for the *London Quarterly Review* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_london-quarterly-and-holborn-review\\_01.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_london-quarterly-and-holborn-review_01.php)

JULY,

1898,

THE  
LONDON QUARTERLY  
REVIEW.

---

No. CLXXX.—New Series, No. 60.

---

**Contents.**

- I. THE LATEST LIGHT ON THE PRACTICAL INFLUENCE OF  
PUSEYISM WITHIN THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND.
- II. A NEW DICTIONARY OF THE BIBLE.
- III. A FLOWER-HUNTER IN QUEENSLAND.
- IV. THE INDWELLING GOD.
- V. THE GREAT MAN THEORY OF PROGRESS.
- VI. SIDE LIGHTS ON METHODISM.
- VII. APOSTOLICAL SUCCESSION: THE LATEST NONCON-  
FORMIST MANIFESTO.
- VIII. PICTURESQUE SICILY.
- IX. MR. GLADSTONE AS A RELIGIOUS TEACHER.
- X. MRS. STOWE'S "LIFE AND LETTERS."
- XI. IRISH LEGISLATION.
- XII. SHORT REVIEWS AND BRIEF NOTICES.
- XIII. SUMMARIES OF FOREIGN PERIODICALS.

---

London:

CHARLES H. KELLY, 2, CASTLE ST., CITY RD., E.C.;  
AND 26, PATERNOSTER ROW, E.C.

1898.

*Price Four Shillings.*

# THE CHRISTIAN INTERPRETATION OF LIFE, AND OTHER ESSAYS.

By Rev. W. T. DAVISON, M.A., D.D.,

Author of "The Praises of Israel," "The Christian Conscience," &c.

Post 8vo. 4s. 6d.

## CONTENTS.

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| I. The Christian Interpretation of Life. | VI. Christianity and Greek Thought.                |
| II. The Great Enigma and its Answer.     | VII. The Evidential Value of Christian Experience. |
| III. The Seat of Authority in Religion.  | VIII. The Service of Man—Positivist and Christian. |
| IV. Christian Philosophy of Religion.    | IX. Problems in Christian Ethics.                  |
| V. The Foundations of Christian Faith.   | X. The Realisation of Christian Unity.             |

"An exceedingly able and instructive criticism from the orthodox standpoint. He brings to his topics not only a thorough grasp of the points in discussion, but a general literary culture and an epigrammatic force of expression which make it a real pleasure to read him."—*Christian World*.

## NEW VOLUME OF BOOKS FOR BIBLE STUDENTS. STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE RELIGION.

By Rev. A. S. GEDEN, M.A.,

Author of "Exercises for Translation into Hebrew."

Small crown 8vo. 2s. 6d.

### CONTENTS.

- |                        |                             |
|------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Origins.               | Muhammadanism.              |
| Egypt.                 | The Qurân.                  |
| Babylonia and Assyria. | Doctrines and Developments. |
| Zoroastrianism.        |                             |

"Presents the result of wide research in a readable and attractive form. The book is remarkably well informed, and it cannot fail to be useful as an introduction to this wide and growing subject."—*Glasgow Herald*.

## HELPS HEAVENWARD. SECOND SERIES.

### SAINTS OF CHRIST.

By T. F. LOCKYER, B.A.,

Author of "The Inspirations of the Christian Life," "The Gospel of St. John, an Exposition," &c.

Crown 12mo, art linen, gilt top, 1s. 6d.

### CONTENTS.

- |                                |                                      |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| I. Sainthood.                  | VII. The Heritage of Saints.         |
| II. The Calling of the Saints. | VIII. The Temptations of the Saints. |
| III. The King of Saints.       | IX. Sainthood and Suffering.         |
| IV. Sainthood and Sin.         | X. The Faith of Saints.              |
| V. The Quest of the Saints.    | XI. The Triumph of the Saints.       |
| VI. The Fellowship of Saints.  | XII. Sainthood made Perfect.         |

"Thorough, practical and stimulating."—*Sunday School Chronicle*.

"The treatment of the subject is clear and sensible. Mr. Lockyer's idea of sainthood is thoroughly Biblical and therefore human."—*Hastings and St. Leonards Times*.

LONDON: CHARLES H. KELLY, 2, CASTLE STREET, CITY ROAD, E.C.;

AND 26, PATERNOSTER ROW, E.C.

# CONTENTS.

---

	PAGE
<b>ART. I.—THE LATEST LIGHT ON THE PRACTICAL INFLUENCE OF PUSEYISM WITHIN THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND . . .</b>	<b>205</b>
1. "Life of Edward Bouverie Pusey." By HENRY PARRY LIDDON, D.D. Edited and prepared for publication by the Rev. J. O. JOHNSTON, M.A., the Rev. ROBERT J. WILSON, D.D., and the Rev. CANON NEWBOLT. Vol. IV. Longmans, Green & Co.	
2. "Life and Letters of William John Butler, late Dean of Lincoln and sometime Vicar of Wantage." Macmillan & Co.	
3. "The Secret History of the Oxford Movement." By WALTER WALSH. Swan, Sonnenschein & Co.	
4. "The Anglican Revival." By J. H. OVERTON, D.D. Blackie & Son.	
<b>ART. II.—A NEW DICTIONARY OF THE BIBLE . . . . .</b>	<b>225</b>
"A Dictionary of the Bible:" Dealing with its Language, Literature and Contents, including the Biblical Theology. Edited by JAMES HASTINGS, M.A., D.D., with the assistance of J. A. SELBIE, M.A.; and, chiefly in the revision of the proofs, of A. B. DAVIDSON, D.D., S. R. DRIVER, D.D., and H. B. SWETE, D.D. Vol. I., A. to FEASTS. T. & T. Clark. 1898.	
<b>ART. III.—A FLOWER-HUNTER IN QUEENSLAND . . . . .</b>	<b>247</b>
"A Flower-Hunter in Queensland and New Zealand." By Mrs. ROWAN. With Map and Illustrations. London: John Murray. 1898.	
<b>ART. IV.—THE INDWELLING GOD . . . . .</b>	<b>256</b>
"Divine Immanence." An Essay on the Spiritual Significance of Matter. By J. R. ILLINGWORTH, M.A. Macmillan & Co.	
<b>ART. V.—THE GREAT MAN THEORY OF PROGRESS . . . . .</b>	<b>265</b>
1. "Aristocracy and Evolution." By W. H. MALLOCK. London: A. and C. Black. 1898.	
2. "The Will to Believe and other Essays in Popular Philosophy." By WILLIAM JAMES, Professor of Psychology in Harvard University. London: Longmans. 1897.	

	PAGE
ART. VI.—SIDE LIGHTS ON METHODISM . . . . .	278
<p>"Side Lights on the Conflicts of Methodism during the Second Quarter of the Nineteenth Century, 1827-1852." Taken chiefly from the Notes of the late Rev. Joseph Fowler of the Debates in the Wesleyan Conference. A Centenary Contribution to the Constitutional History of Methodism. With a Biographical Sketch. By BENJAMIN GREGORY, D.D. Cassell and Company.</p>	
ART. VII.—APOSTOLICAL SUCCESSION: THE LATEST NONCONFORMIST MANIFESTO . . . . .	289
<p>1. "Apostolic Succession in the Light of History and Fact. The Congregational Union Lecture for 1897." By JOHN BROWN, B.A., D.D. Congregational Union. 1898.</p> <p>2. "Ministerial Priesthood: Chapters (preliminary to the study of the Ordinal) on the Rationale of the Ministry and the Meaning of the Christian Priesthood." By R. C. MOBERLY, D.D., Regius Professor of Pastoral Theology in the University of Oxford. John Murray. 1897.</p> <p>3. "St. Paul's Epistle to the Ephesians. A Practical Exposition." By CHARLES GORE, M.A., D.D. John Murray. 1898.</p>	
ART. VIII.—PICTURESQUE SICILY . . . . .	302
<p>"Picturesque Sicily." By WILLIAM AGNEW PATON. London and New York: Harper and Brothers. 1898.</p>	
ART. IX.—MR. GLADSTONE AS A RELIGIOUS TEACHER . . . . .	315
ART. X.—MRS. STOWE'S "LIFE AND LETTERS" . . . . .	326
<p>"Life and Letters of Harriet Beecher Stowe." Edited by ANNIE FIELDS. London: Sampson Low, Marston and Company (Limited). 1898.</p>	
ART. XI.—IRISH LEGISLATION . . . . .	336
<p>1. "A Bill for Amending the Law relating to Local Government in Ireland and for other purposes connected therewith." 1898.</p> <p>2. "Report of Her Majesty's Commissioners of Inquiry into the Procedure and Practice and the Methods of Valuation followed by the Land Commission, the Land Judges Court, and the Civil Bill Courts in Ireland under the Land Acts and the Land Purchase Acts." 1898.</p>	

3. "Report of the Recess Committee on the Establishment of a Department of Agriculture and Industries for Ireland." Second Edition. T. F. Unwin. 1896.
4. "A Bill for Establishing a Department and a Board for the purpose of promoting Agriculture and other Industries in Ireland, 1897; a Bill to afford Facilities for the Establishment and Development of Industries in Ireland, 1897."
5. "The Saving of Ireland, Industrial, Financial, Political." By Sir GEORGE BADEN-POWELL, K.C.M.G., M.P., &c. William Blackwood and Sons. 1898.
6. "The Irish Grand Jury System." By E. A. HACKETT, M.E., M.I.C.E. P. S. King and Son. 1898.

## XII.—SHORT REVIEWS AND BRIEF NOTICES.

*Theology and Apologetics.*—Davison's Christian Interpretation of Life—Gladden's Christian Pastor and Working Church—Macpherson's Christian Dogmatics—Milligan and Moulton's Gospel of St. John—Forrest's Christ of History and Experience—Somerville's St. Paul's Conception of Christ—Gullick's Growth of Kingdom of God—Wright's New Testament Problems—Blass's Philology of the Gospels—Wilkinson's Early History of the Gospels—Beet's Last Things—Moule's Colossian Studies and the Cross and the Spirit—Moulton's Modern Reader's Bible: Psalms and Lamentations—Skinner's Isaiah, chapters 40-56—Horton's Women of the Old Testament—Whyte's Bible Characters—Watson's Companions of the Sorrowful Way—Bigg's Confessions of St. Augustine—Cheetham's Mysteries, Pagan and Papal—Watts's Letters from Heaven and Penitent Pilgrim—Church's Village Sermons—Jackson's Ten Commandments—Mackenzie's Christianity and Progress of Man—Foxell's In a Plain Path—James's Our Boys—Andrews' Yet—In Answer to Prayer—Moule's Our Prayer Book—Forbes's God's Measure—Jowett's From Strength to Strength—Exell's Biblical Illustrator: St. John's Epistles, Revelation—Mackail's Eversley Bible—Gibbs' Bible References of John Ruskin—Playfair's Nicetical Christ—Lamb's Elector, King and Priest—Lilley's Principles of Protestantism . . . . .

	PAGE
<i>History, Biography, Travel</i> —Pullan's History of Early Christianity—History of Kingswood School—Allen and McClure's History of the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge—Hair's Regent Square—Williams's Britain's Naval Power—Hay's Lines from My Log-Books—Shadwell's Lockhart's Advance through Tirah—Life of Norman Macleod, Senr.—Adamson's Life of James Morison—Willard's My Happy Half Century—Willert's Mirabeau—Harris's Life in an old English Town—Vince's John Bright—Whyte's Father John—Father John's My Life in Christ—Whyte's Teresa—Bell's Christina Rossetti—Calderwood's David Hume—Ernest R. Balfour—Douglas' Arctic Expeditions—Synge's Brave Men and Brave Deeds—Williamson's Gladstone—Ramsay's Everyday Life in Turkey—Mallinson's Methodism in Huddersfield—Symond's Renaissance in Italy—Reade's The Cloister and the Hearth . . . . .	371
<i>Belles Lettres</i> —Ruskin's Art and Pleasures of England—Mrs. Ward's Helbeck of Bannisdale—Fowler's Isabel Carnaby—Wesleyan Sunday School Union Publications—Keble's Christian Year—Stevenson's Lowden Sabbath Morn—Girdlestone's Thoughts from Keats—Wilson's Leaders in Literature—Fenn's Woman worth Winning—Cornhill Magazine—Century Magazine—St. Nicholas . . . . .	389
<i>Miscellaneous</i> —Tyack's Book about Bells—Friend's Bygone Devonshire—Andrew's Bygone Hertfordshire—Feasey's Ancient English Holy Week Ceremonial—Armitage-Smith's Free Trade Movement—Holman's English National Education—Murray's Oxford English Dictionary—Titchener's Primer of Psychology—Religious Tract Society's Publications—What is Socialism?—Cunningham's Western Civilisation in its Economic Aspects—Greswell's British Colonies—Fisher's Cathedral Church of Hereford—Routledge's St. Martin's, Canterbury—Cundall and Step's Every-day Book of Natural History—Ellis's Christ in Shakespeare—Extinction of War—Pain's Englishmen, Israelites—Johnson's Geographical Handbook to Africa—New Zealand Year Book and Statistics . . . . .	393
XIII.—SUMMARIES OF FOREIGN PERIODICALS—French, Italian . . . . .	400
INDEX . . . . .	401

# THE LONDON QUARTERLY REVIEW.

---

JULY, 1898.

---

## ART. I.—THE LATEST LIGHT ON THE PRACTICAL INFLUENCE OF PUSEYISM WITHIN THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND.

1. *Life of Edward Bouverie Pusey.* By HENRY PARRY LIDDON, D.D. Edited and prepared for publication by the Rev. J. O. JOHNSTON, M.A., the Rev. ROBERT J. WILSON, D.D., and the Rev. CANON NEWBOLT. Vol. IV. Longmans, Green & Co.
2. *Life and Letters of William John Butler, late Dean of Lincoln and sometime Vicar of Wantage.* Macmillan & Co.
3. *The Secret History of the Oxford Movement.* By WALTER WALSH. Swan, Sonnenschein & Co.
4. *The Anglican Revival.* By J. H. OVERTON, D.D. Blackie & Son.

THE difficult and thorny task which Canon Liddon set himself, and of which he was able to accomplish the greater part, has now been brought to a close. The [NO. CLXXX.]—NEW SERIES, VOL. XXX. NO. 2. O



biographer proposed to arrange his work under four heads—the Preparation, the Movement, the Struggle, the Victory. This fourth volume of Dr. Pusey's life may be taken to represent the Victory, although the men on whom Liddon's mantle has fallen admit that "to a considerable extent it is still only a record of conflict and endurance." The Christian world is now able to form an accurate estimate of what Liddon styled the Victory.

"In the dark years between 1846 and 1860, Dr. Pusey was engaged in convincing his fellow-countrymen that, in spite of all assertions and appearances to the contrary, the teaching which specially characterised the Tractarians was true to the traditions of the English Church. Already by the year 1860 the soundness of this claim was beginning to be acknowledged on all sides; and Catholic teaching was emerging once for all from under the dark clouds of suspicion and obloquy which the defection of so many friends had caused to gather round it. Indeed, so completely had the honesty of the Tractarian position been vindicated, that Dr. Pusey found himself able, without forfeiting the growing confidence in his sincerity, to make open proposals for union with Rome, which, ten years earlier, would have been regarded as the last act of treachery. And as time goes on the Victory, to which Dr. Pusey's patient endurance so materially contributed, becomes more and more apparent; and to-day the Archbishops of England, in addressing 'the whole body of Bishops of the Catholic Church' are able to assume, as part of the undisputed heritage of the English Church, such doctrines as the Apostolical Succession and the Sacrificial Aspect of the Holy Eucharist, which fifty years ago were generally branded with all the discredit that belonged to the hated word Tractarian."

We are among those who still regard Pusey's proposals for union with Rome as "the last act of treachery," and the pitiful story related in this volume will not avail to vindicate his credit either as an ecclesiastical statesman or an honest Englishman. Yet his biographers invite us to overlook all defects in their work, "in recognition of the honesty, the insight, the courage and the patience of this most loyal son of the English Church." What the Church and the world wanted to know was whether the indictment brought by Dr. Rigg in this REVIEW and in his *Oxford High Anglicanism*, and by many other students and critics, was true.

Readers of this last volume of the *Life* will find that the indictment stands wholly unrefuted. Nothing that Dr. Rigg said has been contradicted ; Pusey's weaknesses are here passed over *sub silentio*, and his extravagances in penitential discipline for himself and others are ignored. No attempt is made to rebut the fatal conclusions involved in the whole tissue of evidence. There is no doubt that Pusey was a good man in his way, as a Roman Catholic devotee is not seldom a truly religious man, but when we consider his influence on the Church of England he must be pronounced a traitor to its spirit and traditions. Additional evidence on this subject is given by Mr. Walsh's *Secret History of the Oxford Movement*, a book of the most authentic kind, which brings out in close array a host of undeniable and most discreditable facts, and, both as to Newman and Pusey, reveals a depth of subtlety and a habitual practice of reserve amounting to deception, such as had been suspected previously and on grave, if not conclusive, evidence, but which now stands forth on evidence that cannot be refuted—the secret and authentic history of the parties themselves. The total view obtainable of the High Ritualistic confederation has been made yet more complete by the publication of the *Life and Letters of Dean Butler, sometime Vicar of Wantage*. Here we find self-revealed the high and dry Puseyite, who has little or no sympathy with his Master's experimental religion or with certain Methodist tendencies which were mixed up with Pusey's heterogeneous doctrine. With him the whole matter was summed up in the priestly word of command, and the implicit and unreasoning obedience of baptised followers. That inward experience on which devout Methodists, and not a few devout Puseyites, have placed the most comforting and invigorating reliance for the peace of their souls and the strengthening of their faith and testimony, is with Dean Butler a matter of scorn. Methodist experience, in particular, he regarded with contempt.

Taking these three volumes together and adding them to what was previously known of the Tractarian leaders, and

in particular of Pusey, the chief leader, the orthodox Christian public of England is now in a position to define and pronounce its final judgment as to the movement which has gone so far in England towards wiping out from the teaching of High Churchmen the most precious truths of the New Testament in regard to the experience of personal salvation, and in degrading to the level of servile and superstitious task-work the glorious testimony of the Gospel of Christ, obscuring and often obliterating all traces of that liberty which Christ came to make known to the redeemed children of men.

On September 12th, 1865, Pusey and Newman, who had not seen each other for twenty years, met at Keble's rectory. Newman had put off his visit when he found that Pusey would be at Hursley the same day, as he feared that the double meeting would be more than he could bear. But when he stepped into the train from Birmingham to Reading he felt that it seemed like cowardice to shrink from the meeting. Next morning, therefore, he appeared unexpectedly at Hursley. Keble was at his door, speaking to a friend.

"He did not know me," says Newman, "and asked my name. What was more wonderful, since I had purposely come to his house, I did not know him, and I feared to ask who it was. I gave him my card without speaking. When at length we found out each other, he said, with that tender flurry of manner which I recollected so well, that his wife had been seized with an attack of her complaint that morning, and that he could not receive me as he should have wished to do, nor, indeed, had he expected me: 'for Pusey,' he whispered, 'is in the house as you are aware.' Then he brought me into his study and embraced me most affectionately, and said he would go and prepare Pusey and send him to me."

The three men spent four or five hours together, talking "comfortably," to use Pusey's phrase, "about past, present and future."

Keble caught at such words of Newman's as seemed to show agreement with Pusey's views, and when Newman said that had he still been a member of Oxford University

he must have voted against Gladstone because he was giving up the Irish Establishment, Keble whispered, "And is not that just?" "It left the impression on my mind," says Newman, "that he had no great sympathy with the Establishment in Ireland as an Establishment, and was favourable to the Church of the Irish." Pusey had already reprinted the notorious Tract XC. by Newman's express permission. He wrote, "the obloquy on Tract XC. is a grave scandal to our principles. Dearest N. has rehabilitated himself as honest; I want to show that the judgment was precipitate." His biographers think that to Pusey the meeting at Hursley must have seemed like an omen that his hopes of reunion between the Church of England and the Church of Rome would be realised.

A week later Pusey wrote to Mr. Gladstone that he hoped to arrange a meeting with the non-extreme party before the Synod to be held in Rome the following year. He was afraid that many moderate men might have been removed from the Episcopal bench during the past fifteen years, but added, "My hope, however, is not in many, but that it is God the Holy Ghost, the Author of Peace and Concord, who is putting into people's hearts to wish to be one." Pusey had just written his First *Eirenicon* in reply to Manning's attack on the Church of England. This was

"a vindication of the claims of the English Church to be a portion of the Catholic Church in doctrine and Sacraments, and a detailed exposition of those portions of the Roman system which in Pusey's mind compelled the continued separation between England and Rome."

A month after his interview with Pusey he visited France to bring this *Eirenicon* under the notice of the Roman Catholic bishops. He met with rebuffs in some quarters, the Bishop of La Val even suggesting that he was kept from joining Rome by mere secular considerations, but after two interviews with the Archbishop of Paris, he wrote to Bishop Forbes: "The first stone is, I trust, laid on which the two Churches may be again united—when God wills and when human wills obey." Meanwhile he was a witness of many

sights that might have disillusionised a wiser man. In the Cathedral at Chartres, while evening service was being chanted, he observed little children being taught to kneel before and to kiss a handsomely dressed Madonna with brilliant glass eyes. At Rouen a range of double tablets ran along the whole length of the church bearing the legend: "I called upon Mary and she heard me." The Archbishop of Paris, Pusey says, "was surprised and pleased when I told him that I acknowledged the Primacy. He owned that the relations to Rome involved in the Supremacy were very different from what they were." Pusey felt that the Archbishop's manifest interest in the subject was the first stone of the proposed union. But he soon discovered that he had been too sanguine.

Newman kept silence as to the Eirenicon, but when Pusey contrived to draw out his opinion, he found that Newman regarded the letters as an attack on the cult of the Virgin. Pusey replied that his quotations had been taken from writers of weight.

"I thought, 'There it is; if any of it is disowned, it is a gain.' I thought that everything was published under authority, so that nothing could be likened to the ravings of Spurgeon, who represents nobody but himself, and belongs to himself and to nobody else. I thought none of the system of the Blessed Virgin had been *de fide*, and this is what I wished to be said by your authorities indirectly."

When the *Weekly Register* published a favourable review of his Eirenicon, Pusey wrote to thank the editor. He added,

"We readily recognise the Primacy of the Bishop of Rome; the bearings of that Primacy on other local Churches we believe to be a matter of ecclesiastical, not of Divine law; but neither is there anything in the Supremacy itself to which we should object."

This letter gave great and natural offence to Pusey's friends. He also found that, despite some smooth words, Rome was really uncompromising. Newman, indeed, pointed out that no one or two men, however great, could expect any

answer from her save "Submit to the Church, become one of us—that is your duty—and nothing more has to be said." Newman avowed that he could never have been induced to take Pusey's position: "I should say myself, 'The Roman Communion is either the Church or it is not; if it is not, don't seek to join it,—if it is, don't bargain with it—beggars must not be choosers.'" Pusey felt it necessary to vindicate himself. He rejoined that if he believed the Roman Church to be *the* Church, he would not dream of making an enquiry or a condition, but would submit as a little child.

"I feel no individual need to be in union with Rome, but I do feel the evils of division; and so I wanted a *πρὸς σπῶ* to work from. I should have been glad to say to the English people, 'On such terms the division might be ended. You dread this and that; but you see that all which you need accept, all which is practically required of you, is to believe that and that. Look at it and see whether you object to it.'"

Victor De Buck, a Belgian Jesuit, now stepped forward as an intermediary, urging that some of the English bishops should attend the Vatican Council to present their views on reunion, but Pusey had begun to see that the real object was "to merge as many as may be in the Roman Church without making any change." This view was confirmed by the snub administered to De Buck by the Pope and the Supreme Congregation, who, before the assembling of the Council, bade him cease his correspondence with some "heterodox Anglicans." As the Council went on Pusey's hopes faded. He tells Liddon

"The Council looks as unlike any assembly guided by God the Holy Ghost as one could well imagine. All seems to be done by human policy or stayed by human fears. I fear some compromise which shall involve the principle (of Infallibility), leaving the actual affirmation until hereafter."

The result was worse even than he feared, and in later issues of his third Eirenicon, the title was altered from *Is Healthful Reunion Possible?* to *Healthful Reunion, as conceived Possible before the Vatican Council*. The biographers

of Pusey claim that, though the immediate project had failed the cause will in the end be found to have gained.

"However long God may defer the wished-for end, the contemplation of these years of patient labour will still, as they have already done, kindle others to a like self-devotion. Their history exhibits a picture of no ordinary grandeur—a noble soul daring to believe, amidst the din of jarring controversy, that God is able to fulfil His own ideal, spreading the contagion of his faith to others, and toiling on through calumny and misrepresentation in his efforts to bring low the mountains that bar the way of the Lord."

Plain people will put a very different construction on those labours. Christian unity is a noble ideal, but when, in order to gain it, a man is ready to sacrifice what Pusey was ready to sacrifice, the sorrowful verdict must be that he was disloyal to his own Church and to the best interests of Christianity. The result itself may show how far his judgment was at fault. The only good that came out of the pitiful business was a new revelation of the real temper of Rome.

Pusey was deeply moved by Mr. Gladstone's rejection as Member for Oxford University in 1865. He did not agree with all his views: "But all must be right, in the end, where there is that single-hearted loyal love of God and His Church, of His faith and truth, which there is in Gladstone." After the rejection he told another friend,

"I believe that we are in the course of an inevitable Revolution; that the days of Establishments are numbered, and that the Church has to look to her purity, liberty, faithfulness to Catholicism, while I fear that the Conservatives would corrupt her in order to increase the numerical strength of the Establishment. Gladstone's rejection has severed my last link with earthly politics; I fear it has broken other links too; or rather has shown that it only wanted a pull to sever what was only seemingly held together. The High Church are broken to bits."

The chief interest of Pusey's later years circles round his relations to Ritualism. The Tractarians had deprecated "any innovations in the way of conducting the service,

anything of Ritualism, or especially any revival of disused vestments." But, though Pusey did not approve the way in which ritual had been forced on the people, unexplained and without their consent, it was really the vehicle for the expression of doctrines taught by the Tract writers. For matters such as the Eastward Position and the Eucharistic Vestments, Pusey felt he could not contend too stoutly, yet he "found it impossible to work with those who laid, as he considered, undue stress on unmeaning points of ritual, and irritated their congregations by introducing them." He told the Hon. C. L. Wood, in 1875,

"I suppose that in no Church or body would the claim be allowed that an individual priest should, of his own mind, change the existing Ritual without ascertaining the mind of his congregation, without the sanction of the Bishop, or the concurrence of his co-presbyters. And in all the controversy it is assumed that those who did make changes were perfectly right and that every parish priest has a perfect right to do this, only that he ought to do it discreetly, but still according to his own individual judgment. But the English mind hates arbitrariness, the exercise of an individual will. And I think that they have had a great deal to complain of in this respect. There has been, and is, a good deal of infallibilism outside the Vatican decree. The whole extreme Ritualist party is practically infallibilist. 'We will not retreat; because we are *certainly* right.' And so they must lay the whole blame upon their opponents' hostility, as they think, to truth. Yet very much of their practice has no relation to the truth, or only so far as it makes the Eucharistic service gorgeous. I do not know, *e.g.*, that censuring persons and things has anything to do with setting forth the Real Presence. Yet Lowder, in that meeting at Brighton, said that he had insisted upon censuring persons and things as being as important as anything. And yet to the mass of the English people (and among them to me) it is an un-understood rite. Three different explanations of it have been given me by Ritualists. (As it does not concern me, I have not looked into books.) This, and what is included in the word 'histrionic,' is, at present especially, un-understood by the English. Our service being in English, is especially addressed to the heart and conscience. Acting interferes with this. People are taken off from their devotions to see a ceremony whose meaning they do not know. They may know it by-and-by, they do not now.

"Again, there has been a good deal of pedantry, 'The use



of the word *Mass*,' Liddon said, 'alienated thousands who ought to belong to us.' Yet a young priest put on his church door a notice that 'there will be Mass' at such an hour in his village church. What should the villagers understand by it? The squire of course got offended. I asked A. Bouverie (a friend of my own) why he had joined the Petition against Vestments. He appealed to me, 'You would not go along with these,' and gave an instance where a layman was repelled from communicating, because 'only the clergy communicate to-day.' I think that, with this and so much beside, we have no right to assume the character of suffering simply for the truth's sake."

As the struggle about Ritual grew fiercer, however, Pusey threw the weight of his influence in favour of securing toleration for the Ritualists. When his friend Bishop Forbes of Brechin died, he asks Newman, "Will you say Mass for him?" When Lord Redesdale exposed the notorious *Priest in Absolution* in the House of Lords in June, 1877, and the English public was roused into a storm of indignation, Pusey completed his own preparation of Gaume's *Manual for Confessors*, the greater part of which he had long had in type, and wrote a lengthy Preface of a historical and apologetic character.

Amid the clamour raised by this publication in 1878 Pusey had a serious illness. Canon Liddon wrote to Newman, and received a reply, in which Newman says,

"If his state admits of it, I should so very much wish to say to my dearest Pusey, whom I have loved and admired for above fifty years, that the Catholic Roman Church solemnly lays claim to him as her child, and to ask him in God's sight whether he does not acknowledge her right to do so."

Liddon told Pusey about his old friend's enquiries, but did not say more as to the contents of the letter. He assured Newman that Pusey was entirely satisfied with his own position. Pusey rallied and lived four years longer. He died at Ascot on September 16th, 1882, at the age of eighty-two. "The death-sweat was on his brow when he was heard to sigh out a last aspiration, which summed up his life—'My God.'" A better man than Pusey never did a worse work, and the blight which he cast on English Christianity is assuming graver proportions every day.

The Vicar of Wantage brought the principles of the Puseyite school to bear on the life of a country town with a vigour and success which reminds us of Dr. Hook's work in Leeds, though he had no tincture of Hook's true and experimental Evangelical faith and sympathy. No parish clergyman enjoyed more completely the confidence of Keble and Pusey than Butler. His first rector was the Rev. Charles Dyson, of Dogmersfield, in Hampshire, who had been an intimate friend of Keble, Arnold and J. T. Coleridge. He was a firm, though quiet, supporter of the Oxford Movement, and at the rectory his curate formed friendships with Keble, Manning, Henry Wilberforce and Charles Marriott, which did much to shape his religious convictions. After a while Butler removed to Puttenham, near Guildford, where he married Miss Emma Barnett, daughter of the head of the great banking firm of Barnett, Hoare & Co. In 1844 he was appointed first incumbent of the new parish of Wareside. He had the practical genius which the greater men of the Oxford Movement lacked. In correspondence with Keble he urged that a "Retreat" should be arranged for the clergy. He says that many of his own friends were repenting most bitterly their misspent years at school and college; "their sins are lying like a heavy load upon them and torturing them indescribably. They long to confess and go through some prescribed penance." Butler himself went to Oxford to confess to Dr. Pusey, and urged on Keble the need of making provision for the clergy who wished to avail themselves of that help towards holy living.

This was the man who became Vicar of Wantage in June, 1846. For a century and a half the living, which was in the gift of the Dean and Chapter of Windsor, had been held by non-resident vicars who employed a curate at a very modest stipend. When Butler paid his first visit he found the service conducted in a most slovenly manner. The curate's

"sermon was drier than hay. Not a word of sense in it. I only wonder so many people can sit through such discourses.

I was as fidgetty as possible, and were I likely to undergo such things continually I must join one of the sects with which Wantage is rife. Lengthy, too. 'This leads me to consider,' and all that."

The young vicar, who was only twenty-eight, had some natural fear, in view of the task he was undertaking.

"So many difficult points seem to arise—how much to do, how much not to do; how to encourage a Catholic *parish* under the disadvantage of Protestant or Puritan ways, and then that whole class of questions which connect themselves with Dissenters. And then one feels so much fear as to how best to begin, whether to start strenuously and try to gain something in this way, or to wait and watch opportunities."

He was soon immersed in work, but he found the whole population ignorant and apathetic. The place enjoyed an ill repute as "Black Wantage," and, though it had historic interest as the birthplace of King Alfred and Bishop Butler, its chief local importance consisted in the fact that it was the market for the corn-growers in the Vale of White Horse. The vicarage, an ancient, thatched, dilapidated building, stood at the west-end of the church, the "Latin school" and a dame school, attended by thirty-six children, were in the churchyard. The church was described by a great architect as one that "would awe people into devotion," but its internal arrangements were far from "being decent or in order."

The new vicar had to work warily. He longed to make Confession "a regular common-place part of Christian life," though it seemed "somewhat unnatural, if not wrong, that any one, even a confessor, should know more of a married woman than her husband knows." He acknowledged that the Evangelical school was "more saturated with spirituality" than the High Church. Confession and absolution were to give his own party this higher tone. "We seem to be gradually drifting on to this, and so, as the channel of perfection, Safan has guarded this with special care." He confessed to Archdeacon Manning:

"I am terrified when urging my parishioners to more frequent communion and the like without adding this as a pre-

liminary, and yet I feel very fearful lest by clumsiness, lack of *οἰκονομία*, misuse of words, or what in effect is the same, the use of words, in themselves right enough, but misunderstood and so conveying a false impression, I should be the means of scandal. Of one thing I seem certain, that it cannot properly be urged but by a *confessing* clergy, and here I think we shall find no small difficulty."

He was soon able to report to Keble that things at Wantage seemed to be moving in the right direction.

"But how keenly one begins to feel the absolute necessity, if we are to get on farther, of a regular and so to speak commonplace system of confession. Between that and anything else, *e.g.*, parochial visiting, friendly relations between clergy and farmers, and all the rest, which some bishops and all 'safe and practical' people incessantly urge as the perfection of parish management, it seems to me that there is all the difference between playing at things and real earnest work; that the one is a mere evasion, the other the true Church system, whose pain, like children dreading to have their teeth pulled out, men urge every excuse to escape."

Mr. Butler consistently followed out these principles. He actually wrote to his friend and former curate, the Rev. M. H. Noel, in 1877,

"We do not enough realise the tremendous task which we have set ourselves, viz., to deprotestantise a nation—practically unbelieving, which instinctively feels that Protestantism is like itself, and therefore makes it its religion."

Noel's mission at Wantage was to "bring things on," and he was a man after his vicar's own heart. "My three rules of Faith, Prayer, and Grind, are yours also, and they always, as far as I have seen, succeed." Butler gathered round him a set of men well adapted to his ends. Canon Liddon was one of his curates for about twelve months, and the vicar was fond in after years of quoting his wife's judgment on hearing Liddon's first sermon, "That young man preaches better than the archdeacon" (Manning). Mackonochie was also curate at the same time as Liddon, but he gave six years to Wantage, entering with heart and soul into all his vicar's plans, and winning the affection of the people by his unceasing labours. The old sexton of the day, who was

asked about Mackonochie's sermons, replied, "Preach! He were a fine preacher. He'd rumple himself up to give it 'em straight and plain till he were red in the face. He were the shepherd of the flock and no mistake."

Butler showed much wariness in introducing reforms. He did nothing rashly or violently, but steadily prepared his people to accept his views and made his influence felt in all town matters. But trouble was at hand. In concert with Archdeacon Manning he had established the Wantage Sisterhood. When Manning seceded to Rome, followed by the Mother Superior and one of the Sisters, the town was stirred, and many good Church people who up to this time had been the vicar's warm supporters, became his opponents. The vestry meeting in April, 1852, rejected his plans for the restoration of the church. The vicar had feared opposition. "I felt the awkwardness of such a meeting, when Dissenters could take a part, and more especially because I knew well their exceeding hostility to me." In the event, he says, "a strong party of Dissenters of the worst kind were brought to the vestry." But they could really have done little had not the moderate Churchmen been thoroughly aroused by the fear of Popery. Five years later the work, which was in itself greatly needed, was carried through successfully.

Every reader of this life will be impressed by the strenuous and self-sacrificing labours of the vicar and his curates. He made visiting a business, and laboured to win a soul as an army would strive to take a city. Ministers will do well to study Mr. Butler's methods, and the more deeply they deplore many tendencies of his work the more reason they will find to imitate his unwearying zeal. His communicants' classes were a mighty engine in his propaganda, and his schools, in which he himself taught daily for thirty-four years, leavened the whole district with "Church principles." It is easy to understand as one reads this life that the one refuge and help of Nonconformists in the matter of Christian education has been for more than one generation the Methodist day-school. Butler's sermons were not popular

nor "comfortable," but his attacks on sin and his manifest earnestness explain the verdict of the Lincoln Nonconformist at a later period, who said he liked the Dean best of the Cathedral preachers, "because he means business."

Mr. A. J. C. Hare, in his *Story of My Life*, vol. ii., p. 222, gives an amusing sketch of a visit to the Butler's on February 20th, 1860. He says :

"I came here yesterday over dreary, snow-sprinkled downs. Wantage is a curious little town, surrounding a great cruciform church in the midst of a desert. The vicar (Rev. W. J. Butler) welcomed me at the door of the Gothic vicarage, and almost immediately a clerical procession, consisting of three curates, schoolmaster, organist and Scripture-reader, filed in (as they do every day) to dinner, and were introduced to me one by one. The tall, agreeable vicar, did the honours just as a schoolmaster would to his boys. There was such a look of daily service, chanting and *discipline* over the whole party, that I quite felt as if Mrs. Butler ought also to be a clergyman, and as if the two little girls would have been more appropriately attired in black coats and bands.

"After dinner, in raging snow and biting east wind, we sallied out to survey the numerous religious institutions, which have been almost entirely founded by the energy and perseverance of this vicar in the thirteen years he has been at Wantage. The church is magnificent. There is an old grammar-school in honour of Alfred (who was born here), a National school, painted with Scripture frescoes by Pollen, Burgon, &c., a training school under the charge of Mrs. Trevelyan, a cemetery with a beautiful chapel, and St. Mary's Home for Penitents. At seven o'clock all the curates dispersed to various evening services, Mr. Butler went to St. Mary's Home, and Mrs. Butler and I to the church, where we sat in the dark, and heard a choir chant a service out of what looked like a gorgeous illumination.

"I was aghast to hear breakfast was at half-past seven, but as I could not sleep from the piercing cold, it did not signify. At seven a bell rang, and we all hurried to a little domestic chapel in the house, hung with red and carpeted with red, but containing nothing else except a cross with flowers at one end of the room, before which knelt Mr. Butler. We all flung ourselves down upon the red carpet, and Mr. Butler, with his face to the wall, intoned to us, and Mrs. Butler and the servants intoned to him, and all the little children intoned, too, with their faces to the ground.

"Now there is to be full church service again, and then—oh ! how glad I shall be to get away."

Dean Butler's Church views were almost identical with those of Pusey, falling short, however, of his advances towards Papal supremacy. He objected to the Romanist cult of Mary. "It is very sad to see how the worship of Mary is obscuring that of the one Mediator." He could not countenance the methods of the extreme Ritualists.

"Men like our dear friend A. H. M(ackonochie) and those whom the *Church Times* represents, go on perfectly at ease, until they are told to wear fewer flounces of lace, or the like, and then they shriek and scold as if life depended on it."

He approved of a 'Eucharist for commemorating dead members of the Sisterhood, but dreaded and disliked all systems of purgatory. "The only use of purgatory to the Roman Catholic teaching has been (1) to fill the coffers of Leo X.; (2) to bring on the Reformation; neither of which is satisfactory." He saw no reason to make the Pope the centre of his religious system, for him the "Blessed Sacrament" was the centre of Christian life, and in the words of his curate, he taught the Sisters under his spiritual care "to value a pause of some minutes after the Consecration and before Communion, during which special adoration might be offered to our Lord, present in His glorified humanity under the sacramental veils."

We think we can trace in the volume some growth in spirituality as life advanced. "His continual teaching," an associate writes, "was the acceptance of God's will in all things and at all times. 'Let "Thy will be done" be your moral tonic.'" But Dean Butler's scheme of religion was sacramental, and so far did this blind him that he could write even in 1883 to Canon Liddon: "There are only two religions in England with any definite doctrinal faith, ourselves and the Roman Catholics." He told an old parishioner:

"Depend on it, there is nothing like Church teaching to make children grow up in the right road. . . . There is something in Church teaching definite and satisfying which cannot be found elsewhere. Prayer, Church, Holy Communion, these are the means by which God's grace enters the soul, and when people seek and use them, they will not go far away."

His quarrel with Lutheranism will show how far he had strayed from the Pauline theology. True Christianity in his view humbled pride

"by the institution of the ministry of man to man—use of sacraments—obedience to the Church. But Lutheranism ignores all this, and actually stimulates human pride by enabling them to answer that they *are* saved. And the attack upon 'works' is the answer to 'take up the Cross.' Thus, by substituting a Gospel which is not a Gospel, it contrives nearly to neutralise Christianity."

He says :

"See how well our Wantage lads do in London. . . . Why? Because they have learnt the real Gospel—not the sham thing that people call the Gospel, all feelings and rubbish, but the Gospel which Christ taught, which commands men to use the means of grace, to accept the ministrations of God's ministers and obey the Church. All this is definite and clear, something that one can understand. . . But 'Come to Christ!'—what does that mean? or 'Have you found peace?' to which a very holy man, a friend of mine, replied, 'No, I have found war,' meaning that a Christian man has to fight if he is to hold his own."

Mr. Butler was on friendly terms with the Nonconformists at Wantage, but the feeling that underlay this apparent tolerance is seen in his notes for May, 1862 :

"Visited the ——. They are strong Baptists. They received me in a very kind and friendly manner. I am sure that it is quite worth while to cultivate people of this kind, for friendliness, if it does not win them to the Church, yet disarms them for open hostility; and it is impossible to say when the good seed may be sown."

After he became Dean of Lincoln he lectured on "Alfred the Great" in the hall attached to the Newland Independent Chapel, Lincoln. He always avoided that "petty and vexatious opposition that tends so largely to embitter the relations between Churchmen and Dissenters." But at heart he held pretty much the position expressed in a manual styled *The Congregation in Church*, which speaks of "the eccentricities and ignorant hypocrisies of Dissent, honeycombed, as Mr. Spurgeon says it is, with unbelief and infidelity."



In January, 1881, Mr. Butler left Wantage to enter on his duties as Canon of Worcester, and after four and a half years in that city was promoted to the Deanery of Lincoln. But the real work of his life was done in the little Berkshire town where, to quote Mackonochie's biographer, "people mark the lapse of time by the Church's calendar, and life moves along sedately to the sound of church bells."

The brighter side of the Anglican Revival is given in Canon Overton's little volume. It is an admirable summary of the history, from the point of view occupied by a modest and fine spirited High Churchman, and there is no need to say that it is marked by ample knowledge and much felicity of style. But we must introduce our readers to a very different book, which is opening the eyes of many people to the real drift of Puseyism, *The Secret History of the Oxford Movement*.\* Mr. Walsh's book has been written at the

---

\* Lord Grimthorpe, one of the staunchest and ablest Protestant laymen of the Church of England, who has rendered conspicuous service to his own communion, and is singularly well informed as to the ecclesiastical laws of the country, writes to the *Times* for May 5th a letter entitled "Lawlessness in the Church":—"I advise everybody, however indifferent hitherto, to read the lately published *Secret History of the Oxford Movement*, by Mr. Walsh, who, without entering into theological disputes, has proved, by such evidence as has never been collected before, though a good deal can hardly be called new in substance—which makes it all the more certain—that 'Movement' is only a sacerdotal euphemism for 'conspiracy,' carried on from the very beginning with the mendacity and caution and secrecy which are essential to all conspiracies for a time. Indeed, that seems to have been avowed afterwards by the leaders themselves to a degree which I was not aware of, except as a matter of inference. That conspiracy very early became one to reverse the Reformation, abolish the Thirty-nine Articles and the present Prayer-book, which is practically the second one of Edward VI. and Elizabeth, and even accept the Roman supremacy, to a degree which no outsiders knew, until Lord Halifax & Co. were kind enough to withdraw the curtain and send their agents to Rome and unconsciously pull the string of the shower-bath there. The great attractions have notoriously been clerical supremacy and 'the discipline of the laity,' which Keble from the first demanded; the pretender or confessor that by '*not in the hands*' in his *Christian Year* he had always meant '*as in the hands*,' instigated thereto by Liddon. It has been often said that by a true instinct the world called the 'Movement' Puseyism, and Bishop Wilberforce accused him of doing more to send people to Rome than anybody, though he stayed at home himself. Of Newman's honesty one need only repeat his own often-quoted confession that before he went he 'only

request of an eminent dignitary of the Church of England noted for his liberality and the breadth of his views on religious matters. It is based on the privately printed documents of the Ritualists, and furnishes full accounts of their secret conclaves and the speeches delivered therein by the members. The secret history of the notorious *Priest in Absolution* is here given for the first time, with the discussions about it in the "Society of the Holy Cross," by whose Master it had been prepared. The Rev. R. Rhodes Bristow, now Canon Missioner of Southwark, said that "if the book were published it would be prosecuted as an obscene book. We did not want the book. Dr. Pusey was bringing out a work on Moral Theology." The book, prepared by Dr. Pusey, was really an adapted translation of the same Catholic manual. Mr. Walsh gives many pitiful and startling revelations about the Society of the Holy Cross and the Order of Corporate Reunion which have been working in a Jesuitical and traitorous way to Romanise the Church of England. The idea of going over to Rome is scouted by these dishonest men. As one of the members put it, "Depend upon it, it is only through the English Church itself that England can be Catholicised." "The Order of Corporate Reunion," with its machinery for providing Popish Orders and Sacraments for the English clergy, marks a depth of disloyalty to which no honest man could fall. "It has Bishops secretly consecrated, and these are prepared to give conditional reordination to such of the clergy of the Church of England as may submit to the process." All Mr. Walsh's revelations are based on authentic, direct, original, undeniable evidence, and show the most secret and characteristic depths and windings of the Tractarian history. It is an official record and relation which can neither be contradicted nor discredited.

---

said what was necessary for his position,' and a great deal more of the same kind. But no summary of Mr. Walsh's proofs can be given in half a column of the *Times*, or much more. So I will not try. Hook's prediction, which he quotes, that the reaction from Puseyism would be infidelity, not Protestantism, is being amply verified as to the male sex, and superstition in the female."

Honest Anglicans cannot read the disclosures of the volume without being horror-struck. Mr. Walsh shows what the Tractarian doctrine of "Reserve" really means, and quotes Dr. Pusey's commission to Mr. Hope-Scott, in 1844, to purchase a specimen "Discipline" which, he says, "I suspect to be one of the safest (penances), and with internal humiliation the best. Could you procure and send me one by B.?" Two years later he tells Keble, his father confessor, "I think I should like to be bid to use the 'Discipline.'" Keble hesitated to give such an order. He might allow, but did not feel free to enjoin it. Pusey himself had less scruple, for in his *Manual for Confessors* he recommends penance for Sisters of Mercy. "For mortifications, the 'Discipline' for a quarter of an hour a day."

With such a book in his hands the dullest reader can no longer be ignorant of the real purpose of the Puseyite school. Some incidents of the life in Sisterhoods here recorded are an outrage on all good sense and feeling. Miss Sellon, Mother Superior of Dr. Pusey's Convent, was one day having her boot laced by a Sister, when she thought fit to bestow her other foot on the head of the stooping Sister.

"Some little disposition to objection and resistance to this disgusting insult being manifested, was immediately checked by the Lady Superior, who remarked that such humiliation was good for the Sister."

Another

"Sister who had been hasty with her tongue, and had thrown out some unguarded expression, was commanded by the Rev. Mr. Prynne, one of the confessors to the institution, to lie down flat on the floor, and with her tongue to describe the figure of a Cross in the dirt."

Even Mr. Walsh's book does not altogether represent the gravity of the situation. The *Dublin Review*, for April, says that it would be easy to add to his list of secret societies and that many of the practices which horrify him are "mild in comparison with others which are daily performed and as to which he is a complete outsider." It naturally rejoices in the results obtained so far and anticipates greater things to come.

"The work has gone on for half a century ; it has revolutionised the attitude of the British mind towards Catholicism ; it has made the Established Church unrecognisable, and brought it half-way to Rome. The change of opinion in the minds of our countrymen is matter for unmixed rejoicing ; the change which has made the Catholic Church respected, imitated and longed for ; her practices and her dogmas honoured if not accepted ; the Reformers disgraced ; foreign Protestants discarded. The new views on Anglican orders, on 'Continuity' and such like, are mere passing absurdities. The whole Anglican body is being carried along in a vast sea it knows not whither, and even those who lag behind are ahead of the foremost pioneers of sixty years ago. Those who in the front wave trickle into the Catholic Church may be few, but they are the thin end of a great wedge, the pinnacle of a great pyramid ever growing."

As we turn Mr. Walsh's pages and study the Romanising practices so common in our Anglican Churches, it seems as though we need a new Luther to save the clergy of England from sinking back into beliefs and practices which would have disgraced even the Middle Ages.

## ART. II.—A NEW DICTIONARY OF THE BIBLE.

*A Dictionary of the Bible* : Dealing with its Language, Literature and Contents, including the Biblical Theology. Edited by JAMES HASTINGS, M.A., D.D., with the assistance of J. A. SELBIE, M.A. ; and, chiefly in the revision of the proofs, of A. B. DAVIDSON, D.D., S. R. DRIVER, D.D., and H. B. SWETE, D.D. Vol. I., A to FEASTS. T. & T. Clark. 1898.

**T**HIRTY-FIVE years ago was published the first, and up till now, the only standard Dictionary of the Bible, representative of the scholarship of Great Britain. In saying this, we do not wish to slight the smaller Dictionaries which have appeared either before or since, such as those of Eadie, Fausset and others, for these have done

good service in their way ; nor the larger Cyclopædia of Biblical Literature, edited by Kitto and later by W. L. Alexander, which contained many articles of value. Still, it remains true that for more than a generation there has been in this country but one Dictionary of the Bible, edited by Dr. William Smith and published by Mr. John Murray. Scholars have used their Herzog-Plitt, now being re-edited by Hanck, and some students may have found the American Biblico-theological Dictionary of M'Clintock and Strong useful for many purposes, but, in practice, Smith's Dictionary has stood alone. As our readers are aware, an attempt was made in 1893 to bring this work, then thirty years old, somewhat more fully up to date. It was a feeble and halting attempt, unworthy of the publishing house of Murray and the reputation of the Dictionary. It will hardly be believed that half only of the articles, A—J, were remodelled, while the remainder, J—Z, were left to represent the stage which Biblical scholarship had reached more than a generation before ! It was necessary at the time, however, to be thankful for small mercies, and this second edition of half a book contained many additions which in themselves were important and valuable. The advance made in Biblical studies was indicated by the fact that the article "Acts," by Bishop Lightfoot, occupied eighteen pages, as compared with a page and a half in the earlier edition ; the Gospel of St. John needed twenty-five pages instead of three, and the article "Apocrypha" filled thirty-seven pages instead of four ; whilst Professor Sanday added a valuable article on the Gospels of twenty-six pages, in itself quite a little treatise.

It was indeed high time that something was done, and it would be ungrateful to disparage the very considerable improvements in this standard work effected five years ago. But it was certain that such piecemeal and incomplete reformation could not be considered adequate to the needs of the case. There is no department of Biblical study but has been advancing during the last three or four decades by leaps and bounds. Archæology, sacred history, geography,

Old Testament criticism, Biblical theology, have undergone enormous changes since the lines of Dr. Smith's Dictionary were first laid down ; and when its publisher decided not to attempt a complete reconstruction, it was practically certain that some one else would undertake to fill the gap. Messrs. T. & T. Clark, of Edinburgh, to whom the students of the Bible and theology are already under such heavy obligations, have nobly stepped into the breach, and undertaken the very considerable financial and general responsibilities implied in undertaking an entirely new Dictionary upon an even larger scale. At the same moment—such is the perverseness or the exigency of the publishing world—another important Dictionary is being projected by Messrs. A. & C. Black, of which the first volume is promised in the autumn of this year. This is to be edited by Canon Cheyne and Dr. Sutherland Black, and will probably occupy a more advanced position on questions of current Biblical criticism. But at present our chief information with regard to it is that it is to contain a quantity of work left for a similar purpose by the late Professor Robertson Smith—not, on the whole, a very satisfactory mode either of dealing with a scholar's literary remains or of constructing a homogeneous Bible-dictionary. But with projects, whether well or ill-advised, we have now no concern, desiring, as we do, to introduce to our readers what we have very little doubt will be *the* standard Dictionary of the Bible in Great Britain for many years to come.

The editor, Dr. Hastings, is well known as the able and successful editor of the *Expository Times*, and both he and his chief assistant, Mr. Selbie, are ministers of the Free Church of Scotland, engaged in active service in comparatively rural charges. Happy the Church that can find among its working ministry two men competent for such a task as this ! The proofs of all articles, however, have been carefully revised by scholars of the three leading Universities—Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh—in the persons of Professors Driver, Swete and Davidson respectively. As to the list of contributors, it contains the names of most of the

leading Biblical scholars of this country and America. With commendable catholicity, the editor has selected representatives of all Protestant Churches, and has secured the services of perhaps the ablest men in each community for his purpose. It would be tedious to recount them in detail, but it may be said that the list in the first volume covers three pages and includes more than a hundred and fifty names, nearly all of them those of men who have already proved their competence to write upon the themes entrusted to them. It is invidious to select amongst so many worthy representatives of Churches and seats of learning ; but, as everything in such a publication depends upon the calibre of the contributors, it may be well to say that amongst Oxford scholars are Driver, Headlam, Lock, Margoliouth, Strong and Sayce ; Cambridge is represented by Ryle, Stanton, Gwatkin, Rendel Harris, M'Alister and Armitage Robinson ; Durham by Plummer and Jevons ; and Scotch Universities and Colleges by such names as those of Davidson, Adam Smith, Candlish, Denney, Kennedy, Laidlaw, Kilpatrick and Salmond. Amongst Congregationalist Professors we find the names of Adeney, Bartlet, Bennett, Gray, Massie and Whitehouse ; amongst Wesleyan Methodists are Professors Banks, Beet, Davison, Moss and Findlay ; the Baptists furnish Drs. Marshall and Witton Davies ; and Professor A. S. Peake represents the Primitive Methodists. America takes her due share in this international undertaking, as the names of Beecher, Francis Brown, Porter, Thayer, Price and Warfield will suffice to illustrate ; whilst in the department of Palestinian geography Dr. Bliss and Rev. Selah Merrill are recognised authorities. Professor Hommel, of Munich, worthily represents Continental scholars ; and the contributions of such experts in their several departments as Mr. Pinches, of the British Museum ; Professor Ramsay, Mr. Burkitt, the Arabic scholar : Colonel Conder, General Wilson and Sir Charles Warren, of Palestine exploration celebrity, prove how successful the editor has been in securing the services of high authorities to deal with difficult and contested questions.

Last in order, but certainly not least in importance, are the contributions of the editor himself. Dr. Hastings, in addition to the enormous labour of supervising the whole work, has undertaken the treatment of the Bible words which require explanation, and, both in bulk and in importance, his work must rank with that which chiefly gives character to the volume. Hardly a page of shorter articles but contains his name, and he has executed, with great skill and judgment, the difficult task of dealing with a multiplicity of subjects so that the precise information needed is presented clearly, fully, and in the shortest possible compass.

But of course the editor's chief work has lain in the direction and supervision of the whole. It would be difficult to praise this too highly. In general appearance, in size and clearness of type, in structure and arrangement, this Dictionary exhibits a marked advance on its predecessor. The few maps given are excellent, as are some of the illustrations—*e.g.*, those under "Dress" and "Agriculture." We cannot say the same for all, the process adopted resulting in some instances in a mere smudge, see "Cedar" and "Lodge in Garden of Cucumbers." But our examination of the first volume has led us to the conclusion that Dr. Hastings has exercised admirable judgment both in the full space allotted to the leading articles and in the treatment accorded to subjects requiring only brief notice. It is only too easy; on the one hand, to sacrifice the interests of the reader who requires information briefly given to those who desire long and elaborate dissertations, or *vice versâ*. It is difficult to preserve the balance, as we feel assured Dr. Hastings has done, with impartiality and success, and it appears to us that neither the minister or teacher who needs concise information on some point of Biblical antiquities, nor the more leisurely student who seeks an exhaustive treatment of (say) the chronology of the Old Testament or an elaborate introduction to an important book of the Bible, will be disappointed in consulting the new Dictionary. If the succeeding volumes fulfil the promise of the first, the



whole work will present as complete an encyclopædia of Biblical information as the most exacting could desire.

Having said so much concerning the book as a whole, we propose to examine a portion of its contents more minutely, in order to show the position it occupies upon the vexed questions of Biblical criticism and theological science. Viewed from this standpoint, the publication of this new Dictionary is a sign of the times. No better indication could be found of the progress of Biblical study than is furnished by a comparison of the first edition of "Smith" with the volume before us. The Biblical and theological position taken up by Dr. Hastings may be described as "moderate liberal" or "left centre." The most characteristic names, those of Driver, Ryle and A. B. Davidson, will indicate better than any lengthy description, the attitude adopted upon questions of Old Testament criticism, and indeed the tone and spirit of the work generally. It is quite impossible to please every one, and here and there will be found an article which is too "advanced" for the average minister who may be presumed to consult the book, or too "conservative" for the scholar who expects to find the very latest utterance of criticism. But in the main it appears to us that Dr. Hastings has judged well in his selection of names, if he desired to be neither in front of his time nor behind it, but fairly abreast with its best work, as estimated, not by the standard of Germany or Holland, but of this country and America. The best educated readers of Evangelical Churches in this country may be presumed to form the constituency for which a Dictionary of the Bible should make provision, and, in the main, the provision here furnished is suitable and well chosen. But it is time we left generalities for a closer examination of individual articles.

The article BIBLE, to which we may appropriately turn first, is not one of the most successful. It is written by Principal Stewart, of St. Andrew's, who may well have felt some difficulty in knowing how best to utilise the five-and-twenty columns allotted to his subject. His article is well

arranged, dealing consecutively with the Internal and External Relations of the Bible. The former section includes the topics of Languages, Canon, Texts and Versions; the latter compares the Bible with other sacred books, and discusses the questions of Revelation and Inspiration. Very considerable compression has been necessary to discuss some of these topics at all in the space available, while it is impossible to help comparing the section on other sacred books with Bishop Westcott's admirable handling of the same theme in the *Cambridge Teachers' Bible*. The last two sections, on Revelation and Inspiration, are perhaps the most disappointing. Professor Stewart appears to have aimed at forming a "balanced" judgment, but he has not succeeded in giving his readers much guidance upon what are acknowledged to be particularly difficult questions in this generation. He gives two long extracts from Professor Denney and Dr. Fairbairn, adding, in a helpless kind of way, that "these instances serve to illustrate the difficulties surrounding the question," and that it is probable that no theory of inspiration will ever solve them. Dr. Stewart falls back upon the somewhat obvious remarks that in any case the Bible contains the early record of Christianity, and "this gives to it an interest, if not an authority, which cannot be disputed"; and that "withal the Bible remains, and will remain, the most precious heritage of mankind." This sort of non-committal utterance does not promise well, and if a similar line had been pursued throughout the Dictionary, it must have been pronounced a failure. It is quite possible for a writer to utter a clear voice of his own upon difficult questions, without dogmatically condemning all who differ from him, and neither the text of this article, nor the bibliography, so far as it concerns Inspiration, appears to us worthy of the important theme.

Turning to questions of Old Testament criticism, it is a relief to find that the writers have definite opinions of their own, which they state with commendable clearness and precision. Whether the reader agrees with the conclusions

or not, he may make sure in every case of a carefully stated position, with reasons fully alleged. In the present condition of the subject, no more than this can be expected. Writers have been selected who are well acquainted with the literature of their several subjects, and in many instances are recognised authorities upon them. Professor Ryle, of Cambridge, writes on Deuteronomy ; Mr. Harford-Battersby on Exodus ; Professor Francis Brown, of Union Seminary, New York, on Chronicles ; Professor Skinner on Ezekiel, and Professor E. L. Curtis, of Yale, on Daniel. Other articles which raise similar questions are Professor Ryle's "Abraham," Mr. H. A. White's "David," Principal Whitehouse's "Cosmogony," Mr. F. H. Wood's "Balaam," Professor Paterson's "Decalogue," and Mr. Peake's "Ecclesiastes." All these writers occupy similar, though not quite identical, ground upon questions of criticism. It may be described as a reverent acceptance of the main positions of modern critical analysis and of the dates now usually assigned by scholars to the various documents concerned, without injury done, as the writers would contend, to the authority of Scripture, with no admission of "pious fraud" or conscious misrepresentation on the part of any of the sacred penmen, though discrepancies are admitted and failures in historical accuracy are freely conceded.

Take, for example, the case of Deuteronomy. Professor Ryle thinks there is little question that the book was composed "during the period which intervenes between the accession of Ahaz and the literary activity of Jeremiah." He considers that "there is no manner of doubt" that the book of the law discovered in the temple in the eighteenth year of Josiah was identical with the main portion of Deuteronomy, and he is content to believe that its "finding" was a fortuitous occurrence. "There is no foundation for the suggestion that . . . the story of its finding was a fabrication," and the most probable supposition appears to be that it was written in the troublous reign of Manasseh, and "may well have been deposited for safety within the precincts of the temple." Dr. Ryle has already expressed

his views in his work on the Canon of the Old Testament, but in this article more scope is afforded for entering into detail, and we are a little disappointed not to find a more sustained attempt to grapple with the difficulties of the question. Driver's position is maintained throughout, his analysis is followed and full extracts from his "Introduction" are inserted. But it seems to us that too little is made of sundry evidences of antiquity which the book contains, and we should have expected a clearer account of the *growth* of legislation, as evidenced by this important book. If it be granted, for the sake of argument, that "the law of Deuteronomy represents an expansion and development of the ancient code contained in Ex. xx.—xxiii., and precedes the final formulation of the priestly ritual," more stress should surely have been laid upon the early elements embedded in this hortatory reissue of Mosaic legislation. The discussion of the phenomena of Deuteronomy is crucial, and while we recognise the ability and fairness of Professor Ryle's article, we might have expected a fresher handling of old material and a more discriminating treatment of its evidence than is here given.

Another crucial question is the historical trustworthiness of the books of Chronicles. The treatment of these books by Professor Francis Brown, the chief editor of the new Hebrew Lexicon, is very able and thorough. We do not know where else to find such a complete summary of the contents of Chronicles and such a clear and succinct exposition of the relation between these books and those of Samuel and Kings, together with such a brief but exhaustive discussion of the "Sources." On the main point, Professor Brown says,

"The late date of Chronicles presumably hinders it from being a historical witness of the first order. It could be so only if its sources were demonstrably such. But it has no sources certainly older than the canonical Samuel and Kings; its chief source is probably much later. An interval of 250 or 300 years separates it from the last events recorded in Kings. In all cases of conflict, then, preference must be given to Samuel and Kings."

He adds that we cannot depend absolutely upon this document when it stands alone, and that *perhaps* it does not enlarge our stock of historical matter beyond that given in Samuel and Kings. But "it would be most unjust to call the chronicler a falsifier. His view of the past is that of a son of his own age, in whom the historical imagination had not been largely developed," and who could not conceive of a time when law and ritual were otherwise than as he knew them. Consequently, the chief value of the book does not lie in its historical details. "Nevertheless, its value is real and great. It is, however, the value more of a sermon than of a history." Seven separate paragraphs are then devoted to showing the real importance of the book, and these are excellently and most discriminatingly written. On the one hand, there is no desire to explain away the difficulties caused by discrepancies of detail; but, on the other, there is no attempt to disparage the chronicler, and Professor Brown brings into relief the large measure of agreement with Samuel and Kings, the valuable information afforded as to the compiler's own times, the significance in his selection of materials and the religious importance of the books. "Thus Chronicles illustrates for us God's use of a professedly historical writing to enforce His truth, both in spite of, and by means of, the very qualities which impair its excellence as pure history."

The book of Daniel is also entrusted to an American writer, Dr. E. L. Curtis, Professor of Hebrew at Yale. Without hesitation or question the late date of Daniel is accepted as the only tenable view. The book is said to contain "a series of historical statements which imply a misconception of the exilic period," language, doctrines and historical allusions all point in the same direction, and "the conclusion in favour of the Maccabean date, in view of this accumulation of concurrent facts, seems abundantly warranted." The exact date is fixed as within the year B.C. 165. According to this view, the historical reliability of chs. i.—vi. is given up. These are to be regarded as "a species of the later Jewish Haggada, or method of incul-

cating moral and spiritual lessons by tales of the imagination"; while chs. vii.—xii. are specimens of the Jewish "custom of representing present messages as given in the past through ancient worthies." The article is well written, and we do not quarrel with the writer for setting out with clearness and force the case as it presents itself to his own mind—and, for that matter, to the great majority of modern scholars. It seems, however, to us that the force of arguments used by Keil and Pusey and others of an older and now discredited school is not sufficiently recognised in the article, and we should have been better satisfied if a fair hearing at least had been given to the other side. "Conservative" writers are recognised in the bibliography, but in the discussion of the subject they are ignored. Professor Curtis, however, happily does not indulge in the tone and style of discussion which marked Dean Farrar's recent unfortunate book on this subject, and those who desire an ably stated summary of the chief arguments for the late date of Daniel will find them in this article.

As regards the New Testament, some of the most interesting articles on Introduction will appear in later volumes. In this volume, Mr. Headlam, of Oxford, writes on the Acts of the Apostles; Principal Robertson, of King's College, London, on 1 and 2 Corinthians; Mr. Lock on Ephesians, and Mr. Murray on Colossians. The treatment of "Acts" may perhaps be considered typical of the whole. Mr. A. C. Headlam, who is best known as co-worker with Professor Sanday in the "Romans" of the *International Commentary*, gives, in about twenty columns, an excellent *resumé* of the many vexed questions raised by the subject entrusted to him. One class of these concerns the text, but Mr. Headlam can spare little space for the discussion of the problem of the Western text and the theories of Rendel Harris, Blass and others in relation to it. As to authorship and date, after a full and fair examination, the balance is declared to be in favour of St. Luke as author, and a period shortly after A.D. 70 as the time of writing. On the subject of historical value, Mr. Headlam says very properly that the

fact that the writer has a definite plan and purpose by no means necessarily detracts from his historical accuracy. "The distinction between a history and a chronicle is just this, that a history has a plan." The writer narrates, from his own point of view, which may be right or wrong, but in either case he need not be untrustworthy. In the case of the Acts, Mr. Headlam shows that St. Luke had a view of his own and a very important one, and, though he may have been inaccurate in some minor points, "substantially his history is true and trustworthy," and the point of view from which he writes is just that which of all others needed to be taken.

A minute examination is given to the parallels and apparent discrepancies between Acts and Galatians, and Mr. Headlam on the whole agrees with Lightfoot in identifying the visit of Gal. ii. 1—10, with Acts xv., not with Acts xi. 30 (Ramsay). The independence of the accounts is obvious, and Mr. Headlam does well to point out that many of Paley's arguments in *Horæ Paulinæ*, drawn from undesigned coincidences, are by no means obsolete, as it is now the fashion in some quarters to take for granted. The presence of the author's hand in the speeches is not denied, but no theory can be satisfactory which does not take account of his obvious acquaintance with the persons and events he is describing, and it is clear also that in many cases he had excellent first-hand evidence of what was said. Mr. Headlam thus sums up his conclusions :

"The exact degree of credibility and accuracy we can ascribe to him (St. Luke) is dependent on his sources of information. From ch. xii. onwards his source was excellent ; from ch. xx. onwards he was an eye-witness. For the previous period he could not in all cases attain the same degree of accuracy, yet he was personally acquainted with eye-witnesses throughout, and may very probably have had one or more written documents. In any case, his history from the very beginning shows a clear idea of historical perspective, and in the stages of the growth of the community, even if certain characteristics of the primitive Church in Jerusalem have been exaggerated."

On the treatment of other New Testament books we must

not linger, though we are sorely tempted to do so by the masterly articles on 1 and 2 Corinthians written by Principal Robertson. Those who are acquainted with his "Athanasius" could only expect good work from him, but these articles are beyond the average of excellence. We can only say that on the topic, now again so much debated, of the integrity of 2 Corinthians and the probability that chs. x.—xiii. once formed a separate epistle, Dr. Robertson pronounces weightily against this supposition. He holds that "a patient and circumspect exegesis will gradually dissolve the arguments, at first sight very tempting, for the segregation of chs. x.—xiii., and even perhaps of ch. vi. 14—ch. vii. 1." We suspect that such patient and cautious exegesis is called for in other cases than this of the second epistle to the Corinthians. Victorious analysis has been a little too "victorious," or too confident of victory of late, and the next decade will probably witness a backward swing of the pendulum in favour of the integrity of documents which have been ruthlessly cut to pieces by young critics in a hurry. Meanwhile, we commend most heartily Dr. Robertson's articles on 1 and 2 Corinthians as models of their kind.

Of longer articles on general Biblical subjects, those on the Chronology of the Old and New Testaments, by Professor Curtis and Mr. Turner, of Magdalen College, Oxford, respectively, are amongst the most elaborate. The subject is too technical for discussion here, but we may say that Mr. Turner—whose name was previously unknown to us—has made out a good case for his scheme of dates in the New Testament. He stands between Harnack, who throws everything early—from A.D. 29 for the Crucifixion of Christ down to A.D. 64 for the martyrdom of Paul—and Lightfoot, who throws all late. The chief use of such an article is its very clear presentment of materials which enable the student to form his own judgment.

Another article, which claims separate attention for a moment, is that of Mr. Mayor on the Brethren of our Lord. It is difficult for an editor to know how best to deal with a



controverted subject of this kind. In the earlier edition of Smith's Dictionary two articles were inserted that rival hypotheses might be fairly represented, but in the later edition, one carefully reasoned article seeks to establish the hypothesis of Hegesippus, that James, the brother of our Lord, and James, the son of Alphæus, are the same person, being the first cousin of Jesus on the paternal side—not the maternal, as is implied in the Hieronymian theory. The latter is, as is well known, the view which has chiefly prevailed in the Catholic Church, while Bishop Lightfoot, in his elaborate essay, strongly supported the Epiphanian hypothesis that James and Joses, Jude and Simon, were sons of Joseph, but not of Mary. Professor Mayor holds very strongly that Mary was the true wife of Joseph, and bore him four sons and two daughters, who were therefore uterine brothers and sisters of Jesus. He characterises other views as "a contumacious setting up of an artificial tradition above the written Word." He has no patience with attempts to prove that "brother" does not mean brother but cousin, that "first-born" does not imply other children subsequently born, and that the limit fixed to separation in Matt. i. 24 does not imply subsequent union. Readers of Mayor's Commentary on St. James's Epistle will be familiar with the arguments which are urged with vigour and ability in the present article. Our only hesitation is whether a thoroughly *ex parte* pronouncement upon a question which has so long exercised the Christian Church and in which Christian sentiment, to say the least, is so deeply interested, should form the sole utterance of a Dictionary upon the subject. We see that Mr. Mayor is engaged to take the article "James," and we presume, therefore, that the matter is entirely in his hands. The spirit in which the subject is handled is unexceptionable and many who entertain a strong "prejudice"—in the literal sense of the word—against the Hebridian hypothesis may find it removed by the healthy tone of the article. But the doctrine of the perpetual virginity of Mary, the mother of our Lord, is one which has exercised a deep and

abiding influence upon the Church, and as it is certain that the general acceptance of the exposition of Scripture advocated by Professor Mayor would have far-reaching effects, it might have been well if the single article on this subject had been more judicial in tone.

Amongst the most useful articles in the Dictionary are those on Biblical theology. In this respect Dr. Hastings achieves marked superiority over previous editors. The subject, indeed, is one which has advanced very considerably during the last two or three decades, and its importance is now much more fully recognised than when Smith's Dictionary was first published. Some of the most important topics still remain to be handled; but the present volume contains such contributions as those of Dr. A. B. Davidson on "Covenant," Professor Armitage Robinson on "Communion," Mr. J. O. F. Murray on "Atonement" and "Election," Professor Beet on "Christology," and Professor Warfield on "Faith." To the specially important subject of Eschatology three articles are devoted; Dr. Davidson dealing with the Old Testament, Professor Salmon with the New, and Mr. R. H. Charles with the Apocrypha—a selection which could hardly have been bettered, with all living scholars to choose from.

We regret that our space does not admit of our showing the unspeakable importance of such a study of the Bible as would be implied by Dr. Davidson's "Covenant." The hand of a master is here visible, but it is manifested, as is usually the case, by the self-restraint and sureness of its touch. The word "Covenant" takes us into the very heart of Old Testament religion, and a thorough comprehension of its meaning implies a mastery of some of the chief problems of the Old Testament. The derivation of the word is sufficiently discussed by Dr. Davidson and a full account given of covenants among men. The conditions implied in using any such term as covenant between God and men are then laid down, and three such covenants are particularly specified; that with Abraham, implying the inalienable right of Israel to Canaan; that with David, im-

plying perpetual monarchy in David's house ; and that with Levi, vesting perpetual priesthood upon his family. One very important point the writer does no more than touch. It is a main feature of some modern criticism to assume that such conceptions regarding Jehovah cannot have existed so early as these various covenants, that the account of them in Scripture is antedated, and really only gives a religious view of existing conditions. We regret that Dr. Davidson has not discussed this point, which, as he says, "runs up into what is the main question of Old Testament religious history, viz. : To what date is the conception of Jehovah as an absolutely ethical Being to be assigned ?" The history of the Divine covenants is then traced in a bare outline of the most suggestive kind, every paragraph being calculated to send the reader to a fresh study of Bible-teaching on the question in hand. The idea of a "new covenant" and the exact idea attached to it by the prophets, especially Jeremiah and Deuteronomy-Isaiah, is well described, and the article closes with a discussion of the relation between the Hebrew *bērit̃h* and *διαθήκη* as used in the LXX. and the New Testament. A comparison of this article with the corresponding one of only three or four columns in the earlier Dictionary will show how the whole subject of Biblical theology has been enriched by recent research.

Equally instructive is the long article, of twenty-four columns written by Professor Warfield, on "Faith." A generation ago the subject would have been held to belong to dogmatics, as indeed it still does in many of its bearings. But we have learned to base systematic theology upon a more thorough examination of Biblical usage, and it is naturally with the Biblical side of this many-branched topic that Professor Warfield's article is concerned. In an exhaustive examination of passages, he unfolds the "philological expression" of faith and its "historical presentation," winding up with an account of its "Biblical conception." The most interesting of these sections is the second, which traces the significance of faith in its manifold developments

but essential unity, from Abraham to James, Paul and John. The relation of the several New Testament writers to one another, in their mode of presenting and expounding this cardinal feature of the Christian religion, is well brought out. Professor Warfield is not so rich and suggestive a writer as Dr. Davidson, and a close critic might be disposed to describe his article as too stiff and pedantic, but his collection of Scripture passages is exceedingly copious, and the article as a whole is one in which students may dig for long without exhausting it. Professor Beet's article on "Christology," is but a bare sketch of a great theme. Considering the importance of the subject, we are surprised to find but two or three pages devoted to it. Probably, however, the strength of the Dictionary will be shown rather by Professor Sanday, to whom we see the important article, "Jesus Christ," to appear in the second volume, is allotted.

No one will regret that full space—more than fifty columns—is given to the subject of Eschatology in its various departments. The interest attaching to it is inexhaustible, and recent research has rendered a fresh handling of material very desirable. Dr. Davidson, in dealing with the Old Testament, distinguishes at the outset between the future of the nation and the individual, and he remarks: "One of the strangest things in the Old Testament is the little place which the individual feels he has, and his tendency to lose himself in larger wholes, such as the tribe or the nation." This requires to be borne in mind throughout the study of the subject, and it is true, even of the later period, in which the significance and responsibility of the individual came to be more clearly realised. Another distinction of importance, by no means sufficiently observed, is that between the ideas regarding death and a future existence generally entertained in the popular mind and more or less current among other Semitic peoples and what Dr. Davidson calls "the aspirations, intuitions and inferences of the pious mind itself," which properly constitute the religious teaching of the Old Testament. We cannot expect that all readers will share Dr. Davidson's conclu-

sions, though for ourselves we have long held some such views as he here expresses to be the only accurate representation of Old Testament teaching concerning a future life. He says that "true individualism is little seen in the Old Testament," and that the passages relating to the eschatology of the individual person are few, mostly poetical, in some points obscure, and all comparatively late. The saints of the Old Testament reached such hopes of future life as from time to time they cherished, not, like the Greeks, through metaphysical speculation on the nature of the soul, but they were led on and up from the ethical idea of righteousness which was so cardinal a feature in Israel's view of God and human life. Their hope of immortality was a dimly felt and often little realised corollary of their religion. "Jehovah is my portion. . . . He will not leave my soul in Sheol. . . . He will show me the path of life," and since God is eternal, those who trust in Him shall not perish. "God is not the God of the dead but of the living."

The Apocrypha and Apocalyptic literature generally present many features of interest for the student of eschatology, which are well brought out by Mr. Charles. A bird's-eye view of the somewhat complex subject of Jewish opinion in the two centuries immediately preceding the coming of Christ was a desideratum, and the reader will find here exactly what was needed. We observe that Mr. Charles promises a separate work on the subject in the course of the present year and we shall await its publication with interest. In dealing with the New Testament, Professor Salmond is on familiar ground, but his article is no mere *résumé* of his published book. We notice that with regard to the much discussed texts, 1 Peter iii. 18 and iv. 6, Dr. Salmond does not speak so positively as in his Cunningham lectures. He says here, "the exegesis of these passages has still many uncertainties and awaits yet for its key, while the passages themselves stand entirely alone in the New Testament." On the whole he considers that Peter's eschatology is in general accord with that which is elsewhere recognised in the New Testament. Dr. Beet's volume on *The Last*

*Things* is not mentioned in the bibliography, nor is Dahle's *Life after Death*, nor Fyfe's *The Hereafter*. But a full bibliography would run to an enormous length.

Of ecclesiastical articles in the present volume some of the most important are Dr. Plummer's on "Baptism," Professor Gwatkin's on "Bishop" and "Church Government," and Mr. S. C. Gayford's on "Church." Semi-philosophical articles are well represented by Mr. Kilpatrick's "Conscience," and Mr. T. B. Strong's "Ethics." Professor Gwatkin deals summarily with questions on which volumes still continue to be written. The general equivalence of bishops and elders in the New Testament he takes for granted; the question of the origin of the name *ἐπίσκοπος*, he thinks, is "best left undecided." He does not approve Harnack's theory that while bishops and deacons had the care of worship and the poor, the elders formed a kind of court occupied with questions of discipline. Professor Gwatkin says that this view "may contain more than a germ of the truth," but that it "cannot be accepted without many important reservations." We should have spoken even more strongly than he as to the unlikelihood that in New Testament times the duties of these officers were so widely separated as Harnack's theory implies, especially if the evidence of the Pastoral Epistles is to be admitted. Harnack, however, assigns the relevant portions of these Epistles to a late date, the middle of the second century. On the general question, Professor Gwatkin says, in his article on Church government, that in the New Testament there is no clear trace of bishops in the later sense, nor of any apostolic ordinance that every Church should have its bishop; but he thinks that

"episcopacy must have originated before the apostles had all passed away, and its early strength in Asia cannot well be explained without some encouragement from St. John. But it must at first have been local and partial, and due, perhaps, to more causes than one."

Dr. Hort's *Christian Ecclesia*, it seems, had not appeared in time for use in the article. We greatly prefer its method

to that of Professor Gwatkin, though we cannot precisely agree with the detailed conclusions of either of these able experts. The *fundamental* points in this age-long controversy are now settled amongst scholars almost beyond discussion.

History and geography have, we fear, been unfairly thrust into the background of our article, as compared with theology. These subjects used to form the chief feature in Bible Dictionaries, and their importance is still very great. They have not been slighted by Dr. Hastings, as will appear when we say that Professor Hommel writes twenty-eight columns on Assyria and thirty-two on Babylonia; "Egypt," of about the same length, is undertaken by Mr. W. E. Crinn, of the Egyptian Exploration Fund; Professor Ramsay writes on Corinth and Ephesus, and Professor G. Adam Smith on Bashan and Carmel, Dr. Margoliouth on Arabia and Ethiopia, Sir C. Warren on Gadara, Colonel Conder on Bethany, and Dr. Selah Merrill on Galilee. To Professor R. W. Moss are committed the names of Antiochus, Alexander, Demetrius and others connected with the Greek period of Old Testament history. Professor Rendel Harris, with whom is associated Mr. A. T. Chapman, gives a good account of the Exodus and Journey of Israel to Canaan, and draws attention to the accumulating material now available to illustrate the Biblical narrative. The writers say, "it must not be supposed that the result is an unmixed confirmation of the Biblical account, still in a very large measure that account has been confirmed and the differences can be in part at least explained. The attitude of the article towards miracle is as follows :

"We may lay on one side any question of direct miraculous agency; where the phenomena are so nearly natural to the country, we may be content to say that they are not necessarily unhistorical, and that the question of miracle is merely one of interpretation."

These and similar remarks are no doubt to be understood in the light of Mr. Harford-Battersby's article on "Exodus."

He assumes that the narrative, so far from being contemporary, is made up of three, one of which (P)

“has no independent value as a witness to the Mosaic period, and the materials in E, and to a less extent in J, require careful sifting before being regarded as correctly representing an age which to them was already a distant age.”

Here, as elsewhere, we find almost complete acceptance of current criticism of the Pentateuch and large admissions of historical inaccuracy, coupled with an emphatic insistence upon the religious value of the narratives in question. The subject is too important for incidental discussion, and we content ourselves with pointing out the attitude of the “Dictionary” generally upon these matters.

As we said towards the beginning of this article, some of the most valuable work in the Dictionary is put into short articles, soon read and easily dismissed by a hasty reader, but containing the results of long and careful study. It is a great boon to busy ministers and students of the Bible thus to have the work of the ablest scholars brought, so to speak, to their very doors and made so easily accessible. Canon Driver's articles, for example, on “Day of Atonement,” “Ephod,” “Abomination,” “Azazel,” are illustrations of this, but other articles by less eminent writers are almost equally excellent. The care bestowed upon minutiae is remarkable, and we have noticed exceedingly few misprints. The only case in which any opinion other than that of the appointed writer is recorded, is under “Accadius,” a subject entrusted to Professor Ira M. Price, of Chicago. The editor here appends a note warning the reader that while Professor Price is an accomplished Assyriologist, the majority of experts in the subject are against him on the subject of the identity of the Sumerians and Accadians. Other articles claim mention, such as those of Professor M'Alister, of Cambridge, upon Natural History, and Professor A. R. Kennedy on Old Testament Archæology, but merely to enumerate articles in a Dictionary is wearisome, and where all the work is so good, it is invidious to pass by any names.



Enough, however, has been said to show our readers how valuable an encyclopædia of Biblical knowledge is now being placed within their reach at very moderate cost. Roughly speaking, here are nearly nine hundred closely printed pages, containing nearly two thousand words apiece, giving the results of the latest research in the clearest and most attractive form, for a guinea. This is to be the first of four volumes, and it is safe to say that those yet to come will at least equal the first instalment in interest and value. For Professor Davidson and Professor Sanday are to write on GOD, Professor Sanday on JESUS CHRIST, and Professor Ryle on "Israel." Canon Driver writes on "Moses" and "Law," Professor Strack on the text of the Old Testament, and Mr. J. O. F. Murray, on that of the New ; Professor Margoliouth and Dr. Thayer dealing respectively with the two sacred languages. Professor Karl Budde is to contribute the article on "Poetry," Professor Nowack writes on "Micah," and Graf Baudissin on "Priest." Amongst Methodist scholars we notice that Dr. Davison has undertaken "Job" and "Psalms," and Professor Findlay is to deal with "Paul"—all articles of the first importance. A melancholy interest attaches to the article on the Book of Wisdom, which was all that the late lamented Dr. Moulton felt free to promise for the new Dictionary, and now his pen is for ever still. Other contributors have also passed away in the short period that has elapsed since the Dictionary was projected, amongst whom we note Principal Reynolds and Professor Candlish.

In closing, we heartily congratulate editor, publishers and contributors upon the notable success which has already been secured in the publication of this handsome and valuable volume. It is nothing less than a monument of Biblical scholarship amongst English-speaking people at the close of the nineteenth century. It will form a landmark for many a year to come. It may not command universal approbation in details ; in the present state of Biblical study that is out of the question. But it is a piece of work admirably conceived and nobly executed. Dr. Hastings and

his co-workers have earned the best thanks of all Biblical students in this country for the moderate and reverent, but candid and fearless way in which they have accomplished a difficult task, and it is not hazardous to prophesy that they have secured the reputation of Messrs. T. & T. Clark's Dictionary as *the* standard work of Biblical reference in English-speaking countries for a generation to come.

---

ART. III.—A FLOWER-HUNTER IN QUEENSLAND.

*A Flower-Hunter in Queensland and New Zealand.* By Mrs. ROWAN. With Map and Illustrations. London : John Murray. 1898.

THIS is a brightly-written book ; and the illustrations, mainly of natural scenery, are excellent, heightening the vivid impression, produced by Mrs. Rowan's picturesque narrative, of the remarkable beauty and richness of Queensland. Mrs. Rowan is professedly a flower-hunter, but she is much more. Indeed, the least satisfactory parts of her interesting volume are those relating to the brilliant indigenous vegetation. That she has an eye quickly entranced by gorgeous colour and graceful and delicate form is abundantly evident, but her science falls far short of her delight. As a directory to the floral wealth of Queensland *A Flower-Hunter* is of little value. No list is given of the plants collected. There is a paucity of exact botanical information, for which glowing eulogy in general terms is an inadequate substitute. But, notwithstanding, the book is of real value. The salient features of the charmingly varied landscape are clearly, though incidentally, presented. We see, as we accompany Mrs. Rowan on her adventurous excursions, magnificent forest, valleys of great luxuriance, far-spreading grassy plain and impenetrable jungle. We talk with the aborigines in their native wilds. We get vivid glimpses of

colonial life on solitary cattle stations, on sugar plantations, and in gold-mining districts. We come into close quarters with the singular fauna of this island-continent, this very old land-surface. We are often in the midst of scenery of inexpressible loveliness. There is a strong dash of perilous escapade and exciting incident. The book is full of movement, colour, life, romance.

The forests of Queensland are on a grand scale. The mountains are clothed to their summits with large timber. On the eastern slopes flourish majestic trees of red cedar, beech and pine ; on the western face are rosewood, sandalwood, myall and ironwood, all of great value for costly and ornamental cabinet work, but so common that they are used for fuel. The wide margin of coastlands, thousands of square miles in extent, is covered with forests of gum-trees, iron-bark, blood-wood, native sassafras,

"fig trees of every shade of foliage, broad-leaved Leichardts and many others, all interspersed with feathery palms and creeping vines, forming such a thick canopy above that they shut out all sunlight, whilst their long, trailing arms, twisting and clasping, stretch from one stem to another, and form such matted cords that it is impossible, except by cutting an entrance, to get through them."

Some of the gum trees grow to a gigantic height. A *eucalyptus gigantea* on Cape Otway ranges is nearly 500 feet in altitude, and measures round the base 69 feet. In the river valleys they often run up 100 feet before throwing out a branch. Their medicinal value is well known. This part of Queensland is abundantly watered by streams that pour down from the mountains, and frequently form lagoons, natural reservoirs of priceless utility. The soil is alluvial, and, in the south, will produce our English cereals and fruits ; in the north, where the climate is tropical, the vegetation is profuse, the floral beauty is of the most superb order, whilst cotton, tobacco, coffee and sugar grow to perfection.

Outside the forest region and on the western side of the mountains there are vast plains, partly flat and treeless and partly undulating prairie. The drier tracts are sparsely

covered with salaceous plants and scattered shadeless, scraggy eucalyptus trees, forlorn objects that appear to appeal for pity as they droop and wither under the fierce glare and heat of the cloudless desert sun. Here is a picture :

"The country is all dotted with huge boulders of granite, with outcrops here and there of quartz. Evidences of the terribly dry season were very apparent. The hidden water-courses had sunk, leaving hard cracked fissures behind. The dry bark peeled from the trees as the hot wind swept through them, withered leaves strewn the ground, moss peeled off the rocks, buds were killed before they had blossomed, and dried-up petals fell each time a breath of wind stirred. Nothing remained of juicy creepers but a heap of withered arms clasping the trees. There was an unutterable look of desolation about the whole scene."

But even here there were touches of beauty. A solitary acacia with its golden blossoms "defied the fiery despot," whilst its fragrance filled the surrounding air. In the early spring the waste is carpeted with bright patches of lowly flowers ; the cotton bush, indigenous here, flaunts its orange glory amid tufted grass-trees that send up their long, slender spears. Often, however, "the landscape has a stern and oppressive grandeur." Masses of rock rise suddenly hundreds of feet, their deep rents filled with gnarled tree-trunks whose wiry roots clasp every ledge and protuberance ; while, far above the last vestige of sun-shrivelled, wind-lashed leafage, "stricken, shattered peaks, networks of sharp pinnacles with needle-points, stand gray against the intense blue of the sky." Sombre as are these areas of wilderness, they are not large as compared with the immensely wider stretches of fertile grassy and timbered land. For much of the elevated table-land is fairly watered ; it possesses a rich soil of decomposed volcanic rocks, and is clothed with magnificent natural pasture.

Reference has been made to the wonderful flora of Queensland, and it would be difficult to overstate its prodigal profusion and exquisite beauty. The lagoons and rivers are adorned with blue water lilies (*Nymphaea gigantea*),

the loveliest of all water plants, opening out a blossom of eight or nine inches in diameter, of the most delicate harebell tint, or of rich purple with a heart of gold, while the under surface of the floating leaves is bright pink. When the lotus scatters its efflorescence, dyed in the rosy hues of the dawn, amongst this constellation of azure bloom that floats on diamond-clear depths, and when white lilies moor their frail snow and ivory chalices abreast of these splendid vessels, we have surely reached the crown of all loveliness. The rivers are very beautiful with their margins of rank vegetation displaying, at once, all the charm of swaying, drooping branch, handsome foliage, and delicious colour. As the stream is ascended, tall forest trees growing on each side form a leafy aisle over the water.

"From these," says Mrs. Rowan, "trailing creepers crossed and intertwined their graceful plumes among fan-like branches, great branches of scarlet berries drooped from a dark-leaved tree to the ground in heavy clusters. Here and there a bean-tree (a native chestnut) thrust a crimson-flowered branch through the dense foliage to catch the sunlight from above; large water hibiscus trees were everywhere shedding their blossoms, and the eddy of the current swept the crimson heaps under the banks; while ipomeas (white, purple, blue and pink), wild ginger and endless trailing plants formed a thick undergrowth."

The banks of the stream are flanked, beneath the shade of the forest trees, with tangled thickets of clematis, flowering begonias, erythrinæ all aflame with crimson, and innumerable other climbing and flowering plants that love the sunlight of the river avenue and turn their faces towards it. In the water sways the tall white lily. Dragonflies dart about in search of their prey. In the early morning, the sweet notes of song-birds, the noisy chatter of gaily-painted paroquets and lauries, the incessant chirp of crickets, the scream and flutter of water birds, and the beat of the woodpecker's javelin on the bark, unite in the chorus of joy with which Nature welcomes the growing dawn. As the day advances silence gradually imposes its reign, until an absolute hush falls on forest and stream, broken only by

those sounds which are the background of silence—the plash and gurgle and rhythm of the water, and the deep sigh that seems to rise out of Nature's heart when the breeze trembles in the forest.

Mrs. Rowan frequently dwells on the beauty of such plants as the hibiscus, the white bauhinia, the cassia with its drooping golden sprays of blossom, and the delicate orchids that grow on ragged river-ledges in company with mosses, lichens and a lovely sundew. It is tantalising to be told that this sundew "proved to be the rarest of its kind," yet to be left without any clue to the name of the plant. But this is a sample of what often happens in *The Flower-Hunter in Queensland*. In early summer even the dreary sand-plains are

"one blaze of colour, with flowers of every form and hue, some like feathers, others deeply fringed, wonderful shades of hibiscus, patches of crimson desert pea, with here and there a white variety; others again more like insects, bee and butterfly orchids, black anigazanthus or kangaroo's foot, with its fine sooty fingers lined with lemon; the bright green variety, with its scarlet calyx, pink, yellow, white and crimson verticordias, sweet-scented veronicas and heaths—but their name is legion."

From the mainland the writer voyaged, under a cloudless sky and over a sparkling sea of sapphire dappled with white, to some of the islands off the northern end of Cape York Peninsula, still in quest of her favourite flowers. On Thursday Island she was delighted at the extraordinary brilliance of the sea-flowers, which were a surprise to her. Beautiful living corals and sea anemones of every shade of deep rich colour, from crimson to pink, from mauve to purple; blue, bluer than the sea of these enchanted bays, and emerald and gold. From the waters about this island £120,000 worth of pearl shell are annually brought up and sent away to the jewel marts of the East and West. Returning to Somerset, Cape York, she found herself in "a new Eden." The colour of the water, the endless shades of the jungle, and the richness of the flowers were a source of boundless delight. Some of the palms, whose young leaves are of a delicate

pink, contrasting with the vivid green of the older leaves, arrest attention ; and the mass of starry, jessamine-like flowers of another tree perfumes the air with a delicious scent. Mrs. Rowan says that it is a mistake to imagine that Australia is "a land whose flowers are without scent." Not only are the flowers in the wilds of this island-continent as delicate in form and as varied and charming in colour as "the tenderly-nurtured children of the gardens of the Old World," they are delicious in fragrance.

"What can be more exquisite or delicate than the scent of *Boronia serrulata*, *B. megastigma*, *B. heterophylla*, of the Sydney native rose, of many of the acacias, of *Anthropodium strictum*, of *Alyxia buxifolia*, or of the beautiful rock lily of Sydney (*Dendrobium speciosum*)?"

The birds of this neighbourhood are chiefly bright coloured species that flash their metallic sheen of green and purple and blue and velvet black as they cut the air with their swift pinions. There is an abundance of edible fish, and there are huge crabs that weigh as much as six or seven pounds. Alligators haunt the creeks, immense snakes, from 12 to 16 feet long, infest the jungle, colonies of green ants take possession of almost every flowering shrub, and here is what appears to be a new bit of knowledge about these marvellous insects: "Leaves and flowers are spun together by spiders that the ants keep for this purpose, and inside these homes they lay their eggs." Nothing need be said about termites, scorpions and similar creatures that redeem tropical paradises from luxurious monotony.

Visits were made to other islands. Jervis Island is inhabited by a strong, well-made race, who dye their hair golden with lime and the ashes of the Wongi tree. The place abounds with cocoanut palms, now with their nuts in every stage of ripeness, with papaw trees laden with yellow, melon-shaped fruits, and with banana palms. We see the industrious natives,

"waist deep in the water, making an early start with their canoes, and the sand strewn with their fishing tackle, spears

and baskets; the mats of their sails for a moment flapping loudly in the wind as they hoist them spreading to the breeze,"

and away the whole flotilla sails. Dove Island is of fairy-like loveliness. Mrs Rowan gives a graphic word-picture of it, which space forbids us adequately to reproduce. But when the heavens are roofed with sapphire, and each leaf of the tropical shrubs that fringe the bay sparkles with dew-drops, and the sea is green over golden sand; when flame-trees are ablaze with scarlet blossom and other nameless plants are masses of white flowers; when Nature seems "to revel in the exquisite beauty unfolded in never-ending blooms of brightest hues and vivid contrasts"; when dusky forms pass with the brown water-gourds on their heads, and the men "with backs straight as arrows" toil, waist-deep in the sea, with their nets—when all this meets our inward vision we can perhaps faintly realise the beauty of our authoress's picture. "Every bird," she says, "was singing, the air was full of scent and sound, a distant hum of bees was overhead and butterflies danced in the sunlight." We cannot linger over the remaining islands described in this volume. But the one thing that strikes us is the fact that they teem with life. Sea and air, the trees and the soil are the home of sentient creatures, swimming, burrowing, building, fighting, singing; and of the mystic unconscious energy that blooms in the coral and the orchid, and grows to stateliness in the palm, and clings and climbs in the handsome asclepiadaceæ of these lands.

A word should be said about the fungi of Queensland. They are curiously, even grotesquely, shaped, and of singular rich colours.

"Some, of a most delicately coloured pink variety, are found under logs and overhanging rocky ledges, where not a gleam of sunshine penetrates; under damp ferns and mosses are others of a most deadly-looking blue colour, or flaunting in scarlet spotted with yellow, and with purple gills."

There are green, brown and black varieties; some pulpy, others filled with yellow dust. The natives are able to distinguish the edible from the poisonous kinds. One species

[NO. CLXXX.]—NEW SERIES, VOL. XXX. NO. 2. R



is supposed to be phosphorescent, but probably the decaying timber on which it feeds emits the gleam.

Mrs. Rowan often refers to the birds of the colony, but gives no list of them, and mentions the splendour of their plumage only incidentally. The many varieties of kingfishers are flashing prisms. The fruit-eating pigeons are beautiful birds, especially the king pigeon, *M. magnifica*. The honey-eaters are bright-coloured songsters, that love to play among the scarlet blossoms of the hibiscus. Gaily dressed parrots in flocks haunt the jungle, where also white, gray, and black cockatoos scream by thousands. Water birds—ducks, cranes, geese, pelicans—sport on the lagoons. Wild turkeys, cassowaries, wallabys, bandicoots, whip-birds and bell-birds make their home in the dense foliage of the scrubs. Among the birds of prey are the eagle-hawk and the crested falcon. Of the singular mammals of the country we cannot now speak.

Something must be said about the natives of Queensland. They are a finer people physically and intellectually than the aborigines of the other Australian colonies. Mrs. Rowan visited their temporary camps on several occasions, and was not unfavourably impressed by them. Their huts, or "gunyahs," are simple structures of tree-bark, soon erected and soon taken down. A fire burns at the entrance during the night, and beside it sleep the old men and the women, the "gins." The visitor is greeted with a chorus of barking curs, and is speedily surrounded by a crowd of scantily dressed men and women. Here is one of several etchings of a camp :

"It was a very picturesque scene; the rich, dark brown natives and their huts, the reds of the dying fires and films of blue smoke as they curled upwards against the dark background of forest jungle; and in the foreground the sheen of sunlight on the river, where the little figure of a native boy was dexterously paddling a little canoe to the opposite side. Wild nature shut me in on every side."

The natives are keen trackers—"the keenest in existence;" and their hearing and sight are extraordinary. They will follow on horseback at a gallop a trail where a white man

on foot would distinguish nothing. Their ear will detect and discriminate low sounds that would make no impression on the auditory nerves of civilized men. In their nomad life they are ever in quest of food ; and nothing comes amiss—snakes, kangaroos, opossums, birds, wild honey, roots, and even “the grub of a large moth, which is roasted and is considered a great delicacy.” Mrs. Rowan asserts again and again that they are cannibals, but we take leave to regard her evidence in support of this indictment as of little value. They are extremely superstitious. Their great ceremony is a sort of masonic rite called “Bora,” through which young men have to pass before they are accounted warriors, or are permitted to marry. Candidates for the ordeal have to subject themselves to severe abstinence and athletic drill. No women are permitted under penalty of death to witness the ceremony.

These people spend their summer in the forests. When winter comes they take to higher ground and dwell in caves. They avoid contact with white men, and have some reason for the suspiciousness and ingratitude with which they are credited. Their equipment consists usually of their spears, boomerangs, and the “dilly bags” in which they carry their food. The younger natives are not ill-looking, but tattoo marks, and the hardships of their mode of life, disfigure the older members of the tribes, until they become ugliness embodied. The appearance of the old women is especially unlovely. We see them “with apish jaws, wrapped in a rug, crooning over hot embers, roasting roots,” the picture of wretchedness. But children brought under civilizing influences are found to be intelligent and honest ; not emotional or affectionate, but winning in their gentleness and faithfulness. Not much is said by Mrs. Rowan about the work of Christian missions among these aborigines. She flings a half-sneer once or twice ; but she is constrained to place a wreath over the grave of McLaren, at Cooktown, and to say—

“His was a noble life sacrificed, and had he lived he would have done more for the New Guinea natives than most of the

so-called good men there, by teaching them first to till the ground, and also to learn from his good example that the white man wishes to be their friend."

Our space is exhausted, and we cannot enter on the second part of this volume, which deals with New Zealand. The book contains a most graphic account of Queensland; and we advise our readers who wish to spend a delightful evening or two among birds and flowers, to peruse it for themselves.

#### ART. IV.—THE INDWELLING GOD.

*Divine Immanence.* An Essay on the Spiritual Significance of Matter. By J. R. ILLINGWORTH, M.A. Macmillan & Co.

IN an earlier number of this REVIEW\* we called attention to Mr. Illingworth's Bampton Lectures on *Personality, Human and Divine*, as a work that deserved high rank among rare theological masterpieces. The present volume confirms its writer's claim to be styled a master of Christian thought, whilst the very fact that it appeals chiefly to thinkers makes it the more incumbent on all who wish to strengthen the faith of intelligent people to master and reproduce the arguments of this choice and timely book. Much of the best philosophical writing of recent years, as Mr. Illingworth points out,

"has been critical, or in the technical and proper sense of the word, sceptical. But critical and sceptical phases, in the progress of thought, can never, from their very nature, be other than temporary things: they sift and question the constructions of the past; but only with a view to prepare for those that are to come. For the world, after all, is a fact; sun, moon and stars are real; men and women live and love; the moral law

is strong ;—in a word, the universe exists, and some positive account of it must needs be true ; it can never be finally explained by a negation."

Recent criticism has made the need of reconstruction more apparent. Earnest and thoughtful men are feeling after this, and they will know how to appreciate Mr. Illingworth's attempt to combine some ideas on the relation of Nature to religion, which may be familiar enough in themselves but are not always viewed in combination. The theme is happily chosen. Wordsworth's protest against the worldliness of his age has not been without effect. It is interesting to compare his sonnet :

"The world is too much with us: late and soon,  
Getting and spending, we lay waste our powers:  
Little we see in Nature that is ours,"

with Mr. Illingworth's words :

"For one love, amid all our discord, unites the modern world ; we all of us love Nature in our several ways ; men of science, poets, painters. men of religion, men of affairs are equally affected by its spell—the wonder of its processes, the glory of its aspect, the contrast of its calmness to the coil of human care. And with this feeling for Nature which, we are probably right in supposing, was never so widely diffused as at the present day—comes an increased susceptibility to those spiritual emotions which the presence of Nature inspires, and which lie at the root of what we call natural religion."

The literary naturalist of our generation and the popularity of his work form a strong confirmation of Mr. Illingworth's view. There is a growing enthusiasm among workers in this field. Mr. Kearton has just told us, in *Nature and a Camera*, how his brother journeyed from London to the Highlands of Scotland expressly to secure a photograph of a golden eagle sitting on her eyrie, but had to return without accomplishing his feat.

The sense of natural religion is thus strong in the modern mind, and this is in itself an important step towards positive, constructive belief. History has happened, and our age can

never revert to a mere religion of Nature, any more than we can go back to a state of Nature in society, or policy, or morals.

“For we have learned, from Nature itself, that the law of life is evolution, and that evolution means an increase of distinctive form. Religion, like all other things, must have become, as in fact it has become, increasingly articulate with the process of the years; its development more definite, or, in religious language, its revelation more precise.”

Mr. Illingworth sets himself to show that the Incarnation is the congruous climax of such development, and towards it natural religion inevitably tends.

His first chapter, on “Matter and Spirit,” deals with a question which lies at the root of art and religion, which colours and shapes all our views of life. We only know body and spirit in combination. The material world existed before we were born and will continue to exist when we are dead. Yet our knowledge of that world is largely qualified and coloured by the constitution of our minds, which receive their impressions from the senses. Science penetrates behind this primary aspect of the world to discover the machinery of atoms, energy and ether, by which the effects are produced, yet all its labour brings us no nearer to the knowledge of matter by itself.

“On the contrary, it lands us in a region of theories, hypotheses, ideas, which, however true we may believe them to be, are not material but mental. Thus matter, as we know it, is everywhere and always fused with mind.”

Spirit, on the other hand, is always connected with matter. It is thus impossible to disentangle the respective contributions which body and mind make to what we call experience. We cannot completely know either matter or spirit. Spirit, as a conscious and self-determined thing, reigns in a realm apart. It thinks and wills and loves, whilst matter is what moves in space. Matter is of incessant and inevitable use to spirit. Every state of consciousness depends on the brain and therefore on the blood which nourishes the brain.

"Hellenic sculptures, Gothic cathedrals, mediæval painting, modern music, are only modes of matter when regarded by themselves : yet through them the soul of man has given utterance and permanence to all the varying phases of his inward spiritual story ; which else would have been fugitive and dumb."

The material world derives no possible benefit from spirit, yet it is in countless ways adapted to further spiritual life. It is therefore hard to resist the conclusion that it exists for this very end, and that "all its ingenuity of intricate arrangement is meant to serve the purpose, which in fact it so elaborately serves." The world looms large compared with its inhabitants, and it endures whilst the generations of men pass away. Yet a single human spirit far outsoars material things. If we enlarge our view to include all generations, and measure these by the soul's immensity,

"they form an aggregate which dwarfs to nothingness the size of their temporary home ; while if, after all, they should prove immortal, the relative permanence of earthly things will be an illusion—a mere optical illusion."

Matter then is the servant of man. We who use it and find it so wonderfully adapted to our use have, however, no share in its original production, or control of its general course. We therefore

"infer that it must be guided by a Spiritual Being, of commensurate capacity and will ; while further light must of necessity be thrown upon the character of this Being by the nature of the spiritual purpose which He enables matter to subserve."

Nature by its mere aspect has in every age awakened and sustained religious ideas. Myths about sun and stars, mountains and rivers lie at the root of all early regions. This is illustrated by citations from the Egyptian Book of the Dead, the Indian Vedas, the Greek and Roman literature. The loving interest of the Christian Fathers in the sights and sounds of the natural world will somewhat surprise those who have looked on them merely as authorities for the early beliefs and customs of the Church. Mr. Illing-

worth's quotations from Protestant and Papal writers, from poets and mystics, show what a profound religious influence Nature has exerted on the thoughts and affections of the modern world.

This religious influence cannot be discredited on the ground that the sights and sounds on which it rests are illusory appearances, for the effect they produce is their sufficient title to reality. Nor may their influence be disparaged as emotional rather than rational, since there is no possible reason for elevating one element of our personality above another. The material world is therefore a manifestation of spirit. Its *prima facie* aspect does not make for materialism, but conduces to spiritual belief. What, then, is the relation of the Supreme Spirit to the material universe? Pantheism would have us believe that God is merely immanent in matter, but Pantheism is really "materialism grown sentimental." Our own spirits sustain two relations to matter. As self-conscious, self-determined beings, we transcend matter, whilst we can only realise those qualities by acting in the material world. The Supreme Spirit, we are thus led to argue, infinitely transcends the material order, yet sustains and indwells it. The Trinitarian conception of God, which we have independent reasons for believing, is thus seen intellectually to be the most satisfactory. The complete immanence of the Father in the Son, is inadequately represented by our own relation to our bodies, whilst God's immanence in creation is analogous to our presence in our works,

"with the obvious difference, of course, that we finite being who die and pass away, can only be impersonally present in our works; whereas He must be conceived as ever present to sustain and animate the universe, which thus becomes a living manifestation of Himself; no mere machine, or book, or picture, but a perpetually sounding voice."

If God is immanent in Nature He must also be immanent in man, who is a part of Nature. Conscience is thus His voice, and obedience to its call means a progressive manifestation of God in the heart. The men who know most

about goodness and holiness habitually ascribe it to the co-operation of God, and they must be credited with knowing best what is the secret of their own success. Nor is this conviction confined to the saintly few.

"It is echoed, and has been echoed, from the dawn of history, in countless human hearts; far and wide men have believed that, in the spiritual struggles of their inner life, they were aware of Divine intervention and assistance; while in proportion, as the struggle has been more successful, the conviction has grown more sure."

This is a splendid apologia for Christian experience, but the passage which describes the growing transformation of a human heart and life is even finer and more suggestive.

"Thus God's immanence in Nature, we may reasonably assert, reappears as inspiration in man. Meanwhile our spiritual character reacts upon the material instrument of its realisation, moulding the brain and nervous system, and thence the entire bodily organism, into gradual accordance with itself; till the expression of the eye, the lines of the face, the tones of the voice, the touch of the hand, the movements, and manners, and gracious demeanour, all reveal, with increasing clearness, the nature of the spirit that has made them what they are. Thus the interior beauty of holiness comes by degrees to be a visible thing; and through His action upon our spirit, God is made manifest in our flesh. While in proportion as we are enabled to recognise this progressive manifestation of God in matter, we are prepared to find it culminate in His actual Incarnation, the climax of His immanence in the world."

The Incarnation must be regarded as the self-revelation of a person to persons. The reign of Law, which guides the motions of the stars and controls vegetable and animal life, breaks down in the case of man. His appetites and instincts, though perfectly adapted to their purpose, are continually misused. Jesus Christ comes into the world to remove this lawlessness. The Gospel statements about His birth and His miracles are confirmed by the probabilities of the case, whilst the Resurrection of a sinless body, moulded by a sinless soul, is

"the obviously appropriate climax to the whole of Christ's previous attitude towards matter; the final manifestation of



His personal triumph over the totality of sin—its consequence as well as its cause—and thus the earnest of His power to restore man's entire personality to ultimate order."

In dealing with "The Incarnation and Miracles," Mr. Illingworth shows that if the whole of Nature is rooted and grounded in spirit, and if the primary characteristic of spirit is absolute self-assertion, the antecedent probability of miracles is immensely increased. When Nature was regarded as a machine set going once for all, interference with its regularity may well have seemed impossible, but if Nature is only sustained by its intimate union with spirit, it is no wonder that its processes should be modified for an adequate spiritual end. In the Incarnation the Being, who is behind all things, steps to the front and exhibits as a necessary part of the process His authoritative relation to the world. The severe economy with which Christ used the power to work miracles makes them the more impressive, whilst the very cessation of miracles adds force to the argument. There is no sign of any intention to introduce a reign of miracles, which would bring intellectual confusion into the world. The burden of Christ's teaching is

"that the course of Nature is the will of God, and that faith should recognise that will everywhere: in the clothing of the lilies, the feeding of the ravens, the fall of a sparrow, the sunshine and the rain; not less than in the sicknesses that punish, or the catastrophes that execute swift judgment upon sin. Christian life accordingly consists in accepting the order of events, not in the spirit of fatalism, but in the spirit of faith; not expecting to be exempt from what is common to man, but, patiently enduring to the end, 'as seeing Him that is invisible.' This recognition of spiritual significance where the bodily eye sees none, is the very essence of the Christian probation; the characteristic distinction of the Christian life. It is that walking by faith and not by sight, that belief of those who have not seen, upon which the Gospels and Epistles alike lay all their stress. And to make this possible, miracles, in the ordinary sense, must cease. But they cease, it should be noticed, as the scattered lights of sunrise fade into the fulness of an ampler day. They cease because the fact which they sporadically emphasised has now become a Christian commonplace; the fact that Divine Providence everywhere and always uses matter for the furtherance of spiritual ends. They do not vanish out of

history, as though they had never been, and leave men to lapse into apathetic acceptance of the inexorable order of events. They have inaugurated a new epoch: they have interpreted the order of events afresh: they have accentuated and intensified the providential aspect of the world. And their perpetual trace remains in the abiding consciousness of Christians that 'all things work together for good to them that love God.' "

The belief in a special providence also shines forth in a new light when Christ is our Master. Material nature is an instrument through which God's peculiar personal interest in humanity is shown. Jesus Christ

"first taught men to regard the world, as children look upon their father's house, with a secure sense in it, of being everywhere at home. And it is an old remark that even physical science owes more than we often think, to the friendly attitude towards Nature which this teaching introduced. But miracles were among the means, as we have seen cause to believe, which Christ employed to give weight to His words: leading men to trust His interpretation of the world by visible proof that the world was His own."

In considering the "The Incarnation and Sacraments," we see that even throughout pre-Christian history the phases of man's spiritual life are closely connected with material forms. The crude localisation of fetish worship gave place to symbolic representations such as we find in Athens, yet both alike arose from inability to realise spirit apart from matter. The life of Christ in the flesh is the visible and tangible manifestation of God's true relation to man and man's due relation to God. The human body appears in a new light as the intimate ally as well as the adequate organ of the soul. There is a ministry of matter subordinated to spirit. Christianity swept away that sham contempt of the body in which philosophers had indulged, and exalted it to a position of unique dignity as the temple of the Holy Ghost. Art was pressed into the Christian service and music became a new creation. Science also is being enlisted as an interpreter and revealer of God's working in Nature. The Sacraments were intended and ordained

"by Christ to be means, in one way or another, of union and communion with Himself. . . . Thus the Sacraments, in our

Christian view of them, are the key to the material world, as the means of union with the Supreme Reality, the personal God ; while the form of them—an ablution and a meal—our simplest bodily needs—reminds us that our bodies are an integral element in that entire personality, whose destiny is union with the Word made Flesh."

A noble chapter on "The Incarnation and the Trinity" closes the volume. We expressed a wish in noticing his Bampton Lectures that Mr. Illingworth had expanded this side of the subject, and we are thankful that he has now taken it up. If human life was to be renewed and human society reconstructed on the basis of the faith that "God is Love" it was necessary that the veil should be lifted from the Godhead to show us what those words really meant. Hence we have the revelation of the Trinity—

"that Divine Society, whose co-equal members are one in infinite eternal love, and who in that love's exuberance come forth, in a sense, from out themselves, to create, to sustain, to redeem, to sanctify, to bless."

Any adequate notion that we can form of God must include the capacity for influencing persons, and they can only be influenced in the last resort by love. Love is "the sole solution of life's problem ; and the doctrine of the Trinity is the sole metaphysic of love." Jesus Christ not only revealed that love of God but set forth Himself as the proof and exhibition of it. The revelation of the Trinity supports, and is supported by the whole weight of a fact in history with which nothing else in the world can for a moment be compared—the age-long empire of Jesus Christ over the hearts of men.

"The supremacy of the Christian religion in the field of practical achievement should commend, to men of action, the central doctrine it involves. That it has been, and is, so supreme in achievement, few serious thinkers will deny. For it has inspired a love which, both in kind and degree, remains as we have seen, unique. It has quickened by its presence all the forces that make for progress, even in what are called the secular movements of the world : while among the dim sad things of life, which no secular progress can remove—poverty,

pain, shame, sorrow, doubt, despondency, and death—it reigns, as the great consoler, incontestably alone.”

Every Christian teacher should feed his mind and heart on this noble argument—one of the most suggestive and satisfying vindications of orthodox Christianity that we have read. It will bear great fruit in opening to humble and thoughtful students views of truth which will grow more attractive and comforting the more fully they are grasped and applied to the interpretation of the ways of God both in Providence and in the Christian Revelation.

---

#### ART. V.—THE GREAT MAN THEORY OF PROGRESS.

1. *Aristocracy and Evolution.* By W. H. MALLOCK.  
London : A. and C. Black. 1898.
2. *The Will to Believe and other Essays in Popular Philosophy.* By WILLIAM JAMES, Professor of Psychology in Harvard University. London : Longmans. 1897.

IN one of the liveliest and most piquant of his essays, Professor James makes merry over Mr. Herbert Spencer's teaching concerning "Great Men and their Environment." Remarking on the platitude that a complete acquaintance with any one thing would require a knowledge of the whole universe, he says that not a sparrow falls to the ground but some of the conditions of its fall are to be found in the milky way, in the constitution of the United States, and in the early history of Europe. If any of these had been different the whole universe would, so far forth, be different from what it now is.

"One fact involved in the difference might be that the particular little street boy who threw the stone which brought

down the sparrow might not find himself opposite the sparrow at that particular moment ; or, finding himself there, he might not be in that particular serene and disengaged mood of mind which expressed itself in throwing the stone. But, true as all this is, it would be very foolish for any one who was enquiring into the cause of the sparrow's fall to overlook the boy as too personal, proximate, and so to speak anthropomorphic an agent, and to say that the true cause is the federal constitution, the westward migration of the Celtic race, or the structure of the milky way."

And yet, as both Professor James and Mr. Mallock maintain, "Mr. Spencer's sociological method is identical with that of one who would invoke the zodiac to account for the fall of the sparrow." His thought is too cosmical. He deals in generalisations so vast as to be practically useless in solving the problems which arise in the course of history. In common with most contemporary sociologists, whether individualist or socialist, he regards each society of men as an aggregate of approximately equal units. This, says Mr. Mallock, is the great reason of the practical ineffectiveness of his social philosophy, and of the social philosophy of the time. The problems with which, as practical men, we have to deal arise, not from conflicts between different social aggregates, but from the conflicts between the various parts of which those aggregates are composed. For speculative purposes, it may be sufficient to study the phenomena presented by social aggregates in themselves and in their relations to each other ; but, for practical purposes, we need to study the differences between the groups and classes which make up the aggregate. In particular, we need to study those great inequalities of natural capacity and social position out of which our current conflicts spring. Mr. Mallock, in this volume, as in his previous works on *Social Equality* and *Labour and the Popular Welfare*, undertakes to justify these inequalities of position on the ground that they spring from natural inequalities and are essential to progress. Broadly speaking, his present effort may be described as a defence of the classes in the interests of the masses.

The title of the volume is a little misleading. By aristocracy is meant, not the rule of the nobility, but the *role* of the exceptional man ; and by evolution is meant progress of a special kind. According to Mr. Mallock, progress is of two kinds. There is the progress which is the result of the struggle for existence and the survival of the fittest. There is also the progress which is the result of the action of exceptional men. In other words, progress is not one movement, but two, the one exceedingly slow, the other exceedingly rapid ; the one marked by "the preponderating reproduction of individuals slightly above the average," the other arising from the exertions of men who are superior to their contemporaries, and are able markedly to influence their own generation. It is with the rapid movement alone that the practical sociologist is concerned ; hence, for him, the exceptional man, or, as Mr. Mallock calls him, in a sense to be afterwards defined, "the great man," not the fittest, is the important factor. The fittest men, by surviving, raise the general level of the race and promote progress only in this way ; the great man promotes progress by being superior to his contemporaries. The survivor in the struggle for existence contributes to the improvement of the race by living whilst others die ; the man of exceptional ability promotes progress by helping others to live.

Social progress, then, is not a single movement, but the joint result of two, the one effected by a process of natural selection as the result of the struggle for existence, the other by the agency of exceptionally gifted men. These two movements differ from each other quite as much as the two movements of the earth—around the sun and around its axis—the one set of changes, as already intimated, being slow, like the succession of the years, the other rapid, like the quick succession of the days.

"The general rise in capacity which distinguishes the modern civilized nations from primitive man, or from the lowest savages of to-day, has been the work of an incalculable number of centuries. It has been so slow that, in many respects, it has been indistinguishable during the course of several thousand years.

The great thinkers amongst the ancient Egyptians were not congenitally inferior to the great thinkers of to-day. The brain of Aristotle was equal to the brain of Newton; whilst the masons whose hands constructed the Coliseum and the Parthenon knew as much of their craft as those who constructed the Imperial Institute. But with this slowness in the rise of the general level of capacity, let us compare the progressive results achieved within some short period. Take the past hundred years and consider the progress made in the material arts of life. How the whole spectacle changes! Within that short period, at all events, no one will venture to maintain that the average congenital capacities of our own countrymen have been enlarged. We are not wittier than Horace Walpole, more polite than Lord Chesterfield, more shrewd and sensible than Dr. Johnson; whilst it is easy to see, by reference to those trades, such as the building trades, which science and invention have done comparatively little to alter, that the natural efficiency of the average workman is no greater than in the days of our great-great-grandfathers. And yet, during that short period, what an astounding progress has taken place! To sum it up in a bald economic formula, whilst the capacities of the average Englishman have remained almost altogether stationary, the economic productivity per head of the population of this country has during the past century trebled and more than trebled itself."

In order to understand Mr. Mallock's contention that this astounding progress has been effected by exceptional men, and that the mass have contributed little or nothing, it must be borne in mind that one of his chief aims in all his economic writings is to ascertain the part played by the two main factors in production, Labour and Ability. The fundamental difference between these two forms of human exertion is that

"Labour is a kind of exertion on the part of the individual which begins and ends with each separate task it is employed upon, whilst Ability is a kind of exertion on the part of the individual which is capable of affecting simultaneously the labour of an indefinite number of individuals, and thus hastening or perfecting the accomplishment of an indefinite number of tasks."

Capital is "congealed ability." It is the result of previous exertion in the direction and organisation of labour, and it is the instrument of further production. The "great man,"

in Mr. Mallock's sense, is the man of ability, the man who influences others so as to promote progress. He is not necessarily a saint or a hero or a genius, nor need he be superior to his fellows in all his powers; all he needs in order to "greatness," in this technical sense, is the ability to help and to induce others to do that which they would not otherwise be able or disposed to do. Greatness as an agent of progress is quite compatible with mediocrity in intellect and character. It is measured by the results produced. It has nothing to do with what a man is, except in so far as what he is enables him to do what he does. A brilliant intellect or a lofty imagination is often a hindrance to practical efficiency. The inventor by himself is often helpless. He has to ally himself with a man of business to become a social force. It is the man who makes the capital at his disposal or the invention he employs efficient in producing specific results in the direction of social progress that is the great man in our author's view.

"When we say that a man is great we mean that he is exceptionally efficient in producing some particular result—in commanding armies, or in managing hotels, or in conducting public affairs, or in cheapening and improving the manufacture of this or that commodity; and when we say that such and such a man possesses the quality of greatness to such and such a degree we mean that he produces results of a given kind, which are in such and such a degree better or more copious than results of the same kind which are produced by other people. . . . Progress of an appreciable kind, in any department of social activity and achievement, takes place only when, and in proportion as, some men who are working to produce such and such a result are more efficient in relation to that class of result than the majority; or conversely, if a community contained no man with capacities superior to those possessed by the greater number, progress in that community would be so slow as to be practically non-existent."

The great man, whether in peace or war, attains his ends by precisely the same means—by organising and directing the actions of other men, by issuing his commands and securing their obedience. Mr. Spencer admits that a primitive society, if it is to succeed in war, must have a great leader to direct it; but this is just as needful in the



peaceful paths of civilized society. The composers who put into type the words "homogeneity" and "the Unknowable" from Mr. Spencer's manuscript were acting under Mr. Spencer's orders just as really as were the Guards at Waterloo who charged the French at the bidding of Wellington. When an inventor desires to make his invention useful in business or in industry he is obliged to secure the services of a number of men who act under his orders in a similar way. A great contractor is like a great commander, and so is every other "captain of industry;" and

"one of the most important, as it is one of the rarest, faculties required for maintaining a complicated civilization like our own, is the faculty by which, given a number of tasks, one man governs a number of men in the act of co-operatively performing them."

In the economic sphere there are two ways in which men of ability may obtain a control over the productive actions of other men: one is by means of slavery; the other by means of the capitalistic wage system. Both slavery and wages are contrivances by which the exceptional few may secure the obedience of the ordinary many. They differ solely in this, that the one secures obedience by working on men's fears; the other by working on their hopes, desires, and wills. The wage-system does not represent capital as such, but capital in the form of the means of subsistence owned or controlled by a small number of persons; and its efficiency as a productive agent resides in the bargain which it enables the exceptional man to make with ordinary workers to act in accordance with his directions. It is the method of inducement. The only other method is the coercive method of slavery. Curiously enough, this fact is not denied by the more thoughtful of contemporary socialists. They are coming to perceive that ability is as important a factor in production as labour, and they propose to transfer the ownership of capital to the State, and to substitute for private employers a hierarchy of State officials. For all the citizens alike (according to the preface to the

American edition of the *Fabian Essays*) an equal provision for maintenance is to be made irrespective of their relative specific services.

"The rendering of such services, on the other hand, instead of being left to the option of the citizen, with the alternative of starvation, would be required under one uniform law or civic duty, precisely like other forms of taxation or military service."

This might, as Mr. Mallock says, be an escape from capitalism, but it would be

"an escape into complete slavery. For the very essence of the position of the slave, as contrasted with the wage labourer, so far as the direction of his productive actions is concerned, is that he has not to work as he is bidden in order to gain his livelihood, but that, his livelihood being assured to him, he has to work as he is bidden in order that he may avoid the lash, or some other form of punishment; and amongst all the more thoughtful socialists there is now a consensus of admission that the socialistic State would necessarily have in reserve the severest pains and penalties for the idle and the careless and the disobedient."

In proportion as the wage-system is departed from, the system of slavery is and must be introduced.

Passing from the means of exercising industrial control, Mr. Mallock proceeds to consider how the most efficient men of ability secure this control. They do this by successfully competing against the less efficient members of their class. Progress depends on the struggle that is continually going on for supremacy and domination within the limits of the exceptional minority. In the domain of industry and commerce the standard of efficiency is the acceptability to the public of the goods or services the great man offers them. If he pleases the public, he prospers and prevails: if he does not please them, the public pass him by and he succumbs to the rival whose goods or services they prefer. There would be the same struggle under a Collectivist régime. The only difference would be as to the means by which the fittest director is placed in power and the less fit deprived of it—an official body deciding the matter in the

one case, and the mass of the consuming public deciding it in the other. The law of demand would dominate in either case, and the question is under which system the demand would be met most economically and efficiently. Under Collectivism the directors of labour could only prove their efficiency as they do at present by practical experiment. The State would need to

“invest them with quasi-military power over so many regiments of labourers for such and such a time, which power would be renewed if they could persuade the State to re-appoint them, or taken from them if the State should be persuaded that some other men, their rivals, would employ this power more usefully.”

You cannot escape from struggle and rivalry under any system of production, and Mr. Mallock gives strong reasons for the supposition that the system of industrial coercion advocated by collectivist socialists would not merely be out of harmony with modern sentiment, but an exceedingly clumsy, wasteful, and arbitrary instrument of competition. The present system works, at all events, and works with fairly equitable results. The great masses of the employed profit most when this competitive struggle amongst employers is the keenest. When two masters are running after one man his wages usually rise. It is only when two men are running after one master that their wages fall. And, of course, in a progressive country where the population is rapidly increasing, there always tends to be more hands than profitable work. There is always a struggle therefore to find remunerative employment comparable to the Darwinian struggle for existence; and for the higher kinds of work the struggle is very keen. But this is not the struggle to which progress is due.

“The struggle which produces economic progress—and progress of every kind is produced in the same way—is not a general struggle which pervades the community as a whole; neither is it a struggle between the majority and an exceptionally able minority, in which both classes are struggling for what only one can win, and in which the gain of one involves the loss of the other; but it is a struggle which is confined to the members

of the minority alone, and in which the majority play no part as antagonists whatsoever. It is not a struggle amongst the community generally to live, but a struggle amongst a small section of the community to lead, to direct, to employ, the majority in the best way; and this struggle is an agent of progress because it tends to result, not in the survival of the fittest man, but in the domination of the greatest man."

The workers are as much interested in the maintenance of this competitive struggle amongst employers as the employers themselves; for not only does it, as a rule, inflict no injury on themselves, but to it that progress in the processes of production is due on which their hopes, as much as the hopes of the employers and the rest of the community, depend. It is one of the most patent facts of modern industrial history that

"along with the vast increase in wealth which the ablest employers have, by their struggle with rivals, secured for their own enjoyment, there has been, not a corresponding diminution, but a corresponding increase in the means of subsistence that have gone to the population generally."

The question for the whole community, for every civilized community is—and it is a vital question—how can this fruitful rivalry be stimulated and maintained? How can men of exceptional ability be enabled and induced to exercise their powers? How can it be discovered whether men possess these rare and precious gifts—of leadership, of enterprise, of management, invention, influence? It can only be discovered by experiment, and men will only make the experiment under the influence of some adequate motive. What is an adequate motive to exertion of exceptional industrial ability? The pleasure of excelling? Joy in creative work? The approbation of others? The happiness of doing good? The prospect of wealth, with all that wealth can bring, of pleasure, honour, ease and influence to the man himself and to his family?

For elaborate and reasoned answers to these and kindred questions, and for an opportune and luminous but not quite convincing dissertation on "equality of educational oppor-

tunity" and on "inequality, happiness and progress," as well as for most interesting essays and excursions on minor but subsidiary topics, the reader must reluctantly be referred to Mr. Mallock's vigorous and absorbing book. The rest of our space is needed for an outline of his answer to Mr. Spencer's famous critique on the Great Man Theory and to those who use that critique in support of Socialism.

The case against the great man, as stated by Mr. Mallock in the language of Mr. Spencer, Mr. Kidd, Mr. Bellamy and Mr. Sidney Webb, is analysed by him into four arguments, to two of which, as being the most plausible and prevalent, he devotes the strength of his dialectic. In both these arguments "the distinctly exceptional character of the great man is assumed, or at all events is not denied, but it is represented as being, if it exists, not properly the great man's own." He is not therefore entitled to any exceptional reward. The first argument refers that character to the great man's social inheritance and environment; the second to his line of ancestors, from whom he inherits his exceptional capacities, "which capacities his ancestors acquired by being members of society, and of which it is accordingly contended society is the source."

To these arguments it is answered first, in general, that, in a remote and speculative sense, they are perfectly true, and indeed almost truisms, but that, for practical purposes, they are either not true at all or altogether irrelevant. To invoke them is like calling in the milky way to account for the fall of a sparrow. Without resorting to philosophic hair-splitting or indulging in Hegelian paradox, it is easy to show that the same statement may be true or not true according to the nature of the discussion on which it is brought to bear.

"If the vast majority of any given population, *e.g.*, vary in height between the limits of five feet six and six feet, the statement that a man's average height is from five feet seven to five feet eight would be a truth most important to producers of ready-made overcoats. But if half the population were two feet high, and half rather more than nine feet, to give the average as something like five feet seven would be for the coat-

makers the most absurd misstatement imaginable, and would lead them, if they acted on it, to make garments that would fit nobody."

The relevance or irrelevance of a statement admits of equally easy and homely illustration. Goods when sent by rail have to be sorted according to bulk, weight, fragility, perishability, &c.

"In deciding which are to be sent by fast trains and which by slow, the primary question will be that of perishability. When the perishable and non-perishable have been separated, and they are being placed on the trains allotted to them, the primary questions will be those of shape, weight, and fragility. But so long as the preparatory separation is in progress, to assert that the goods possess any of these latter characteristics will be wholly irrelevant, no matter how true. . . . Each characteristic, and every classification based on it, will be either relevant or irrelevant, full of meaning or meaningless, according to what question, out of a considerable series, has to be answered at the moment by the officials who superintend the business."

In like manner, arguments which though true to the speculative philosopher, and apposite to the point he aims to prove, may have no meaning for a practical man and no relevance to the problems he desires to solve. This is notably the case with respect to the arguments before us.

With respect to the argument that the great man owes his faculties to his ancestors, and through his ancestors to the society which helped to develop his ancestors, it is obvious that this, though a speculative truism, leads to the utmost absurdities if we apply it to practical life. For

"if the inferior competitors who were beaten by the great man's ancestors are to be credited with having helped to produce the talents by which they were themselves defeated, and must therefore be held to have had a claim on the wealth which these talents produced, which claim has descended to the inferior majority of to-day, the same claim might be advanced by any weaker nation which, after a series of battles, succumbs to the stronger."

The French might say to the Germans,

"by fighting with us you developed the powers by which you overcame us; your strength therefore in reality belongs to us,

and all that it procured for you ; therefore, in strict justice, you should hand us back the provinces we helped you to acquire."

In the same way it might be urged that all the idle apprentices of the world, by the warning they have afforded, have stimulated industry, and that, therefore, they and their like have a claim on the earnings of the industrious.

But for the fact that reasonings such as these are at the bottom of much of the popular socialistic rhetoric of the day, we should be ashamed to dwell on such transparent sophistries. "Fantastic puerilities," Mr. Mallock calls them, and yet he feels it to be necessary to expose them and attack them with a vast variety of weapons from his well-stored armoury. He shows how fatalistic is the socialistic and Spencerian argument. If the great man owes his greatness to society, the idle man owes his idleness to the same source, and the stupid man his stupidity, and the dishonest man his dishonesty. The doctrine strikes at the root of all morality. If a man's character and conduct are the results of heredity and environment alone, he cannot be accountable for his actions. He cannot justly be rewarded for his virtues or punished for his crimes. But it is in the field of economics that the battle is now being fought. With copious illustration and with cogent argument Mr. James and Mr. Mallock show that if the great man who produces an exceptional amount of wealth can, with justice, claim no more than the average man who produces little, because the great man is the product of society past and present, then the idle man may, with equal justice, claim as much wealth as either, for his idleness (and every other form of economic incompetence) is equally the product of society.

With equal cogency both these brilliant writers argue against the assertion that most of the achievements of the great man depend on past achievements and discoveries and that he adds little to what has been already done. This is Mr. Spencer's main contention. The great man owes his

greatness chiefly to the fact that he inherits the fruits and achievements of civilization. "A Laplace, for instance," he says, "could not have got very far with the *Mécanique Céleste* unless he had been aided by the slowly developed system of mathematics, which we trace back to its beginnings amongst the ancient Egyptians." Shakespeare could never have written his dramas but for the "multitudinous conditions of civilized life." True to the point of truism ! But it is equally true that but for Shakespeare the conditions of civilized life, however multitudinous, would never have produced his plays. The question is how to account for Shakespeare and his works. How was it that the Elizabethan age did not produce a hundred Shakespeares ? How is it that there are no Shakespeares now when the conditions of civilized life have become a thousandfold more multitudinous and favourable ? The fact is, as Mr. Mallock shows, that while all men inherit the past they inherit it in widely different degrees.

"They inherit the knowledge of the past only according to the degree in which they acquire it ; the language of the past only according to their skill in manipulating it ; the inventions of the past only according to their skill in reproducing and using them."

Shakespeare's contemporaries had the same environment and the same national antecedents that he had, but they were not able to do what he did. The introduction of the past into the question is a far-fetched irrelevance and leaves the differences between the great man and others undiminished. If the ordinary man does anything the exceptional man does more, and he is just as really the cause of the progress that is attributed to him as the ordinary man is of the things and actions that are attributed to him. "Therefore," to let Mr. Mallock close this most imperfect outline of his argument,

"if the ordinary man does any of the things that he seems to do, and causes any of the events he seems to cause—if he ploughs the farm that he seems to plough, and lays the bricks



that he seems to lay—indeed, we may add, if he eats the dinners that he seems to eat—the great man in a precisely similar sense is the cause of those changes that he seems to cause. Hence, of these changes he is, for the practical sociologist, not merely the proximate initiator, whose action and peculiarities may be neglected, but a true and primary cause, on which the attention of the sociologist must be concentrated; and just as in action it is impossible to do without him, so in practical reasoning it is impossible to go behind him."

---

#### ART. VI.—SIDE LIGHTS ON METHODISM.

*Side Lights on the Conflicts of Methodism during the Second Quarter of the Nineteenth Century, 1827-1852.* Taken chiefly from the Notes of the late Rev. Joseph Fowler of the Debates in the Wesleyan Conference. A Centenary Contribution to the Constitutional History of Methodism. With a Biographical Sketch. By BENJAMIN GREGORY, D.D. Cassell and Company.

JOSEPH FOWLER died in 1851, so that the publication of his notes of the Wesleyan Conference debates cannot be described as premature. Many will no doubt be of opinion that it might have been wiser to leave them in manuscript rather than to stir up the memory of old controversies. Dr. Gregory says, "It seems a strange predicament to have to apologise for conferring a great boon on one's contemporaries and posterity by saving them from serious loss." But, though we do not agree in all their editor's judgments and interpretations, we regard these notes as a singularly interesting and valuable contribution to the study of one of the most memorable and most distressing periods of Methodist history. Joseph Fowler is a witness whose alertness and accuracy are acknowledged on all sides. Dr. Bunting, in a speech on reporting at the Conference of 1849, said, "I have great confidence in one

individual who has been accustomed to take from year to year copious notes of the proceedings of Conference ;" and Mr. W. M. Bunting added his testimony, "I have long deeply and religiously loved Joseph Fowler, and conceived of him as of one of the princes of the Wesleyan pastorate, both in the pulpit and out."

Dr. Gregory's unrivalled knowledge of the details of Methodist life and history enriches every page of this record. His memory is so royal that those who are less richly gifted in this direction are sometimes a little inclined both to doubt and to wonder. It is evident, however, that he has reduced reminiscence to a science. Few of his treasures were better worth opening than those relating to Joseph Fowler. His own position in Methodism half a century ago and the imperial reputation won by his son—Sir Henry Fowler—give peculiar interest to the chapter devoted to this sagacious and noble man.

Mr. Fowler was born at Bradford in 1791, and

"retained through all the changes of his life the strongly marked characteristics of the genuine Yorkshireman. He was shrewd, frank, self-reliant, and outspoken, warm-hearted, practical, appreciative, and wide-awake. In manner he was sometimes bluff, and on occasion brusque, but in catholic appreciativeness, in helpful sympathy and in high-toned honour, and in all the fealties of friendship he was as good as gold and as true as steel."

Dr. Gregory lingers gratefully over the "cordiality and, above all, *respect*" which this grave and solemn-seeming man paid him when he was a guest in his house as a school-boy of twelve. They were afterwards colleagues in London and Hull, and no one could more thoroughly appreciate Mr. Fowler's reminiscences of Methodism. Mr. Fowler

"had the indispensable pre-requisites of effective tale-telling. He threw himself into his story with an *abandon* of enjoyment. He hit off the salient points, and left the listener to draw the moral. It was a kind of necromancy of narrative. One had but to say: Bring me up Bramwell, or John Barber, or Timothy Crowther, or other of the old worthies, and the old prophet stood before one."

In the pulpit Mr. Fowler was the great preacher of sacred biography and Scripture character and narratives, who "brought the truth home to men's businesses and bosoms, and gave both leaders and members something to talk of in their class meetings." In Conference he was the recognised leader of the party that claimed freedom of speech, of enquiry and of discussion. He claimed that every subject of importance should be sifted and ventilated so that an intelligent decision might be reached. Dr. Gregory has given an exquisite sketch of the man, which will be read with keen interest in extra-Methodist circles by those who wish to know what manner of man the father of Sir Henry Fowler was.

For many years no report of the proceedings of Conference was presented to the public, but about 1823 Joseph Fowler saw what a wealth of interest would attach to these debates in after years and began to keep his record. Readers of these pages must remember that the Conference was a ministerial brotherhood, and that no detailed reports of its Conversations were published. This tended much to the freedom of debate. What would now sound as personalities were then regarded as homely thrusts, such as those in which a large and lively family will often indulge. Dr. Gregory says that Mr. Fowler's notes

"perform for us the wonders of the new photography, empowering us to see through the stone walls and the honest brickwork of the solid, quaint old sanctuaries, where the conclaves were assembled, and then put to our ear the telephone through which their deliberate articulations and their solemn, earnest cadences still strike upon our ears."

Methodism has seldom had a finer set of leaders in Conference than in the year when Joseph Fowler opened his notebook. There was Adam Clarke, who ranked among the first scholars and *savants* in Christendom, and was even mightier with his voice than with his pen. Joseph Entwisle and Joseph Sutcliffe were the two saintliest-looking men Dr. Gregory ever saw. Richard Watson towered above his

brethren both in physical and mental stature. He stood six feet two and had an extraordinary forehead—

“not cast like a cannon-ball, in a mould that had been used before and might be used again, but as if elaborately modelled by a master workman's hand. For native dignity of carriage and of utterance, he was quite unrivalled ; yet his quiet talks to boys were in a subduing tenderness of tone which made his patriarchal counsels sink deep into the heart.”

Dr. Gregory describes him as “the stateliest intellect our Church has yet produced.” Jabez Bunting was the acknowledged leader of the Conference, whose “immensely preponderating personality” coloured and shaped all the history of that age.

We do not wish to follow Dr. Gregory in his detailed study of the famous organ controversy at Leeds. We have already discussed that subject in earlier numbers of this REVIEW. But Dr. Gregory shows that Jabez Bunting was not without warrant for his dictum that “The Yorkshire Methodists, with all their excellencies, need teaching a lesson.” So early as 1803, when William Bramwell was in Leeds, he had become the nucleus and head of an ungovernable Revivalist party, whose doings led Richard Reece to write :

“If a Revivalist must be supported by one preacher and two leaders in opposition to three preachers and fifty leaders, when he tramples the rules of our Society under his feet, and that merely because he is a ‘Revivalist,’ Revivalism will be the ruin of Methodism.”

Mr. Sigston, who became head of the party after Bramwell's removal, was an autocratic schoolmaster, whose temper may be gauged by the fact that he summarily dismissed his young usher for no other fault than expressing disapproval of the proceedings of the party. The usher was the future Sir Isaac Holden, M.P.

There was a good deal of unrest at this time in the Connexion. City Road, London, was in a depressed and declining state, so that, in 1829, Richard Watson was taken from Birmingham, to which he was pledged, and was put

down for London. Mr. Fowler demanded a vote, and this was the first ever taken on a question of stations. London won its man by one vote. It was a happy appointment. City Road soon began to regain its lost ground, and at Southwark the benignant policy of the Treffrys, father and son, with the help of other wise and kindly men, saved the Connexion from serious discord and loss.

One charm of Mr. Fowler's notes lies in their wealth of detail. In 1834 the Missionary Secretaries complained of Thomas Collins for "declining to go abroad." Jabez Bunting said ; "I trust he will be looked after as to his zeal for the home work. Let him not think that we are satisfied with him. We think him defective in zeal." Jabez Bunting's usual penetration must have deserted him. Thomas Collins "defective in zeal"! The facts seem to have been misunderstood. Collins did not decline to go to the West Indies, but frankly explained his altered circumstances, and left it to the Conference to decide whether he should go abroad. Happily for Methodism he was allowed to remain in England.

Nothing in this volume is more ominously instructive than the discussion on the case of James Everett. It was reported at the Conference of 1834 that he had a thriving bookseller's business in Manchester, though his name appeared on the Minutes as a supernumerary minister. He had the appearance and habit of a man in robust health, and was doing

"an amount of preaching and platform speaking, which involved a larger expenditure of energy and of exposure in coach-travelling by night and in the winter than any ordinary circuit work entailed."

This had been going on for eleven years. Mr. Everett was asked whether he could not return to circuit work. He replied, "I have not for some time had any return of my old complaint. I could preach every Sabbath, but do not know what the week-night work might do." Richard Reece expressed his opinion that it would be wise to leave Mr.

Everett where he was, for, if his health broke down in a year or two, he might not recover his business. It was, however, felt to be an anomaly for a man engaged in trade to be receiving help from the Preachers' Fund, and he returned to circuit work, with results which are written in the darkest page of Methodist history.

Another unfortunate decision retained William Griffith on probation "after all his manifestations of untamable individualism and insubordination, and his eager politics, and despite the warnings of such men as Beaumont, Reece and Bunting." The trio afterwards so notorious had a black record, for Richard Reece informed the Conference that he found himself yet more incompetent to superintend Mr. Dunn than Mr. Griffith; that he could manage the Sheffield Circuit and District, but Mr. Dunn was quite beyond his powers. Some one else must solve the problem, how to superintend a colleague who would not be superintended. Dunn's case was met by appointing him as Superintendent at Tadcaster, with Dr. Moulton's grandfather as his young man.

Dr. Gregory points out that the debates in Conference consist mainly of Dr. Bunting's epigrammatic and incisive utterances. It is evident that the matrimonial affairs of the probationers caused some anxious hours to their fathers in the ministry. The Nestor of the debates expressed his opinion: "The devil is assailing the young men of this Connexion in a particular way. I lament the tremendous evil of young men living out of the house of their superintendents." Complaint was made that the Halifax Circuit had been left without a preacher during Conference, though it was suffering from a division. It was proposed that the offender should be heard, but Jabez Bunting replied:

"He has no right to be heard, but he has a right to hear us. In Mr. Wesley's time no man came to Conference without his leave, the living John Wesley is the Brethren in full Connexion. No member of the Hundred even has the right to come without the consent of his District Meeting."

Two years later, in the Conference of 1836, Bunting said,

"One old Methodistical habit was to repeat the Lord's prayer after one's own. I wish it was revived." That desire has happily been realised. He also referred to the fact that he had been the means of keeping that fine scholar and preacher, Thomas Galland, to Methodism; "and there is no other 'ism half so good for a man's soul." Mr. Fowler had been sorely tried by the flood of talk at the Sheffield Conference in 1835. "The unexampled prolixity of the last three days has given me a distaste for anything of the like kind." Happily he found courage to resume his pen.

At the Centenary Conference of 1839 education took a prominent place in connection with the Government scheme of the day. The Bill brought into Parliament provided that the Bible should be read and taught in all State-aided schools, but it did not forbid the use of the Douay version for Roman Catholic children. Dr. Bunting strongly opposed the measure because "Popish chaplains were to be employed." He objected to any version of the Scriptures save one being used in the schools.

"I am against schools being established by the State. Let every denomination educate its own children. The instruction provided in these schools is said to be religious instruction. That I deny. I defend my own expression. The distinction between general instruction and special religious instruction is *ineffably absurd*. No man was ever converted by this general instruction. What right have we to separate what God has joined together? What right have we to think that education sufficient for the poor which is not sufficient for our own children? Popish priests can attend from three to four o'clock, but what other ministry can? And Popish priests are not married; they may do it. They have no itinerancy, no leaders' meetings."

At the same Conference the question whether the President should reside in London was discussed. Dr. Bunting said that if not indispensable it was extremely desirable, and expressed a hope that the time would come when a house would be provided for the President in the Metropolis. His saying, in reference to a West African appointment, that "a missionary ought to be willing to live anyhow, and die

anywhere," is, as Dr. Gregory says, "worthy of being remembered among the oracles of Methodism."

A most interesting discussion arose as to licensing chapels for marriages. Jacob Stanley held that "the time will come when it will be as common to solemnize matrimony as to administer baptism." "The annoyances arising from teetotalism" were also dwelt on. The singing at Brunswick Chapel, Leeds, caused some discussion. It was stated that improper tunes were used, and four lines given out instead of two. Dr. Bunting thought there was much danger of irreverent singing. "These galloping tunes are bad. It is a great scandal to have persons conducting our singing who are not religious. I would insist on good men to conduct our singing, as well as to read prayers."

Some expressions in the Address to the Irish Conference were regarded as political. One of the speakers held that "the least said about politics the best. You had better leave such matters to our own prudence and Protestantism. We Wesleyan ministers are objects of jealousy to all parties." Mr. Scott urged, "we should not with so much frequency allude to our support of the Church. I would avoid it now." Dr. Bunting made a characteristic deliverance.

"I have lived long enough to know that large and sweeping censures against Christian bodies are generally unjust. I think we are in danger in these Centenary times of going to extremes. Mr. Wesley was asked by Mr. Moore if Mr. Fletcher had escaped this precipice. Mr. Wesley kept on writing; the question was reiterated. At length Mr. Wesley threw down his pen and said, 'Yes, Harry, I think he has; but if any man attempt to follow him, he will be sure to tumble over it.'"

Next year there was mourning over the death of Theophilus Lessey, a preacher of the highest rank and of the finest evangelical stamp. Dr. Dixon pointed out that he was "all the more popular because so evangelical and earnest. To aim at popularity was very paltry in a minister of Christ." Samuel Jackson described the holy indignation which Lessey had expressed on listening to a non-Methodist sermon from a Methodist pulpit. Lessy said, "I could have collared the



man." Mr. W. M. Bunting added, "I can't imagine how any Methodist preacher can have any pleasurable feeling in preaching anything else than the vital doctrines of the Gospel."

The examination of candidates for ordination was made most thorough and most stimulating. At the Conference of 1836 the President, Jabez Bunting, reported that he had spent nine hours with the young men in private, enquiring into their religious experience and was thoroughly satisfied. The theological examination recalls the early days of Wesley, when doctrine held such a prominent place in the Conversations of Conference.

"Some candidates quoted the passage, 'Godly sorrow worketh repentance.' The President observed on the inappropriateness of the quotation as applied to the penitence which comes before justification by faith. He insisted that the passage refers to 'a case of ecclesiastical discipline,' and that as God 'justifieth the ungodly,' no sorrow before justification can be called 'godly sorrow.' He maintained that 'the penitent is considered under the wrath of God until he believes.' Mr. Grindrod: 'Repentance does not abate the judicial displeasure of God.' Dr. Fisk (the representative of American Methodism) who took an animated part in the 'conversation' introduced the subject of the witness of the Spirit. Next came the doctrine of Christian Perfection. Mr. Treffry attributed the Calvinistic denial of that verity to the preposterous and unscriptural tenet that 'the body is the seat of sin, and therefore the dissolution of the body is necessary to the extermination of sin.'"

How frank the discussion was may be seen from the President's statement as to the baptismal service of those days: "There are many things in that form which nothing in the world could induce me to use." Nothing interested these fathers like a good theological discussion. In the Conference of 1837, when some point in the Pastoral Address was challenged, Dr. Bunting insisted that "when born, we are placed in a provisional state of salvation." Dr. Dixon said, "I believe and preach that by baptism we are brought into visible connection with the Church." In 1844 Mr. W. M. Bunting said

"A man cannot know his own justification and adoption but

by the witness of the Spirit. He knows his own regeneration by the witness of his own spirit, his own consciousness of the movements of the Spirit on his affections and his dispositions."

A candidate who referred to Tillotson's views on eternal punishment, was told by Dr. Bunting, "Tillotson is no authority here." He had to state his *own* opinion on the subject that the Conference might judge of its accordance with the Scriptures and the Methodist standards. Dr. Hannah urged the young men to "a sedulous and indefatigable study of the Scriptures, as the one effective safeguard against the want of freshness and reality in preaching," whilst Dr. Beaumont advised them not to be ashamed of Methodist phraseology. "I like the Evangelical vocabulary," he said. Such counsels, followed by the President's impressive address to the young men, must have borne gracious and abiding fruit.

The Conference of 1845 gave considerable attention to the case of Mr. Caughey, the American revivalist. He was causing strong partisan feeling in many circuits, and his methods were open to grave objection. He would call together converted people from other circuits and get them to promise that as soon as he invited penitents to come forward to the rail they would crowd up in order to allure others. He had the gift of drawing people to decision, but the unrest becaused was becoming serious, and Dr. Bunting urged that he ought to go back and give his fellow-countrymen the benefit of his rare gifts.

"Let us catch his zeal and fervour; and let the Americans have a chance. He does say very improper things, and then pauses, and looks as if he had delivered some supernatural communication, such as 'a young man who now sits before me will die within twelve months.' He passes off as revelation things that are either fancy or fraud."

Dr. Gregory adds painful confirmation of this indictment. One of his own schoolfellows, who listened to such a statement of Caughey's,

"felt himself doomed; went home and shut himself up in his room and never left it till the church chimes rang in on next

New Year's Day and proved the illusiveness of the vaticination. But, to his dying day, his nervous system never quite recovered from the shock it then received."

At the next Conference Mr. Caughey's position caused extended discussion. Dr. Newton complained that he occasioned a very great amount of Sunday travelling. One inn had as many as twenty conveyances bringing people to hear him, and an extra Sunday train had been run for the purpose. Nor was this all.

"Acquainting himself beforehand with facts with regard to individuals, he declares them from the pulpit as if they were learned by spiritual intuition; he says he has been on his knees for hours, and the Lord will not give him another text, when people in the congregation had been talking with him nearly all the time between the two services."

The wealth of detail in this volume is astonishing, and light is thrown on many stages of Methodist development. But all minor matters are eclipsed by the absorbing interest of the closing chapters. Dr. Gregory was in the very heart of the controversy which rent Methodism asunder half a century ago and was a zealous worker in the cause of peace and forbearance. He evidently inclined a good deal to the side of the reform party, and is lenient in his verdict on some of its leaders, but his pages are full of lessons for our own times. The discussion of Dr. Bunting's policy is specially valuable. Bunting had the great honour of originating the mixed committees of ministers and laymen, but it was not till 1851 that the Conference consented to take into consideration the representative principle in the appointment of lay members of Connexional Committees. Dr. Bunting frankly declared, in 1851, "I am a reformer of forty years' standing." His aim was "to solidify and to consolidate the whole economy of Methodism, and to give to our economy homogeneity, cohesion, vigour and effectiveness." He was no doubt impetuous and masterful. He found it hard to brook opposition to any plan on which his heart was set, but his real greatness has never even yet received due recognition.

Dr. Gregory has shown the dangers attendant on such influence as Dr. Bunting wielded—dangers which neither he nor his brethren altogether escaped. Some sparks were no doubt thrown off in the heat of debate, but Jabez Bunting was a Christian gentleman of exquisite courtesy, and his kindness to young men was a fine feature of his character. This volume may reveal some of the limitations of the master mind, but it will add to the reputation for sagacity, far-sightedness, sterling sense and entire devotion to his Church of the greatest and most broad-minded statesman whom Methodism has produced since the days of Wesley himself.

---

ART. VII.—APOSTOLICAL SUCCESSION : THE  
LATEST NONCONFORMIST MANIFESTO.

1. *Apostolic Succession in the Light of History and Fact. The Congregational Union Lecture for 1897.* By JOHN BROWN, B.A., D.D. Congregational Union. 1898.
2. *Ministerial Priesthood : Chapters (preliminary to the study of the Ordinal) on the Rationale of the Ministry and the Meaning of the Christian Priesthood.* By R. C. MOBERLY, D.D., Regius Professor of Pastoral Theology in the University of Oxford. John Murray. 1897.
3. *St. Paul's Epistle to the Ephesians. A Practical Exposition.* By CHARLES GORE, M.A., D.D. John Murray. 1898.

IT is much to be wondered at that the world has waited so long for a book on Apostolical Succession, written from the standpoint of Nonconformity, and attempting to deal adequately with the entire question. High Anglicanism is provided abundantly with controversial and expository literature on the subject. Articles and pamphlets on both sides have been fairly numerous. But since Thomas Powell fell out of date, the Free Churches have lacked a volume on

the Succession which could, in any way, claim to be a standard work. This reproach is wiped off by Dr. Brown's Congregational Union Lecture for 1897. It formally challenges the upholders of the doctrine, both Roman and Anglican, and is not unworthy of the cause it champions.

Naturally this Lecture will be regarded by our opponents as a complete and representative statement of the views and arguments of the Free Churches on its subject. Both for this reason and on account of the intrinsic importance of the book, it is necessary to examine it with a kindly severity, to endeavour to estimate as impartially as may be its ability to carry our case, to set forth the full strength of our position. With this end before us, we will look at it in three different, though connected, lights. We will ask, first, if and to what extent it renders the theory of Apostolical Succession untenable ; second, how far it is affected by its Congregationalist opinions on ecclesiastical policy ; third, whether it may be accepted as a complete and satisfactory putting of the general grounds on which the Successionist doctrine is rejected, and of the special difficulties attaching in this matter to the Established Church of England. Let us say at once that, in our judgment, it does show that the theory is opposed to both Scripture and history ; that its Congregationalism seriously hampers its reasoning and lessens its effectiveness ; that, under the third head, it is, like the English alphabet, both defective and redundant. We recognise ungrudgingly the great merits of the Lecture—its range, its force, its skill, its lucidity, its courtesy, its self-restraint ; but we are bound to venture upon some amicable, if not altogether commendatory, criticisms.

In three separate articles in this REVIEW we have indicated our estimate of the Roman and, more particularly, of the Anglican claims. We need not therefore display Dr. Brown's argument at any length where necessarily it follows more or less familiar lines. Clearly the position, authority and office of the bishop is " the crucial question," at any rate so long as the controversy wears its present form. Practically Apostolical Succession is narrowed to mean episcopal

succession. Mr. Haddan alone of his school perceives the logical and historical blunder involved. Dr. Brown accepts the common putting of the matter, as indeed his Congregationalism compels him to. Of course he has no difficulty in proving the oft-proved essential identity of bishops and presbyters in the New Testament, and he rightly regards this identity as fatal to the Successionist hypothesis. With very few and comparatively unimportant exceptions, the most pronounced High Churchmen admit the substantial identity during the lifetime of the Apostles, and contend for an immediate or gradual change on their removal. Dr. Brown seizes quickly and firmly one weighty consequence of the admission and the plea. The question becomes concerned with uninspired and therefore fallible evidence not only as to the external facts but as to the authority and motives of the assumed alteration. Very properly he insists upon demonstration, not mere likely or unlikely guesses and doubtful inferences from unascertained events.

Hence, much, but by no means undue, weight is attached to the "grave uncertainty" of and the objections to the theory, or rather to the proof of it. Dr. Brown places in the forefront the indisputable fact that for three hundred years the Church at Alexandria knew only presbyterian ordination—the presbyters ordained the bishop, as bishops consecrate archbishops now. Thus the episcopal authority came not by devolution but by delegation. Perhaps more might have been made of the Alexandrian custom. To our mind the argumentative force does not lie mainly in the long existence—survival—of the method of appointment, though that itself has no small force; but in the complete and absolutely unquestioned recognition accorded to the Alexandrian Church and hierarchy by the rest of the Christian world. Dr. Brown brushes away High Church explanations of the apparent anomaly with quiet but well deserved scorn. All rest upon the same *petitio principii*—that the record cannot possibly mean what it says.

The Alexandrian custom cannot be regarded as an "uncertainty," and it leads to a conclusion very different from

uncertainty. Dr. Brown's next position is that "there is no certainty as to the time and fact of devolution." He examines the passages, *e.g.*, John xx. 22, 23, which are used as the Scriptural basis of the Succession, and compares them with others, *e.g.*, Acts i. 21—39 ; x. 39—41, which militate against its theory of the Apostolic office. It is shown easily that the Successionist interpretation is open to the gravest doubts exactly where it would be strongest if true. Slightly to modify the lecturer's finding, the adduced passages might, though not without strain and no little special pleading, be explained in harmony with the High Church doctrine of the Christian ministry, if that doctrine were established from other sources ; but the absence of such grounds leaves the natural significance in possession of the field. Another "uncertainty" relates to the method of devolution. Here the reasoning is acute, and far from valueless as an *argumentum ad homines*. But too much stress is laid upon mere technicalities, nor are these technicalities stated quite accurately. We should be willing to waive them all, to accept almost any form of ordination or consecration, if only the necessity or the existence of a mechanical succession could be displayed. Still, the lack of clearly prescribed and defined form points strongly to the fictitious character of that which the form is supposed to enshrine and perpetuate. The doubtfulness of the line of succession is the next argument, and it is unanswerable.

All too brief is the discussion of underlying principles, but it is excellent and conclusive, so far as it goes. We may not tie down the free Spirit, even in His activities within the visible Church, to a hard and fast boundary drawn by human fingers. We may not limit the possibilities of His call even to the work of the ministry by a rigid rule which He conspicuously violates. As we have urged in a previous article, the contrary contention approximates to blasphemy. And, our enemies being judges, He has never confined supernatural grace, the signs of a true Christian character, and therefore life within the fences of a digital succession.

Against this logic of facts, arbitrary or preconceived theory, *à priori* hypothesis, breaks itself in vain.

The prominence assigned by High Anglicans to the Ignatian Epistles justifies the devotion of an entire chapter to them. Dr. Brown is perplexed by the evidence for and against their genuineness as well he may be. He casts all manner of doubt upon them ; he will not accept them with Bishop Lightfoot, or reject them with Dr. Killen, or acknowledge the short Syriac recension of the three with Cureton, or adopt the hypothesis of wholesale interpolation with Canon Jenkins. He inclines to a partial acceptance, though he does not clearly indicate its amount. We have not space to record our reasons, but it seems to us that the Syriac three stand upon safe ground ; that the remaining four of the claimed seven have more in their favour than against them, but that the temptation to and the chances of interpolation so accentuate the otherwise rather dubious signs of it as to render them polemically worthless. Dr. Brown, however, is willing to admit, for argumentative purposes, the genuineness of the whole seven, and simply to cross-examine their apparent teaching. He makes one good point at the outset, the full force of which has too often been overlooked—by ourselves, for example. If the Ignatian Epistles are genuine, so also is Polycarp's Epistle to the Philippians—this is admitted universally. But, as Bishop Lightfoot declares, this Epistle "has proved a stronghold of Presbyterianism." It is altogether incompatible with the existence of "the monarchical episcopate . . . either at Smyrna or Philippi." Not only is there no mention of the bishop, but the presbyters appear the highest governing power. And the Church, not even the presbyterate, is exhorted to restore an erring but repentant presbyter. Thus we have testimony to an ecclesiastical organisation other than episcopal, which can be impugned only by the surrender of the indispensable Ignatian letters. It matters very little, *pace* Dr. Brown, that the Ignatian bishops are not diocesan ; a diocese has never been held essential to the Succession. More weight may be attached



to the silence upon the later idea of Apostolical Succession. Curiously the very exaltation of the bishop excludes it ; the bishop is set in the place of God and the presbyters in that of the Apostles—phraseology impossible if the modern doctrine had even been known. Finally, the lecture quotes Bishop Lightfoot, "there is not throughout these letters the slightest tinge of sacerdotal language in reference to the Christian ministry."\* Without sacerdotalism the Succession carries the scantiest practical value, probably would never have been heard of, at any rate in its present shape. The real difficulty with Ignatius arises from a certain "tone of Oriental exaggeration here and there" in his exhortations to unity, and the part he assigns to the bishop in the preservative of unity. Nevertheless, so far as we can see, he says nothing inconsistent with the bishop's position as *primus inter pares*, if due allowance is accorded to his *representative* character in the eyes of both Christian and heathen during times of conflict and persecution. Deprived of the support of the Ignatian Epistles, the notion of the necessity of a distinct episcopal order as indispensable to the *esse*, and not merely to the *bene esse*, of the Church hangs in mid-air.

We are almost loath to touch the chapters on "Earliest Forms of Church Life" and "The Transition from Prophet to Pastor," because of their pronounced and aggressive Congregationalism. Time would fail us for unavoidable distinctions and differences. Dr. Brown does show that no proof of the Successionist hypothesis can be furnished by the Apostolic or the Sub-Apostolic periods. With this let us rest satisfied. A similar verdict may be passed upon the lecture headed "Hierarchical Developments in the Church," though the fault is less prominent. So long as we perceive

---

\* This, amongst others, is one reason for our doubt as to the tenability of the theory of forgery or serious interpolation. In neither case could sacerdotalism have been left out. The (assumed) purpose of forger or interpolator would have been answered effectively by the denial of the validity of non-episcopal sacraments. Besides, are there not apparent contradictions and substantial agreements inconceivable apart from genuineness? The method of "undesigned coincidences" applied to the New Testament by Paley, Blunt, Birks could be applied to the Ignatian letters with a fair measure of success.

that the developments had no scriptural foundation, resulted from the mistakes of good men acting rather from pressure on the part of the world than from influences properly belonging to the Church, their precise path and method may be disregarded. An extremely interesting and able lecture on "The Imperial Church" exhibits the authority and rank of the bishop as issuing from and dependent on the professedly Christian state, and goes far to explain the acceptance of his lordship. The discussion of the effect of Agnosticism and kindred philosophies on Christian doctrine and practice impresses by its ingenuity, and bears more closely on the main subject than might be imagined. We wish that we could command space for quotation and exposition.

To the lecture on "The Development of the Papacy" we must refer again. It owes its legitimate place in the general argument to the evil lives of only too many of the Popes. Truly incredible is it that Divine grace should have chosen so foul a channel when purer courses were open, that the waters which heal as they flow should have been poured through a passage impossible to cleanse! Dr. Brown dwells upon the disputes between Popes and Anti-Popes as breaking the unity of the Church, but he hardly emphasises sufficiently the confusion into which they throw the historical succession. He, however, reminds us of the boy-pope, Benedict IX. Anglicans are curiously silent upon the conveyance of the grace of orders through this child, who grew up a profligate of the vilest type. This infantile papacy came after the consecration of Archbishop Theodore. The date may lessen, but does not remove the hindrance. Dr. Brown is justified in the wide extension he gives to the indisputable doctrine,

"The Anglican Church, of necessity, derives through the Roman, therefore for all its bishops and priests the Pope becomes the *fons et origo* of whatever priestly power and sacramental grace they are supposed to possess."

The next lecture transports us to the Tudor times. With respect to the Reformation, High Anglicanism must disperse

three gigantic obstacles : the intentions and doctrines of the men, lay as well as ecclesiastic, who initiated and guided the English Reformation ; the relations of the Reformed Church to Scotch, Continental, and other strictly Presbyterian Churches ; the vitiation of the Succession (under the doctrine) by such occurrences, partly proved, partly probable, as those mentioned in our own articles on Baptism and Orders and on Apostolical Succession, and those adduced by Dr. Brown himself. The lecture sets forth lucidly the non-priestly tone and declarations of official documents, and gives some historic particulars of great interest and importance. Thus M. Cougot, a Walloon minister, as late as 1702 was instituted rector of Millbrook in Southampton. "To the day of his death, in 1721, he was both rector of the Episcopal Church of Millbrook and minister of the French Presbyterian Congregation meeting in 'God's House.'" The Dutch Reformed Church in England was placed under the protection and jurisdiction of the bishops, and all the bishops concerned acknowledged its ecclesiastical propriety. A full account is furnished of the Established Presbyterian Church in the Channel Islands, which was included in the diocese of Winchester, and its ministers and members reckoned as part of the Church of England, an arrangement lasting till the end of the first quarter of the present century. We may endorse fully the last paragraph of the lecture :—

"And now—to bring this part of the subject to a close—what is the plain and unmistakable inference to be drawn from all these facts ? It is that in England, from the Reformation to the time of the Stuarts, at all events, Episcopacy was regarded simply as a mode of government and not as a channel of grace.\* It was a national and legislative arrangement to be enforced upon Englishmen, like other laws of the realm, as the will of Crown and Parliament. . . . But while thus forced upon Englishmen, irrespective of their convictions, it was not regarded as at all necessary for the religious life of foreigners. It was, therefore, merely a matter of territory, a geographical expression, not a spiritual fact. It need scarcely be said there is a wide difference between episcopal jurisdiction as a con-

---

\* The adjectives *necessary* and *exclusive* should qualify "channel" here.

venient mode of government, though not the only mode permissible, and Apostolic descent ensuring Apostolic grace and personal salvation. But it certainly was not Apostolic grace as an arrangement from heaven, which was believed in by the great body of the Anglican Church from the Reformation settlement under Elizabeth\* till the days of Archbishop Laud."

The concluding lecture, "The Anglican Church from 1603 to 1833," valuable as it is, must be left almost without remark. Till the Oxford Movement the doctrine of Apostolical Succession scarcely made itself heard, after its Laudian revival, much protested against, had died out. At first Newman stated it tentatively,

"men are sometimes disappointed with the proofs offered as to the necessity of episcopal ordination in order to constitute a minister of Christ. . . . If there be but a reasonable likelihood of our pleasing Christ more by keeping than by not keeping to the fellowship of the Apostolic ministry, this, of course, ought to be enough,"

a very different form from that in which the doctrine now appears. And Newman is conveniently silent as to probabilities on the other side.

As to the second aspect of Dr. Brown's work, we have no quarrel now with Congregationalist Church principles. They may or may not be nearer to the New Testament than any other. Our objection is that they have no real weight in the discussion, but simply afford opponents an excuse and opportunity for avoiding the main issue—the original position of the bishop and the gradual accretion to him of powers by no means involved in the essence of the office. We ought not to be called upon to consider, in this connection, the extremely doubtful notion that deacons stood on the same level as bishops and presbyters; or the highly improbable assumption that each congregation was absolutely self-governing and could boast its own separate episcopate. Small Churches may well have been dependent upon the mother-Church, village Churches upon that of the neighbouring city, on much the same principle as that of a Methodist circuit. The Apocalypse addresses only "the

---

\* Better—from the time of Archbishop Cranmer.

angel" of each of the seven Churches. It seems unlikely that in every case the large town had but a single Christian meeting. All this has nothing whatever to do with the general question. If this able lecture is to be accepted as the manifesto of the Free Churches, it must free itself from points on which those Churches are not agreed.

Congregationalism is not responsible for all the excrescences upon Dr. Brown's argument. He provides a capital reply to the Papal claim of universal supremacy. And he asserts, in almost so many words, that the failure of the claim is fatal to the Anglican theory. This overstates his case. In the first place, the Succession, conceivably, may have descended through a Church that did not arrogate to itself universal dominion. In the second place, High Anglicans, like Dr. Littledale and Canon Gore, deny the Roman claims as stoutly as Dr. Brown himself. The present Bishop of Bristol delivered in St. Paul's a four years' course of lectures, in which he contends with equal ardour for the Apostolic succession and the perfect autonomy of the Church in England.\* The two questions are distinct and should not have been confused.

Again, the contention that "there were always orthodox communities outside the Catholic Church" is not only verbally erroneous but bad polemically. If the communities were "orthodox" they must, *ipso facto*, have been, even if unacknowledged, an integral part of the Catholic Church. Perhaps some little relevancy inheres in the reference to the separated Churches of Arsinoë (A.D. 260-268), but Novatianism was never regarded as other than heretical. "If we knew all," we are told,

"we should probably find many other bishops or pastors besides

---

\* We are fain to add a word on a side issue. Bishop Browne, in his lectures on "Theodore and Wilfrith," displays "unrelenting hate" against Wilfrith. He thinks that he strengthens his case by bringing frivolous and vague charges against Wilfrith of misconduct, for which there is no real evidence. He cannot even be just to Wilfrith's self-sacrificing and successful missionary labours. This unreasonable animus, so contrary to Bishop Browne's literary habits, betrays uneasiness with respect to the proof of the illegality of Wilfrith's appeals to Rome.

those of the Novatians, and thousands of sincere Christians who, either from remoteness or other causes, remained aloof from any such confederation as is implied in the unity of the Episcopate, who yet were quite as Christian and Apostolic in their faith as were those who found place within it."

This is pure guess work, and is obnoxious to a ready retort. How did the Church of England act towards the ecclesiastical arrangements of the mutineers of the "Bounty"?

The recent commemorations of St. Augustine's landing in Kent have roused controversies respecting the dependence of the Church in England upon Rome and the abiding influence of Scotie evangelisation. On neither matter does Dr. Brown vouchsafe a syllable. He steps at one bound from Gregory the Great to the Reformation. The Scotie confusion of the Succession has received too little notice on all sides; is slurred over by the Bishop of Bristol, who starts a totally fresh Succession with Theodore rather than face it. But the line derived from him was certainly crossed by both the Scotie and the British. As to the relations of England with Rome, the *mot* ascribed to Sir Henry Wotton would be sufficient, were it not for the High Anglican doctrine of schism. To the question, "Where was your religion before Luther?" he is said to have replied, "Where was your face before it was washed this morning?" It is a pity that Dr. Brown has not discussed more fully the nature and meaning of schism.

We regret also that, in dealing with the Reformation and Tudor times, this latest Congregational Lecturer has omitted some of the most striking facts with regard to Presbyterian orders and the Church of England. Dr. Brown is wrong also, canonically and actually, in holding that Barlow was the sole consecrator of Parker. In both the Roman and the Anglican Ordinals, the bishops "assisting," lay their hands upon the candidate. And he does not vouchsafe a solitary syllable about the suggestive treatment of Scotland by the English Church, save to mention the remarkable commanded prayer for the Established (Presbyterian) Church of Scotland.\*

---

\* On all these subjects we must refer the reader to our article, "Bap-

By its title this Lecture limits itself to one part of the subject. It treats of it only "in the light of history and fact." To these tests the matter must ultimately be brought ; they constitute its direct touchstone. Anglicanism, however, manifests a disposition, if not to yield these elements of the case, yet to retire them quietly into the background. We have seen that the argument from history and fact is pretty safe in Dr. Brown's hands. His references to the spiritual nature of the Christian religion, the true grounds of unity, and the non-sacrificial character of the Lord's Supper are sound and sensible, so far as they go. The plan of the Lecture prevents their going further. But these questions are intertwined inextricably with the Succession theory. Two volumes published very recently illustrate these aspects of the matter—Dr. Moberly's *Ministerial Priesthood* and Canon Gore's *The Epistle to the Ephesians*.

Being a series of Oxford Divinity Lectures, Dr. Moberly's book may be reckoned as, in some sort, an official pronouncement. It would require a separate article to deal at all adequately with them ; we can only indicate a single feature. Dr. Moberly attempts the task of replying to Bishop Lightfoot's essay on the Christian ministry. By subordinating the Bishop's obvious meaning to his occasional loose phraseology, some verbal victories are won. Dr. Moberly argues for the priestly character of the entire Church, and for the representative character of the ministry. Here a Nonconformist, certainly a Wesleyan Methodist, could accept his general argument, though *cum multis granis salis*. The last chapter, however, takes a sudden leap. The Real Presence, he urges, constitutes the Eucharist a proper sacrifice ; that sacrifice needs a priest to offer it, the priesthood can be guaranteed only by a (mechanical) Apostolic Succession. For this reason the Succession is assumed. The Succession used to prove the priesthood ; now the priesthood proves the Succession. Thus the controversy is

---

tism and Orders," in this Review for January, 1891. Of course the Scotie (Irish) question is entirely distinct from the Scotch.

shifted to the nature and significance of the Eucharist ; and the eyes are closed resolutely to the dangerous weakness of the change of front. Yet even here Dr. Brown's "history and fact" furnish a conclusive reply. An external, historical Succession must possess external, historical evidence.

Canon Gore's sermons are intended for popular consumption. He relies chiefly upon the necessity for a visible unity. From several utterances to this effect let us select one :

"It is certain that the development of the ministry occurred on the principle of Apostolic Succession. Those who were to be ministers were the elect of the Church in which they were to minister ; but they were authoritatively ordained to their office from above, and by succession from the Apostolic men. And such a principle of ministerial authority appears to be not only historical, but also most rational. For a continuous corporate unity was to be maintained in a society which, as being catholic, must lack all such material links of connection as are afforded by a common language or common race. And how could such continuous corporate unity have been so well secured as by a succession of persons whose function should be to maintain a tradition and whose ministerial authority should make them necessary centres of unity ? "

To such an extent is this notion pressed that we are exhorted to pay no heed to theological divergences, however wide—apparently the Creeds themselves being surrendered ; and Cyprian is lauded because he held full communion with those from whom he differed as to the validity of baptism. "Each individual Christian" must remain in relation to the "commissioned stewards if he wishes to continue to be of the Divine household ;" this relation maintained, all else may go. Of course, Canon Gore does not intend this ; he is compelled to it by the exigencies of a theory that breaks down under its own weight. It is stupendously incredible that the one thing that makes a Christian is belief in or outward acceptance of an unproved and unprovable hypothesis on a question which can be brought to the test of history and fact.



In what, then, consist Church-membership and Church unity? Canon Gore himself shall suggest the answers:

"In opening the way to God by a simple human trust in a heavenly Father, and not by the complicated arrangements of a special law," our Lord "had put all men on the same level of need and of acceptance." . . . "The Church, as a visible congregation of men can be what it is—the city of God, His household and His sanctuary—only because it is pervaded by Christ's life and Spirit. . . . In this recurrent thought is the interpretation of all" St. Paul's "theory of the Church. It is verily and indeed the extension of the life of Christ." . . . "How are we to receive this great and manifest ideal of what the Church means? It is by meditating upon it till St. Paul's conception—and not any lower or narrower ones, Roman or Anglican or Nonconformist—become vivid to our minds." . . . The "unity" of all believers "is the deepest and most ultimate conceivable: it has a width and range from which no one can be excluded: whilst it has a closeness and cogency like the unity of the blood."

Light breaks through these truly Christian utterances. In their light the warm-hearted speaker must see further light. The narrow and narrowing conception of unity through a digital ministerial succession must give place to fellowship with all who hold it with our Head. May God hasten the time!

---

#### ART. VIII.—PICTURESQUE SICILY.

*Picturesque Sicily.* By WILLIAM AGNEW PATON. London and New York: Harper and Brothers. 1898.

SICILY is little known to the outside world to-day, yet it well repays study, for, as Goethe said, "Italy without Sicily leaves no image in the soul—Sicily is the key of all." Historians and archæologists find here a field full of riches, and it is the more tempting because it has been so little tilled. Mr. Paton discovered, to his great surprise, that there are more remains of Greek temples in the island of

Sicily than are to be found in the Peloponnesus or in all Greece besides. Nor is this its only attraction to the student of the past. Sicily has been called "the archæological museum of Europe," for in it are to be seen

"the caves of the cliff-dwellers; fragments of cyclopean structures reared by pre-historic builders; foundations of walls laid by Phœnicians and Carthaginians; temples, theatres and fortresses of Greek construction; bridges, aqueducts and amphitheatres erected by Roman engineers; remains of edifices built by Byzantine architects; mosques and towers of Saracenic origin; while of Norman churches, castles, palaces, who can tell the number or describe the magnificence?"

The island was one of the chief battlefields of antiquity, where the fate of European civilization often trembled in the balance. There Moslem fought against Christian, whilst in later times the island became

"the football of popes, emperors and kings. Suabians, Angevins, Aragonese, Catalans, Castilians, Savoyards, Spaniards, Austrians—all these, in turn, holding dominion in the island—ruled despotically, unwisely, unjustly."

Then came the pitiful despotism of the Bourbons, broken by Garibaldi in 1860. Italian literature must be traced to the court of the Norman kings of Sicily, who made the vernacular of their island realm popular and fashionable. The Sicilian lyrics were the earliest beginnings of the literature which culminated in Dante. Italian literature thus dawned on the world at Palermo, not at Florence; for, as Petrarch says, "The Sicilians were before us."

Mr. Paton steamed across from Naples to Palermo in the early days of December. When he came on deck after a boisterous night, he discerned far ahead in the south

"a range of mountains uplifted grandly from the sea, showing in purple silhouettes crested with roseate snow. It was the coast-line of Sicily, finely limned against an opalescent sky. . . . It was a brilliantly glorious morning; the air was invigorating, the atmosphere remarkably transparent. We forgot our woes, the deadly sinkings and upheavals of the night, and eagerly scanning the sea and shore, feasted our eyes upon the inspiring picture. As we drew nearer to the coast mountains seemed to

advance from out the golden distance ; great headlands and promontories grew towards the sea ; shadows withdrew into the depths of valleys ; the brows of precipices and the crests of rock-ribbed mountain-steeps caught the glory of the morning ; intervening hills, becoming luminous, stood out in high relief in front of the ' Sicilian Apennines.' Last of all, the lowlands and the sea-shore received the day and glowed in russet-brown and tawny-yellow of fallow fields, in green of meadows girt with deeper green of orange-trees and silver-gray of olive groves."

Two vast promontories, Monte Pellegrino and Monte Zaffarano, tower superbly on either side of the Bay of Palermo. Between them lies a crescent shore twelve miles in length. From the yellow sands, with their long curving line of white breakers, the sea ascends in gentle activity of meadows and rich plantations, of luxuriant gardens and rich groves of orange and lemon trees. Further inland rise thousands on thousands of almond and olive trees, and beyond these terraced vineyards climb up towards the mountains. Out of this "Horn of Gold," as the ancients styled the plain between the mountains and the sea, Palermo the Superb shines like a pearl in an emerald chalice. Its red roofs, domes and minarets stand up against a rich background of vegetation, where tropical flowers vie in beauty with the rose, the lily, and the jessamine. Palermo was called Panormus—All Harbour—by its early colonists. It has two harbours with one common entrance. Mr. Paton endorses the judgment of Mr. T. A. Symonds that "there are few spots upon the surface of the globe more beautiful." The people are great lovers of bright colours, and the gay pigments used to adorn their boats make the harbour bewilderingly brilliant.

The American travellers had been warned on all hands that Sicily was "the land of brigands, earthquakes and social disorders." They had not long to wait for an introduction to the brigands, for, as they passed to their hotel, a prison van crossed the piazza, guarded by eight soldiers. In it were ten men belonging to "La Banda Maurina," who had just been captured and were on trial for all manner of misdemeanours. For many years Santo Mauro had

borne an infamous reputation as the resort of a company of desperados

“who murdered peaceable citizens, terrorised peasants and proprietors, harried the country, committing rapine and arson, assaulted innocent men and women—and, until lately, with impunity. Nor did these ‘bravi’ hesitate to turn their knives against their own associates, committing murders on all occasions upon the slightest provocation, or upon no provocation, at times apparently inspired solely by the delight it gave them to shed innocent blood.”

Mr. Paton took care to attend the trial of the brigands, which lasted for a whole month in the Assize Court of Palermo. The chief had been captured by the carabinieri after a five hours' desperate fight, during which he defended himself from the top of a high cliff. Some fugitives from this band made their appearance in the province of Messina. The people boast that a brigand cannot set foot in their territory and live. Francesco Leanza, a gigantic farmer, who was such an unerring shot that he could hit a soldo piece with a bullet while galloping at full speed, armed his three sons and two farm hands and surprised five of the brigands, who were roasting the flesh of a stolen cow. All five were killed, and their scout, who ran towards the camp fire on hearing the report, was also shot dead. The band was thus broken up. Mr. Paton says that the lurking places of brigands are now few and far between. All the spots of interest to tourists lie outside the dangerous districts and may be visited with impunity.

Palermo was Mr. Paton's head-quarters for his first three months in Sicily. He found it one of the brightest, cleanest, and most picturesque of cities. Every day it presented new attractions to its American visitors. The Palerman cars which serve the trade of the place form an ever-shifting picture gallery. Wheels and shafts are gaily painted, whilst the body of the vehicle, a square box twice as wide as it is deep, is embellished with scenes from Greek mythology, from the Bible, and from all ages of Sicilian history.

“There were fanciful portraits of beautiful women and handsome men; knights and ladies; enchanters, fairies, monsters,

and angels; devils and monks. Many carts were adorned with scenes from Italian operas, and many more with designs of fruit and flowers or gaudy landscapes—Ætna in eruption, for instance, and storms at sea. The marvellous vehicles, thus decorated, are drawn by asses tricked out in all the colours of the sunset, with pompons nodding on their heads and from the middle of their backs, and all clothed in gaudy harnesses, to which are attached rosettes, bows of ribbons, and bright bunches and bits of tapes and cords of the brightest hues."

There is scarcely a more magnificent prospect in the world than that from the summit of Monte Pellegrino. A landscape of sea and shore, of island and mainland, of wide ocean and sheltered bays lies spread out before you. Far to the east stretch the Sicilian Apennines, which skirt the northern coast of the island. Palermo, with its light cream-coloured buildings, rises like a city of white marble from a vast park interspersed with groves of ilex, orange and almond trees, and gardens of stately palms. The heart of Palermo is "The Four Corners," near which are the University, the public libraries, the courts of justice, clubs, palaces, and principal shops. Two brimming rivers of humanity meet here. Along the Via Macqueda stream the fashionable folk. Il Corso is the commercial highway with its array of carts and drays, its itinerant peddlers and its fruit shops. The church of St. Joseph, which stands at The Four Corners, is a colossal structure built between 1612 and 1645. Like the other seventeenth-century churches in Palermo, it exhibits, as Goethe said, the Jesuits' love of show and finery

"in its greatest extravagance, not from design or plan, but by accident, as artist after artist, sculptor, carver, gilder, painter, or worker in marble chose to labour, without taste or rule, merely to display his own abilities."

The exterior of these churches reminded Mr. Paton of some ungainly elephant or hippopotamus. But the interior of San Giuseppe was veneered from floor to roof with Sicilian marbles,

"plain and inlaid, of all colours, of all grains, of all degrees of beauty. Inlaid altars, beautifully chiselled fonts and candelabra,

cornices, panels, crucifixes, lintels, and door posts; all delicately carved in variegated marbles, matched and joined together as nicely as the inlaid woodwork one sees at Sorrento or the delicate mosaics for which the artists of Florence are celebrated."

Beneath the nave of San Giuseppe is another church, and below this a chapel sacred to Santa Rosalia. Here the visitors bought a ticket at a box office for five centesimi, receiving for it two hazel nuts wrapped in paper, on which were printed directions for wisely and devoutly applying these sacred comestibles, which were said to possess wonderful curative qualities. Ignorant Sicilians are extremely superstitious. Signor Crispi himself, the most noted Sicilian of the day, is said to have an implicit faith in charms, and to wear a coral horn on his watch-chain as a protection against the evil eye. Sicilian credulity is explained when we learn from the census of 1880 that 85.72 per cent. of the inhabitants of the province of Catania could not read. "Sicily is not of to-day." It seems to be still lingering in the dark ages.

The true splendour of Palermo, as Mr. Symonds has said, is to be sought in its churches. La Cappella Palatina, dedicated to St. Peter by Roger II., about the year 1132, forms part of the old Royal Palace. When Mr. Paton and his wife crossed the threshold the building was shrouded in darkness.

"As we stood in silence, wondering, we became conscious of dormant colour tones blending with deep, soft shadows, as mysterious, as entrancing as melodies heard from a distance through a calm night. Broad bands and beams of sunlight, falling obliquely athwart the darkness of the nave and chancel, were reflected upwards from the marble pavement and illuminated the high altar and the apse above it."

In this mysterious radiance a colossal figure of Christ loomed forth. The grand presence seemed to fill the church, and gradually other forms and faces became visible through and beyond the golden sunbeams.

"The mosaics on the upper walls, the marble wainscoting, the inlaid floor, the polished columns, gleam and glisten,

imparting to the atmosphere of the chapel a colour quality of its own, as if it had absorbed and were suffused with rainbow hues, emanating from the precious material with which La Palatina is adorned and rendered glorious."

But the gem of Sicilian ecclesiastical buildings is Monreale, founded by William II. in 1174. A visitor follows the highway from Palermo for four miles amid gardens and villas, orange and lemon groves, plantations and vineyards, till he climbs the rocky heights from which the cathedral looks down on an earthly paradise. The exterior is very simple, but the walls of the interior are covered with mosaics of exquisite workmanship, representing a world of angels, archangels, prophets, patriarchs, martyrs, monks and holy women. Mr. Symonds says,

"Other cathedrals may surpass that of Monreale in sublimity, simplicity, bulk, strength, or unity of plan. None can surpass it in the strange romance with which the memory of its many artificers invests it. None can exceed it in richness and glory, the gorgeousness of a thousand decorative elements."

Its cloisters surrounding a charming garden must have been like an Eden to the Benedictine monks of olden times.

An amusing account is given in this racy record of the ingenious pantomime by which the lively and entertaining guardian of San Giovanni degli Eremiti supplemented his score of English words. He boasted that he possessed the art of making the ladies and gentlemen of all nations understand everything. He vociferated each word so distinctly and so loudly that really his visitors had no difficulty in catching his meaning. His description of the Sicilian Vespers was masterly.

"He pretended to ring the vesper bell, fancied he saw crowds of people running towards him from all quarters, then, as if bewitched, or seized with homicidal mania, he fired guns, aiming them in all directions, stabbed and was stabbed, cut throats and had his throat cut in turn, closed his eyes to show that he, presumably a Frenchman, was asleep when seized and clubbed to death. He rang the supposititious bell again frantically, until we could fancy we heard its alarm booming through the outraged air, and fell to his horrid work once more, shouting:

'Morte, morte! Detto di Franchy!' which we understood to mean 'Death to the French.'"

Some of the streets in Palermo remind a traveller of quarters in Tangier or Algiers. In this Oriental world a teeming population of paupers is packed into quaint, old, dilapidated dwellings. They live mostly out of doors, except during the wettest weather, when they retreat into their dark, unfurnished, cave-like houses. Some of the streets are so narrow that people in the upper stories of the houses which lean tottering over the pavement can almost shake hands with their neighbours on the opposite side. A constant stream of traffic passes along these narrow ways. The shouts of the vendors, the laughing, talking, screaming, scolding pass all belief. The majority of the people are in rags, but even their rags are picturesque. Women may be seen with a dozen or two of chickens suspended from their necks. The cries of the vendors drown the cackling of the unfortunate birds. Mr. Paton watched one woman make a purchase, and then begin to pluck the feathers in handfuls from the living bird. To eight-tenths of the Sicilians animal food is an untasted luxury. The display of meat on the stalls, chiefly goats' flesh, is singularly unappetising. One corner of the market place is given up to the fishmongers, who offer a large and varied assortment to their customers.

"Small jars of tiny anchovies; larger anchovies in larger jars; anchovies grown to be sardines—boxes, buckets, barrels filled with these; and overgrown sardines—boxes, buckets, barrels filled with these; and overgrown sardines, resembling small herring, fresh, salted, or preserved in oil."

Mackerel abound, and oysters, but the staple food is the polyp, which is eagerly sought after by the poor Sicilian, though a New York long-shoreman would turn away from it with loathing. The cauliflowers, larger and coarser than ours, are of all shades—bright green, pink, red and purple, yellow and golden. At a distance they look like huge chrysanthemums, and lend vivid colour to the market place.

The most curious shops are those where the macaroni is sold. Incredible quantities of it are hung on rods in front



of the buildings, across doorways, in vacant lots, on the roofs of buildings, in courtyards and from window to window across narrow lanes. It may also be seen drying by the shore among the fishing boats. It is left out at nights yet it is never stolen. The cheese shops display wonderful shapes and designs of the odoriferous, pungent, biting cheese of the country, without which no mess of macaroni will suit the Sicilian palate. In the fruit shops are oranges and lemons, prickly pears—mottled, white, scarlet, crimson and yellow—bunches of tomatoes, peppers, egg-plants and melons.

The favourite seaside resort of the fashionable inhabitants of Palermo is La Villa Belmonte, at the foot of Monte Pellegriano. A broad avenue winds upwards to the villa through a lemon grove. Hedges of geranium, *fico d'Italia*, heliotrope and honey-suckle fringe this avenue. Pines and myrtles, ilex, cypress and pepper trees shade the lawns, marble seats are set amid the roses and the visitor's eye wanders over the lovely expanse of the Horn of Gold. The ancient olive trees at the foot of Monte Grifone are also wonderfully picturesque. Many of these are said to have been planted by the Saracens more than a thousand years ago.

"Grand ruined trees, grey and venerable, weird, misshapen and fantastical, overgrown with vines and creepers like ruined towers, clutching moss-grown rocks with gnarled and knotted roots, grasping the earth with giant claws whose deathless grip had resisted the whirlwind of many centuries. They reminded us of the supernatural beings described by Dante and drawn by Gustave Doré."

The whole place seemed weirdly full of fantasies, and in the gloaming it was easy to fancy oneself transported to a domain over which ruled the gods of ancient Greece.

The book gives some vivid pictures of peasant life. Mr. Paton saw a young recruit taking leave of his family in order to join the army. The boy was

"in uniform, had his knapsack packed, and was ready to depart, but he stood in the middle of the street, blubbering as

he related his tale of woe to his younger sisters and brothers, and perhaps cousins, for there were at least ten or twelve small children around him, some of whom stood, others knelt upon the pavement, all of them weeping as if their hearts would break. The boy's mother, her eyes red, her hair dishevelled, was delivering a tirade (presumably against the iniquity of the military system of the kingdom) to a dozen or more of her friends, who gave their most unequivocal, vociferous assent to all her propositions and complaints. The lane was full of women; there were a few men, and these latter were very old, too old to work. The windows and doors of the houses were occupied by other women, all talking, all gesticulating, all very angry. When the young recruit was motioned to come away by the sergeant (a good-natured fellow who had permitted his charge to halt on the way to the railway station), the scene in the lane begged description. The children gave loud voice to their sorrow; the mother frantically kissed her boy, his face, his hands, his clothing, and, falling to the ground, kissed his feet. Then, rising to her knees, she clinched both her hands, and, raising them to heaven, seemed to be delivering curses at the sergeant and at all above him set in authority who had lot or interest in taking her son away from her. Leaping to her feet in a paroxysm of fury, she crossed herself, spat upon the tips of her fingers, and, stooping, made the sign of a cross upon the pavement, upon which she threw herself and lay at full length, weeping hysterically. Her women friends gathered around her, raised her from the ground, and led her into her wretched house. The children, bellowing and gesticulating, followed the young recruit to the corner of the street, whence they shrieked a last farewell to the young soldier, who trudged beside the sergeant, weeping aloud."

Mr. Paton also gives a lively account of the behaviour of the Sicilians at the opera. Palermitans are music-mad, and assist at the representation of a favourite play like an old Greek chorus. "The crowd seems to become vibrant, infected by the harmony and rhythm, responding involuntarily to the tone of the instruments and the expression of the singers." There is a strong infusion of Spanish blood in the people, and they go wild with enthusiasm over "Carmen" with its pictures of the bull-ring.

From Palermo Mr. Paton made visits to the less-frequented parts of the island. Piana dei Greci, the birthplace of Signor Crispi, is a strange survival of olden times. It was colonized by Albanians, who fled from their country when

it was conquered by the Moslems in 1488. The people acknowledged the Pope, but were allowed to retain their ecclesiastical independence. To this day their priests neither shave nor use the tonsure. They are allowed to marry, and they and their families live on the happiest terms with the parishioners. The women of Piana dei Greci wear woollen petticoats and bodices of black or dark coloured silk, embroidered and otherwise adorned. Some have blue nun's bonnets with deep capes; others fasten bright neckerchiefs under their chins, allowing the borders to hang down over their shoulders. On great occasions, such as christenings and weddings, the better class of women array themselves in silk gowns and vests, embroidered in gold, with short, bright-coloured sleeves. Their arms are covered with white muslin, trimmed with lace. Belts with massive silver buckles are worn, and these often have curious and artistic representations of the Virgin or some of the local saints. There is a general air of poverty about the town. The houses have no fireplaces; glass is little used. The children seem robust and happy; but the men look sullen, the women sad and careworn.

Cefalu Cathedral towers like a giant over the low houses around it. It is the earliest of the Norman-Sicilian churches, and those who have not seen its mosaics can form no conception of their artistic beauty and perfection. The mosaics at St. Peter's in Rome are bad imitations of oil paintings; but those of Cefalu are the work of artists, who not only knew how to design, but also were able to blend their designs into one great scheme of interior decoration. The farmers round the city still have old wooden ploughs, such as were used in the time of the Pharaohs. The sailors beach their ships with tackle which might well date from the days of Homer. Their craft are round-bodied, full-breasted, clumsy hulks, with broad sterns, great rudder posts, and tillers overtopping their poop decks. The hawse-holes are painted to represent human eyes, and the men seem like survivals from the Middle Ages.

A visit to Corleone brought home to Mr. Paton the abject

poverty of the region. The sight took away all his appetite. He passed

"up one filthy street, down another, meeting poverty-stricken folk—pale, anæmic women, hollow-eyed men, ragged, weird children, who begged for bread, croaking in hoarse accents like weary old people tired of the world. The streets were paved, it is true, but in that respect resembled the beds of mountain torrents. The dens in which the inhabitants of Corleone live are dark, damp and desolate; but, be it noted particularly, they afford evidence of a continued struggle on the part of their occupants for cleanliness."

The air was wintry, yet there were fires in few houses, and but two shops were of any importance, though Corleone has 14,000 inhabitants. These shops belonged to gunsmiths working for the sportsmen who come to shoot in the region.

"We looked in vain for butcher stalls, and found but few bakers shops; but we did see several ill-omened signs of lottery offices. Our guide, pausing a moment, pointed first to one of the latter, and then to a neighbouring church, saying, 'They make the soldi jump out of the pockets of people who have hungry children.'"

In conversation with one woman of the better class, Mr. Paton learned that her husband earned about fifteen pence a day. Her boy of fourteen received fifty centesimi for tending goats. Yet these people, who could scarcely afford meat on a festa, gave forty centesimi every Sunday to the Church. They had been more fortunate than their neighbours, for they had only had two children. "Babies," said the woman, "were misfortunes to poor people, but when they come poor people love them as much as do I, Signori."

Scenes of poverty grew more appalling as the visitors travelled through the country. "Muore di fame, Signori!" was the cry which darkened the glory of the Sicilian sky. In an instructive appendix Mr. Paton shows that the system of sub-letting the land and the resort to money lenders are largely responsible for the agrarian distress. Sicily swarms with usurers, who charge their clients from twenty to fifty

per cent. The absentee landlords are hated, and the country is always in a state of latent revolution. The government at Rome has made praiseworthy efforts to grapple with the Sicilian problem, and the Marquis di Rudini, who is himself a Sicilian, seems likely, if he perseveres in his present course, to bring peace and prosperity to the island.

The ruins of Greek temples at Selinus are most impressive. The temple of Apollo was only surpassed in size by that of Diana at Ephesus, and that of Zeus at Agrigentum. On Mount Eryx stood an ancient city sacred to Venus. Past and present seem almost to mingle in such an atmosphere. As the travellers reached the east of the island the whole landscape was dominated by the mighty form of *Ætna*.

"All day long, from far to the westward of Castrogiovanni, where we first caught sight of it, we had beheld the wonderful pyramid, snow-capped, uplifted so grandly above the earth, and we realised that, were there nothing else wonderful to see in all Sicily, the sight of *Ætna* was nobler, more inspiring, than the view of all the other mountains the traveller may behold in years of wandering."

A good description is given of the ruins of Syracuse and of the Ear of Dionysius with its wonderful echoes. As the visitors stood round the grotto they repeated in chorus, "*Permesso, Dionisio!*"

"Our words came back to us, not once, but countless times; were shouted back to us, spoken, whispered, shouted again and again, until we fancied we had awakened, not Dionysius, but a thousand imps that mocked us. From the trumpet-like mouth of the cavern came a thousand words for every one that we had spoken. It was impossible to believe that two words had provoked so multitudinous a reply. When, finally, the last whisper had died away, our guide shouted the words, 'Enter, you are welcome,' and it seemed to us as if a regiment repeated the invitation."

The wonders of Taormina, with its glorious view of *Ætna*, its great Greek theatre, and its landscape of sea and shore so entranced the visitors that they could scarcely tear themselves away.

"What sweeping coast-lines and sky-lines of mountains! What colour! Violet distance, purple mountains, amethystine sea,

gold of reaped fields, dark green of orange groves, silver of olive trees and almond blossoms, glistening snows of the Pillar of Heaven, and over all the wonderful, deep, lustrous blue of the Sicilian sky."

Messina, with its grand harbour, was the last spot at which they stayed. Then, favoured by sky and sea, they steamed away past Scylla and Charybdis into the Bay of Naples. Every one will find it pleasant to read this charming volume. Its exquisitely clear pictures add much to its interest and value. Those who wish to study the social conditions of the island must not forget the Appendix on "La Mafia," the mysterious canker of Sicily, which works with knife, gun, dagger and poison to tyrannise over honest folk. It aims by all manner of means to terrorise witnesses in the courts, to overawe judges, and strengthen the forces of disorder and crime, yet even this blight must pass away from the fair island of Sicily if the remedies which the Marquis di Rudini is applying are allowed time to operate.

---

#### ART. IX.—MR. GLADSTONE AS A RELIGIOUS TEACHER.

MUCH of Mr. Gladstone's almost unparalleled influence over his fellow countrymen resulted from his moral character. We do not go beyond our warrant in saying that even those who were indifferent or hostile to Christianity esteemed and trusted him the more thoroughly on account of his religious principles. In the hearing of the then Dean of St. Paul's a charge was once brought against him of political insincerity. "Insincere, Sir," was the indignant reply, "I tell you that in my knowledge Mr. Gladstone goes from communion with God into the great affairs of State." He never shrank, in his writings or addresses, from the confession of Christ. He himself followed the advice

that he gave to the boys at Mill Hill School, "Whatever you aspire to, aspire above all to be Christians, and to Christian perfection." Writing within a few hours of his peaceful and prepared-for death, we can not but express deep thankfulness for his stainless life and his outspoken testimony. "Even when Prime Minister of England, he has been found in the humblest houses, reading to the sick or dying consolatory passages of Scripture in his own soft melodious tones." His first book contains striking sentences as to the necessity of religious principle in statesmen, his last bears equally striking witness to the effect of religion upon the leaders of both the great political parties.

His theological studies evinced not merely his wonderful versatility, but his genuine interest in the subject. Biblical theology might be called his favourite pursuit. He has left his mark upon the religious thought of the nation, indeed of all English-speaking peoples, nor can it be limited to them. All his publications connected with theology and Christianity impress the reader with their author's large reserve of power and learning, and with the intensity of his convictions. Out of the fulness of the heart did his mouth speak.

To discuss with any approach to detail Mr. Gladstone's writings and speeches on religious and theological questions would require a series of articles rather than a few pages. Not only did he publish much directly treating of these subjects, but he could hardly discuss any matter, at any rate not immediately political, without reference to them. His address on "Ancient Greece," delivered at Edinburgh University, might have come from the lips of the Principal of a Theological College, to judge from its insistence on a Providential order of the world. And its recognition of the working of the Divine Spirit amongst the heathen was instinct with the Spirit of the Fathers. Opening a new Reading and Recreation Room, he reminds his hearers—

"We should fall into a terrible snare and temptation were we ever to suppose that it is through wealth and worldly power that man can achieve happiness. The words are as true and solemn

now as they were when they were spoken by one who was infallible. 'What shall it profit a man, if he gain the whole world, and lose his own soul?'"

His speech in the Bradlaugh debate dwelt with earnest and glowing eloquence on the terrible evils of Atheism and the yet more deadly Agnosticism, whilst his Homeric essays contain passages on Christianity and its practical effects.

His earliest published book, *The State and its Relations with the Church*, roused rather heated discussions, which we have no intention to traverse. He never withdrew altogether from the position then taken up. A year after his first book he issued his second, *Church Principles considered in their Results*, the whole tone of which is that of a typical High Churchman, antagonistic to Rome, incapable of understanding Nonconformity. When he proposed to disestablish the Irish Church, he defended his apparent inconsistency; he published *A Chapter of Autobiography*, designed as an explanation and a defence. He separated himself from Erastianism by an essay on the Scotch Presbyterian Churches. With regard to the connection between Church and State, we may leave these volumes to face the double assault of Lord Macaulay and the *Quarterly Review*. Plainly Mr. Gladstone was prepared to concede the principle of Establishment unless it could justify itself, in any given case, by its results. Equally plainly he clung to the Church of his baptism, not merely with the affection of a son, but from opinions as to continuity and unity shared by the average High Anglican. Yet throughout these productions the reader must feel that they proceed from one who has grasped firmly the essentials of Christianity, one who knows that the seat of all worthy, all real, religion is in the heart. It is this which differentiates these books from by far the greater number of controversial treatises, and gives to them something of permanent value.

It naturally followed from his Church principles that Mr. Gladstone viewed Ritualism with little disfavour so long as it did not degenerate into the grotesque. He expounded his opinions in two *Contemporary Review* articles, which

[No. CLXXX.]—NEW SERIES, VOL. XXX. NO. 2. X



involved much wider consequences than were intended originally. One paragraph described the nineteenth century as a time

“when Rome has substituted for the proud boast of *semper eadem* a policy of violence and change in faith, when she has refurbished and paraded anew every rusty tool she was fondly thought to have disused ; when no one can become her convert without renouncing his moral and mental freedom and placing his civil and loyal duty at the mercy of another ; and when she has equally repudiated modern thought and ancient history.”

The allusion, of course, was to the Vatican decrees that centred in the proclamation of Papal Infallibility. Roman Catholic protests were numerous and loud-voiced. In reply, Mr. Gladstone issued his pamphlet, *The Vatican Decrees in their Bearing on Civil Allegiance*, and, in further reply to expostulations from Dr. Newman and others, a second pamphlet, *Vaticanism*. He wrote, too, other articles on the same question. We are certainly not disposed to underrate the sturdy and agile ability displayed nor the genuine service rendered to civil and religious liberty. Nevertheless, one cannot help astonishment at the seeming waste of energy. But Mr. Gladstone—as his recent writings on the Papal judgment concerning Anglican orders show—has ever felt an intense desire that Rome should assume an attitude compatible with reconciliation between her and England. Protestants, however, can find little fault with his tone or his arguments.\*

Later, Mr. Gladstone changed his attitude towards Nonconformity. Without yielding one jot or tittle of his High Churchmanship, he cultivated friendly personal relations with Nonconformist representatives, and appeared amongst them—notably at the City Temple and the Memorial Hall—in semi-public gatherings. His general tone towards non-Episcopalian Churches became more and more sympathetic

---

\* The Vatican decrees produced Mr. Arthur's brochure *The Modern Jove*, and his elaborate volumes, *The Popes, the Kings and the People*, the most thorough examination of the Papal attitude towards freedom that the controversy can boast of.

and appreciative. This was not due altogether to political associations and necessities, but, as in the case of many distinguished High Churchmen, to the outflow of experimental religion which could not be confined by the barriers of ecclesiastical organisation, even whilst those barriers were held theoretically to be uncrossable. A passage from a reprinted essay on *The Evangelical Movement* expresses his judgment on a force of which Methodism remains the most salient result :

"It was a strong, systematic, outspoken and determined reaction against the prevailing standards both of life and preaching. It aimed at bringing back, on a large scale and by an aggressive movement, the Cross, and all that the Cross essentially implies, both into the teaching of the clergy and into the lives as well of the clergy as of the laity. The preaching of the Gospel became afterwards a cant phrase; but that the preaching of the Gospel a hundred years ago had disappeared, not by denial, but by lapse, from the majority of Anglican pulpits, is, I fear, in large measure, an historic truth. To bring it back again was the aim and work of the Evangelical reformers in the sphere of the teaching function. Whether they preached Christ in the best manner may be another question; but of this there is now, and can be, little question that they preached Christ; they preached Christ largely and fervently where, as a rule, He was but little and but coldly preached before. And who is there that will not say from his heart, 'I therein do rejoice, yea, and will rejoice?'"

This may not be all that could be desired, but it is at least ungrudgingly appreciative. And we may mark its author's agreement with St. Paul's estimate of "the foolishness of preaching," and of the true subject-matter of preaching—a conviction which Mr. Gladstone took repeated opportunity to enforce.

One who held so firmly and profoundly that the Gospel was the power of God unto salvation could not but perceive both the dark fact and the terrible effects of sin. Quotation after quotation might be given to illustrate this. For example :

"Our Lord has emphatically said, 'They that be whole need not a physician, but they that are sick'; and this saying goes

to the root of the whole matter. Is there or is there not a deep disease in the world, which overflows it like a deluge, and submerges in a great degree the fruit-bearing capacities of our nature? Are we, as a race, whole, or are we sick, and profoundly sick? I think that, to an impartial eye and to a thoughtful mind, it must seem strange that there should be a doubt as to the answer to be given to this question. It seems more easy to comprehend the mental action of those whom the future of the actual world, as it is unrolled before them, tempts, by its misery, guilt and shame, into doubt of the being of God, than of persons who can view that future, and who cannot but observe the dominant part borne by man in determining its character, and yet can make it a subject of question whether man is morally diseased. . . . This sense of sin, which lies like a black pall over the entire face of humanity, has been all along the point of departure for every preacher, writer and thinker within the Hebrew or the Christian fold; and it is the gradual and palpable decline of it in the literature and society of to-day that is the darkest among all the signs now overshadowing what is, in some respects, the bright and hopeful promise of the future."

The acceptance of Jesus Christ as the Divine, the only Saviour from sin, carries with it consequences, practical and doctrinal, which Mr. Gladstone embraced heartily. The life and death of our Lord must be accepted as historical events, and the Atonement regarded as an accomplished fact, by whatever rationale it is explained; and you can hardly avoid acknowledging it as vicarious. Possibly searching criticism might object to some points in Mr. Gladstone's presentation of the vicarial theory, but that he held it there can be no manner of doubt. And while, perhaps, he speaks less distinctly about justifying faith, he understood its nature. He walked by faith, and believed on Jesus Christ as the source of pardon and justification. The "Protestant Evangelical" school he was apt to regard as intellectually feeble and ill-furnished. "Its weakness," he says, in a comparative review of English religious opinion, "is on the side of thought." But he seriously misconceived its position except as shown in its narrowest and most unattractive and least defensible forms. Even his marvellous mastery of detail could not appraise with equal justice and knowledge all the diverse phases of Christian organisation and creed.

Of all Mr. Gladstone's theological works, the greatest, unquestionably, is his edition of *Butler*, and the *Studies* subsidiary thereto. These we noticed at some length immediately after their publication.\* They prove that, on due examination, Mr. Gladstone held the evidences of Theism, of religion, of Christianity, to be valid and satisfactory—not absolutely demonstrative, but an amply sufficient basis of belief. To him, as he often declared, belief or unbelief, in the first instance, was decided by moral rather than by intellectual considerations. Thus faith depends upon the will no less than on the reason. The value assigned to evidence varies with the will to believe, with underlying postulates that have their root in desire after or aversion from God. Any deficiency of proof, whether apparent or real, constitutes an intentional part of our probation, a test of spiritual tendencies. The force of Mr. Gladstone's argument on the evidences of Christianity has been underrated seriously, its general bearing misconceived, because the above principles have been overlooked or ignored. Nor can we omit here that he relied upon the Holy Ghost, the light that lighteth every man, to manifest the truth to every man's conscience. These may be commonplaces of theology, but in mentioning them we cannot forget that Mr. Gladstone was more than a theologian. He would have rejected them, had they not commended themselves to his trained logic as well as to his spiritual sensitiveness. In much the same way he dealt with the question of a future life. Initially it might be a question of faith; but that faith soon justified itself as the highest reason, and, indeed, attained to a species of verification. How real that life-to-come grew to him is shown in the abiding continuous influence which it exercised upon him, and in the emphatic earnestness wherewith he urged it as a motive power upon others. He walked by faith; he experienced its light and strength; and he urged all whom his voice could reach to try the same experiment—to live here and now with the thought

---

\* LONDON QUARTERLY, January, 1897, p. 247.

of the certainty of eternal life ever in both mind and heart.

Possessed by such convictions, he could not regard miracles as incredible or antecedently improbable. Few men were better qualified to estimate the argumentative worth of assaults upon miracles, whether proceeding from metaphysical assumptions or from alleged untrustworthiness of testimony. A firm belief in God, in a personal Governor of the universe, determined his attitude towards attacks upon or denials of them. He avoided judicially the attempt to prove too much from them. He recognised the difficulties certain minds must have in accepting them, and in appreciating the argument from them when accepted as facts. Yet they appeared to him *natural*, as events to be anticipated on *à priori* grounds, when once their connection with revelation and their significance were understood.

His public addresses and books exhibit a profound reverence for and an intimate familiarity with Holy Writ. He could not doubt that the Bible was a revelation of and from God, the principal means of His manifestation to the human race. The title of his popularly-written volume, *The Impregnable Rock of Holy Scripture*, indicates his deliberate judgment that its claims had not been and could not be shaken. The book contains a good deal that must be distasteful to many Christians. It yields much—and not merely for the sake of argument—that in our opinion need not be surrendered, cannot be surrendered, without detriment to the authority of the Bible. It does not escape a too common confusion; because we are ignorant, to a greater or smaller extent, of the methods of inspiration, it does not follow that our ignorance is the measure of the effects of inspiration. Mr. Gladstone's views approximated closely to those set forth in *Lux Mundi*, and in the latest Bampton Lecture, *Some Aspects of the Old Testament*. So long as matters of faith and morals were preserved intact, he was comparatively indifferent to destructive "higher criticism." He did not trouble to draw the line separating moral teaching

from the history that enshrined it. He fought shy of the all-important question of the truthfulness of the inspired writers. But he loved the Scriptures none the less devoutly because he forgot that the analogy of their outward and their inward is not husk and kernel but body and soul.

Nevertheless Mr. Gladstone would not take the whole journey with the leaders of the school to which he approached. His controversy with Professor Huxley as to the Gaderine miracle, and his articles on the Proem to Genesis show, that he regarded the accuracy of Biblical statements as far more precious than certain of his admissions and principles would have indicated. He loved the words of Scripture too dearly to sacrifice any of them, when details came to be pressed and the choice must be made. He would not refuse the findings of natural science, he prized truth too highly ; but his cautious reserve in accepting their proclaimed contradictions to the Scriptures furnishes an example that should serve to check exaggerated alarm and hasty capitulation. We may think that his obvious and laudable desire to exhibit the Bible as exactly appropriate to present times, to welcome light and truth from what quarter soever they sprang, caused him to allow needless and dangerous concessions ; we must acknowledge, however, that his own faith in and obedience to Divine revelation suffered not even the faintest eclipse or breach of continuity. He seems to have imagined that the abandonment of out-works displayed the invincible strength of the citadel. It would not perhaps be impossible to treat *The Impregnable Rock of Holy Scripture* as the exhibition of a position which no criticism, "higher" or "scientific," could touch, whether their contentions were true or false. The book was, however, scarcely meant to be interpreted after this manner. Sentences might be culled from the *Gleanings of Past Years* suggestive of a theory of the co-ordinate authority of Scripture or the Church with the Bible. They read like a tribute to memory, a survival of old associations, rather than avowed opinions. That these notions exerted an influence of which Mr. Gladstone was scarcely conscious is, we think,

clear. But they are conspicuous only by their absence when the paramount claims of the Written Word are under discussion. We refer to them simply in order to mark the triumph that the doctrine of the supremacy of the Scriptures won over early teaching that threatened to interfere with it.

Some articles on *Ecce Homo* provoked hostile, not to say angry, criticism from one side and the coldest approval on the other. They were thought to trench upon our Lord's divinity, or, at any rate, to sanction the hiding of the divinity behind the humanity. The doctrine of *Kenosis* was not then popular or commonly understood. Hence, Mr. Gladstone's allusions to it were misinterpreted. He had no idea of diminishing the glory of the incarnate Godhead. His mistake—for he himself admitted that he had fallen into one—arose from an ardent hope that the author of *Ecce Homo* would proceed to an *Ecce Deus*. When *Natural Religion* proved to be the sequel, the disappointment was great. At the close of the articles occur words which must disarm the objector, if he be not already pacified. Of our Lord it is said,

“if He is not now without an assailant, at least He is without a rival. If He be not the Sun of righteousness, the Physician of souls, the Friend that gives His life for His friends, and that sticketh closer than a brother, the unfailing Consoler, the constant Guide, the everlasting Priest and King, at least, as all must confess, there is no other come in His room.”

If now we look at Mr. Gladstone's theology, his religious teaching as a whole, we find adherence to the prime verities of Christianity, to the faith once for all delivered to the saints, and to the form of sound words into which it was deposited. We have not shrunk from indicating our disagreements from him, but these, intrinsically important, are unimportant in comparison with the wider and deeper truth which he accepted with heart and head and hand. We cannot avoid admiration for, sympathy with the keen dialectic with which he expounded and defended his beliefs, the eloquent and forceful language in which he expressed exhortation, appeal, polemic. Yet their highest value had its

rise in the personal conviction that gave to the tones their warmth and vigour and thrilled reasoning with emotion. For a statesman to choose his recreations in the noblest of the sciences might have called forth pleasing wonderment ; for him to have attained in it to his chiefest delight excites sentiments of a more elevated order ; that he stood before his country a preacher of righteousness, a messenger of Christianity, calls forth gratitude to the Father of lights from whom every good gift cometh.

One closing word we are fain to add on Mr. Gladstone's enthusiastic love for the Psalms. It appears and reappears in formal religious treatises and in the most unexpected places. Take this tribute to the Psalms from the *Homeric Studies* :

" In that Book, for well nigh three thousand years, the piety of saints has found its most refined and choicest food ; to such a degree indeed that the rank and quality of the religious frame may in general be tested, at least negatively, by the height of its relish for them. There is the whole music of the human heart, when touched by the hand of the Maker, in all its tones that whisper or that swell, for every hope and fear, for every joy and pang, for every form of strength and languor, of disquietude and rest. There are developed all the innermost relations of the human soul to God, built upon the platform of a Covenant of love and sonship that had its foundations in the Messiah, while in this particular and privileged Book it was permitted to anticipate His coming."

Judged by this test, and it is to be relied on for its positive as well as its negative results, William Ewart Gladstone had entered into the secret places of religion, and must be listened to when he tells of its joy and peace and rest. It will be long before the echoes of that voice cease to reverberate down the gathering years.



## ART. X.—MRS. STOWE'S "LIFE AND LETTERS."

*Life and Letters of Harriet Beecher Stowe.* Edited by ANNIE FIELDS. London: Sampson Low, Marston and Company (Limited). 1898.

IT may reasonably be concluded that the volume now before us is the "last word" that can or ought to be said on the personal history of the lady who will go down to posterity as "the author of *Uncle Tom's Cabin*." There is little indeed in the book that will be absolutely new to the reading public; to a large extent it is merely a skilful condensation of the bulky work which, put forward while Mrs. Stowe was still among us in the flesh, with faculties clouded but not lost, was very largely autobiographical, and had something of the amiable diffuseness of the veteran, who "shoulders his crutch and shows how fields are won." It was well worth while to publish this very successful redaction of an interesting biography; it will not deter the every-day reader by its size or weary him by gossiping-discursiveness; and being compact and lucid, it may do much to make a new generation that "knows not Joseph" familiar with a career of very great, if of somewhat fortuitous importance, and with a personality that has its own quaint peculiarity, its own clear-stamped *cachet* of unapproached originality.

Mrs. Stowe wrote many other books beside that which brought her immediate fame and fortune, with much obloquy into the bargain. Not a few of these were better constructed than *Uncle Tom*, and were comparatively free from certain defects of style and taste, due to the disadvantage of the writer's bringing up. But the artistic superiority of *The Minister's Wooing*—to take the best example of its author's excellences,—the spiritual insight displayed, the interest of its unhackneyed love-story, the high finish of its feminine portraits so admirably discriminated, the historic value

of its faithful picturing of society and religion in unspoilt New England—all these traits of power and of attraction, winning and impressive though they be, have never availed to gain for this singularly able and graceful book a tithe of the popularity still enjoyed by the faulty, ill-constructed, ill-compacted *Uncle Tom's Cabin*, with its occasional lapses into mere vulgarity of style though not of thought, its awkward digressions that impede the onward sweep of the narrative, its constant intrusions of the author's own moralising and expatiating personality, and its lack of anything like the "love-story" supposed to be a quite indispensable ingredient of the novel.

What then is the secret of a success awarded to all appearance in exactly the inverse order of the merits of two books by the same author? The answer is not far to seek, with any life of Mrs. Stowe in hand; it is made clear as day under the able handling of the present biographer. George Sand, whose critical notice introduced the strange immortal book to the literary world of France, divined the truth with the sympathetic intuition of genius:

"We do not say," she wrote, "that the success of the book is because its great merits redeem its faults; we say its success is because of those very alleged faults. . . . If culture is of the truest kind it will never resist a just and right emotion. Therefore it is that this book, defective according to the rules of the modern French romance, intensely interests everybody and triumphs over all criticism. . . . Its long discussions, its minute details, its portraits carefully studied—mothers of families, young girls, little children, servants even, can read and understand them, and men themselves, even the most superior, cannot disdain them. . . . Mrs. Stowe is all instinct; it is the very reason that she appears to some not to have talent. Has she not talent? What is talent? Nothing, doubtless, compared to genius; but has she genius? I cannot say that she has talent as one understands it in the world of letters, but she has genius, as humanity feels the need of genius—the genius of goodness, not that of the man of letters, but of the saint. Yes—a saint! Thrice holy the soul which thus loves, blesses, and consoles the martyrs. Pure, penetrating and profound the spirit which thus fathoms the recesses of the human soul. Noble, generous, and great the heart which embraces in its pity, in its love, an entire race, trodden down in blood and mire under the whip of ruffians

and the maledictions of the impious. . . . The life and death of a little child and of a negro slave!—that is the whole book. This negro and this child are two saints of heaven! The affection that unites them, the respect of these two perfect ones for each other, is the only love-story, the only passion of the drama. I know not what other genius but that of sanctity itself could shed over this affection and this situation a charm so powerful and so sustained. . . . Children are the true heroes of Mrs. Stowe's works. Her soul, the most motherly that could be, has conceived of these little creatures in a halo of grace. George Shelby, the little Harry, the cousin of Eva, the regretted babe of the little wife of the Senator, and Topsy, the poor, diabolic, excellent Topsy—all the children that one sees, and even those that one does not see in this romance, but of whom one has only a few words from their desolate mothers, seem to us a world of little angels, white and black, where any mother may recognise some darling of her own. . . . These children come at last to interest us more than the personages of an ordinary love-story. . . .

"The saints also have their claw! it is that of the lion. She buries it deep in the conscience, and a little of burning indignation and of terrible sarcasm does not, after all, misbecome this. Harriet Stowe, this woman so gentle, so humane, so religious, and full of evangelical unction. Ah! yes, she is a very good woman, but not what we derisively call 'goody good.' Here is a heart strong and courageous, which in blessing the feeble and succouring the irresolute, does not hesitate to bind to the pillory the hardened tyrant, to show to the world his deformity."

There is true discernment in this estimate, especially where the critic touches on the impassioned idealising motherliness of her author. Harriet Beecher, as we see her in these records, a dreamy maiden with enthusiastic adorations at the service of her girl friends, is far other than the Harriet Stowe who poured out the hoarded fiery indignation of years—an indignation born of outraged love—in the lava flood that rushes in burning waves, an all but irresistible torrent, throughout that unexampled romance that can still stir its readers into an answering passion of wrathful, almost intolerable, pity, though the wrongs it unfolds have been "portions and parcels of the dreadful past" for more than thirty years. For this work to be possible, it needed the wedded experience so full of distress and difficulty, that school of divinely-appointed suffering, of blessed poverty

and victorious love—it needed that the heart of the wife and mother should be torn by the dagger-stroke of bereavement, that the lover of little children should learn through her own anguish to understand the deeper agony of mothers bereft, not by the hand of a wise all-seeing Father, but by that of guilty man—wailing victims, not of a high Providential necessity, but of a man-made wicked law, offspring of pitiless greed. That nature so ardent, so simple, so ultra-feminine, so poetic in its impulsive benevolence, could only have been exalted into real power through two supreme influences—the sovereign passion of motherhood, the fully accepted teaching of Christ Jesus—He who, first of men born of woman, understood the nature and claims of woman; He who took the little children in His arms, put His hands upon them, and blessed them. An unbelieving Harriet Stowe could never have been aroused to that solemn dedication of herself to warfare against a national sin—to the resolve “I will write something to make this whole nation feel what an accursed thing this slavery is. I will if I live.”

She lived, and she wrote. But it remained her intimate persuasion that what she wrote was not hers—or only hers in this limited sense, that she held the pen, and found the words needed to embody the story that was given her. This conviction is insisted on twice in *The Life and Letters* now before us—the first time in a really charming passage from the pen of a “Mrs. John T. Howard,” a parishioner of Henry Ward Beecher—a lady whose intimacy with the authoress of *Uncle Tom's Cabin* would seem to have dated from the appearance of that book. We do not apologise for extracting the very characteristic pages that follow; they show the true woman as her friends knew her, better than volumes of mere description could do. Returning, after the success of her great romance, to her modest home in Andover,

“She urged my going with her,” says Mrs. Howard. “To lessen the fatigue of the long railroad journey, we spent one night in Hartford with Mrs. Stowe's sister . . . sharing the same room, at Mrs. Stowe's request. I lay upon the bed, looking at her little childish figure, gathered in a

heap upon the floor as she sat brushing out her long curls with a thoughtful look upon her face, which I did not disturb by words. At last she spoke, and said, 'I have just received a letter from my brother Edward, from Galesburg, Illinois. He is greatly disturbed lest all this praise and notoriety should induce pride and vanity, and work harm to my Christian character.' She dropped her brush from her hand, and exclaimed with earnestness, 'Dear soul, he need not be troubled. He doesn't know that I did not write that book.' 'What,' said I, 'you did not write *Uncle Tom*?' 'No,' she said; 'I only put down what I saw.' 'But you have never been at the South, have you?' I asked. 'No,' she said; 'but it all came before me in visions, one after another, and I put them down in words.' But, being still sceptical, I said, 'Still, you must have arranged the events?' 'No,' said she, 'your Annie reproached me for letting Eva die. Why! I could not help it. I felt it as badly as anyone could! It was like a death in my own family, and it affected me so deeply that I could not write a word for two weeks after her death.' 'And did you know,' I asked, 'that Uncle Tom would die?' 'Oh! yes,' she answered, 'I knew that he must die from the first, but I did not know how. When I got to that part of the story I saw no more for some time. Mr. Stowe had then accepted a call to Andover, and had to go there to find a house for the family. He urged my going with him for the change, and I went. No available home could be found, and the Faculty gave us permission to occupy a large stone building which had been built for a gymnasium. I had always longed to plan a house for myself. We consulted an architect, and had been with him arranging the plan. . . . I was very tired when we returned to our boarding-house. . . . After dinner we went to our room to rest. Mr. Stowe threw himself on the bed. I was to have the lounge; but suddenly arose before me the death scene of Uncle Tom—with what led to it, and George's visit to him. I sat down at the table and wrote nine pages of foolscap paper without pausing, except long enough to dip my pen in the inkstand. Just as I had finished Mr. Stowe awoke. "Wife," said he, "have you not lain down yet?" "No," I answered; "I have been writing, and I want you to listen to this and see if it will do." I read aloud to him with the tears flowing fast. He wept too, and before I had finished his sobs shook the bed upon which he was lying. He sprang up, saying, "Do! I should think it would do!" And, folding the sheets, he immediately directed and sent them to the publisher, without one word of correction or revision of any kind. 'I have often thought,' she continued, 'that if anything had happened to that package in going it would not have been possible for me to have reproduced it.'"

"Many years after this occurrence," Mrs. Howard was

surprised to read, in the preface to a new edition of the book, an account of its genesis by Mrs. Stowe, which seemed at variance with the preceding statement. "She spoke of having *many years before* written a sketch of the death of an old slave—the original idea (in part) of *Uncle Tom*." Questioned as to the apparent discrepancy, "Both accounts are true," she said, "I had entirely forgotten that I had ever written the sketch, and I suppose that I had unconsciously woven it in with the other."

"Unconsciously" the dreamy, absent-minded authoress had fallen into other errors of detail as to the time and place when the incident so vividly related by her to her friend occurred. "Professor Stowe did not accept the appointment to Andover until after the publication of *Uncle Tom*." Letters from him and from the Committee of Trustees make this very clear: the Stowes did not go to the boarding-house mentioned until *Uncle Tom* had been three or four months before the public. "Mrs. Stowe must have written the chapter as described after a busy day either in Brunswick or in Boston," not in Andover; and it was no consultation with architects, no planning of a "house for herself," that had called away her thoughts from the more momentous task in hand. But the psychological value of the central incident is not impaired by this curious lapse of memory associated with it. A side-light is indeed thrown on the peculiar mental constitution of Harriet Beecher Stowe, and we understand a little better how this emotional, imaginative being, with her true intuitions and sympathetic divination of truth of character underlying outward action, of the true bearing and significance of events in national and social life, should yet be a very indifferent witness as to the hard matter-of-fact details of events themselves, great or small. Hers was not the minutely faithful art of the realist, photographing such occurrences as were mirrored on the lens of the mind with absolute accuracy; it was rather the art of such a poet-painter as Turner, who, seizing the large outlines of a scene and reproducing these with recognisable faithfulness, yet shed over the whole landscape

imaginative splendours not to be caught by any camera—"the light that never was on sea or shore"—"the ampler ether, the diviner air, the fields invested with purpleal gleams," of the poet's vision were by that art made visible on the canvas, and the prosaic observer might say with perfect truth, "I do not see these colours in nature which you paint"; for the glowing hues and the strange glories of light and shade were reflected mysteriously from the visible landscape on the mirror of the artist's soul, and then flung back on the scene as he painted it. Something there was of this quality—higher than the heart of the realist, more true to the inner truth of things—in the best and greatest work that it was given to Harriet Beecher Stowe to perform; but she would have made one of the most unsatisfactory witnesses who ever lost herself in a maze of self-contradiction if, for her misfortune, she had found herself called to testify under cross-examination in a court of justice. An impulse of generous indignation, a passion for setting the world's judgment right on what she deemed a point of much importance, did once lead her to place herself in a position not less trying and scarcely less humiliating than the one we have just suggested, when she believed herself compelled to intermeddle with the exceedingly unedifying "Byron scandal." She was very probably right in her main contention—that the character of Byron's wife, personally known to her as a noble, pure-souled philanthropist, had suffered cruel wrong at the hands of Byron's biographers, who had accepted and endorsed the poet's *ex parte* statements with a not very creditable credulity. But it cannot be doubted that her honest zeal, being ill-supported by the treacherous memory that her warm imagination betrayed into curious errors of detail, achieved very little towards the rehabilitation in public esteem of the friend whose friendship she esteemed a singular honour—that indeed it wrought far otherwise, and that for Lady Byron's sake, no less than her own, it had been well had she borne in mind the homely proverb that warns against the touching of pitch. Something much

worse than pitch was that witches' cauldron of foul old scandals which she unwittingly stirred up into unsavoury seething and sulphurous steam. It is satisfactory to find that all the obloquy she incurred by an effort really made in the cause of righteousness—however injudiciously it might be made—did not seriously disturb her. Friends, on whose calm judgment she could rely, cheered her by their approval of her motives and acceptance of her views in the matter ; and she was able, with perfect sincerity, to say, " I don't dwell on it. It is a duty done and left with God, who takes care of duties. I have no more concern with it."

There is a curious resemblance between the " method"—which was no method of hers—of the production of *Uncle Tom* and the method always habitual with her gifted contemporary and her superior in literary art and style, Charlotte Brontë, whose few highly-finished stories have every chance of outliving all of Mrs. Stowe's " thirty novels," save the one which has the unmistakable immortal quality, and which is so inseparably associated with a great historical event like that portentous convulsion which ended in the abolition of slavery in the United States.

Of Miss Brontë, her sympathetic biographer tells us,

" She said it was not every day that she could write. Sometimes weeks or even months elapsed before she felt that she had anything to add to that portion of her story which was already written. Then some morning she would waken up, and the progress of her tale lay clear and bright before her, in distinct vision. When this was the case, all her care was to discharge her household and filial duties, so as to obtain leisure to sit down and write out the incidents . . . more present to her mind at such times than her actual life itself. . . ."

Notwithstanding this " possession," adds Mrs. Gaskell, " never was the claim of any duty, never was the call of another for help, neglected for an instant ;" and probably the two women of genius, differing from each other as they did in almost every non-essential point of mental idiosyncrasy, resembled each other quite as closely in this one respect as in that curious exaltation of the imaginative faculties by some " possessing" power which becomes

[NO. CLXXX.]—NEW SERIES, VOL. XXX. NO. 2. Y



manifest in Mrs. Stowe's account of the production of *Uncle Tom*, and in Miss Brontë's unvarying fashion of literary procedure. Mrs. Stowe's distinguished countryman and friend, Oliver Wendell Holmes, has spoken somewhere of "strange clairvoyant flashes" surprising a critical reader in the crude literary attempts of very young inexperienced women—of "the mysterious inspiration which every now and then seizes a young girl and exalts her intelligence, just as"—(this smacks of the psychological physician a little too strongly)—"hysteria in other instances exalts the sensibility—a little something of that which made Joan of Arc, and the Burney girl who prophesied 'Evelina,' and the Davidson sisters;" the last a sufficiently striking American instance, not perhaps familiar to many English readers.

Has not our wise and witty *Autocrat* struck here on something of deeper and wider significance than he himself fully recognised? Here are two cases, and one of paramount significance, in which a "mysterious inspiration" seized and exalted the feminine intelligence in those who could by no stretch of courtesy be styled young girls or even young women; both had attained the high table-land of middle life before they achieved anything memorable; and Mrs. Stowe's great achievement was of such surpassing importance in the world's history, and she was stirred to it in so singular a fashion, that she may be held justified in the words that, a white-haired old lady, she addressed to the old sea captain who desired to shake hands with her who wrote *Uncle Tom's Cabin*.

"I did not write it," she said gently, as she pressed the ancient mariner's hand; "God wrote it; I simply did His dictation." "Amen," quoth the captain reverently; and we may echo his words. Never again could she do what she did once; her other works are good, delightful, characteristic, are valuable records of the times she knew, and beautifully reflect the simple noble character, as of an inspired Christian woman-child, which is developed from page to page of the attractive record before us; but we can see how they were fashioned, from what sources she drew her materials, and

with what measure of art-workman's craft she put them into shape. It is not so with the one book she was inspired to write, as truly as Jeanne d'Arc was inspired to the extraordinary, the unexampled exploits that saved France from English domination, and England from the fatal craze for European sovereignty, leaving her free for her own inner development and achievement of world-empire, so little dreamed of in the days of the conquering Plantagenets. Were not our Norse and Teuton forefathers wise and right when they recognised in their nobler and loftier women-folk the appointed channels for teaching the mind and will of the gods to men, whose practical ability and superior physical might should give embodiment and active reality to those mystic teachings? Something of a holier Alruna there surely was in that "very woman," true wife and most devoted mother, Harriet Beecher Stowe, imperfect as her mental equipment might be on certain of the less essential points—

" Not perfect, nay, but full of tender wants ;  
No angel, but a dearer being, all dipt  
In angel instincts, breathing Paradise.

Happy he  
With such a mother! faith in womanhood  
Beats with his blood, and trust in all things high  
Comes easy to him, and tho' he trip and fall  
He shall not blind his soul with clay."

Such a mother, as truly as though she had never written or printed a line, was assuredly the strangely gifted, mysteriously inspired woman whose earthly life, happy and beautiful amid all its fierce vicissitudes of fortune, its great joys and great sorrows, came to its most peaceful end, as this volume tells us, on July 1st, 1896, when she had lived eighty-five years. Then the Master said to His faithful servant, "Come up higher."

" Nothing is here for tears, nothing to wail,  
Or knock the breast, no weakness, no contempt,  
Dispraise, or blame, nothing but well and fair,  
And what may quiet us in a death so holy."

## ART. XI.—IRISH LEGISLATION.

1. *A Bill for Amending the Law relating to Local Government in Ireland and for other purposes connected therewith.* 1898.
2. *Report of Her Majesty's Commissioners of Inquiry into the Procedure and Practice and the Methods of Valuation followed by the Land Commission, the Land Judges Court, and the Civil Bill Courts in Ireland under the Land Acts and the Land Purchase Acts.* 1898.
3. *Report of the Recess Committee on the Establishment of a Department of Agriculture and Industries for Ireland.* Second Edition. T. F. Unwin. 1896.
4. *A Bill for Establishing a Department and a Board for the purpose of promoting Agriculture and other Industries in Ireland, 1897; a Bill to afford Facilities for the Establishment and Development of Industries in Ireland.* 1897.
5. *The Saving of Ireland, Industrial, Financial, Political.* By Sir GEORGE BADEN-POWELL, K.C.M.G., M.P., &c. William Blackwood and Sons. 1898.
6. *The Irish Grand Jury System.* By E. A. HACKETT, M.E., M.I.C.E. P. S. King and Son. 1898.

THE Irish Local Government Bill is noteworthy not only as inaugurating a new and somewhat momentous departure in Irish legislation, but also because it is the outcome of the policy advocated by the Unionist party as an alternative to that embodied in the three unsuccessful Home Rule Bills of Mr. Gladstone. During the five years that have elapsed since the rejection of the last of these measures, the consideration of more recent and not less important political questions has not unnaturally tended to weaken

public interest in the Home Rule movement and to dim the recollection of much of its earlier history. The facts and reasons on which that movement was based must, however, be taken into consideration in estimating the value of the legislation of the party which opposed it, and Sir George Baden-Powell, who has written *The Saving of Ireland* with the view of assisting "in paving the way for a sound Local Government Bill,"\* has therefore done good service in drawing attention to its leading features. The merits of his work appear to us to be somewhat impaired by the fact that the greater part of it is devoted to proving that Ireland cannot be "saved" by Home Rule; and it is also to be regretted that the small portion of it allotted to the discussion of the remedies suggested for her "salvation" contains no reference to the valuable scheme of industrial reform advocated in the Report of Mr. Plunket's Recess Committee of 1896. As, however, he writes as one of the rank and file of the Conservative Party for the purpose of vindicating, as against Home Rulers, "the genuine and long felt desire of that party to be a true friend to Ireland and to all legitimate and useful Irish aspirations and hopes,"† the preponderance in his work of the controversial element, which is treated with great fairness and moderation, may be regarded as almost unavoidable. His views are based on an acquaintance of many years with Ireland and with all classes of Irishmen, and his able and exhaustive review of the economic, financial, and political conditions of the country and of the various remedies proposed for dealing with the Irish problem are well worthy of the study of all who are interested in its solution.

It will probably be now generally admitted that the only result of the Irish policy of successive Governments down to the middle of the present century has been to very materially increase the difficulties of this problem. If, however, abundant legislation can be accepted as evidence of

---

\* *The Saving of Ireland*, Preface.

† *Ibid.*, p. 42.

the desire of Parliament during the present reign to effect the saving of Ireland, an examination of the Statute Roll will show that its failure to do so cannot with fairness be ascribed to want of effort. Setting aside legislation relating to subjects of less importance, such as Grand Juries, County Courts, Coroners, Public Health, Prisons, Weights and Measures, &c., &c., it has introduced the English Poor Law system into Ireland, disestablished the Irish Church, and established a system of National Education, and has also assisted Secondary Education by promoting the foundation of the three Queen's Colleges of Belfast, Cork, and Galway, the Catholic University, and the Royal University of Ireland. It has authorised grants from the Consolidated Fund and loans for inland navigation, fishery, piers, reclamation of waste lands, building of cottages, the teaching of agriculture, repairing and purchase of fishing boats and nets, and various other reproductive purposes; and in 1880 it sanctioned loans amounting to nearly two millions sterling for the relief of distress. It has endeavoured to provide for the migration and emigration of population from congested districts and to ensure adequate cottage accommodation for labourers. Lastly, by a series of between forty and fifty Acts regulating the relations between landlord and tenant, it has, *inter alia*, sanctioned advances from the State to both landlords and tenants for improving their properties and holdings; established a system of "judicial" rents enforced by specially appointed tribunals; and provided, not only for the protection of tenants in respect of improvements and against unfair eviction, but also for their conversion into owners by means of State aid. In addition to this, it has, within the last twelve years, unsuccessfully, endeavoured to pass the Home Rule Bills of 1886 and 1893, and the two Bills of 1897 for the promotion of Agriculture and Industries, and has also, in 1893 and 1897, appointed Commissions to enquire into the Financial Relations between Great Britain and Ireland and into the working of the Land Acts. Considered as a whole, this mass of completed and attempted legislation must be admitted to constitute a good

record of parliamentary work, which, having regard to the time and labour bestowed on it—the length and “warmth” of some of the Irish debates can hardly yet be forgotten—and the expenditure for improving the economic position of Ireland which it has entailed, affords incontrovertible evidence that the Imperial Government has not neglected Irish affairs during the Victorian era. The Local Government Bill now before Parliament is a fresh earnest of its desire to do justice to Ireland, and as it is, as has been said, an important innovation in Irish policy, it may be of interest to examine the leading features of the legislation to which it forms the latest addition, and the nature and prospective effects of the scheme which it embodies.

1. The introduction of the new measure, when coupled with the continued demand of a section of the Irish people for Home Rule, would seem to furnish a conclusive proof that, whatever be the merits of individual measures, Irish legislation, as a whole, must be held to have failed to accomplish its object. This failure is doubtless very largely due to the great difficulties with which the Legislature has had to contend.

“The essential duality,” as it is aptly termed by Sir George Baden-Powell, “of Irish affairs,”\* which appears in every province of the country, and has been a prominent feature in every period of its history, has made Ireland the shuttlecock of political parties and the stumbling-block of statesmen. The influx of Britons and Normans, which began in the eleventh century, and has since that date periodically filtered into Ireland, united the two previously distinct and frequently hostile races of Celts, respectively inhabiting the north and east and the south and west, only to initiate a new era of conflict between the “Irish” and the “English.” These conflicting racial elements have become so blended together that most of the names of so-called Irish families are of external origin, but the spirit of duality, preserved and stimulated by the differences of character and religion of

---

\* *The Saving of Ireland*, p. 48.

each successive wave of immigrants, is still as clearly manifest in other phases of life and action at the present day. The Catholic ascendancy is in abiding hostility to Orange Protestantism, and the Ireland of the Land League is the sworn foe of the Ireland of the Irish Loyal and Patriotic Union, while the tenant farmers and agricultural labourers contest with the landlords, bankers, manufacturers and tradesmen the claim to the title of the "Irish nation." The differences of race, religion and sentiment, of history and tradition, which, in old days, enabled France and Spain to intrigue with Irish malcontents for the invasion of England—the three years blockade of Brest, begun in 1796, was undertaken solely to defeat one of these numerous intrigues—are now utilised as weapons for the warfare of political parties, not only in this country, but in the United States.\* It is, therefore, not surprising that the task of at once harmonising these differences, and checking the action of those who endeavour to accentuate them for political purposes, should have baffled the ingenuity and resources of many successive ministries.

It must, however, on the other hand, be admitted that the unsatisfactory results of Irish legislation are also to a large extent attributable to the inadequate conception of the Irish character and of Irish needs on which it has been based. Such legislation may, broadly speaking, be classified as industrial, aggrarian and political, and, though differing widely in character, the policy adopted by the Legislature in each of these three classes of measures has in a greater or less degree exhibited the same characteristics of fitful and often experimental treatment, and of distrust of the aims and capacity for self government of the Irish people.

The industrial legislation of the present reign may not unfairly be described as a tardy attempt to remedy the evils caused by that enacted during the last century, in the interest of British traders and manufacturers, for the purpose of crushing Irish industries at a time when the natural resources

---

\* *The Saving of Ireland*, pp. 149, 173.

of Ireland, before the days of steam, made her competition so formidable, that, according to Froude, "the mere rumour of a rise of industry in Ireland created a panic in commercial circles in England."<sup>\*</sup> The Navigation Laws excluded Irish cattle, beef, pork, bacon, butter and cheese from England, while the woollen trade, which was the result of these restrictions, was in its turn destroyed by legislation, and the undertaking of Parliament to encourage the linen trade as a compensation was never kept. The Irish glass trade was ruined by the 19th Geo. II., and that in cottons by an import duty of 25 per cent. ; and the trade in sail-making, at one time so extensive that Ireland was making sails for the entire British Navy, was crushed by imposing duties on sail-cloth made of Irish hemp. Irish beer, malt, hats, coals, gunpowder, bar-iron, ironware, and other products were all similarly subjected by the British Parliament to legislative restrictions which, as is pointed out in the Report of the Recess Committee, have been the main cause not only of Irish poverty, but also of the thriftlessness and lack of enterprise and perseverance in respect of industry which have characterised the Irish people throughout the greater part of this century.† Agriculture is now therefore not only the main, but over the greater portion of the country practically the sole, Irish industry, and the system on which it is conducted is described by the Recess Committee as one of the simplest and most barbarous in Western Europe. It has, however, been estimated by the Recess Committee that, by mixed husbandry, the feeding of stock on cultivated crops, and more scientific tillage, the agricultural produce of

---

<sup>\*</sup> *English in Ireland*, vol. i., p. 443.

† *Report of the Recess Committee*, pp. 3—5. That the spirit which inspired this legislation is unhappily not dead is shown by the conduct of the Wholesale Co-operative Society towards the Irish Co-operative Creameries system, which has been so successful that 122 dairying societies have been established in two or three years. The Wholesale Society took advantage of the failure of one of these societies to purchase the business and has now established between 20 and 25 creameries in Ireland to compete with those of the Irish Society.—(See a paper on "The Co-operative Movement in Ireland," by the Right Hon. Horace Plunkett, M.P., in *Labour Co-partnership* for June, 1898, p. 93.)



Ireland might be doubled ; while the prospects of development of so-called industrial as distinguished from regular agricultural crops—such as flax, beetroot and tobacco—and of produce demanding special organisation for its exploitation—eggs, poultry, vegetables, honey, fruit, and bulbs—as well as of agricultural manufactures are no less remarkable. In addition to this, Ireland possesses other valuable economic resources as yet entirely neglected—an aggregate of coal estimated at 209,000,000 tons ; iron, of which 30,000,000 tons are available in Ulster alone, and other minerals ; extensive sea and inland fisheries ; large tracts suitable for the cultivation of forests ; and some 3,000,000 acres of waste land capable of reclamation.\* She has, therefore, as pointed out by Mr. Arthur Balfour in a speech delivered at Alnwick in 1895, a case for special economic treatment. Such treatment, however, has hitherto been entirely confined to the sanctioning by the Legislature of the loans and grants from the Consolidated Fund for industrial purposes already referred to†—a policy which, despite the generosity and good intentions by which it has been inspired, cannot fail to undermine the self-reliance of all classes of Irishmen by leading them to trust entirely to the State in all their difficulties, as well as to check the investment of private capital in industrial undertakings. It is, therefore, much to be regretted that both the Government Bill of last year for establishing a special department for promoting Irish industrial development, which embodied some of the most important recommendations of the Recess Committee, and also the measure introduced by Mr. T. M. Healy for granting facilities for the acquisition of land, water, and water rights to promoters of industrial undertakings, should have failed to become law. Though the work of an unofficial body, the Report of the Recess Committee merits especial consideration as a record of the unanimous opinion of representative Irishmen, of all political parties, with regard to the economic position of their

---

\* *Report of the Recess Committee*, pp. 10—43.

† See *ante*, p. 338.

country. Its exhaustive review of the industrial resources of Ireland, and the valuable proposals for their development which it contains, render it, as it appears to us, the most important contribution yet made towards the "Saving of Ireland," and it is earnestly to be hoped, therefore, that legislation on the lines it suggests may shortly be again introduced into Parliament.

Agrarian legislation, the principal features of which were dealt with in this REVIEW some two years ago,\* forms considerably the largest of the three classes under consideration and has been of a far more important character than that relating to industrial development. In addition to purely remedial measures, such as those already referred to for sanctioning advances by the State to landlords and tenants and for improving cottage accommodation,† it comprises a series of Land Acts and Land Purchase Acts, beginning in 1870 and ending in 1896, which have effected one of the most sweeping agrarian reforms ever accomplished in any country. The Land Act, 1870, which legalised the Ulster custom and extended an analogous system to the rest of the country, on the one hand secured both past and future improvements to the tenants and provided for their compensation on eviction for any cause except the non-payment of rent, and, on the other, authorised the advance of two-thirds of the purchase-money to tenants desirous of purchasing their holdings. The two-fold policy thus initiated has been still further developed by the Land Act, 1881, and the subsequent measures, some eight in number,‡ by which it has been amended. Tenants throughout Ireland now enjoy fixity of tenure and can assign and devise their holdings without the consent of their landlords. They have also the rights of appealing to

---

\* LONDON QUARTERLY REVIEW, October, 1895, Art. viii., "Agrarian Reform."

† See *ante*, p. 338.

‡ This number would include the Arrears Act, 1882. The other seven, some of which are Land Acts, some Land Purchase Acts, and others both Land and Land Purchase Acts, were passed in 1885, 1887, 1888, 1889, 1891, 1895 and 1896.

a special tribunal, the Land Commission, to determine the amount of their rent for fifteen years, and of applying for a revision at the end of that term, while the amount of the purchase-money advanced by the State for facilitating their conversion into owners, which was increased to three-fourths in 1881, has, by the Land Purchase Act, 1885, been extended to the whole. The Legislature has thus substituted for the system of landlord and tenant prevailing in the greater part of the United Kingdom, one of dual ownership, under which the sole right left to the original landlord is the payment of a judicial rent, and while abolishing freedom of contract, has constituted the State sole arbiter in all matters affecting the ownership of land. It has at the same time created a new class of freeholders who enjoy the full rights without any of the disadvantages of the dispossessed landowners, and has deprived the latter of the rights both of full ownership and also of hiring out the usufruct of their lands. Its laudable desire to redress the grievances of the tenantry has led it unwittingly to seriously injure the well-being of the landlords—a term which, it must be remembered, comprises not only individual landowners, but also London City companies, insurance and other societies, trustees, mortgagees, municipal corporations, the Churches and the Universities. On the other hand, while the resources of this class, whose expenditure is of the highest value to the country, are being seriously reduced and in some cases entirely crippled, purchasers with capital are deterred from acquiring estates by the knowledge that they will be unable to let any portion of them without parting with half their proprietary rights. As, therefore, big houses are being closed and wealthy residents are growing scarce, the new freeholders, who are obliged to refund to themselves the interest on the capital value of their land, find themselves called on to pay all rates and taxes, as well as to meet the burdens of charitable, religious and other contributions.\*

---

\* LONDON QUARTERLY REVIEW, October, 1895, Art. viii., p. 156—160; *The Saving of Ireland*, pp. 29, 299—301.

In addition to this, the Report of the Commission presided over by Sir Edward Fry reveals many defects in the system established under the Land and Land Purchase Acts for the revision of rents and the sale and purchase of estates. The Land Commission, constituted originally by the Act of 1881, consists of one Judicial and four other Commissioners, and seven legal and eighty-one Lay Assistant Commissioners, from whom Court Valuers and Inspectors are selected. The Commission may delegate such powers as it thinks fit to Sub-Commissions consisting of a Commissioner and one or more Assistant Commissioners or of Assistant Commissioners only. As, therefore, questions as to "fair rent" and "true value" may be heard, not only by the Commission or a Sub-Commission, but also in the Civil Bill Court, and questions as to purchase may also come before the Court of the Land Judge (popularly called the Landed Estates Court) it is evident that, as pointed out by the Commissioners, the system "is of a highly complicated kind."\* It is, therefore, not surprising that they should quote the statement in the Report of Mr. Morley's Committee in 1894, that, in reference to the proceedings under the Land Acts, "there is neither a common understanding of the law nor anything approaching to uniformity in practice," as accurately describing its working.† The concurrent jurisdiction of the Land Commission and the Civil Bill Court has led to discrepancies in practice in the proceedings to fix a fair rent as to the position of valuers, who, before the Land Commission are never, and in the Civil Bill Court are only sometimes, present at the hearing, while in hearings before Sub-Commissioners, they are members of the Court. Similar differences exist as regards the mode of treatment of the schedules, known as the *pink* schedules, in which the particulars of valuations are entered, and the custody of papers, several thousands of the records of cases in the Civil Bill Court, which are entrusted to the Clerks of the Peace, being unaccounted for.‡ The Acts contain no

\* *Report of the Commission to Inquire into the Land Acts*, pp. 8—10.

† *Ibid.*, p. 13.

‡ *Ibid.*, pp. 10, 11.

definition of the terms "fair rent" and "true value," and, though the system has now been in force over sixteen years, there has been no judicial exposition of the former expression, and it is only very recently\* that one has been given of the latter, while even the members of the Head Commission apparently differ among themselves as to the principles and method by which a fair rent should be ascertained.† This is doubtless one of the chief causes of a great diversity of opinion and practice on these questions amongst the Court Valuers and Sub-Commissioners, which causes dissatisfaction in the minds of litigants and increases the number of applications for rehearing, the total of which, between 1881 and 1897, was 51,668, and the costs of which greatly exceed the pecuniary advantages for which they are incurred. These results are intensified by the unfounded suspicions to which these officials are unfortunately exposed and which are engendered partly by the hostility between political parties and between the classes of landlord and tenant, and partly by an idea that they desire to lower rents and delay business in order to keep the machine at work. It must, therefore, in justice to them, be noted that the Commissioners record their belief that they have, as a whole, "striven honestly and to the best of their ability to discharge the difficult duties cast upon them," and that their work is now more carefully and deliberately done than in the early days of the Land Commission.‡ Though, however, they are of opinion that the machinery of the system cannot be said to have been uniformly worked with injustice towards landlords, and are convinced that there has not been any systematic endeavour on the part of the Commissioners or Assistant Commissioners to benefit either side at the expense of the other, they are also convinced that the settlement of fair rents has been effected in an unsatisfactory manner.§ As regards land purchase, on the other hand, it is satisfactory to find that there is a consensus

---

\* *Curneen v. Tottenham* (1896), 2 I. R. 37, 356.

† *Report Commission to Inquire into Land Acts*, pp. 16, 21.

‡ *Ibid.*, pp. 12, 13, 15.

§ *Ibid.*, p. 26.

of opinion in Ireland, in which the Commissioners concur, both as to the beneficial results that have followed from the sales already effected, and also as to the desirability of encouraging landlords and tenants to avail themselves more fully of the benefits of the Land Purchase Acts than they have hitherto done. Owing to defective procedure the efficiency of the Land Commission for carrying out sales with despatch appears, especially since the passing of the Act of 1896, to have largely diminished, but the Commissioners suggest reforms in this respect which seem well calculated to increase it, as well as to effect considerable saving both to litigants and the State.\* There are, however, two evils resulting from the establishment of the Land Commission which cannot be dealt with so easily as the defects of its procedure—the heavy burden, namely, laid upon the country by the existence of the great staff of officials employed under it and of the great body of solicitors and valuers gathered round them, and the unrest generated by the periodical settlement of rents. If, as the Commissioners recommend, this unrest could be allayed and the burthen of perpetually recurring litigation removed by an automatic adjustment of rents or their conversion into rents charge, and if the improvements in detail of the system which they suggest could at the same time be effected, “a great boon would,” as they justly observe, “be conferred on Her Majesty’s subjects in Ireland.”†

2. It would be not one of the least merits of this suggested agrarian reform that its redress of acknowledged grievances would not assail any interests or institutions. Though great benefits may fairly be anticipated from it, this cannot be said of the important political measure now before Parliament, which has been well described as “transforming the structure of Irish local government from top to bottom.”‡

Local government may be said to have been the field in

---

\* *Report Commission to Inquire into the Land Acts*, pp. 35, 40.

† *Ibid.*, p. 40.

‡ See an article in the *Fortnightly Review* for May, 1898, by Judge O'Connor Morris, on “The Irish Local Government Bill.”

which the most practical results of political legislation during the present reign—the establishment of the Poor Law system and the extension of the rights of municipal corporations—have been obtained. The other and more prominent features of such legislation have been the Coercion Acts, necessitated by the agrarian disturbances which unfortunately preceded the passing of some of the principal Land Acts, the Home Rule Bills, and the Report of the Financial Relations Committee. As the thorny questions raised by these measures are temporarily in abeyance, it will be sufficient here to observe that, when considered as an alternative to local government, the most vital objections to the policy they represent is the injury which the severance of the close network of mutual action and advantage binding England and Ireland together would inflict on both countries, and especially on the latter. Separation would deprive Ireland of the capital, now amounting to £400,000,000 sterling, which, on the strength of English credit, has, ever since the Union, been steadily flowing into Ireland, as well as of the advantages of the vast network of mercantile and commercial facilities which Great Britain has established all over the world. It would entail the loss of her trade with Great Britain, amounting to over £40,000,000 sterling, and employing 7,000,000 tons of shipping, and leave her with a trade of £1,000,000 with foreign countries, most of which passes along English routes. It would rob her of the financial profits she obtains from the hunting, shooting, fishing and scenery, which attract sportsmen and tourists to the country, the economic value of which may be gathered from the fact that the loss in annual local expenditure from the diminution of hunting during the ten years ending in 1881 alone was £200,000.\* While these and numerous other economic advantages would be lost to her by separation, they can only be enhanced by the reform in her local government system, which has long been promised to Ireland.

---

\* Cf., *The Saving of Ireland*, pp. 64—71, 215.

Though the Poor Law system—which is the most popularly-constituted department of Irish local government—and cities, towns and harbours are managed by elected bodies, the grand juries, which administer the government of the counties, are nominated, represent only the country gentry, and, though Roman Catholics have been admitted since 1793, still consist largely of Protestants. As, moreover, several of their chief officers are appointed and their expenditure is largely controlled by the central Government, they are, as pointed out by Judge O'Connor Morris, mere Boards of the Castle.\*

It is stated by Mr. Hackett, in his interesting and useful pamphlet, that the Grand Jury system, which corresponds to that administered by the Justices of the Peace in this country prior to the establishment of county councils, was introduced into Ireland by Henry II., and is known to have existed in England and also in Normandy, where it was termed *Le Grand Inquête* before the Conquest. It was originally chiefly a criminal institution confined to the local division of the hundred, but was eventually extended to the county and entrusted with the general management of its affairs. The first record of a Grand Jury in Ireland is the precept for the summons of one for the City of Cork in the reign of Edward I., while the first mention of such a body in an Irish statute is as late as 10 Char. I. c. 26, and many of the practices of these tribunals are based on custom irrespective of the Legislature. While English Grand Juries had by the end of the seventeenth century been gradually deprived of all their functions save that of finding true bills against accused persons, Irish Grand Juries, together with their associated co-ordinate bodies, the Baronial Presentment Sessions have, by a series of statutes, of which the chief is the consolidating Act of 6 and 7 Guil. IV. c. 116, been invested with most of the fiscal and charitable, as well as the criminal business of the county. Besides finding

---

\* *The Saving of Ireland*, pp. 12, 59, 185, 287; and see the article in the *Fortnightly Review* before referred to.



true bills against accused persons, they award damages for malicious injuries, and are responsible for the payment of witnesses' expenses and of extra police. They are charged with the making and repair of all roads, bridges, piers, harbours, and Court and Sessions Houses, and have special powers with respect to the promotion of railway construction under the Light Railways Act. They are entrusted with the management of pauper lunatics, asylums, fever hospitals, industrial schools and reformatories, and also appoint the visiting justices. Lastly, they are responsible for the analysis of foods and drugs, and are the local authority under the Weights and Measures Act, 1878, and may also make presentments for drainage, river conservancy and navigation, guarantees for tramways and various other matters.\*

The Grand Jury consists of twenty-three members selected by the Sheriff, while the Baronial Sessions, the previous approval of which is necessary for all votes of money for roads and works, is composed of such county magistrates as choose to attend and a certain number of cess or ratepayers, called associated ratepayers, who are selected by the Grand Jury from a list furnished by the cess collector for each barony. The barony, which is supposed to be an old Irish tribal division, and has no counterpart in England, is a subdivision of a county with the limits of which its area is always, unlike the English parish, conterminous. The duties of the Baronial Sessions are to approve of, in whole or part, or reject the various applications for payments by contractors for public works and new votes of money, to examine the Surveyor as to the performance of the works previously contracted for, and to give directions as to new votes for public money. The county cess, which is payable by the person occupying the premises at the time the collector makes his levy, is assessed on the rateable value of the property set out in the general valuation lists, and is also payable on tolls of roads, bridges, railways

---

\* *The Irish Grand Jury System*, pp. 3—5, 13, 15.

and gas and water works which are liable to poor rate. The amounts of county cess and poor rate in Ireland are about equal, and together make a total of nearly £3,000,000.\*

The administration of the Grand Juries has been efficient and economical, and in the latter respect compares favourably with that of the poor law, but it will be evident from the foregoing survey that the system is devoid of any popular element and violates the constitutional maxim that taxation and representation should go together.† For this oligarchical system the Local Government Bill will substitute one no less purely democratical. The civil jurisdiction of the Grand Juries, except that relating to compensation for criminal injuries, which is delegated to the county courts, is to be transferred to county councils, practically identical, save that they will contain no aldermen, with those in this country, to be established in every administrative county of Ireland: while those of the Baronial Sessions are to be vested in district councils, the members of which, as in this country, are to be the Poor Law Guardians for their respective divisions. All, except persons in holy orders, possessing the parliamentary franchise, and also peers and women, may vote for the election of, and are eligible to act as county and district councillors; while the chairmen of rural district councils are to be *ex officio* members of county councils, and the chairmen and vice-chairmen of county councils are to be *ex officio* justices of the peace.‡ In addition to the functions transferred to them from the Grand Juries, which thus retain only their criminal jurisdiction, the county councils are constituted local authorities under the Technical Instruction Acts 1889 and 1891. They are to assess and levy the poor rate, a duty hitherto performed by Boards of Guardians, to regulate all arrangements relating to the lunatic poor, and, in cases of exceptional distress may, on the representation of Boards

\* *The Irish Grand Jury System*, pp. 8, 12, 16, 17, 37.

† *Ibid.*, pp. 6, 34. Cf., article in *Fortnightly Review* before referred to.

‡ *Local Government Bill*, secs. 1-5, 59.

of Guardians, apply to the Local Government Board to make provision through the Guardians for exceptional relief.\* Dublin, Belfast, Cork, Limerick, Waterford and Londonderry are made county boroughs for the purposes of the Bill ; while towns, with sanitary powers, of which there are about forty and the increase of which is provided for in the Bill, are to be made district councils, which, subject to county councils, may vote the expenditure on lesser public works.†

Both county and district councils will be subject to the jurisdiction of the Supreme Courts of Ireland in respect of misconduct of various kinds ; and, as regards road expenditure, the appointment of officers, and other matters, will, to a certain extent, be under the control of the Local Government Board.‡ A strong additional stimulus to economy, which, however, cannot affect urban councils, is also supplied by the financial provisions of the Bill, which provide for the annual payment out of the Consolidated Fund of half the poor rate and county cess raised off *agricultural* land in Ireland, and thus relieve both landlords and tenants of half their expenditure under these heads. The relief thus given is to be a fixed amount, to be determined by the charge for the county cess and poor rate in the year before the Bill becomes law, which is to be taken as "the standard financial year," and the knowledge that it cannot be increased or diminished should operate as a strong restraint on extravagance on the part of county councils.§

Though it thus places local government in Ireland on the same basis as it is in England and Scotland, the Bill is doubtless open to criticism in many points. It is, for instance, suggested in the article already referred to by Judge O'Connor Morris, whose experience as a grand juror of fifty and county court judge of twenty-five years' standing gives considerable weight to his opinion, that the trouble

---

\* Secs. 6, 7, 9, 12, 50.

† Secs. 8, 52, 55, 61.

‡ Secs. 17, 27, 28, 67, Sched. 2.

§ Sec. 34.

and expense now entailed on Irishmen with respect to Private Bill legislation in London might be saved, and an argument for Home Rule disposed of, if such legislation were chiefly conducted through county councils, whose decisions, if approved by the Irish Privy Council, might be ratified by Parliament. He also urges that county councils, having interests in common, ought to be empowered to deliberate on them in common by means of committees. Both these proposals seem well worthy of consideration, and it may be noted, as regards the practicability of the first, that a similar one with respect to Scotch Private Bill legislation is embodied in a Bill now before Parliament, and was also mooted when county councils were first established in this country.

It is also contended in the same article that the checks on the popular element in the councils contained in the Bill are inadequate and should be supplemented, both by the infusion of "conservatism" through the addition of a certain number of members elected by ratepayers of a higher class, and also by empowering county courts to take cognisance of wrongs done by these bodies and giving the superior courts a more summary jurisdiction in this respect. With these suggestions, the first of which would obviously introduce an extremely invidious distinction between the Irish Councils and those of the rest of the United Kingdom, we are quite unable to agree. It appears to us, on the contrary, that to be effective this tardy concession to Ireland of a long-denied right must be based on what Sir George Baden-Powell—who would carry it to the extent of casting the duty of maintaining law and order entirely on the localities—well describes as "the forgotten principle of trust in the communities in Ireland." \* It is to this want of trust, coupled with the system of paternal legislation which, as already stated, has seriously impaired the self-reliance of its people, that most of the sufferings of Ireland are due, and to re-emphasize it in the Local Government Bill would be to doom it to the failure

---

\* *The Saving of Ireland*, p. 295.

which has so largely attended Irish legislation. The powers of local self-government were finely described by Mr. Gladstone, when still a Unionist, in a Midlothian speech in 1885, as "associating the people in act and feeling with the law, and lying at the root of political stability, of the harmony of classes, and of national strength." The confidence reposed in the Irish people by the unfettered grant of these powers and the bracing influences of their exercise offer the best prospect of improving the condition of the Irish people, and enabling them, with the aid of the industrial and agrarian reforms already indicated, to develop the great natural resources of their country. The favourable reception accorded to the Local Government Bill in the House of Commons is a good augury for the ultimate attainment of these objects, and we may hope with Sir George Baden-Powell that the close of the century that has elapsed since the disastrous rebellion of 1798 may witness the dawn of a new era of peace and prosperity for Ireland, or, as he urges that it should rather be called, Western Britain.\*

---

\* *The Saving of Ireland*, pp. 323—5.

## SHORT REVIEWS AND BRIEF NOTICES.

---

### THEOLOGY AND APOLOGETICS.

*The Christian Interpretation of Life, and Other Essays.*

By W. T. DAVISON, M.A., D.D. C. H. Kelly. 4s. 6d.

Dr. Davison has for many years been one of the chief contributors to this REVIEW, and our readers will be glad to have in convenient form some of his most important articles. They represent the clearest thinking and ripest scholarship of Methodism, and deal with problems of Christian life and conduct which never lose their interest or importance. *The Service of Man—Positivist and Christian* is an answer to Mr. John Morley and Mr. J. Cotter Morison, who, at the time when the article appeared, were two of the strongest champions of the anti-Christian host. The answer will commend itself to the intellect and the heart of thoughtful Christian men. Dr. Davison writes without a touch of bitterness, though not without deep regret, over the position taken by such antagonists. *The Evidential Value of Christian Experience* is a paper which will act as a trumpet-call to every Christian reader. Dr. Davison says "all may take part in an apologetic which is not of the study nor of the schools, but of the heart, the will and the life. And when this line of Christian defence is fully manned and fully worked there will be no need of any other, for, from such lives, as in the case of the Thessalonian Church of old, the Word of the Lord will be 'sounded out' as from a trumpet, so that others need not to speak anything." *The Realisation of Christian Unity* is too fresh in the minds of our readers to need detailed comment, but it would be hard to find a saner or more truly catholic deliverance on a subject which becomes every day more important. If all the Churches walk by this rule we shall see a great growth in that inward, spiritual unity, which is the only worthy ideal for the Christian Church. The paper which gives its title to the book is now published for the first time and forms an introduction to the later essays, which open up various sides of the great theme there set forth. The claims of a religion may be submitted to various tests, but none is more suggestive than "the attempt to exhibit and justify the interpretation of life which is implicit in religious teaching, the

power which a religion possesses adequately to explain and interpret the history of the world as it unfolds itself before the fullest and best knowledge of succeeding generations." Christianity has been tested from every point of view in turn, but the most serious assault during the present generation has hinged on its interpretation of life. Dr. Davison shows that there can be no real contradiction between true science and true religion. Theism has no quarrel with evolution as a fairly probable working hypothesis. "Evolution does not exclude teleology, though unquestionably it affects its character. The design argument, in the shape it will probably assume in the course of the twentieth century, will of a certainty be more comprehensive and more cogent than it was possible for the eighteenth or even the nineteenth century to conceive." The argument is a fine piece of Christian reasoning. Difficulties are not ignored or made light of, but new lights are thrown upon them, and the conclusion reached is both well based and eminently reassuring. "That the final harmony shall take up into itself all conceivable discords and resolve them in a fashion now unimaginable; that Christ shall be King in all worlds, and that a God of flawless righteousness and eternal love shall at last be all in all, is the final note of the Christian interpretation of life." The book will do a great work in the strengthening of an intelligent faith and will teach its readers how to give "answer to every man that asketh you a reason concerning the hope that is in you."

*International Theological Library: The Christian Pastor and the Working Church.* By WASHINGTON GLADDEN, D.D., LL.D. T. & T. Clark. 10s. 6d.

The subject of applied Christianity is of vital interest for both pastors and Churches, and Dr. Gladden brings to its discussion a large fund of practical experience, reaped amid the engrossing cares of a large congregation. He seeks to show how the pastor may order his own life and the life of his flock, so that their joint service may be most effective in extending the kingdom of God upon earth. The problems discussed are of immediate practical concern, and abundant use is made of the best that has been said upon these themes by wise pastors and teachers of the present generation. After an introductory chapter, which deals with the literature of the subject, Dr. Gladden comes to the question of the Church or local congregation. How large may it be permitted to become with due regard to efficient oversight? A leader with even exceptional power as an organiser finds himself burdened by the care of more than a thousand members. "Generally it will be expedient to colonise before the number reaches that limit. . . . Two Churches of six or seven hundred members each will generally accomplish far

more than one Church of twelve or fourteen hundred members." Some wise remarks are made on the ethics of church architecture, on the location of churches, and on the class of people to be gathered in. Dr. Gladden's position will be understood from a single sentence. "The one intolerable schism is that by which Christ's poor are practically cut off from the fellowship of their more prosperous neighbours." In discussing "The Call to the Pastorate," we find these wise words: "The better preacher he is, the less likely is he to be quite himself in such an ordeal. The consciousness that he is on exhibition is not conducive to the highest spiritual frame in the best preacher. The Church that insists on hearing a candidate has, therefore, adopted a method by which its own ends are apt to be defeated." Dr. Gladden has some helpful words in his chapter on "The Pastor in his Study." "Best of all books for the pastor are the good biographies." The supreme importance of preaching is also insisted on. No stress of other duties must be allowed to push it into a secondary position. The problem of the evening service is one of considerable difficulty in America, where most of the churches are thinly attended. "Where it has not been abandoned, various devices have been resorted to for increasing the congregation—praise services, musical services, spectacular services with lanterns, and such like. One despairing pastor of one of the larger cities has lately grasped at the device of employing young lady ushers as bait to catch the young men. It would not be difficult to hit upon a less objectionable method. If the great concern is to get the young men into the church, a free luncheon, with liquid refreshments, would be more effectual and less indecent." Dr. Gladden holds that any attempt to turn the church into a place of amusement is doomed to failure, but would have special care given to choose interesting subjects which would be legitimately attractive. The subject of church music is also discussed. Quartette choirs, which call forth the remark, "Was not that a splendid exhibition?" are branded as little less than horrible. "It is a grave question whether the musical service, in very many American churches, is not a savour of death unto death, rather than of life unto life." Dr. Gladden's own preference is for a large chorus, with a leader who will see that the anthems or solos are appropriate to public worship. "The Pastor as Friend" is a very suggestive chapter. Sunday Schools, Woman's Work in the Church, Young Men and Women, Missionary Societies, Revivals and Revivalism are other subjects discussed in this singularly helpful and timely book. Its American origin adds to its interest, and furnishes some valuable warnings against current tendencies of Church life on this side of the Atlantic. Dr. Gladden is a sober and sagacious guide, and every preacher who gets this volume will feel that it is one of



the chief treasures of his library—bright, stimulating, instructive at every point, and full of hints for the better fulfilling of his work as pastor, preacher and leader of all the Church's varied activities.

*Christian Dogmatics.* By Rev. JOHN MACPHERSON, M.A.  
T. & T. Clark. 10s. 6d.

Mr. Macpherson attempts in this work to give a systematic presentation, in methodical order, of all the leading doctrines of the Christian faith, from the standpoint of a moderate Calvinism. The history of dogmas has been introduced only in so far as is necessary for the clear and intelligible statement of the positive doctrine. No attempt has been made to develop in detail the Biblical element, except so far as this is needed to supply the foundation for the dogmas accepted and formulated by the Church. The list of books given at the head of each section have been prepared with special care and will be very helpful to those who wish to pursue any subject further. In an introductory chapter on "The Idea and Contents of Christian Dogmatics," the history is treated with great fulness. Special tribute is paid to Professor Banks' *Manual of Christian Doctrine* as very far superior to Moule's *Outlines of Christian Doctrine*. The volume is divided into six chapters, dealing with the doctrines of God and the world, man and sin, redemption, application of redemption, means of grace, the last things. The book is never heavy. It is written in a scholarly style, clear, full, restrained, judicious, and it is a work which every minister will do well to get on his shelves and to read and re-read. The section on "The Eternal States" strikes us as rather scanty, but it is not possible to give extended treatment to every subject in a volume covering the whole field of Christian dogmatics.

*Commentary on the Gospel of St. John.* By the late Professor MILLIGAN and Rev. W. F. MOULTON, D.D.  
T. & T. Clark. 9s.

This Commentary originally formed part of Dr. Philip Schaff's *Popular Commentary on the New Testament*, but its publication in a separate volume will be hailed with delight by all who have used it in its less accessible form. Professor Milligan was mainly responsible for the Introduction, Dr. Moulton for the Textual Criticism, but, to quote Dr. Moulton's words, it was "a joint work, in the fullest sense of the word, a fusion of results of separate labour, a fusion made possible by repeated conference, and most of all by union in sympathy and principles of study, and a common relation of reverence and love towards the Fourth Gospel itself." The Notes are very full and represent the ripest scholarship, the keenest Christian insight and

the most perfect judgment. It is a memorial of two great Christian doctors which all students will prize, and from which they will always rise richer both in mind and heart.

Messrs. T. & T. Clark send us two companion volumes—volumes, at least, which may well be used as companions, treating as they do of kindred subjects. These are *The Christ of History and Experience*, by the Rev. David W. Forrest, M.A., of Wellington Church, Glasgow, being the Kerr Lectures for 1897, and *St. Paul's Conception of Christ, or the Doctrine of the Second Adam*, being the Sixteenth Series of the Cunningham Lectures, by David Somerville, M.A., Minister of Roseburn Free Church, Edinburgh. The latter volume is one of great ability, and very suggestive, but the writer is more than a little enamoured of Ritschl and his teaching. He does not seem to be fully awake to the perilous heresy which underlies the thinking and teaching, however fresh and original it may be, of Ritschl. As to this point, in particular, Mr. Forrest's volume may well serve the student as a corrective. But Mr. Forrest's book is throughout one of remarkable breadth and strength, fresh, deep, and orthodox. Perhaps he has hardly yet fully ripened. We may fairly expect even better gifts than this volume. May we venture on a caveat as to some of his observations as to the Divine discourses in St. John? No such difficulty, we venture to think, is found in interpreting the discourse in the synagogue at Capernaum as that which undoubtedly perplexes the student of John iii., in the closing verses of the chapter. But we hardly like to intimate any qualification of the praise which we are bound to give to this stimulating and suggestive treatise.

*The Growth of the Kingdom of God.* By SIDNEY L. GULICK, M.A., Missionary of A.B.C.F.M. in Japan. Religious Tract Society. 6s.

Mr. Gulick prepared the substance of this volume for a course of addresses to a set of bright Japanese youths. Material grew upon him, and he has done good service to Christian workers in England by the publication of these facts and figures. The record is inspiring. At the end of the third century the adherents of Christianity numbered five millions, at the end of the tenth they had grown to fifty millions, and now they reach the grand total of five hundred millions. In the last ninety years we have added three times as many to our roll as in the first fifteen hundred years after Pentecost. By an ingenious set of charts the figures are made very impressive. The first section of the book deals with growth in numbers, the third chapter shows the growth of the kingdom of God in England and Wales with all the auxiliary movements such as Sunday Schools, Young People's Societies, University Settlements, Charities and

Education. Another chapter deals in a similar way with the United States, then the growth in understanding Christianity is dealt with, and the growth in practice and in influence. Such a book is an armoury where the Christian apologist will find all that he needs both to defend the truth and convince his opponent.

*Some New Testament Problems.* By Rev. ARTHUR WRIGHT, M.A., Fellow and Tutor of Queen's College, Cambridge. Methuen & Co. 6s.

This volume belongs to "The Churchman's Library," edited by the Rev. J. H. Burn, B.D. Its first chapters deal with the composition of the synoptic Gospels, a subject which has engaged much of the writer's time in his lecture room. He holds strongly to the oral theory, and believes that the written St. Mark was preceded by an oral St. Mark, which took many years to form. A single lesson, perhaps connected with the Passion, was probably the first small origin of the Gospel, and other lessons, one at a time, collected round that centre, sometimes in one chapter sometimes in another, till it reached its present dimensions. The student who patiently follows these chapters will gain much light on his Gospels, and will find Mr. Wright a guide of rare critical insight and balanced judgment. Some of the expository sections of the book are of special value and interest. We entirely agree with the writer in regarding our Lord's words about the camel going through the needle's eye as an Oriental hyperbole, wrung from his heart by the smart of a great disappointment. It is probable that the name needle's eye for a smaller door in the large city gate has been invented in order to explain a difficult saying. Still more valuable is the discussion of the Gift of Tongues. Mr. Wright holds that the gift on the Day of Pentecost was not different in kind from that in which the Church of Corinth gloried. He adopts Dean Alford's view that in both cases there was a powerful inspiration of the Holy Spirit, in which the praises of God were uttered in languages hitherto unknown to the speaker. The case is presented in a new light with modifications and explanations which make it much more reasonable. We are persuaded that he is nearer the truth than those who regard the gift at Corinth as a mere trance or ecstasy. This is certainly one of the most suggestive and stimulating set of studies on New Testament problems that has appeared for many a day.

1. *Philology of the Gospels.* By FRIEDRICH BLASS, Dr.Phil., Professor of Classical Philology in the University of Halle-Wittenberg. 4s. 6d. net.
2. *Four Lectures on the Early History of the Gospels,*

*delivered at Milborne Port, Somerset.* By the Rev. J. H. WILKINSON, M.A. 3s. net. Macmillan & Co.

1. Professor Blass, the eminent philological student of Halle-Wittenberg, begins his study of the Gospels with St. Luke, which, although confessedly not the first written, is the only Gospel which can be regarded as a literary production in the stricter sense of the term. It opens with an elaborate dedication, like other literary productions of that age. This preface Dr. Blass discusses with much acumen. Theophilus lived outside the circle reached by the Apostolic preaching and the "us" of verses one and two—the Christian community of Judæa. Evidence is brought forward to prove that St. Luke finished his Gospel in the year 56 A.D., though this is in direct opposition to the opinions most current at the present day. "Omne vaticinium post eventum" is really the axiom that lies at the root of these opinions; but Dr. Blass cannot accept that rationalistic maxim. A valuable chapter on "The Importance and Method of Textual Criticism in the New Testament" will repay careful study. It prepares the way for a discussion of the textual condition of the Gospels, the double text in St. Luke and the Acts, and leads up to a study of textual difficulties in the Gospel which throws new light on some old problems. Dr. Blass is an acute and judicious critic, whose work scholars will both prize and use.

2. Mr. Wilkinson's *Lectures on the Early History of the Gospels* are principally based on the researches of Harnack and Zahn; but he attempts to sum up all that is known as to the origin of the Gospels, and to focus the converging lines of evidence into one connected whole. His chapters deal with the Gospels in Palestine before 100 A.D.; in Egypt about 100—150; in Rome, 150—200; in Syria after 170 A.D. After a brief general preface, he traces the Gospels back to their common original in Palestine through Papias, the Ebionite Gospel, the Gospel according to the Hebrews. The other chapters try to piece together the history of the Gospels in different parts of the world, in order to throw light on their history. Mr. Wilkinson does not seem very hopeful as to any final solution of the problem presented by the relation to each other of the Synoptics. Whether anyone will ever be able to reach anything like demonstrable conclusions on this subject it is impossible to say; but the attempt to grapple with the problem is itself an education, and this little book is worthy of close attention.

*The Last Things.* By JOSEPH AGAR BEET, D.D. Third Edition. Hodder & Stoughton. 6s.

Dr. Beet has wisely availed himself of the opportunity presented by this new edition to guard some of the statements

which we challenged in our notice of the first edition. He has now made his meaning clearer, and has defined his position in a way that will quiet many minds, though its trend and tone will still be eminently unsatisfactory to trained theologians. He is now careful to guard himself from being understood to imply that the authority of the moral sense is superior to that of the Bible. "Each is supreme in its own sphere, and each recognises the authority of the other." Dr. Beet has also re-written four or five pages dealing with this subject, which had caused grave anxiety to the theologians of his own Church. The most valuable addition to the volume is a note of seven pages, discussing Mr. Gladstone's chapters on the Future Life, given in his *Studies Subsidiary to the Works of Butler*. He claims the great statesman as a witness on his own side. "Mr. Gladstone denies strongly, and again and again, . . . that the Bible ever teaches, in the proper sense of the phrase, the immortality of the soul"; and adds: "The whole volume fills me with wonder that a man whose days have been spent in the activities and conflicts of political life has been able so carefully to ponder the great realities which will abide when all earthly kingdoms have passed away; and in extreme old age, on the borderland of the unseen, to give us so valuable an addition to our theological literature."

1. *Colossian Studies : Lessons in Faith and Holiness from St. Paul's Epistles to the Colossians and Philemon.* By H. C. G. MOULE, D.D. Hodder & Stoughton. 5s.
2. *The Cross and the Spirit : Studies in the Epistle to the Galatians.* By H. C. G. MOULE, D.D. Seeley & Co. 1s. 6d.

1. Dr. Moule has given us a set of studies in the Colossians which must stir every Christian heart and lead to more real and deeper spirituality. His purpose has not been to supply a complete and elaborated critical commentary, though he has sought to render every word of the text with careful regard to diction and connection. He has aimed as it were to take up the Apostle's words for the first time, and to give in English the freshness of the impression. Having thus prepared the ground he endeavours to bring out "the inexhaustible messages for the soul which the study of the God-given utterances of the Apostle has carried home to himself." The Epistle is taken *seriatim*, and its message gains new meaning and force as we study these chapters. The writer says: "Let a man of elevated and penetrating understanding get a true view of the Christ of God, as the Word shows Him and the Spirit glorifies Him, and he will have a subject-matter for his whole mental powers such as

he never had before. . . . He will find himself not studying Christ in the light of other things, but studying everything else in the light of Christ. Christ will no longer be a light, however brilliant, shining among others in the firmament of thought. He will be the sun of the sky. He will be the sun of the whole rolling system." Dr. Moule has reached that point, and his book will help every spiritually-minded reader to approach it. He clearly sees that "an untheological devotion" has no firm foundation. Under very moderate pressure from fashions of thought and attractive personalities it will soon get away from that ground where alone the world, the flesh, and the devil can be really met. It will be well for every one to read the most tender and stimulating chapter on "The Christian Home," which in itself would make it worth while to buy this volume.

2. *The Cross and the Spirit* is a smaller book, embodying four lectures given to a gathering of clergy at Cambridge last summer. It does not attempt to deal exhaustively with the literary and critical topics suggested by the Epistle to the Galatians, but to lay hold of its spiritual meaning and to enforce and illustrate the duty of expository instruction. The brief specimens of exposition will supply many good hints for pastors and teachers. The economy of opportunity in the pulpit is forcibly brought out. The modern preacher must be content to be brief if he would win full attention, but that should only stir him up to make full use of his opportunity. "The less the time granted him by usage, the more must he preach the Word, the more must he preach the Lord." That end will be much furthered by this little volume, which is full of meat for full-grown men.

*The Modern Reader's Bible: The Psalms and Lamentations.*

Edited, with an Introduction and Notes, by RICHARD G. MOULTON, M.A. In Two Volumes. Macmillan & Co. 2s. 6d. each.

Two exquisite little devotional volumes. Mr. Moulton points out with great force that "the change from Judaism to Christianity is immense; but it is a change that has had no influence on the Book of Psalms; the modern Christian turns to it as naturally as the ancient Hebrew. It is safe to predict that, however much mankind may alter the articles of its belief, the Hebrew Psalms will not cease to furnish matter for liturgy and stimulus to private devotion." The Introduction will help many readers to understand the metrical parallelism of the Psalms. Their range of subjects is also very happily described. "Lyric verse is the confidant of the soul in all its moods—from pompous ritual and national pæan down to the cry of a solitary soul in the dark, there is nothing that cannot

find a record in the Book of Psalms." The chief features of the Psalter are brought out in a way that will provoke thought and tempt to further study. The arrangement of the Psalms with their felicitous headings is a great attraction of these volumes; the notes are often very suggestive and helpful, whilst the printing and get-up are simply perfect.

*Isaiah, Chapters 40—56.* With Introduction and Notes. By the Rev. J. SKINNER, D.D. Cambridge University Press.

Professor Skinner will be found a wise guide for students of the second portion of Isaiah's prophecy. He gives a clear account of the verdicts of modern criticism as to the date and authorship of these chapters, and the interpretation of the "Servant" passages. We think he concedes a little too much to the higher critics at certain points; but he reasons out each position in a masterly way, and supplies full material for those who wish to study these great and thorny problems. The exposition is sound, and much light is thrown on difficult passages. With these volumes and Dr. G. A. Smith's "Isaiah," in the *Expositor's Bible*, preachers and teachers will find themselves well equipped for all their studies in this prophecy.

*Women of the Old Testament.* By Rev. R. F. HORTON, M.A., D.D. Service & Paton. 3s. 6d.

Dr. Horton's book belongs to a series called "The Popular Biblical Library," for which Dean Farrar has written a volume on *The Herods*. The standpoint is that of the New Criticism, and the Story of Eve is pronounced to be unhistorical—a myth or allegory. But though the tone of the discussions may occasionally irritate, the sketches are so fresh and vigorous, so full of good points and lessons for to-day, that they will quicken interest in some of the most beautiful stories of the Old Testament, and help preachers and teachers to present these well-worn narratives with new life and force. Rebekah finds a warm apologist in Dr. Horton, whose estimate of her character will repay careful study. Ruth is one of the finest portraits, and Abigail is pronounced to be "the most savingly attractive woman in the history of the Old Testament." The noble character of Naomi is very sympathetically sketched.

*Bible Characters: Gideon to Absalom.* By ALEXANDER WHYTE, D.D. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 3s. 6d.

Dr. Whyte has a happy knack of entering into the spirit of these old Hebrew worthies. He is himself one of the chief mystics of the present day; but he is also a man of strong practical sense, who understands the hard work set these great leaders, and sympathises with all their difficulties. His sketch

of "Jephthah and his Daughter" is full of sympathy for "the most ill-used man in all the Old Testament," who "continues to be the most completely misunderstood, misrepresented, and ill-used man down to this day." "Ruth" is a fine subject for Dr. Whyte, but his "Hannah" is somewhat strained and exaggerated. The book will quicken the reader's imagination, and give freshness and point to the beautiful stories of the Old Testament.

*Companions of the Sorrowful Way.* By JOHN WATSON, D.D. Hodder & Stoughton. 2s. 6d.

This may be described as a companion volume to *The Upper Room*, which is one of Dr. Watson's best pieces of devotional work. The Way itself is described in the first chapter. "As the devout reader chooses he may join himself to the Lord in the Sorrowful Way at Gethsemane, or three and thirty years earlier at the manger of Bethlehem. And it may not be unprofitable for the disciple to remind himself that the Lord was walking in the Sorrowful Way before the Incarnation, as He suffered and sorrowed over backsliding Israel unto bitter crying and lamentations, and that He is still to be found therein as He shares from day to day the temptation and griefs of His Church." "The Three Intimates of Jesus," Peter, James and John, furnish a theme for some very happy moralising and meditation on the blessings of sorrow. "It is in this travail of soul over the world that saints are formed and reach the heights of holiness; it is in this shadow that pious hearts are led into the mysteries of the soul and into the secret things of God. The agonies of life grow luminous and beautiful to those who are taken apart and who keep watch with the Lord. It is not by the way of learning but by the way of suffering that we come unto knowledge, and he was right who, being asked how he came to know so much, pointed to the crucifix. They who sail on the surface of a summer sea gain no treasures, but they who, weighed down with that sorrow, fear not to sound the depths, return to the light with pearls in their hands." These quotations will show what treasures there are in the little volume. Some of the chapters are too fanciful; notably that on "The owner of Gethsemane," and there is a little straining after novelty, but there is a tender pathos about the whole book which will make it a great and deserved favourite for the devotional library. It is beautifully bound and printed.

*The Confessions of St. Augustine.* Newly translated with Notes and Introduction by C. BIGG, D.D. Methuen & Co. 2s.

This is the first volume in "The Library of Devotion," and [No. CLXXX.]—NEW SERIES, VOL. XXX. NO. 2. 2 A



if the books that follow maintain the high standard here set, the publishers' statement that "no such attractive editions of devotional books have ever been offered to the public at such a low, or even at a higher price," will be perfectly justified. Dr. Bigg's introduction gives some useful notes on earlier translations, and then deals with the Confessions and the struggle through which Augustine passed before he found rest at Milan in a way so suggestive and instructive that it ought to be read again and again. The whole course of a soul's progress to the light is mirrored here. The translation itself is not only exact but brightly alive.

*The Mysteries, Pagan and Christian.* Being the Hulsean Lectures for 1896-97. By S. CHEETHAM, D.D., F.S.A., Archdeacon and Canon of Rochester, &c. Macmillans. 1897. 5s.

This is a small but scholarly and well-digested book on a profound and difficult but singularly interesting subject. Students owe a debt of gratitude to Canon Cheetham for thus presenting the results of close research into a tangled maze of recondite learning. Remarkable sobriety of judgment no less than a clear mastery of the controversies involved distinguishes this cheap and handy volume.

*Letters from Heaven.* A Communication from a Star. Edited, with permission, by G. E. WATTS, M.A., F.R.A.S.

*The Penitent Pilgrim and Manual of Prayer and Practice,* Re-edited from the Edition of 1641 by G. E. WATTS. David Nutt, in the Strand, 1897.

These little paper-covered, but exquisitely printed, books cost sixpence each. The first works out an idea which has not seldom visited meditative minds, but which has not often been developed in thought. It reminds us at times of some passages in Tucker's *Light of Nature*. It relates to the change of the soul from dying into the life beyond. The headings of the chapters are all that we can give—"The End," "The Change," "The Trial," "The New Abode," "Our Society," "Our Occupations," "The King," "Conclusion." It is very fanciful, whether it is orthodox or not it would be hard to say. Some may think there is a Swedenborgian glamour about it. But it is worth reading; is in some parts beautifully written, and to the mere children of the passing hour may prove usefully suggestive and elevating. The other little book is perhaps Mr. Watts' own production, and only imagined as a modern

reduction to handy size and simple style of a Stuart High Church Manual. It is touchingly and searchingly devotional and also practical.

*Village Sermons.* Preached at Whatley, by the late R. W. CHURCH, M.A., D.C.L. Third Series. Macmillans. 6s.

These sermons will not disappoint those who have found the earlier volumes so full of spiritual force and masterly simplicity. Every subject which Dean Church touches grows richer in his hands. The sermon on "Holy Communion" will be found specially suggestive and profitable. Preachers will trace on every page the hand of a great master of Christian thought, who knows how to combine depth of teaching with simplicity of language.

*The Ten Commandments.* By GEORGE JACKSON, B.A. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 2s. 6d.

This volume will increase Mr. Jackson's reputation as a preacher and thinker. He has a singularly clear and logical style, and is able to illustrate his positions by apt quotation drawn from a considerable area. He handles some thorny themes, but the treatment of them is always judicious and manly. This is a book that will do real service to the cause of Christian morality.

*Christianity and the Progress of Man, as illustrated by Modern Missions.* By W. DOUGLAS MACKENZIE, M.A., Professor in Chicago Theological Seminary. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 3s. 6d.

Professor Mackenzie's aim is to show how the "one universalistic religion has been moulding the life of the one race of mankind during the nineteenth century," and he has produced an impressive sketch of the influence of the missionary as pioneer, translator, educator, martyr and civilizer of the world. The subject is one of deep interest to all churches, and missionary advocates will gain much material from this volume. It furnishes a noble argument for Christianity and a powerful plea for missions.

*In a Plain Path.* Addresses to Boys. By the Rev. W. J. FOXELL, M.A., Minor Canon of Canterbury Cathedral. Macmillans. 3s. 6d.

Mr. Foxell has followed up his successful volume, *God's Garden*, with this companion book. The addresses are simple, direct, homely and filled with good illustrations. Teachers and

parents will be glad to have such a set of addresses to read to boys. They are manly and full of food for mind and heart. The description of the loafer, on page 169, is, perhaps, too realistic, but we have no doubt that it caught attention and fastened a good lesson on the memory.

*Our Boys.* Being a Book for Schoolboys and Others. By Various PREACHERS. Edited by the Rev. S. B. JAMES, D.D. The Roxburghe Press. 3s. 6d.

Dr. James is responsible for twelve out of the twenty sermons in this volume. They were preached to a congregation of more than five hundred boys, and it is evident that the preacher's heart was in his work. There is much good feeling, wise counsel and spiritual earnestness in the volume, but it is not high-class work. There are jerky sentences, passages marked by affected rhetoric and other palpable blemishes. We can scarcely understand a master preaching on "Corporal Punishment" from a school pulpit.

*Yet.* By the Rev. FREDERIC R. ANDREWS. London: T. Fisher Unwin. 1897. 5s.

This is a collection of sixteen sermons, in which there is no other unity than arises from the presence of the word "yet" at the beginning of the text of each. It is impossible to commend such a method of selecting texts. The sermons are mainly topical, ethical and evangelical in their aim, but rather diffuse in treatment. They abound in quotations and in illustrations, chiefly from biography and history, but lack any philosophic depth or artistic merit. They are interesting and pleasant, and certain to benefit readers who resent any exacting claim upon their powers of attention.

*In Answer to Prayer.* Isbister & Co. 2s. 6d.

These papers on answers to prayer attracted considerable attention when they appeared in the pages of the *Sunday Magazine*, and will be very useful in this more accessible form. We think some of the instances scarcely deserve to be chronicled under this category. Dr. Horton's story of the golosh lost in Norway is not only open to "the cold laugh of prayerless men," but the calm judgment of Christian people will be that it was scarcely worthy of insertion here. Bishop Boyd Carpenter takes strong ground in his happy little paper, where he points out that "the least-answered prayer may be the most-answered. It is the realisation that experiences fit us for the duties of later life, which yields to us the assurance that, in the deepest sense, our seemingly disregarded prayers have been most abundantly remembered before God." The Rev. John Watson's instances

of personal guidance are very interesting, and Mr. Hugh Price Hughes dwells on some pages of his own experience, which show that answers to prayer are "the commonplace of real and active Christianity."

*Our Prayer Book*, by H. C. Moule, D.D. (Seeley & Co., 1s.) is a series of short chapters on the history and contents of the Book of Common Prayer, which are so bright and so spiritual that young members of the Church of England will take a new interest in its services as they read Dr. Moule's pages. The book will also be of service to Nonconformists who wish to study the history of the Prayer Book. Dr. Moule knows his subject well, and the evangelical and Protestant note is never lacking. We heartily commend this most instructive little volume.

*God's Measure, and other Sermons.* By the Rev. J. T. FORBES, M.A. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 2s. 6d.

This volume ought to be widely known. The sermons are rich in thought, chaste and felicitous in style. We have found it both fresh and stimulating—a book to be enjoyed, and likely to deepen religious feeling.

*From Strength to Strength*, by J. H. Jowett, M.A. (Hodder & Stoughton, 1s. 6d.) is a helpful contribution to "Little Books on Religion." The Strengthening of the Will, Conscience, Heart and Mind are the four subjects, and everybody ought to be stronger and wiser for a perusal of the homilies.

*The Biblical Illustrator.* By JOSEPH S. EXELL, M.A. *The Epistles of St. John and St. Jude, Revelation.* Nisbet & Co. 7s. 6d. each.

These two volumes of *The Biblical Illustrator* will be specially useful to preachers and teachers. They are full of anecdotes and illustrations, drawn from all sources, and the compilers have rifled every available store to enrich their own pages with things that will stimulate a preacher's mind, and brighten his sermons and addresses. The man who has such helps and uses them wisely will find that he is never at a loss for good matter.

*The Holy Bible.* Vol. VII. St. Matthew to St. John. Vol. VIII. Acts to Revelation. By J. W. MACKAIL. Macmillans. 5s. each.

Beautifully printed and with nothing to distract attention from the text, this addition to the "Eversley Series" ought to be welcomed by every lover of the Bible. It is a most convenient volume to handle, and we hope the edition will be widely popular.

*The Bible References of John Ruskin.* By MARY and ELLEN GIBBS. George Allen.

Ruskin's works are in some sense a Commentary on the Bible, and we heartily commend this suggestive and skilful grouping of the chief Scripture illustrations to be drawn from his books to preachers and teachers. They will often catch a glow for their own minds and hearts from Ruskin's words, and will enrich their addresses and lessons by the thoughts of one of our greatest masters. The volume will be found both fresh and profitable for use as a book of devotion. The selections are arranged alphabetically, and there is a good index showing the passages of Scripture which are illustrated. The neat get up adds to the attractiveness of the volume, which ought to be widely popular as a gift-book.

Mr. George Stoneman has published three small volumes by the Rev. George Henslow, which are full of matter. *The Argument of Adaptation* indicates how Paley's famous argument for design should be restated in view of the scientific attack upon it. *Christ no Product of Evolution* shows that Christ is absolutely unique, a new product, and no evolution from Judaism. *Spiritual Teaching of Bible Plants* is a book which will furnish some good hints for harvest festivals and flower services. The little books are richly suggestive and instructive.

*The Nicetical Christ.* By S. H. PLAYFAIR. Edinburgh: W. H. White & Co. 1s.

This is a strange pamphlet. Faith in the conquering Christ is shown to be the secret of a conquering life, but the theme is disguised by the vilest jargon that was ever printed. "To have the faith of Christ is to have this eternal life, which is the nicetical energy of the eternal spirit of God immanent in the universe and the mind of man: the faith of Christ fits a man to wield the energy of his life nicetically. This is the nicetical mood, the nicological motive of life which the parenetic promises of the nicetical Christ seek to evoke. Faith in the nicetical Christ fits a man to attain the nicetical faith of Christ." We should like to watch a mothers' meeting listening to these sentences. Mr. Playfair takes a strange way to enlighten the world.

*The Elector King and Priest*, by A. S. Lamb (Nisbet & Co., 1s.) is another timely protest against the Idolatry of the Mass and the Adoration of the Cross of which we hear so much in the Church of England. Mr. Lamb grounds his position on Scripture, enforces it from the Homilies, and gives point to it by some descriptions of Ritualistic services. His earnest defence of true Protestantism ought to commend his book to every straightforward man.

*The Principles of Protestantism.* By J. P. LILLEY, M.A.  
T. & T. Clark.

The handbooks for Bible classes are all solid and able, but few are more thorough and instructive than this. Mr. Lilley shows how the leading doctrines of Protestantism took shape in opposition to those of the Church of Rome. He divides his subject into three sections, dealing with the Gospel, the Charter and the Polity of Protestantism, or in other words the evangelic method of Salvation, the Word of God, and the fellowship of believers. The book is packed with matter, and it is well arranged and well put. It would not be easy to get a more clear, full and readable discussion of the contrasts between Popery and Protestantism.

---

## HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY.

*The History of Early Christianity.* By LEIGHTON PULLAN, M.A., Fellow and Lecturer of St. John Baptist College, Oxford. Service & Paton. 3s. 6d.

It has long been conceded by intelligent opponents that about 180 to 190 A.D., Orthodox Christianity was in possession of the field. "The Divinity of Christ, the unique value of our four Gospels, a creed resembling our Apostle's Creed, were then only disputed by men who were in open antagonism with the Church." The opponents of Orthodoxy are also beginning to admit that it could not have been a mere product of the controversies which were rife between 120 and 160 A.D. Mr. Pullan holds that this concession must prove fatal to any but the orthodox account of the belief of the Primitive Church. He has therefore set himself to treat the history in the period from A.D. 29 to 190 as a defence of Orthodox Christianity. After a suggestive chapter on "Rome and her Religion," "The Birth of the Church," "St. Paul and the Law," "St. John and the Church of Asia," and such subjects as "The Church and the Gospels" are treated in a way that clears up many difficulties for an intelligent reader and shows how solid and reliable the Christian argument is. The book is written from the point of view of an English High Churchman, but it is so instructive and fresh in its treatment that even those who differ in some respects from the writer will find his work most valuable and helpful.

*The History of Kingswood School : together with Registers of Kingswood School and Woodhouse Grove School, and a List of Masters.* By THREE OLD BOYS. C. H. Kelly. 8s. net.

It is no easy task to trace the history of a great school for one hundred and fifty years, but the compilers of this record have brought true enthusiasm and much literary skill to their work, and have given us a volume which will be studied with the deepest interest not only by those who have been trained at Kingswood, but by a wider circle of readers both inside Methodism and beyond her borders. Mr. W. A. Willis has been mainly responsible for the first section on "*Origines Sacrae*," which tells again the famous story of the Founder's hopes and fears and disappointments, and brings the little bark after its first anxious half century into smooth and safe waters. The record is spiced with many a good story. Adam Clarke's quarantine here in 1782 is vividly described. Mrs. Simpson, the headmaster's wife, played the part of "*Bengal Tiger*" to the Irish youth. He was compelled to rub himself with noxious ointment, was confined to his chamber without fire or change of sheets. "He had bread and milk for dinner, breakfast and supper, was left to make his own bed, sweep his own room, and perform all the other offices of a chambermaid." He showed his benumbed fingers to the head master, but was simply recommended to use some form of physical exertion from which, however, he was driven by the redoubtable Mrs. Simpson. Clarke gives a painful description of the utterly disorganised state of the school. "In several respects each one did what was right in his own eyes. There was no efficient plan pursued; they mocked at religion, and trampled under foot all the laws." Twenty years later we find a supernumerary minister, William Stevens, appointed as writing and English master. He and his wife came from Yorkshire to the dirty little cottage which was the only shelter that could be procured for them at such short notice. "Here we had to begin the world again, without even a spoon or a single article of furniture." Mr. Stevens opened a small business in the village "in the druggist and stationery line," and acted as a sort of medical practitioner in the district. He rendered good service to the colliers in the terrible distress which prevailed among them at this time. In 1803 the Conference resolved to depart from Wesley's rules forbidding play or absence from the school until a boy left it for good and all. A vacation of two months every other year was allowed, but this was pronounced next year to be "highly detrimental to morals and learning." Mr. A. H. L. Hastling is responsible for the next two sections, headed "*Sparta*" and "*The Promised Land*." A pleasant vein of

humour enlivens this part of the record. Questions of finance are discussed, methods of teaching and examination are brought under review. The nearest approach to physical education in the early part of this century is a resolution of the committee in 1825. "We deem it very desirable to have the assistance of a pious soldier to instruct the boys in walking." A chapter entitled "The Living Spirit" is an introduction to tutors and governors. The Rev. Robert Smith, governor from 1820 to 1843, was "of patriarchal appearance and vast perimeter." His wife was a thorough housekeeper, and was sorely disturbed when the boys tried how far the wind would blow their nightcaps from the bedroom windows into the garden. "Oh, these wicked lads," she used to cry, "they'll ruin the institution!" Jonathan Crowther brought the rod of iron into the school and inaugurated, as one of his pupils says, a system of "harsh and cruel treatment, which turned boys into devils, and made school a prison house." Some of the junior masters followed in Mr. Crowther's steps with disastrous results both for themselves and the lads under their charge. The lack of a kindly woman's influence was keenly felt in these days. There was a famine of love, and small boys cut off from home and under Spartan discipline felt this very keenly. One of them writes: "True, there was Dame Smith, but she seemed centuries off, and never spoke to us unless, in true shopkeeper fashion, she sold us sweets once a week. There was Miss Smith, too, but her duties did not lie our way. I remember how we little boys yearned for a look from her, and if she ever smiled on one of us the favoured one ran off with rapture to boast of it to the rest." New Kingswood, near Bath, was opened in October, 1852, and round its buildings there centres a history of scholastic success such as few schools in England can rival. Two Senior Wranglers and a host of capital scholars have been trained here. Dr. Jowett once expressed his pleasure in receiving Kingswood boys at Balliol, because "they were not all cut to one pattern." The sketches of the "General Life" of the school, and of "Men and Measures" are full of racy things. The attempts to guide the religious life of the place were not always happy. "In the dormitories, for instance, boys both knelt for their devotions and rose from them by word of command. A case is recalled of a boy who was rebuked for praying too long!" A well-merited tribute is paid to the Rev. Theophilus Woolmer, who during his governorship devoted his whole salary to providing the boys with a Saturday meat dinner. He made great efforts to improve the clothing and food, distributed apples from his own garden, and opened that enchanted realm to the boys on Sunday afternoons. What higher claim can any governor have to immortality! Mr. T. G. Osborn's memorable years at Kingswood find worthy record, but they are written in a roll of



academic successes which will never fade. The Appendices and the Register of Scholars will be consulted eagerly by boys and masters. The get up of the book reflects great credit on the publisher, and it is plentifully supplied with plans and illustrations. "The Three Old Boys" have earned the lasting gratitude of their school and of the Methodist Connexion by this sparkling record of life and manners at Kingswood.

*Two Hundred Years: The History of the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1698—1898.* By W. O. B. ALLEN, M.A., and EDMUND MCCLURE, M.A. S.P.C.K. 10s. 6d.

The two Secretaries of the S.P.C.K. have set themselves what they call the almost impossible task of compressing the records, letter-books, reports, and minutes of two hundred busy years, into reasonable limits and a readable book. A world-wide and many-sided Society, which, during the last sixty-eight years, has voted £651,894 to our colonies and dependencies for church buildings, schools, colleges, studentships, medical missions, endowment of sees and clergy; a Society which has circulated millions of Scriptures, books and tracts, and kept itself in touch with all the developments of the English Church in other lands as well as in this country; such a Society deserved to have a permanent record of its work, and the general verdict will be that the compilers have shown amazing industry in their task, and have produced a volume which is a mine of material for students of Church life at home and abroad. A preliminary sketch of the religious movements of the seventeenth century prepares the way for biographical notices of Dr. Bray and other founders of the S.P.C.K. The early minutes furnish some pleasant details as to the *modus operandi*, and abstracts are given of letters from the country clergy which often throw a good deal of light on the religious condition of our towns and villages. Samuel Wesley, of Epworth, was a stout supporter of the Society, and few communications recorded here are more interesting than his. He was, in some sense, buried in the Isle of Axholme, yet his brain was as prolific in suggestions and methods as that of his famous son—the founder of Methodism. The chapters describing the great work done by the S.P.C.K. in promoting religious education, spreading Christian literature, translating the Scriptures and other religious books, will be found full of various interest. The chapter on "The Plantations in America" will be eagerly scanned on both sides of the Atlantic, and it contains much material of great value. Missions in nearly all parts of the world come under review. The volume is a worthy monument of two hundred years' service to Christianity, and its appendices and index will enable everyone

to put his hand easily on its treasures. The reprints of title pages of early publications show what progress the printers' art has made since the Society was founded, and the whole book is crowded with interesting facts.

*Regent Square.* Eighty Years of a London Congregation.

By JOHN HAIR. Illustrated. Nisbet & Co. 6s.

Six shillings will be well invested in this volume. It is not only the history of a famous Church which numbers Edward Irving, James Hamilton and James Oswald Dykes and John McNeil among its pastors, but it gives a glimpse into the inner working of Presbyterianism and shows how strong it is in the gifts and the loyalty of its laymen. Mr. Hair has been a member of the kirk-session at Regent Square for more than twenty years, and is steeped in the traditions of the place. He knows how to make the history live, and at some points the interest of his record becomes intense. Regent Square really owes its origin to the Highland Society of London, formed in 1798, which not only founded an asylum for the education and support of the orphans of Scottish soldiers and sailors, but set itself to provide Gaelic preaching in the Metropolis. For this purpose the Swedenborgian Temple in Hatton Garden was taken in 1816. A minister was secured who could preach both in English and in Gaelic. This was the Rev. James Boyd, father of Dr. Boyd, of St. Andrews. He received £130 a year and another £100 as his half of the pew rents, but after a successful year he accepted a call to Scotland. Another minister served for a year, then Edward Irving was invited to become pastor. He could not speak Gaelic, but this difficulty was met, and in October, 1822, he was inducted as ordained minister of the Caledonian Church. He had made no mark in Scotland as a preacher, but in Cross Street he won a great reputation. Sir James Mackintosh told George Canning how much he had been impressed by Irving's prayer for some fatherless children: "We pray for these orphans, who are now thrown upon the Fatherhood of God." Canning asked Mackintosh to take him to the Scotch Church next Sunday, and referred to the service in the House of Commons. A crowd of celebrities presented themselves at the church on the next Sunday, and henceforth peers, statesmen, philosophers, poets, painters and literary men mingled with fashionable ladies and shopkeepers and mechanics in the mean-looking, dingy chapel. The building is still standing, but it is now used as a storehouse for chemicals. Irving's popularity led the officers to seek a more worthy home for their congregation. Mr. Hair traces the course of events to their pitiful climax in Irving's deposition and the tearing asunder of

his Church. It is an old story, but it is told with much impressive detail, and it is a warning that students of the prophecies in our day ought not to disregard. Irving's prayers and expositions were of inordinate length, but he resented any interference with his prerogatives as an ordained minister, and would not listen to his Session who entreated him to abbreviate by but one half-hour. After the great catastrophe the Church had some trying days, but prosperity dawned once more with the coming of James Hamilton to Regent Square in 1841. His work for the Church and for Presbyterianism in England is gratefully recorded in this history. Dr. Candlish described him as "a man whose loss Evangelical Christendom deplores; whose bright, radiant, genial, hearty look at once, on his immediate entrance into any circle, diffused over it all a certain nameless charm of unstudied, cheerful, natural and easy piety; in whose presence nothing sordid, selfish, or mean could long survive; under the spell of whose benign and blessed temper, always 'giving thanks,' converse was sure to cease from being mere earthly talk, and to become—serenely, happily, and even joyously—fellowship of a more heavenly sort."

A noble successor to Hamilton was found in Dr. James Oswald Dykes, whose ministry must be pronounced to be the most successful that Regent Square has seen. He was in feeble health when he accepted the pastorate, so that an assistant had to be found to take one service each Sunday, but the loyalty of his people and their warm appreciation were well repaid by the results of his nineteen years' ministry. Professor Elmslie was for a time his assistant and is remembered with rare affection at Regent Square. Mr. Hair has a difficult task in recording John McNeil's brief pastorate, but this chapter of its history does honour to the Church which loved the Scotch Evangelist and helped him nobly, though it could not fail to see that he was not exactly the man for the pulpit of a settled Church. The volume pays just tribute to elders, deacons, precentors and church officers, who have all contributed to the success of Regent Square, and it is pleasant to know that the prosperity is nobly sustained under the present pastor, the Rev. Alexander Connell. The mission work done in Somer's Town and around the mother church shows that the claims of the poor and the degraded have always been present to the minds and hearts of the congregation at Regent Square, and that great fruit has been won here for Christ.

*Britain's Naval Power.* Part I. A Short History of the Growth of the British Navy from the Earliest Times to Trafalgar. Part II. From Trafalgar to the Present Time. By HAMILTON WILLIAMS, M.A., Instructor in English

Literature to the Naval Cadets in H.M.S. *Britannia*.  
Macmillans. 4s. 6d. each volume net.

The first part of this history, which was published in 1894, republished in 1896, and now again in 1898, supplied a great lack. It traces the history of our navy from the days of Alfred the Great, who laid down the principle that "the first and only real line of defence for an island consists of an efficient navy," through all the historic scenes of Elizabeth's reign, right down to the heroic days of Nelson. The story is told with abundant knowledge, and in a style both clear and unaffected. The most valuable part of the second volume is the modern section, which deals most instructively with the ironclads, torpedoes, and monster guns, which make the navy of to-day such a terrible instrument of destruction. "Modern British Ships in Action" is a chapter for which there is, happily, little material available. The section which follows shows that we are not yet out of the region of experiment, especially in regard to torpedoes. The sketch of "Modern Disasters" is a valuable Supplement to the other chapters, and is not the least instructive from a naval architect's and officer's point of view. The volumes are very neatly got up, and have some capital illustrations, which add much to the value of a work that ought to be dear to the heart of every lover of his country. It is an inspiring record, and it is told with much literary skill, much spirit, and admirable judgment. There could scarcely be a more acceptable or instructive present for an intelligent youth.

*Lines from My Log-books.* By Admiral the Right Honourable Sir JOHN C. DALRYMPLE HAY. David Douglas.

This is an unaffected record of a well-spent life. Admiral Sir John Hay came of an old Scotch family related to the Cochranes, and most of the influences about him in his youth suggested the life of a soldier. "My great-granduncle had been killed in battle, my great-grandfather desperately wounded, both my grandfathers had been in the army and had seen war. My father always lamented that his father and mother had declined all offers to place him in the navy or army." Colonel Stewart, who had been Nelson's military *attache* at the Battle of Copenhagen, insisted on giving the future admiral's father a pair of colours in his own regiment, and told Lady Hay that if she would not let her boy fight for his country he would break his neck off a coach-box. He did not fulfil the prediction, but became a first-rate whip and a good yachtsman. His son John was brought up in the midst of soldiers and sailors. When about five years old he visited London and was taken to see Chunee, the elephant at Exeter 'Change, with whom he made great friends. He heard soon after, with great grief, that his

favourite had gone mad and been shot by a company of the Guards. His father drove home with his own horses all the way from London in a phaeton. In 1828 the boy's first tutor arrived. He was a clergyman—a gentleman and a scholar, but one day, when the boy was lunching with an old friend of his mother, she accidentally discovered that his arms were black, blue and yellow. Her husband, the family doctor, was called in and found that he was so ornamented from top to toe. This led to a speedy change of tutor. The boy was sent to Rugby in 1833, and was soon ushered, with his tutor, into the presence of the head master. Dr. Arnold put him through his facings in Greek, detected a mispronunciation of Scottish origin, and, when the tutor intervened to take the blame, gave him a bit of his mind very sharply: "Then you have taught him wrong. He will have to do here what I bid him." Sir John Hay endorses *Tom Brown's Schooldays* as a truthful picture of his time at Rugby. He had only three interviews with Arnold, which generally began with fear and trembling, but in each case without need. His schoolboy life was brief, for a vacancy offered in the Navy for a first-class volunteer, and on August 4, 1834, he joined the *Thalia*. The ship was under the care of a first lieutenant, Henry Joseph Puget, and he took care that the youngster should have a thorough training. In 1847 he married the sister of Lord Napier and Ettrick, who has been for fifty years his "true and faithful companion." The suppression of the Chinese pirates in 1849 was an exciting struggle, and Lieutenant Hay was promoted to be captain in recognition of his great bravery and skill. Captain Hay also did good service in the Crimean War. In 1859 he was appointed a member of the Commission to inquire into the condition of Greenwich Hospital, and then served as chairman of a committee dealing with the question of iron plates for the protection of ships from shot and shell. In 1861 he was elected Member of Parliament for Wakefield, and was soon recognised as a naval authority in the House. In June, 1866, he went with Lord Hartington on board the *Royal Sovereign* to watch the effect of a shot fired from the *Bellerophon* with the heaviest rifled gun. Lord Hartington stood on the gangway to watch the impact of the shot on the cupola. Sir John Hay was afraid of splinters and begged him to come into a shelter close at hand. He did so, and when the first shot struck the turret it "glanced off at right angles, and hurtling along the gangway where Lord Hartington had been standing, plunged over the bows into the water. He would certainly have lost both his legs, and probably his life, if he had continued in the position he had first selected. He witnessed the incident with entire nonchalance." In the same year Sir John became Fourth Lord of the Admiralty, in which office he did much to promote the growing efficiency of the navy, and to arrange the transport service for the Abyssinian

war. In 1870 the proposals brought forward by Mr. Childers for the retirement of naval officers seemed to him so unjust that he resigned his position in the navy though the Government offered him the post of Commander-in-Chief in the East Indies, which he was very reluctant to refuse. The whole transaction was greatly to his credit as a man of sterling principle and enthusiastic loyalty to his fellow-officers. This volume is brightly written, and there is no touch of egotism in a record which does honour both to the man and to the service.

*Lockhart's Advance through Tirah.* By Capt. L. J. SHADWELL, P.S.C. With Two Maps and Seven full page Illustrations. Thacker & Co.

The British public ought to be encouraged to read this volume. It gives a description of the difficulties of Sir W. Lockhart's force in their guerilla war with the Afridis and Orakzais, which is singularly impressive because it is so restrained and even matter of fact. Few readers at home can have realized the enormous task of transporting supplies for an army in such country as that leading up to Tirah. The nature of the track, the helplessness of the native drivers, who utterly neglect the rule of the road, and when any breakdown occurs never dream of getting out of the line of march, but block the whole stream of traffic for hours is very vividly brought out. Tirah was an untrodden world for Europeans, and the invaders were astonished at its fertility and the evident comfort in which the tribesmen lived. The difficulties of the country were terrible, and Captain Shadwell is confident that no other troops in the world could have fought a better campaign than ours. The harassing guerilla war conducted by the finest skirmishers in the world was enough to try the mettle of any army. The weather was most unpropitious, yet our troops, both British and native, were always cheerful and uncomplaining, and performed deeds of heroism which make one's pulse beat quicker even in these restrained descriptions. Captain Shadwell discusses each step of the operations in a way that will be warmly appreciated by military students. He pays tribute to the splendid Goorkha soldiers who did themselves such honour in the campaign, and discusses England's future policy in a way that is singularly instructive. If Tirah were annexed he holds that the Afridis would become as loyal as the Goorkhas, and their country would be an advance post of supreme importance in resisting any invasion of India. The Afridis are almost as fond of money as of fighting, and would gradually see how the preservation of order would work for the common good. The whole book is of absorbing interest, and its maps and the fine illustrations help a reader to follow every step of the campaign,

and to appreciate the task which our men had to perform in a land where soldiers needed to be as agile as goats and as wary as a huntsman stalking his game.

*Memorials of the Rev. Norman Macleod (Sen.), D.D.* By his Son, JOHN N. MACLEOD, F.S.A. (Scot.) David Douglas. 5s.

This memorial of a Scotch minister, who died in 1862, seems somewhat belated; but is well worthy of publication, both as a record of a good and great man, and of a vanished state of society. The fame of his son eclipsed his own; but he was a Gaelic preacher without a peer, and a leader of his Church, beloved at Court, and trusted in all circles. His father, the minister of Morven, was a fine specimen of the old Highland clergyman, who spent three or four days a week on horseback visiting his parishioners, whose homes lay scattered over a district of 130 square miles. He was an admirable classical scholar, who could repeat from memory large portions of Homer, Virgil and Ovid. However tired he was, when he returned home, he used to give his boys their "lessons," and during this operation he would clear off the stiff growth of stubble on his own chin. His boy Norman was worthy of his Highland upbringing, for at Glasgow College he was the only student who could compete with the future Professor North in athletic exercises. He was an ardent sportsman, and his father often felt troubled that the boy was so idle during the summer and autumn vacation. He never ceased to lecture his son upon his love of sport till one day, when they were out together, two magnificent blackcock rose from the stubble, and both fell to a right and left shot from his son's double-barrelled gun. The dog carried the birds and laid them at the feet of the minister, who from that day ceased to lecture his boy on his sporting propensities. Despite his idle vacations, Norman did well at college, and soon got to work as a parish minister. Many interesting glimpses of a long-vanished past are preserved in this volume. When he began work at Campsie the interior of the dingy church was "not brightened by the painting on one side wall of a jet black colour, with large white spots dotted here and there over its dark ground, the whole composition being supposed to represent tears and mourning for the late Princess Charlotte of Wales!" He visited St. Kilda in 1838, where he found a pious, simple-hearted, reverent people, struggling hard to obtain a precarious living. Their spirit was shown by one of the natives, who was leaving his rocky world to visit the Island of Mull. A man in the boat asked if they ever heard of God in St. Kilda. The native drew from him a description of the wealth of nature, and then replied to his

question: "Is that the kind of land that you come from? Ah, then, you may forget God, but a St. Kilda man never can! Elevated on his rock, suspended over a precipice, tossed on the wild ocean, *he* can never forget his God; he hangs continually on His arm." The company was silenced by this striking reply. Here was a man who knew more about religion than themselves. Dr. Macleod preached before the Queen, and mixed in some of the best society in London during his visits on the business of the Church of Scotland. In 1838 he writes: "I yesterday dined in company with the Duke of Wellington. What a man! We had a long private interview with him at his own house yesterday forenoon, and I had the high gratification of dining in his company yesterday afternoon. The scene was truly magnificent. I was near the Duke; he was very attentive to me, and shook hands cordially on retiring, saying, 'Thank you, doctor, for your most prudent and most admirable speech.'" In the same letter he speaks of a dinner at Sir Robert Peel's, where the Bishop of London took him aside as Mr. Gladstone entered the room, and said, "Mark that young man, for, if I am not much mistaken, he will some day be Premier of England."

*The Life of the Rev. James Morison, D.D., Principal of the Evangelical Union Theological Hall, Glasgow.* By WILLIAM ADAMSON, D.D. With Six Portraits. Hodder & Stoughton. 7s. 6d.

This is a life that will appeal mainly to readers on the other side of the Tweed, but it is a record which all good men will prize. Dr. Morison's monument states that he was expelled from the Secession Church in 1841 "for testifying that Jesus died for the sins of all men without distinction or exception. He was spared to see his views of Divine truth almost universally accepted in his native land. His ministry, begun under much obloquy, was finished amid the love and esteem of all classes of his fellow countrymen." A full account of the proceedings of the presbytery and synod is given, and no one can fail to be impressed by the calm and noble bearing of the young minister under this ordeal. His people at Kilmarnock stood bravely by him through the long controversy, and deeply regretted his removal to Glasgow after twelve years of fruitful ministerial work amongst them. In Glasgow Dr. Morison gained much distinction as a preacher, and was professor and principal of the Evangelical Union Theological Hall from its institution up to the time of his death in 1893. His "Sheaves of Ministry" is a fine specimen of those gifts of mind and heart which made him one of the pulpit princes of Scotland. Dr. Adamson might have given us some more details of his home life and his pulpit success, but we are thankful for such an introduction to a truly great and good man. In his early life



Dr. Morison was a very powerful Evangelist. The hard Calvinism of his time was altogether repellant to such a man, and he did much to lead his country to broader and gentler views.

*My Happy Half Century.* The Autobiography of an American Woman. By FRANCES E. WILLARD. Ward, Lock & Co. 3s. 6d.

The death of Miss Willard gives new interest to this autobiography. It is a story of American life, which readers on this side of the Atlantic will find singularly fresh and instructive. Miss Willard's ancestor, Simon Willard, came from the quiet village of Horsmonden, in Kent, where the register still shows the entry of his baptism. Her father was a farmer, who lived in remote parts and struggled all his life with delicate health and narrow means. It is interesting to find that though his wife was a thrifty housewife, and a woman of abounding good health, cheery spirits and equable temper, he took the management of everything into his own hands. "Indeed, he selected nearly all our dresses and bonnets, mother making no objection to this curious arrangement, though I think she would have been glad to have it different." He had a Cromwellian sense of duty and was loyal to all the ties of kindred, business, and church life, though his feeble health made him somewhat irritable. He held strong views as to medicine. He thought every family ought to pay so much a year to the doctor and then deduct for every day's illness. This, he argued, would make the doctors study how to keep folk well. "He used to say that God had but about half a dozen laws of health, and if people would only study these and obey them they would have a happy, well-to-do life. He thought it was wonderful how easy our Heavenly Father has made it for us in this world, if, to use his favourite phrase, we will 'only take hold of the right handle.'" Miss Willard's desire to escape from the "one-purse theory for families" which her father followed, led her to become a teacher. She spent some happy years in this work, and finally found a sphere exactly suited to her gifts, as President of the Women's College at Evanston. Differences of opinion on questions of management led her to resign this post, but this proved a sore wrench to her. She was, however, set free for that temperance work which proved the most fruitful labour of her life. She visited every State, and became the best known lady platform speaker in the United States. Money flowed in but she never used her position to gain a fortune, for she felt that one of her vocation "could not afford to make money." She was an attached Methodist, a warm champion of the admission of women to the General Conference and, above all, a humble seeker after holiness. She says "Wonderful uplifts come to me as I pass on, clearer views of the life of God

in the soul of man. Indeed, it is the *only life*, and all my being sets towards it as the rivers toward the sea. Celestial things grow dearer to me; the love of God is steadfast in my soul; the habitudes of a disciple sit more easily upon me; tenderness toward humanity and the lower orders of being increases with the years. In the temperance, labour, and woman questions I see the stirring of Christ's heart; in the comradeship of Christian work my spirit takes delight, and prayer has become my atmosphere." We hope that a final chapter will now be added to this record of a devoted life.

*Mirabeau.* By P. F. WILLERT, M.A. Macmillans. 2s. 6d.

Mr. Willert's study of the orator of the French Revolution will be of great value to those who wish to understand the man and his times. In Mirabeau licentiousness was "carried to the verge of erotic mania," but his ancestry, his training, and his surroundings must be held as in part responsible for his excesses. His stormy and disgraceful private life scarcely prepares us for the amazing industry and ripe sagacity of his public career. As an orator he had no rival in France, but he found that the distrust aroused by his personal conduct barred the way to abiding influence or high trust in public life. He was a convinced supporter of the crown, and had he been able to secure the hearty confidence of the King, and especially of Marie Antoinette, might have been able to avert the horrors of the Revolution, but here also his past was his evil genius. He could find no fulcrum on which to rest his lever, and his early death was probably a safeguard for his reputation as a Statesman. The interest of this book for the moralist is intense. Mirabeau reaped what he sowed.

*Life in an Old English Town. A History of Coventry from the Earliest Times compiled from Official Records.* By MARY DORMER HARRIS. Swan, Sonnenschein & Co. 4s. 6d.

This is a volume of the "Social England Series," which seeks to give a general idea of the religion, commerce, art, and general life of England. Its central idea is that the greatness or weakness of a nation does not depend on any one man or body of men, and that the odd millions always have their part to play. To leave that part out and call the rest history is misleading. A better type of old town life than Coventry presents it would be hard to find. Miss Harris begins with the Story of Godiva, and passes in review the chief stages in the development of the town with many citations from old records and much vivid detail as to the beginnings of municipal government, the corporation and the guilds, the relation of the town to the

kingdom of England during the wars of the Roses and down to Tudor times. The four closing chapters on "The Crafts," "Daily Life in the Town," and "Old Coventry at the Present Day" are of unusual interest. At the beating of the daybell the townsfolk rose to their daily work. Soon after daybreak the streets were alive with a busy throng. Cattle and ducks wandered freely about, fishmongers' stalls were set in the middle of the streets, inn signs had to be limited in length lest they should knock the heads of the unwary. "But the mediæval trader was well inured to inconvenience. Neither did noise distract him, though taverners and cooks standing at the door offered good things hot from the oven to passers-by, each seeking to cry louder than his neighbours; while in the open places the crier proclaims the terms of a recent charter, or newly-made ordinance of leet or council; and overhead the church bells pealed forth, calling folks to their prayers, to the market, or in case of a brawl or riot, to a common meeting place." The book is an excellent piece of painstaking work, and those who read it will be astonished at the interest of the subject.

*John Bright.* By C. A. VINCE, M.A. Blackie & Son. Victorian Era Series. 2s. 6d.

An admirable little life of one of England's greatest orators. Mr. Vince was brought up in Birmingham, and from his boyhood has breathed the political atmosphere of the metropolis of the Midlands. In preparing his monograph he has also had the advantage of consulting many of Mr. Bright's most intimate associates, Mr. Chamberlain and Mr. J. T. Bunce, in particular, who have communicated to him some most interesting personal recollections. With these helps, and by the aid of *Hansard*, of Mr. Bright's published speeches, of innumerable newspaper cuttings, of the larger lives of Bright, and of the standard histories of the time, Mr. Vince has made a careful study of the career and character of this great free-trader and reformer, and has given us in a few condensed and well proportioned chapters a faithful and a living picture of a great and noble man. The chapter on "Bright's Oratory" strikes us as the freshest and the most remarkable, not merely because of its description of Bright's special gifts, but because of incidental analysis and illustrations of effective popular oratory. But all of them are excellent in knowledge, judgment, tone and taste.

*Father John of the Greek Church.* By ALEXANDER WHYTE, D.D. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 2s.

Father John Sergieff was introduced to English readers by the *Times* correspondent at St. Petersburg in 1891. He enjoys

a unique reputation as a saint in Russia, and is as much revered in the royal palace as in the humblest cottage. He lives at Cronstadt in a modest little house hidden behind a high fence and a thick hedge. But as soon as he steps outside he is beset by the people who have a touching belief in the efficacy of his prayers, and are happy if they can only touch the hem of his simple robe. Dr. Whyte finds in this saint and mystic a congenial spirit. His sketch of the Greek Church ought to send many readers to Dean Stanley's classic history of the Eastern Church and the extracts from Father John's spiritual biography. Dr. Whyte is an enthusiast, but "Father John" is a man to set all the spiritual pulses tingling, and to make every reader long to learn the art of prevailing prayer.

Messrs. Cassell have published Father John's *My Life in Christ*, which is translated by E. E. Goulaeff, and dedicated to our Queen. It is a series of meditations from his diary, which have a tinge of mysticism and contain passages defending the customs of the Greek Church, such as the use of icons, prayers to the Saints and to the Virgin Mary. It is interesting to see what a man of such eminent piety has to say on behalf of what we regard as superstitions; but the real charm of the book is in its spirituality, its devotion to Christ, its protest against worldliness and carelessness. The superstitious side comes out in the words: "God rests in the saints, and even in their very names, in their images; it is only necessary to use their images with faith and they will work miracles." The finer side is seen in another passage: "During the prayer of repentance and devotion the thorns, the bonds of the passions, fall from my soul, and I feel so light; all the spell, all the enticements of the passions vanish, and I seem to die to the world; and the world, with all its blessings, *dies for me*. I live in God, and for God—for God alone." Here also is a fine thought: "The invisible plays the first part in the whole world, in every being; and when the invisible leaves a certain being, the latter loses life and is destroyed; so that the visible in beings, without the invisible, forms but a mass of earth. I and all men live through an invisible first cause—God."

We are glad that a second edition of Dr. Whyte's *Santa Teresa* (Oliphant & Co.) has been called for so soon. It is a glowing eulogy, but readers of Jowett's *Life and Letters* will remember that, though he was greatly interested in Teresa's style, a greater attraction was her "intensity of feeling, so far beyond anything that is now to be found in the world." He added: "Some day I should like to draw out at length in a sermon how feeling and intellect ought to be combined. The secret seems to be lost in modern times." This verdict ought to make many prize Dr. Whyte's introduction to such a saint and thinker.

*Christina Rossetti.* A Biographical and Critical Study.  
By MACKENZIE BELL. With Six Portraits and Six  
*fac similes.* Hurst & Blackett.

The preparation of this book has been a labour of love to Mr. Mackenzie Bell. He enjoyed Miss Rossetti's friendship in the last days of her life, and found her one of the most lovable of women. With the help of her brother he has gathered together a mass of valuable material for the study of the poetess and her poems. Her life was comparatively uneventful, and with the exception of eleven months at Frome, in Somersetshire, was spent within a mile of Regent's Park. She was pre-eminently a London song bird, and her work probably suffered a little in breadth and variety from her limited knowledge of life. But if Mrs. Browning deals with some themes of more human interest Christina Rossetti's finest verse "reached a higher point of technical excellence than the finest work of Elizabeth Barrett Browning; indeed, it might be said that Christina's verse as a whole is of higher technical excellence than that of Elizabeth Barrett Browning." This is Mr. Bell's verdict, and though competent critics may differ from him no one can deny that Miss Rossetti's devotional poetry has enriched our literature and brought comfort and inspiration to a multitude of readers. Mr. Bell's book is far from perfect, but it is a genuine tribute to the memory of one for whom many cherish what the Bishop of Durham called a "reverent admiration."

*David Hume.* By Henry Calderwood. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 1s. 6d.

This is an interesting addition to the "Famous Scots' Series." Professor Calderwood had almost completed the volume at the time of his death, and his chapters on Hume as a philosopher and as a historian will be of great service to students as luminous presentations of the chief results of Hume's investigations with critical notes from a philosophical expert. The most interesting chapter, however, is that on "Hume's attitude as to Religion." Professor Calderwood shows that he was not an infidel, that he scorned the name of Deist, and that "the man who himself challenged the belief in miracles maintains 'that the Christian religion not only was at first attended with miracles, but even at this day cannot be believed by any reasonable person without one.'" It thus seems that we are able to find in Hume "a witness for Christianity whose testimony is in some respects the more valuable since beset with so many and such grave doubts." The little volume is worthy of the close attention not only of philosophical students but of all Christian thinkers.

1. *Ernest R. Balfour*. 1s. 6d.
2. *Breaking the Record : The Story of Three Arctic Expeditions*. By M. DOUGLAS. 2s.
3. *Brave Men and Brave Deeds : or Famous Stories from European History*. By M. B. SYNGE. 2s. 6d. With Sixteen Illustrations. T. Nelson & Sons.

1. Ernest R. Balfour was a young Scotch athlete, who stood six feet two-and-a-half inches high, and did a good deal to win the great University boat race in 1896. His father was the well-known Liverpool merchant and philanthropist. A purer hearted, more loving, and lovable young fellow scarcely ever lived. He had a passion for friendship, a delight in making others happy, and a devotion to his mother which was idyllic. He was not without his faults, but these were being conquered, and a life of noble service was opening before him, when bad drainage and a severe chill brought on his fatal illness. He was only twenty-two. What he had felt about religion is seen in his letters. He wrote to his mother from Oxford: "I never forget my prayers, you may be quite sure of that." A few months before his death he wrote again: "It's an awfully important thing—I'm feeling it more and more—to take proper time for prayer. Things nearly always go wrong if you don't."

2. Mr. Douglas gives a graphic and deeply interesting sketch of Arctic Exploration in his *Breaking the Record*. Nares, Greely and Nansen are the three explorers, and their story is told in a way to instruct and interest young and old.

3. *Brave Men and Brave Deeds* is a chronicle of heroic exploits, which opens with Bobadil and Bayard, and catches the glow of many an old page of history. It is a stirring record, and we hope it will be followed by a similar set of stories dealing with British heroes.

*Gladstone : The Man. A Non-Political Biography*. By DAVID WILLIAMSON. Illustrated. Second Edition. James Bowden. 1s.

It was a happy idea to make the personal aspect of Mr. Gladstone's life the subject of this book, and Mr. Williamson has seized on the salient points and handled them with much brightness and felicity of style. In thirteen chapters he treats of Mr. Gladstone's youth, marriage, authorship, reading, churchmanship, and, though his record is not exhaustive, it is a capital outline, which readers may fill out by further study. There is a healthy ring about the book, and though it admires it does not worship. It is beautifully illustrated and attractively got up.

*Every-day Life in Turkey.* By Mrs. W. M. RAMSAY.  
Hodder & Stoughton. 5s.

Mrs. Ramsay has shared many of her husband's wanderings in the East, and where some record little but hardship and discomfort, varied by ruins, she has treasured up romantic and quaint experiences which came almost daily to her. The Turks have been represented as a "combination of ferocious wild beast and incarnate fiend," but Mrs. Ramsay found the people "simple, peaceable, hospitable, and friendly—living amicably with their Christian neighbours, at least as much oppressed by the bad government as they are—often more so." Those who wish to see Turkey on its better side should read this book. It is singularly fresh and full of details which give life to the picture.

*History of Methodism in Huddersfield, Holmfirth and Denby Dale.* By Rev. JOEL MALLINSON. C. H. Kelly. 2s.

This is a painstaking piece of work. It traces the history of some typical Yorkshire circuits from John Wesley's day to the present time, and the record is enlivened by many a story of conversion and noble living. Mr. Mallinson ought to be encouraged by a wide circulation of this capital book. It is copiously and effectively illustrated, and written in a pleasant, unassuming style.

*Renaissance in Italy. The Catholic Reaction.* In Two Parts. By J. A. SYMONDS. New Edition. Two Vols. Smith, Elder & Co. 15s.

These volumes crown and complete Mr. Symonds' studies of the Renaissance. The Catholic Revival was a reactionary movement, and to explain its influences the position of Spain in the Italian peninsula, the conduct of the council of Trent, the specific organisation of the Holy Office and the Company of Jesus, and the state of society upon which these forces were brought to bear, has to be considered. These studies, which occupy the main part of the first volume, give profound interest to this work. They are followed by chapters on Tasso, Bruno and Sarpi, also by valuable discussions on "Palestrina, and the Origins of Modern Music," and of the "Bolognese School of Painters." The subject is a fascinating one, and Mr. Symonds has handled it in a masterly manner.

*The Cloister and the Hearth* (Chatto & Windus, 6s.) is a very neat, well printed and marvellously cheap edition of Charles Reade's masterpiece, with a frontispiece to each of the four volumes and wide margins. No romance of the early Reformation times is more enthralling and more instructive.

## BELLES LETTRES.

*The Art of England and the Pleasures of England.* Lectures in Oxford. By JOHN RUSKIN. George Allen.

If anyone had to choose a single volume as an introduction to the Ruskin treasure-house, we should be disposed to give this the palm. It deals with names that have cast a halo over our own times, and about which everyone likes to know as much as possible. It is full of fine passages, which linger in the memory and find their way into the heart. It is intensely earnest; it is full of love to nature and true art; it contains some pleasant fragments of autobiography, and all its treasures are set forth with a grace and charm such as only Ruskin is master of. The Pleasures of England—pleasures of learning, faith, deed, fancy—are treated in the same sparkling style as the art. The Lectures are a rare feast for lovers of Ruskin, and this new edition ought to give them a greatly widened circle of readers.

*Helbeck of Bannisdale.* By MRS. HUMPHREY WARD. Smith, Elder & Co. 6s.

Mrs. Ward has returned to the Westmoreland scenes which glorify the opening chapters of Robert Elsmere, but happily in this latest story she never wanders far from them. The great fells, the acres of daffodils, the breezy uplands, and above all the strong willed, narrow-minded folk with their quaint talk and their strong individuality give wonderful interest to the whole book. Helbeck is a Roman Catholic squire, belonging to a decayed county family, and living the life of a recluse amid the antagonism and dislike of the whole district. His sister marries a sceptical scientist to escape from his overbearing ways, but returns to spend her last days of widowhood under his roof with her stepdaughter, Laura Fountain. This girl, bred in so different an atmosphere to Mr. Helbeck, lives in daily revolt against the Popish ways of the friends who cluster round him. But Bannisdale, with all its Westmoreland glories, exercises a spell over her, and she gradually begins to see the noble simplicity and sincerity of their host, though his bigotry and delight in what he considers its seamy side of other churches repels her. Helbeck is a fascinating subject for the novelist, and Mrs. Ward surrounds him with a halo. His struggle between his love for Laura and his Romanism is powerfully worked out, and Laura's struggle between love and freedom is even more realistic. Laura's pitiful fate, torn asunder by love and religion, will probably open some eyes to the tyranny of Popery. There is not a wasted word in the story.



*Concerning Isabel Carnaby* (Hodder & Stoughton, 6s.) has been a fresh revelation of Miss Ellen Thornycroft Fowler's powers. The Methodist setting of the story gives piquancy to its studies of literary and social circles.

#### WESLEYAN SUNDAY SCHOOL UNION.

The Rev. Robert Culley sends us an attractive set of books suitable for teachers and Sunday School workers. Mr. James Bailey's admirable manual on *Sunday School Teaching* (1s. 6d.), deals with class instruction, management, and discipline in a way so clear, so simple, and yet so manifestly the outcome of a life-time of experience that it will be a treasure for every teacher. *A String of Pearls* (1s. 6d.), is a last legacy from the Rev. Samuel Gregory, giving suggestions for Bible work. They will often assist a busy worker in the choice of a subject, and furnish a hint as to treatment. *Songs of Living Things* (1s.), by Alfred H. Vine, is a little book of verse for boys and girls, with some good stuff, notably the Sea Songs, and the verses on *My Cat*. The stories are bright, full of incident, and thoroughly healthy in tone. *The Morrison Family* (2s. 6d.), is a bit of Emily Spratling's best work. *Love the Conqueror* (2s. 6d.), is a book by Jeanie Terry, which will greatly interest young folk. *From Under the Shadow* (3s.), by Annie B. Foskett, is the story of a Methodist church into which worldiness creeps and makes sad havoc. The writer needs to cultivate a simpler style, but there is promise in her work. *Melissa's Victory* (2s. 6d.), by Ashton Neill, shows how a girl found peace in a Methodist chapel and made a brave stand for her new convictions. *Runnelbrook Valley* (2s.), is a stirring temperance story by Mrs. Haycraft, who is also responsible for *Sunrise Corner* (1s. 6d.), a touching story illustrating Psalm ciii. *Twelve Famous Girls* (2s.), by Marianne Kirlaw, is a set of living pictures. The Princess Victoria, Grace Darling, and other heroines are vigorously sketched. *Golden Deeds Told Anew* (9d.), by Annie Craig, is on similar lines. Alice J. Briggs is very happy in *Isabelle's Story* (1s. 6d.), a capital tale of the days of Tyndale. In *It's My Nature* (1s. 6d.) Helen Briston tells how a girl conquered her selfishness, and her *Ladyboy's Story* (6d.) gives a set of tales which ought to be useful for a Band of Hope. *Jackalant* (2s.), by Mrs. J. A. Smith, has some vigorous tales of the slums. *Marjorie's Stranger* (9d.), is a good piece of work by Isabel S. Robson. Mr. Forster's *White Mouse and Other Stories* (8d.), is a well written set of tales, and *Little Parables*, by Edith E. Rhodes, should not be overlooked by those who wish to have material for an address or lesson. *Our Boys and Girls* (1s.) is a very cheap and attractive volume full of good stories and short pieces suitable for the nursery.

*The Christian Year.* By JOHN KEBLE. With Notes and Introduction by WALTER LOCK, D.D. Methuen & Co. 2s.

This attractive edition of *The Christian Year* is, in the main, a reprint of that published by Messrs. Methuen in 1895, though several mistakes in that edition have been corrected, and some new illustrations of Keble's language have been added. A list of the poems, arranged in their order of composition from 1819 to 1828, gives material for a very interesting study of the poet's development; and, besides the notes on special words and allusions, a little analysis of the thought is prefixed to each poem. Such helps will be prized by all who use *The Christian Year* as a book of devotion. We do not know an edition so attractive and helpful as this.

*A Lowden Sabbath Morn.* By ROBERT LOUIS STEVENSON. With twenty-seven Illustrations by A. S. BOYD. Chatto & Windus. 6s.

Stevenson's description of a Lowden or Lothian Sabbath morn, though it does not touch the deeper notes, is almost worthy to be set beside Burns' *Cotter's Saturday Night*, and Mr. Boyd has caught the humour of the scene without sacrificing its deeper meaning. His illustrations are very happy, and the volume will be dear to every lover of Stevenson. As a gift book, it will be very hard to find anything better than this beautiful *Lowden Sabbath Morn*.

*Thoughts from Keats.* Selected from his Letters by P. E. GERTRUDE GIRDLESTONE, with Portrait. George Allen. 2s. net.

The portrait is Severn's, and the face is that of a dreamer, who describes himself in one of these extracts. "You speak of Lord Byron and me. There is this great difference between us: he describes what he sees—I describe what I imagine." The selections are well arranged, and often, as Miss Girdlestone says in her helpful Introductory Sketch, "contain veritable gems of thought; clear-glancing criticisms; racy, witty appreciations; keen, intuitive judgments on men and the world."

*Leaders in Literature.* Being Short Studies of Great Authors in the Nineteenth Century. By P. WILSON, M.A. Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier. 3s. 6d.

The great authors are Emerson, Carlyle, Lowell, "George Eliot," Mrs. Browning, Robert Browning, Matthew Arnold, Herbert Spencer and John Ruskin; and the studies are singularly fresh and discriminating. Mr. Wilson is no blind worshipper. He is a sound critic and a sincere Christian thinker, who finds matter to condemn as well as to praise; but he knows his authors well, and packs his pages with quotations and

references which will revive former memories, and spur his readers to further study. The book is wonderfully cheap and delightfully suggestive.

*A Woman worth Winning.* By GEORGE MANVILLE FENN. Chatto & Windus. 6s.

The plot of this story hinges on Sir Martin Jerdan's mad jealousy of his wife's former lover, Captain Brendon. Lady Jerdan and her friend Molly Windham are two noble women, and Captain Brendon finds Molly worth winning in the end of the story, though he nearly loses his life and is immured in a lunatic asylum through the baronet's jealousy. The story is not pleasant, though it is powerful.

*The Cornhill Magazine.* New Series, Vol. IV., January to June, 1898. Smith, Elder & Co.

Mr. Stanley Weyman's "Castle Inn" centres round Marlborough and gives a vivid picture of bygone times when the life of England flowed along the great highways. Sir George Soane is a real gentleman, despite the influences under which he has been brought up, and Julia will be happy at last, though this part of the story leaves the girl in bad hands. "London Fish and Fish-shops" is one of Mr. Cornish's most savoury papers. We greatly miss the "Pages from a Private Diary" in the last two numbers, for their quiet humour and literary asides added much to the interest of *Cornhill*. Mr. Fitchett's "Fights for the Flag" stir all one's pulses. "Sir John Moore at Corunna" is a fine tribute to a great name, and the other papers catch the spirit of the famous struggles that they represent.

*The Century Illustrated Monthly Magazine.* Vol. LV., New Series, Vol. XXXIII., November, 1897, to April, 1898. Macmillan & Co.

Dr. Weir Mitchell has struck a new vein in his "Adventures of François," the Parisian thief, juggler and swordsman, whose lot is cast in the days of the Great Revolution. The unexpected seems always to the front and a good side view is given of the passions of the time. The Tennyson papers are specially interesting, and the two articles on Klondike are very timely. "Ruskin as an Oxford Lecturer" is a pleasant page from the reminiscences of an American student at Oxford. "Over the Alps on a Bicycle" is an entertaining sketch from the notebooks of Mr. and Mrs. Pennell.

*St. Nicholas* for November, 1897, to April, 1898 (Macmillan & Co.) is as full of good things for young folks as ever. The editor and her staff have prolific pens and a never failing succession of devices for winning the attention of their exacting constituency.

## MISCELLANEOUS.

1. *A Book about Bells.* By GEORGE S. TYACK, B.A. 6s.
2. *Bygone Devonshire.* By HILDERIC FRIEND. 7s. 6d.
3. *Bygone Hertfordshire.* Edited by WILLIAM ANDREWS.  
London : William Andrews & Co. 7s. 6d.

1. Mr. Tyack's book on Bells is the best and fullest cheap manual on the subject. He begins with the invention of bells in far-off Bible times, and then introduces us to the monastic and lay founders of the Middle Ages, giving many a pleasant glimpse into the secrets of the craft. The famous bells of the world both past and present are described, and the uses of bells at fasts and festivals are brightly sketched. The chapters on "The Decoration of Bells" and on "Belfry Rhymes and Legends" are full of racy matter and capital illustrations, which add greatly to the value and interest of a volume, which is not only one to be read but also to be consulted again and again. Mr. Tyack has laid us all under obligation by such a complete and compact sketch of a delightful subject.

2. Mr. Friend's life in the county has given him special qualification as a historian of "Bygone Devonshire." He has selected his topics skilfully, and handles them in a way which whets the reader's appetite for more. "Plant Names and Flower Lore" is a subject of which he is past master. "Gleanings among Church Antiquities," "Old Time School Life," "A Brief Life Story of the Cathedral" give a general view of Devonshire history, which students will enlarge by further reading. There is much out-of-the way lore in this volume, and Mr. Friend never tires us, but makes us wish to know still more about one of the most charming counties in England.

3. There is a happy combination in this new volume of the *Bygonas* of history, archæology, social customs, and gossip about literary celebrities. St. Albans naturally has a full share of attention, but there are pleasant little papers on "King's Palaces," on "Stately Homes," on "Witchcraft," and on the "Great Bed of Ware," in which twelve men and their wives could sleep. "The Romance of the Road" is not forgotten. The book is brightly written, and wherever one opens it there is something both racy and instructive. Its pictures are specially good.

*Ancient English Holy Week Ceremonial.* By HENRY JOHN FEASEY. London : Thomas Baker. 10s. 6d.

Mr. Feasey describes with ample citations from parish registers and other documents the Holy Week ceremonies observed in English Churches before the Reformation. Lent

was then a period marked by many signs of exterior penitence, and that "penance of the senses" was intended to bring home the meaning of the sublime "Pagente of the Pacion." In the first part of Lent the altars were veiled in white linen, in the last two weeks in red cloth. The use of the lenten veil, rood cloth, and other clothes for images and pictures; the office called Tenebræ, the Maundy Thursday ceremonies, and all the other customs in vogue, are described with great care and ample knowledge in this volume, which will have peculiar interest for archæologists. Its Church worship in these pre-Reformation days was essentially dramatic, for the worshippers were really children who had not passed beyond the nursery stage of pictorial training.

*The Free Trade Movement and its Results.* By G. ARMITAGE-SMITH, M.A. Blackie & Sons.

This is another of the admirable half-crown Victorian Era Series of volumes, several of which we have already had occasion to commend. In no respect is it inferior to Canon Overton's *Anglican Revival*, Mr. Vince's *John Bright*, or Mr. Gissing's *Charles Dickens*. It is a thoroughly informed, well-written and impartial estimate of the history, the principle, and the effects of Free Exchange, supplemented by three helpful chapters on the reaction against Free Trade, Foreign Competition and Imperial Federation. Mr. Armitage-Smith is Principal of the Birkbeck Institution and Lecturer on Economics for the London Society for the Extension of University Teaching. We have read his handbook with much pleasure, and can recommend it as an interesting and substantial piece of work.

*English National Education.* A Sketch of the Rise of Public Elementary Schools in England. By H. HOLMAN, M.A. Blackie & Sons. 2s. 6d.

This book is packed with information as to elementary education from the days described as "The Reign of the Voluntary System" down to the present moment. Mr. Holman urges that a grant, sufficient to carry on the work of each school efficiently, should be paid without any condition save that the work of the school, as a whole, should be thoroughly satisfactory. This would give real and complete liberty for putting into practice true educational principles. Teachers and inspectors could work together to secure the very best curriculum for a school with a view to purely educational ends. "We have all the raw material out of which to make a splendid system of schools. There remain but two things to be done to make practically perfect our system of national education—viz., to make it national and to make it educational."

*The Oxford English Dictionary.* Edited by Dr. JAMES A. H. MURRAY. H—Haversian. Oxford. 1898.

This section of this great work contains interesting articles on the verb *hack* and its compounds and cognates. The word is evidently onomatopœic, indicative of the action of incision, and has for frequentative forms *haggle* and *hail*—the one meaning to divide minutely, the other to descend in minute particles. Phonetic variants of *haggle*, with essentially the same meaning, are *hackle*, *heckle* and *higgle*. These, with other less apparent affinities, are well brought out in the several articles and sub-articles devoted to this group of words. Valuable articles of what may be called the more literary type, from the history of *halcyon*, *hanse*, *harbinger*, *harlequin*, *harvest*, *hat*, *hatch*, *hatchet*, *hatchment* and *hautboy*, while the verb *to have* of course receives the elaborate treatment due to the unique importance of that many functioned auxiliary. It is impossible here to give the slightest indication of the wealth and variety of knowledge philological, hermeneutic, illustrative, which is condensed into these columns and arranged with a skill and formulated with a precision which leave nothing to be desired. At the rate at which the work now advances there is every prospect of its completion within the first decade of the next century. The typography continues excellent. We know no book which presents fewer instances of printer's errors. In an age in which we hear so much about "decadence," it is an excellent thing to turn from time to time to this great masterpiece of learning, skill and solid execution.

*A Primer of Psychology.* By EDWARD BRADFORD KITCHENER. Macmillans.

This is the freshest, most readable book, on Psychology that we know. It is luminously clear, perfectly arranged, supplied with a wealth of illustration, and should do a great deal to make Psychology a popular study. The chapters are furnished with a list of "Additional Questions and Exercises," very happily chosen with a touch of novelty. Many suggestions are made as to class experiments which will be of great service both to teachers and students. Every one who has any taste for the subject will find the book absorbing, and some readers will discover the charms of a science which may have heretofore repelled them.

#### RELIGIOUS TRACT SOCIETY'S PUBLICATIONS.

*Pilate's Gift and Other Sermons* (5s.), by Dr. Chadwick, Bishop of Derry, is a volume which will be equally welcome in the minister's study and for devotional reading. It is fresh, spiritual, suggestive, stimulating. Old truths are set in new lights, and the heart and conscience are probed as well as enlightened and

comforted. *The Service of the Mass in the Greek and Roman Churches* (1s. 6d.) is another valuable contribution from Dr. C. H. H. Wright to the Protestant cause. The idolatry of the Mass is powerfully exposed, and those who read this little book will have their eyes opened to the extreme gravity of the High Church assimilation of English worship to that of the Greek and Roman Churches. It is a most interesting and timely volume. *The Story of the Religious Tract Society* is a brief history of the founding and the chief work of the Society. It has done noble service, and the success of its centenary effort will give it greater powers for usefulness. *Bulbs and Blossoms* (1s. 6d.), is a very pretty children's story by Amy Le Feuvre, author of *Probable Sons*. Old Bob, with his flower-pots and his Easter hopes, teaches the Gospel of the Resurrection in a way that will comfort many a drooping heart.

#### WESLEYAN BOOK ROOM PUBLICATIONS.

*Studies in Comparative Religion*, by Alfred S. Geden, M. A., 2s. 6d. —Professor Geden's book was proved in the form of lectures at Richmond College, and has a vividness and directness of presentment which a mere set of essays could not attain. Professor Geden deals in this volume with Egypt, Babylonia and Assyria, Zoroastrianism and Muhammadanism, in brief, bright sections full of facts. He generally leaves these to speak for themselves, but when he criticises we find ourselves in hearty agreement with his verdicts. Another volume, *Studies in Eastern Religions*, is being prepared, which will deal with India and the Far East. The subject is profoundly interesting, and we can heartily recommend this catholic-spirited and judicious little handbook.

*Saints of Christ*, by Thomas F. Lockyer, B.A., 1s. 6d.—Mr. Lockyer's twelve sermons deal with various aspects of "Saintship" in a way that will lead many who are walking the high-way of holiness to take courage and will show them the path more clearly. It is an admirable devotional manual—practical, judicious, scriptural, and finely fused with feeling.

*Wesley's House* (1s.) gathers under one roof the sermons and addresses at the City Road Dedication Services last March. They not only form a permanent record of the great effort which the Rev. T. E. Westerdale piloted to success, but furnish an inspiring supplement to the Centenary deliverances of 1891.

*Two Men of Devon in Ceylon* (3s. 6d.) is a new revelation of the Rev. Samuel Langdon's literary gifts. Devonshire and Ceylon are the two scenes of the story, and in both the writer is manifestly at home. Jan Withycomb and his brother, two splendid specimens of Devonshire youth, are carried as captives to the Portuguese settlement in Ceylon, where they have a wonderful

series of adventures, and become brave and noble men. The story is full of incident, and gives much information as to the history and worship of Ceylon. It ought to be widely used as a prize, and the boy or girl who gets it will be happy indeed.

*Life on High Levels* (2s. 6d.) is a set of Familiar Talks on the Conduct of Life, by Margaret E. Sangster. It belongs to the "Guild Library," and is bright and fresh, with a touch here and there that betrays its American origin. Graver subjects, like "Choosing an Avocation" and "Dull Days," are spiced by talks on "The Sweet Serenity of Girlhood," "Of Falling in Love," and "The Engaged Couple. The writer is never prosy, and her little homilies will brace her readers for the fight of life.

*Kitty Lonsdale and Some Rumsby Folk* (3s. 6d.), by Emily M. Bryant, throws a halo round Lincolnshire Methodism, with its wayside chapels, its local preachers, its godly farmers and farm labourers, and its devout women not a few. Kitty Lonsdale is a vicar's daughter; but she yields to the spell of this new world, and blossoms into a Methodist preacher's wife. Deep religious feeling and quiet humour mark this tribute to village Methodism.

*As in a Mirror* is a healthy story by "Pansy" of a young American author, who disguises himself and finds shelter and work at a farmer's. There he loses his heart to Hildreth Elliott, who embodies his long-cherished ideal of truth. The tale is well told, and will make truthfulness attractive to young readers. There is a good deal of varied interest in the book.

*What is Socialism?* By SCOTSBURN. Isbister & Co. 7s. 6d.

Had the author of this elaborate examination of "the principles and policy propounded by the advocates of Socialism" first answered his own question to his own mind he might have made the answer to it clearer to his readers. As it is, they will be obliged to give it up as a sort of conundrum. Nowhere are we expressly told either what Socialism is or what are the forms of Socialism the author has specially in view. Socialism to "Scotsburn" is evidently an abstraction as vague as Society, and means anything from the most comprehensive and thorough-going communism to the most limited collectivism. And Socialists are all treated as if they all belonged to one class and taught one kind of doctrine. The subjects discussed have a very wide range. The writer brings to the discussion a fresh and vigorous, if sometimes a far too fiery and impetuous, mind. His style needs pruning and would gain by polishing on almost every page. Most living Socialists have given as much attention to the form as to the substance of their writings, and this is one great secret of their popularity. "Scotsburn" would have done much better service to the cause of freedom and of progress had he followed their example. As it stands, his book

[NO. CLXXX.]—NEW SERIES, VOL. XXX. NO. 2. 2 C



is rather a repertory of valuable materials than an armoury of finished weapons for the anti-Socialist campaign.

*An Essay on Western Civilization in its Economic Aspects.* (Ancient Times). By W. CUNNINGHAM, D.D. Cambridge University Press. 4s. 6d.

The Cambridge historical series to which this volume belongs has won a high reputation for research and for solid learning put in an attractive form. Dr. Cunningham's earlier contribution to the series was a lucid and interesting summary of economical history, and this volume is a most instructive discussion of the great trading communities which gathered round the Mediterranean in ancient times.

*The Growth and Administration of the British Colonies.* 1837-97. By W. P. GRESWELL, M.A. Blackie & Son. 2s. 6d.

This is one of the most timely volumes of the "Victorian Era Series." Mr. Greswell traces the change of British policy as to the colonies, gives an instructive sketch of the pioneers of colonial progress and reform, describes the growth, constitution, and present position of each of our colonies with a wealth of detail and a mastery of facts and principles which make his book a complete refutation of the Little England policy. It is by far the best handbook we have on the subject, and its views about South Africa and the supreme importance of maintaining our naval supremacy ought to be pondered by every man who has the heart of a patriot.

*The Every-day Book of Natural History.* By JAMES CUNDALL. Revised and in part re-written by EDWARD STEP, F.L.S. With Sixty-four Illustrations. Fifth Edition. Jarrold & Sons. 5s.

This book was first published many years ago, and gained considerable popularity. It has now been thoroughly revised by a competent hand, and brought well up to date. It gives about a page to each day of the year, trying to deal with the birds, fish, insects, trees, and flowers about the time when they first appear or are in season. The articles are brightly written, with good anecdotes and happy quotations of poetry, also with abundance of facts and valuable information. We know no book that will tempt young people more pleasantly to use their eyes as they walk in the country.

I. *The Cathedral Church of Hereford.* A Description of its Fabric and a Brief History of the Episcopal See. By A. HUGH FISHER. 1s. 6d.

2. *The Church of St. Martin, Canterbury.* An Illustrated Account of its History and Fabric. By the Rev. C. F. ROUTLEDGE. G. Bell & Sons. 1s. 6d.

1. An excellent addition to a charming series. Hereford Cathedral cannot claim artistic unity; but its massive pile is a valuable record of historical progress, and Mr. Fisher is a competent guide, who brings out the history of the fabric and the see in a way that cannot fail to interest and instruct his readers.

2. St. Martin's is a little gold mine for the antiquarian, and this book well deserves its niche in Messrs. Bell's Cathedral Series. The Church is the cradle of English Christianity, and also a witness of that earlier Christianity which existed in Britain during the period of the Roman occupation. Canon Routledge tells the history and describes the Church in a way that is full of charm and instruction. He writes pleasantly, and the fine illustrations are a notable feature of a valuable little book.

*New Zealand Statistics for 1896.* Wellington: John Mackay.

This Blue Book contains more than five hundred pages of facts and figures which set the life of the colony clearly before the statesman and student of current problems.

*The New Zealand Official Year Book for 1897* is even fuller and more useful than its predecessors. Nothing could be better done or more complete in its way than this volume.

Messrs. W. & A. K. Johnston's *Geographical Handbook on Africa* packs into 32 pages such a mass of information about that Continent as can be found in no similar compass in the world. It is an astonishing bit of work, and all for threepence.

*Englishmen, Israelites: Turks, Edomites: Politics and Prophecy*, by H. Herbert Pain (R. Banks & Son, 1s.) is an Anglo-Israel brochure of the most pronounced type. A wilder piece of work we have seldom met, and it actually has a map, specially prepared by Stanford, showing what it calls the Promised Land.

*The Christ in Shakespeare*, by Charles Ellis (Houlston & Sons, 3s. 6d.) is an attempt to trace the parallels between the Bible and the *Merchant of Venice*, *Measure for Measure* and the Sonnets. The book is not satisfactory. To put opposite the page of Shakespeare a string of texts bearing more or less remotely on the passage is too vague and unscientific a method of dealing with the subject.

*The Extinction of War, Poverty and Infectious Diseases*, by a Doctor of Medicine (London: E. Truelove, 6d.) is a dull pamphlet on Home Rule, War, Poverty and Infectious Disease. It is not likely to attract many readers.

## SUMMARIES OF FOREIGN PERIODICALS.

**REVUE DES DEUX MONDES** (April 15).—M. Lévy's article on "German Commerce" shows the extraordinary progress which the country has made in the last few years, and points out the development of the German Marine, and of that colonial policy of which the most recent triumph has been the occupation in China of the territory of Kiao Tchau. In the extreme Orient many old English firms have been conquered—the writer says the word is not too strong—by the Germans, who play a considerable rôle to-day in India and China. The German banks have taken a considerable part in this movement by founding or supporting these foreign houses. Two young Hamburg merchants have recently published the record of their tour of the world. They justify their tour by saying that Germany—its commerce, industry, and agriculture—needs men who know the rest of the world better than they can learn about it from books and newspaper. The brothers viewed the world from the characteristic commercial standpoint:

(May 15).—Th. Denzon's first paper on "The Women of Canada" deals with the Charity Institutions. She found the Abbé Casgrain a valuable helper in her studies. He is one of the most distinguished of French Americans, and pays an annual visit to Europe. The writer sailed in the same vessel from Havre and formed a warm friendship with the Abbé, who was crossing the Atlantic for the thirtieth time. He is a great salmon fisher, and has inherited the astonishing physical activity of his race with a mental activity as remarkable. A doctor of letters, professor in the University, biographer of Montcalm and Levis, and a laureate of the French Academy for his history of the Acadians, he proved a valuable ally to the French visitor, and gave her every facility for studying the women of Canada.

(June 1).—M. Augustin Filon has an appreciative article on "The Theorist of Imperialism—Sir J. R. Seeley." He says that Seeley is now presented to the French reader in all his essential parts and there can be no dispute as to the originality of his teaching. The jubilee of 1897 naturally draws attention to him for that great manifestation of which the Queen, as object and symbol, was in reality the fête of Imperialism. In surveying the work done during the sixty years the English people found their work good and glorified it. It is especially in reference to Colonial expansion that doctrines have changed.

**NUOVA ANTOLOGIA** (January 16).—This number opens with an illustrated article by Filippo Mariotti on "The Portraits of Giacomo Leopardi." It is a pleasantly written and well-informed paper, and does not forget Mr. Gladstone's study of Leopardi in the *Quarterly Review* for 1850, of which he recently said:—"Half a century ago, struck with the genius of Leopardi I endeavoured to make him known in this country." Pompeo Molmenti, in his paper on Elizabeth Barrett Browning refers to a meeting with Browning fourteen years ago, when the old poet took him to see the sights of Venice, especially the mysterious spots far from the great centres and not yet touched by the profaning step of modernity. There is not a corner of Venice, however remote, in which art has not scattered its flowers, and with his melancholy accent the poet recalled Venice picturesque, poetic, full of fascination and mystery spoiled or destroyed in these modern times not for convenience or beauty, but by unthinking desire for novelty. He could not understand how the rulers of the commune could thus degrade a city whither people came from every part of the world to enjoy that luminous peace, that poetic fascination, which, according to Dante, transmutes thought into reverie.

(May 16).—Deputy Vincenzo Riccio writes about Cardinal Kopp and his mission to Rome. Kopp was nominated Bishop of Fulda when the German Government was beginning to be convinced of the necessity of bringing the struggle with the Papacy to a close. The nomination was one of the first indications of a new conciliatory policy. In 1886, when it appeared for a moment as though pacific measures were hanging fire, William I. nominated Kopp as a member of the Upper House. Kopp took a large share in arranging matters, and when the breach seemed to be widening, at one critical moment he made new propositions, and had the pleasure of contributing to the happy issue of matters for his own community. He thus became the most eminent personage in the world of German Catholicism.

# INDEX TO VOLUME XC.

- 'Accidents, A chapter of,' Fraser's, 194.
- 'Africa, Geographical Handbook of,' Johnston's, 399.
- Africa, Bryce's impressions of South, 21; configuration and climate of South Africa, 23; fauna and flora, 25; landscape of South Africa, 27; native races, 29; Portuguese and Dutchmen, 31; Boers and their President, 33; Transvaal and Mashonaland, 35; how to treat the natives, 37.
- 'Africa, Impressions of South,' Bryce's, 21.
- 'Africa, on the Threshold of Central,' Coillard's, 202.
- 'Alaska to Behring Straits, through the gold-fields of,' De Windt's, 79.
- 'America, English colonization of,' Neill's, 59.
- 'America, English in,' Doyle's, 59.
- 'Anglican revival,' Overton's, 205.
- 'Apostolical succession,' Brown's, 171, 289.
- 'Apostolical Succession: the Latest Nonconformist Manifesto,' 289.
- 'Argument of Adaptation,' Henslow's, 370.
- 'Aristocracy and Evolution,' Mallock's, 265.
- 'Art of England and Pleasures of England,' Ruskin's, 389.
- 'Asbury, Bishop,' Briggs', 59.
- Arch, Joseph, 91; ancestry, 93; early days, 95; ploughboy and stable-boy, 97; Agricultural Labourer's Union, 99; public life, 101.
- 'Augustine, confessions of St.,' Bigg's, 365.
- 'Balfour, Ernest R.' 387.
- 'Bells, a book about,' Tyack's, 393.
- Bible, a new dictionary of the, 225; other Bible dictionaries, 227; Dr. Hastings and his staff, 229; general critical position, 231; Deuteronomy and Chronicles, 233; Dr. Curtis on Daniel, 235; Acts of the Apostles, and I. and II. Corinthians, 237; brethren of our Lord, 239; articles on biblical theology, 241; eschatology and ecclesiastical articles, 243; history and geography, 245.
- 'Bible, Eversley,' Mackail's, 177, 369.
- 'Bible, Modern Readers': Select Masterpieces: St. Matthew, &c., Psalms and Lamentations, R. G. Moulton's, 363.
- 'Bible Plants, Spiritual Teaching of,' Henslow's, 370.
- 'Bible Characters: Gideon to Absalom, Whyte's, 364.
- 'Bible References of John Ruskin, M. and E. Gibbs, 370.
- 'Bible Translated According to the Letter and Idioma,' Young's, 177.
- 'Biblical Illustrator,' St. John, Revelation, 369.
- 'Biblical Study, Guide to,' Peake's, 179.
- 'Birds of the British Empire,' Greene's, 199.
- 'Boys, Our,' James', 368.
- 'Brave Men and Brave Deeds,' Synge's, 387.
- 'Bright, John,' Vince's, 384.
- 'Britain's Naval Power,' Hamilton Williams's, 376.
- 'Butler, Life and Letters of W. J., late Dean of Lincoln, and sometime Vicar of Wantage,' 205.
- 'Carnaby, Concerning Isabel,' Fowler's, 390.
- 'Cathedral Series,' Bell's, 198.
- 'Century Magazine,' vol. lv., 392.
- 'Charlemagne, Age of,' Wells', 184.
- 'Charles the Great,' Hodgkins', 188.
- 'Christ, Nicetical,' Playfair's, 370.
- 'Christ, St. Paul's Conception of,' Somerville's, 357.
- 'Christ, Studies of the Mind in,' Adamson's, 1.
- 'Christ of History and Experience,' Forrest's, 355.
- 'Christian Interpretation of Life,' Davison's, 355.
- 'Christian Year,' Keble's, 391.
- 'Christianity and the Progress of Man,' Mackenzie's, 367.
- 'Christianity, Beginnings of English,' Collins's, 182.
- 'Christianity, History of Early,' Pullan's, 371.
- 'Civilization, Essay on Western,' Cunningham's, 398.
- 'Clerical Life, The,' 178.
- 'Cloister and the Hearth,' Reade's, 388.
- 'Colonies, Growth and Administration of British,' Greswell's, 398.
- 'Colossian Studies,' Moule's, 362.
- 'Commandments, The Ten,' Jackson's, 367.
- 'Companions of the Sorrowful Way,' Watson's, 365.
- 'Conditions of our Lord's Life on Earth,' Mason's, 1.
- 'Corleone,' Crawford's, 182.
- 'Cornhill Magazine,' vol. iv., 392.
- 'Coventry, History of,' Mary D. Harris's, 384.
- 'Cross and the Spirit,' Moule's, 363.
- 'Democracy, Rise of,' Rose's, 201.

- Devon and Cornwall, Highways and Byways in, 'Norway's, 190.
- Devonshire, Bygone, 'Friend's, 393.
- Dictionary, Oxford English, H—Hav, 'Murray's, 395.
- Dickens, Charles, 'Gissing's, 195.
- Dictionary of the Bible, 'Hastings', 225.
- Dictionary of Quotations, 'Hartbottle's, 197.
- Dogmas, Vitality of Christian, 'Sabbatier's, 175.
- Dogmatics, Christian, 'Macpherson's, 358.
- Donne, John, 'Jessop's, 183.
- Echoes of a Vanished World, 'Holmes, 197.
- Education, English National, 'Holman's, 394.
- Egypt, History of the Church in, 'Butcher's, 181.
- Elector, King and Priest, 'Lamb's, 370.
- Englishmen, Israelites, 'Pain's, 399.
- Ephesians, St. Paul's Epistle to the, 'Gore's, 179, 289.
- Euphrates, By Far, '195.
- Evolution, Christ no Product of, 'Henslow's, 370.
- Fairy Greatmind, 'Butler's, 198.
- Father John of the Greek Church, 'Whyte's, 385.
- Fern World, The, 'Heath's, 199.
- Flower Hunter in Queensland, 247; forests of Queensland, 249; luxuriant and charming vegetation, 251; islands teeming with life, 253; life of the natives, 255.
- Flower Hunter in Queensland, A, 'Rowan's, 247.
- France, 'Bodley's, 102.
- France as it is to-day, 102; preparation for his task, 103; acute and contagious pessimism, 105; admirable phases of national life, 107; instances of intolerance, 109; equality, fraternity, patriotism, 111; fear of greatness, 113; political indifferentism, 115; ministerial life, 117.
- France. Modern, 'Lebou's, 185.
- Free Trade Movement and its Results, 'Armitage-Smith's, 394.
- Gladstone, The Man, 'Williamson's, 388.
- Gladstone as a religious teacher, 315; Church principles, 317; attitude towards Non-conformity, 317; attitude towards Christianity, 321; the higher criticism, 323; a preacher of righteousness, 325.
- God's Measure, 'Forbes', 369.
- God, The Indwelling, 256; growing sense of natural religion, 257; relations of matter and spirit, 259; God's immanence in Nature and in man, 261; miracles, providence, sacraments, 263; Incarnation and the Trinity, 265.
- Gospels, Four Lectures on Early History of, 'Wilkinson's, 361.
- Great Man Theory of Progress, The, 265; what is social progress, 267; greatness as an agent of progress, 269; slavery or the capitalistic wage system, 271; no escape from struggle and rivalry, 273; case against the great man, 275; fatalistic and immoral arguments, 277.
- Heaven, Letters from, 'Watts', 366.
- Helbeck of Bannisdale, 'Mrs. Humphrey Ward's, 389.
- Hereford, Cathedral Church of, 'Fisher's, 398.
- Hertfordshire, Bygone, 'Andrews', 393.
- History, Some Verdicts of, Reviewed, 'Stebbing's, 59.
- Holy Father and Living Christ, 'Forsyth's, 179.
- Holy Week Ceremonial, Ancient English, 'Feasey's, 394.
- Hume, David, 'Calderwood's, 386.
- Ideal Life and other unpublished Addresses, 'Drummond's, 178.
- Immanence, Divine, 'Illingworth's, 256.
- Incarnation, Dissertation on Subjects connected with the, 'Gore's, 1.
- Incarnation, Principles of the, 'Powell's, 1.
- Ireland, Bill for amending Local Government in, '336.
- Ireland, Bill for promoting Agricultural Board, '336.
- Ireland, Report on Agricultural Department, '336.
- Ireland, Report of Commissioners on Land Courts in, '336.
- Ireland, Saving of, 'Baden-Powell's, 336.
- Irish Grand Jury System, 'Hackett's, 336.
- Irish Legislation: home rule bills, 337; attention to Irish affairs, 339; attempts to crush Irish industries, 341; economic treatment and agrarian legislation, 343; defects in land legislation, 345; working of the land commission, 347; objections to separation, 349; grand jury administration, 351; present Local Government Bill, 353.
- Isaiah, 'chaps. 40—56, 'Skinner's, 364.
- John, Commentary on Gospel of St., 'Milligan and Moulton's, 358.

- 'Keats, Thoughts from,' Girdleston's, 391.
- 'Kingdom of God, Growth of,' Gulick's, 359.
- 'Kingswood School, History of,' by Three Old Boys, 372.
- Klondike, The, 79; sudden fame, 81; marvellously rich strikes, 83; rush to Klondike, 85; life in a mining camp, 87; description of the country, 89; placer mining, 91.
- 'Klondike, Goldfields of the,' Leonard's, 79.
- 'Klondike, Pioneers of the,' Hayne's, 79.
- Korea, an eye witness on, 157; truth about missionaries, 159; a great innovation, 161; Methodist Episcopal missions, 163; Korean Christian givers, 165; power of the old Gospel, 167; his'orical parallel, 169.
- 'Korea and Her Neighbours,' Bishop's, 157.
- 'Korosko, Tragedy of the,' Doyle's, 193.
- 'Last Things,' Beet's, 361.
- 'Leaders in Literature,' Wilson's, 391.
- 'Lessons from Life: Animal and Human, 202.
- 'Life in an Old English Town,' 384.
- 'Life in Christ, My,' Father John's, 385.
- 'Lines from my Log Books,' Hays', 377.
- 'Liturgy and Ritual of Ante-Nicene Church,' Warren's, 183.
- 'Lockhart's Advance through Tirah,' Shadwell's, 379.
- Lord's Knowledge as Man, Our, 1; reasons for this inquiry, 3; how to approach a hard problem, 5; views of English theologians, 7; extreme views untenable, 9; limitations to Christ's knowledge, 11; Scripture teaching, 13; inalienable and eternal attributes, 15; is self-limitation inconceivable? 17; practical bearings of the subject, 19; need of reverence and reticence, 21.
- 'Lowden Sabbath Morn,' Stevenson's, 391.
- 'Macleod, Senr., Memorials of Norman,' J. N. Macleod's, 380.
- 'Martin, St., Canterbury, Church of,' Routledge's, 399.
- 'Mary Queen of Scots,' Fleming's, 187.
- 'Mary the Virgin, Oxford, St., Church of,' Jackson's, 119.
- Methodism, Side Lights on, 278; Rev. Joseph Fowler, 279; a band of Methodist leaders, 281; wealth of detail in Mr. Fowler's notes, 283; educational and other discussions, 285; theological examinations and Mr. Caughey's case, 287; the great Methodist statesman, 289.
- 'Methodism, Side Lights on the Conflict of,' 1827—52, Gregory's, 278.
- 'Methodism in Huddersfield,' Mallinson's, 388.
- 'Millais and his Work,' Spielmann's, 195.
- 'Ministerial Priesthood,' Moberly's, 289.
- 'Mirabeau,' Willert's, 383.
- 'Morrison, Life of Rev. James,' Adamson's, 381.
- 'My Happy Half Century,' Willard's, 382.
- 'My Life in Christ,' Father John's, 385.
- 'Mysteries Pagan and Papal,' Cheetham's, 366.
- 'Natural History, Every-day Book of,' Cundall and Step's, 398.
- 'New England Divines, Sketches of,' Sherman's, 59.
- 'New Man, The,' Oberholtzer's, 198.
- 'New Testament, Illustrated,' 177.
- 'New Testament Problems, Some,' Wright's, 360.
- 'New Zealand, Year Book,' 1897, statistics, 392.
- 'Nicholas, St.,' 1897—8, 392.
- 'Nuova Antologia,' January 16, 400.
- 'Old Testament, Introduction to Literature of,' Driver's, 176.
- 'Oxford Movement, Secret History of,' Walsh's, 205.
- 'Pansies from French Gardens,' Attwell's, 193.
- 'Pastor and the Working Church, Christian,' Gladden's, 356.
- 'Patmos, Sidelights from,' Matheson's, 173.
- 'Penitent Pilgrim, The,' Watts', 366.
- 'Perpetua,' Baring-Gould's, 194.
- 'Philip II. of Spain,' Hume's, 189.
- 'Philology of the Gospels,' Blase's, 360.
- 'Plain Path, In a,' Foxell's, 367.
- 'Plant Life, Glimpses into,' Brightwen's, 201.
- 'Prayer Book, Our,' Moule's, 369.
- 'Prayer, In Answer to,' 368.
- Preacher, The Making of a Great, 37; happy childhood, 39; precocious boy, 41; Church of England school, 43; under strong conviction, 45; a memorable conversion, 47; severe critic, 49; defence of Calvinism, 51; village pastor, 53; first sermons in London, 55; most popular preacher in London, 57.

- 'Preaching, Homi etic Lectures on,' Chrissel's, 174
- 'Prophets, Book of the Twelve,' vol. li., G. A. Smith's, 170.
- 'Protestant Episcopal Church, History of,' McConnell's, 59.
- 'Protestantism, Principles of,' Lilley's, 371.
- 'Pusey, Life of E. B.,' Liddon's, vol. iv., 205.
- 'Puseyism within the Church of England, Latest Light on Practical Influence of,' 205—225.
- 'Psychology, Primer of,' Titchener's, 395.
- 'Raleigh, Sir Walter, Hume's, 186.
- 'Record, Breaking The,' Douglas's, 387.
- 'Regent Square,' Hair's, 375.
- 'Religious Tract Society's Publications,' 396.
- 'Renaissance in Italy,' Symonds', 191.
- 'Renaissance in Italy: The Catholic Reaction,' J. A. Symonds', 388.
- 'Revel and the Battle, The,' Ridding's, 172.
- 'Revue des Deux Mondes,' January 15—March 1, 204; April 15—June 1, 400.
- 'Rossetti, Christina,' Bell's 386.
- 'Shakespeare, The Christ in, Ellis', 399.
- 'Shaw, John F., Books for Boys and Girls,' 196.
- Sicily, Picturesque; A rich field for archæologist, 303; scenery and brigands, 305; Palermo and its churches, 307; streets and shops of Palermo, 309; an excitable people, 311; distressing poverty, 311; Greek temples and present conditions, 315.
- 'Socialism—What is,' Scotsburne's, 397.
- 'Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, History of,' Allen and McClure's, 374.
- 'Spurgeon's Autobiography, C. H.,' 37.
- Stowe, Life and Letters,' 326; G. Sand's judgment, 327; inspiration of the work, 329; errors of memory, 331; Byron scandal, 333; mysterious inspiration, 335.
- 'Stowe, Life and Letters of Harriet Beecher,' Fields', 326.
- 'Strength to Strength, From,' Jowett's, 369.
- 'Teresa,' Whyte's, 386.
- 'Turkey, Every-day Life in,' Ramsay's, 388.
- 'Two Hundred Years,' 374.
- United States, Civil and Religious Liberty in, 1600—1800, 59; Virginia, 61; Maryland and the Carolinas, 63; New York and Pennsylvania, 65; refugees from Protestant and Popish persecution, 67; four periods of colonial history, 69; the great awakening, 71; causes and effects of the American revolt, 73; growth of Methodism, 75; triumph of the voluntary principle, 77.
- 'United States, History of,' Bancroft's, 59.
- 'United States of America, Religion in,' Baird's, 59.
- University Church, A, 119; ghosts of universities, 121; university functions in St. Mary's, 123; scholastic disputations, 125; university sermons in St. Mary's, 127; brawls in church and churchyard, 129; great riot of 1354, 131; Cranmer, Ridley, Latimer, 133; Laud and the Wesleys, 135; the Oxford movement, 137.
- 'Value, Rise of,' Jordan's, 202.
- 'Village Sermons,' Church's, 367.
- 'War, Extinction of,' 399.
- Wesleyan Book Room Publications, 200, 396.
- Wesleyan Sunday School Union, 390.
- 'West India Royal Commission, Report of,' 137.
- West Indies, Crisis in the, 137; history of the West Indian colonies, 139; a stormy youth, 141; products of the colonies, 143; sugar bounties, 145; threatened crisis, 147; suggestions, 149; Conference of the Powers, 151; botanical establishments, 153; large demands, 155.
- 'Whitefield, Life and Times of Rev. George,' Tyerman's, 59.
- 'Who's Who, 1898,' Sladen's, 199.
- 'Wilberforce, Private papers of William,' 186.
- 'Will to believe, The,' James's, 165.
- 'William the Silent,' Harrison's, 189.
- 'Woman Worth Winning, A,' Fenn's, 392.
- 'Women of the Old Testament,' Horton's, 364.
- 'Yet,' Andrews', 368.